
**INTERNATIONAL
HELSINKI
FEDERATION FOR
HUMAN RIGHTS**

HONORARY CHAIRMAN
Yuri Orlov

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR
Aaron Rhodes

DEPUTY EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR
Brigitte Dufour

ADVISORY BOARD (CHAIR)
Karl von Schwarzenberg

EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE
Holly Cartner
Bjørn Engesland
Vasilika Hysi
Krassimir Kanev
Ferenc Köszeg

PRESIDENT
Ulrich Fischer

VICE PRESIDENT
Srdjan Dizdarević

TREASURER
Stein-Ivar Aarsæther

Wickenburggasse 14/7, A-1080 Vienna, Austria; Tel +43-1-408 88 22; Fax 408 88 22-50
e-mail: office@ihf-hr.org – internet: <http://www.ihf-hr.org>
Bank account: Bank Austria Creditanstalt 0221-00283/00, BLZ 12 000

Ingushetia / North Ossetia / Kabardino Balkaria: The Spread of Chechnya-type Human Rights Violations

International Helsinki Federation for Human Rights (IHF)

2 June 2005

The IHF has consultative status with the United Nations and the Council of Europe.

MEMBER AND COOPERATING* COMMITTEES IN:

Albania–Armenia*–Austria–Azerbaijan–Belarus–Bosnia–Herzegovina–Bulgaria–Canada–Croatia–Czech Republic–Denmark–Finland–France–Georgia*
Germany – Greece – Hungary – Italy – Kazakhstan – Kosovo – Kyrgyzstan – Latvia – Lithuania – Macedonia – Moldova – Montenegro – Netherlands
Norway – Poland – Romania – Russia – Serbia – Slovakia – Slovenia – Sweden – Switzerland – Ukraine* – United Kingdom – United States – Uzbekistan*

COOPERATING ORGANIZATIONS:

The European Roma Rights Center – Human Rights Without Frontiers – Mental Disabilities Advocacy Center

The International Helsinki Federation for Human Rights (IHF) is a non-governmental organization that seeks to promote compliance with the human rights provisions of the Helsinki Final Act and its follow-up documents. In addition to supporting and providing liaison among 44 Helsinki committees and cooperating organizations, the IHF has direct links with human rights activists in countries where no Helsinki committees exist. It has consultative status with the United Nations and the Council of Europe.

The IHF represents member and cooperating committees in Albania, Armenia, Austria, Azerbaijan, Belarus, Bosnia and Herzegovina, Bulgaria, Canada, Croatia, Czech Republic, Denmark, Finland, France, Georgia, Germany, Greece, Hungary, Italy, Kazakhstan, Kosovo, Kyrgyzstan, Latvia, Lithuania, Macedonia, Moldova, Montenegro, Netherlands, Norway, Poland, Romania, Russia, Serbia, Slovakia, Slovenia, Sweden, Switzerland, Ukraine, United Kingdom, United States and Uzbekistan. Other cooperating organizations include the European Roma Rights Centre (Budapest), Human Rights without Frontiers (Brussels) and the Mental Disabilities Advocacy Center (Budapest).

President:	Ulrich Fischer
Vice President:	Srdjan Dizdarević
Executive Director:	Aaron Rhodes
Deputy Executive Director/Legal Counsel:	Brigitte Dufour
Chief Editor:	Paula Tscherne-Lempiäinen

This report is part of an IHF initiative on Chechnya, conducted with the support of the Open Society Institute (OSI) and the Mott Foundation.

International Helsinki Federation for Human Rights
Wickenburggasse 14/7, A-1080 Vienna, Austria
Tel: (+43-1) 408 88 22 Fax: (+43-1) 408 88 22-50
Email: office@ihf-hr.org
Internet: www.ihf-hr.org
Bank account: Bank Austria Creditanstalt, 0221-00283/00 BLZ 11 000

©2005 by the International Helsinki Federation for Human Rights and IHF Research Foundation. All rights reserved.

Content

I – Introduction	4
II - Cases in Ingushetia	6
26 June 2004. Ekazhevo. Unlawful detention and torture of Bekkhan Lolokhiev (b.1966)	6
20 July 2004. Nazran. Unlawful detention, death through torture of Bashir Velkhiev (b.1963). Unlawful detention and torture of Bekkhan Velkhiev (b.1965)	7
20 July 2004. Galashki. Extrajudicial execution of Beslan Arapkhanov (b.1966)	8
2 August 2004, Ordzhonikidzevskaya. Special operation on passport verification in the IDP camp “Konservnyy Zavod” (“Cannery”). Torture and beatings of the detained IDPs. Disappearance of Sultan Khatuev (b.1962)	9
August 2004. Fourteen doctors repeatedly mistakenly accused of being terrorists	11
3 September 2004. Nesterovskaya. Enforced “disappearance” of Alaudi Khashiev (b.1974)	14
11 October 2004. Special operation against an armed fighter in Nazran. 11 civilians, including 8 children wounded	15
4 November 2004. Special operation near the Ordzhonikidzevskaya train station. Beating, abuse of human dignity, abuse of religious feelings	17
III. Cases in North Ossetia – Alania and Kabardino-Balkaria	19
3 August 2004. Nazran, Ingushetia and Vladikavkaz, North Ossetia. Unlawful detention and torture of Adam Parchiev (b.1974)	19
2 October 2004. Mayskoe, Prigorodny district, North Ossetia. Illegal detention and beating of Magomed Khamkhoev (b.1980)	20
November 2004. Mayskoe, Prigorodny district, North Ossetia. Psychological pressuring and forced cooperation of Mamed Daskiev (b.1982)	22
4 November 2004, Nalchik. Illegal detention of the juvenile Marina Korigova (b.1988)	23
22 March 2005. Kabardino-Balkaria and North Ossetia. Unlawful detention and torture of Osman Bogatyrev (b.1976)	26
1 April 2005. North Ossetia and Ingushetia. Unlawful detention and torture of Hassan Egiev (b.1978)	27
IV. Conclusion	28

I – Introduction

For over two years Ingushetia has attracted the attention of human rights activists due to increasing numbers of human rights abuses. Initially there were reports of cars with dark tinted windows and no license plates arriving from neighbouring Chechnya and abducting people, then driving off in an unknown direction. The victims were primarily Chechen refugees. Since the end of 2003, these abductions have become more frequent, and increasing numbers of Ingush civilians are also being abducted.

This criminal trend in Ingushetia is made evident by data from the Human Rights Center “Memorial,” which consistently monitors the situation in the region.

In the year 2002, 28 cases of abduction were registered in Ingushetia. Of these, 27 residents of Chechnya and 1 resident of Ingushetia were the victims. Six persons remained “disappeared” (5 residents of Chechnya and 1 of Ingushetia).

In 2003, 52 persons were abducted in Ingushetia. From these, 41 were residents of Chechnya, 9 residents of Ingushetia and 2 citizens of Armenia. Fourteen persons remained “disappeared” (11 residents of Chechnya and 1 of Ingushetia).

In 2004, the number of those abducted in Ingushetia increased to 75 persons. Of these, 38 were residents of Chechnya and 37 were residents of Ingushetia. Twenty three persons remained “disappeared” (12 residents of Chechnya and 11 residents of Ingushetia).

The deputy prosecutor of Ingushetia, Rashid Ozdov, tried to investigate the role of the local FSB office in these abductions. As a result, on 11 March 2004 he was abducted too, and then “disappeared”. More than a year has passed since his abduction, and while the facts about his abduction and the abductions he was dealing with were given quite some publicity, no proper investigation has ever been conducted, and those who are guilty have not been identified and brought to justice.

Following the 21-22 June 2004 events, when the armed fighters carried out an armed raid on the republic, an investigative group of the Office of the Russian Prosecutor General, headed by M.Lapotnikov, an investigator dealing with particularly important cases in the North Caucasus Prosecutor’s Office arrived in Ingushetia. The investigators dealing with this case of the Ingushetia raid as well as representatives of the federal forces in Chechnya disregarded the concept of “civilian”, and as a result, another Chechnya-like “anti-terrorist operation” was launched, this time in Ingushetia. Now any resident of the Republic can be detained, abducted, subjected to torture, beaten and even killed. The perpetrators are not held responsible for their actions.

On 30 April 2005, the opposition of Ingushetia attempted to conduct a rally. A leader of the opposition, the deputy of the Ingush Parliament, Musa Ozdov, was detained. According to a journalist of the radio station “Echo of Moscow”¹, who witnessed the arrest, masked people without any identification bound up Ozdov’s hands behind his back and drove him away in a car without

¹ <http://www.echo.msk.ru/guests/9306/>

license plates. Such a detention can hardly be called legal. Ozdoev was brought to the Nazran police department, where he met Bekkhan Guireyev, another detained Ingush. On 26 April 2005, Guireyev had been unlawfully arrested by a group of unidentified military in the city of Nazran. Guireyev was in a poor physical state and explained to Ozdoev that he had been tortured and beaten.

Ozdoev reported his experiences in the police department in an interview to the radio station “Echo of Moscow” as soon as he was released. After that, Guireyev was immediately taken to the Nazran hospital where he is currently staying in a poor health condition. While this situation was brought to public attention, it is hardly likely, though, that those who unlawfully arrested and tortured Guireyev will be duly punished.

The extensive data provided provided in the given report shows that even in the cases where the names of the perpetrators are known, none of them are brought to justice. The climate of impunity, which originated in Chechnya, has effectively spread to Ingushetia.

Furthermore, following the Beslan tragedy, Northern Ossetia and Kabardino-Balkaria also became “places beyond the rule of law”.

II Cases in Ingushetia

26 June 2004. Ekazhevo. Unlawful detention and torture of Bekkhan Lolokhoev (b.1980)

On 26 June 2004 at 6 a.m. the Ingush citizen Bekkhan Lolokhoev (b.1980) was unlawfully detained in the house of his family in the village of Ekazhevo, and carried away in an unknown direction. He was in bed when a group of armed and masked people rushed into the house. They handcuffed him, covered his head with his T-shirt, threw him into their car and took him away. They did not identify themselves, did not show any documents, and did not tell any reasons for the detention. Bekkhan does not know how many they were. According to his parents, who had been locked in their room, and the neighbors who were watching from a distance, they were numerous.

From the interview with Bekkhan Lolokhiev:

I was driven in the car for about 15 minutes, and brought inside a premise, where I was tied with the handcuffs to an electric heater. They started to beat me, all the time asking the same question: where I had been in night from 21 to 22 June? These persons were in masks and spoke Russian without accent.

On the same day I was transported to another place, a completely dark dugout in the ground. There I was undressed and tied to a stretcher on the floor. Those who went down to interrogate me, came with a lamp, strongly beat and tortured me with electricity, including passing a current through his genitals. Again they demanded from me to admit that I was among the insurgents of 21/22 June and continued to beat and torture me. Only at the fifth day of my detention they gave me bread and water. Being totally exhausted I had already started to lose consciousness.

From the dugout I was transported to another place, most likely a military base. I was transported with a bag over my head, but nevertheless I could see a little around of myself. Here, people in masks again beat me, but already less. And during the day they brought me a piece of bread and water. Here they demanded from me to confess that I was a member of the illegal armed groups, and then in 3-4 years I would become free. They told me that I was seen among the insurgents. But when I denied, naming witnesses who had seen me in this night in his house, they changed the accusation that I have helped the insurgents. I also denied it. Finally they asked me if I knew any people who were participating in the armed raid. I was held in this place for about ten days.

Then, one morning a person came to me and told me that if I want to survive, I should remain silent and to speak to nobody about what has happened with me. I should remember that I have brothers. After that they again put a bag over my head, tied my hands and carried me somewhere. I was pushed out from the car and put on the ground. When the car had left I stood up, approached the road, and stopped passing cars, from whom I learned that I was in the Chechen Republic, near to the Kavkaz-1 check-point at the border with Ingushetia. But the drivers refused to transport me through the border, explaining that in my condition (Bekkhan had lost 30 kilos during the imprisonment) it would cause suspicion at the check-point. And I also did not have my passport on him. Then I asked a driver for a mobile phone, from which I contacted my family and informed them where I was. Soon later some relatives arrived and brought me away.

Bekkhan has addressed the Office of the Public Prosecutor, where a criminal case was initiated, but no effective investigation was conducted. During the period of his “disappearance” his relatives went to the police, where they were informed, that the police forces had not detained Bekkhan and that he was not on the lists of alleged participants in the events on 21/22 June.

Some days after his release, Bekkhan and one of his brothers were again detained, this time by the Nazran regional police department (GOVD). Without any explanation they were kept for three days. They were not beaten and the treatment was normal. At the same time, they were not interrogated at all. After that they were released without any explanations.

Bekkhan’s passport was taken away by the people who abducted him. It is an important necessity for Bekkhan to receive a new passport.

20 July 2004. Nazran. Unlawful detention and death through torture of Bashir Velkhiev (b.1963). Unlawful detention and torture of Bekkhan Velkhiev (b.1965)

On 20 July 2004 at approximately 8.30 a.m., in the Barsuki district of Nazran, Ingushetia, Bashir Velkhiev (b.1963) and Bekkhan Velkhiev (b.1965) were both unlawfully detained in the home of Bashir Velkhiev by 7 unknown representatives of the RF Ministry of Internal Affairs and servicemen of the Department against Organized Crime of the Ingushetia Ministry of Internal Affairs (UBOP). The detention was carried out with violations of all relevant procedural norms. The police officers neither showed their identification papers, nor any legal documents justifying the house search and the subsequent detention of the Velkhiev brothers. They did not give any explanations with regard to their actions. All of them were armed and wore camouflage uniforms. Several of them also had their faces covered with masks. They behaved in a rude manner. Bashir Velkhiev’s wife, Rima Velkhieva (born 1961), and his five children were witnesses of this arbitrary detention. Afterwards, Rima Velkhieva realized that in the course of the illegal search they also stole from the house all the family savings in the amount of 12,000 USD and 40,000 roubles.

Upon detention, Bashir and Bekkhan Velkhiev were taken to the building of the Ingush UBOP (Department against Organized Crime). There, in the room #17, both of them were interrogated in connection with the 21-22 June armed raid of the rebel fighters on Ingushetia. Severe torture was inflicted on them to force them to confess in having been involved in those events. First, they were beaten and questioned in the same room. Then, Bashir was taken to another room, and Bekkhan has not seen him again.

Bekkhan was beaten by feet and sticks and tortured with electricity until the evening. Then, he was put in a car, with his hands tied and his head covered with a non-transparent plastic bag. He was driven for some time, and then thrown out of the car in the outskirts of Nazran.

There, Bekkhan was found by some policemen of the Nazran city police department and had to spend the night in their custody. In the morning of the next day, on 21 July 2004, Bekkhan was released by Ruslan Albakov, investigator of the Nazran prosecutor’s office. He informed Bekkhan that his brother Bashir had died in the previous night in the premises of the Ingush UBOP.

On 30 July 2004, the Nazran prosecutor’s office opened a criminal case against unidentified staff-

members of the RF Ministry of Internal Affairs and servicemen of the Ingush UBOP in accordance with Article 286, Part 2, Para “v” of the RF Criminal Code (i.e., abuse of official powers) for having caused the death of Bashir Velkhiev and having inflicted physical and moral harm on Bekkhan Velkhiev. Bashir Velkhiev’s body was exhumed and forensic expertise was carried out (Act #464) evidencing severe bodily damage. Likewise, Bekkhan Velkhiev had to undergo a medical examination and the forensic expert also registered severe physical damage (Expert Conclusion #397).

Since then, no progress has been made with regard to establishing the identity of the perpetrators. On 17 September 2004, Eliza Moussaeva, researcher of the IHF, visited the Nazran prosecutor’s office and was informed that the case was difficult, the investigation was stalling, and there was little hope that the criminal case could be brought to court.

20 July 2004. Galashki. Extrajudicial execution of Beslan Arapkhanov (b.1966)

On 20 July 2004, armed people in masks and camouflage belonging to an unidentified unit of the Federal forces, killed Beslan Arapkhanov (b.1966) at 1 Partizanskaya St., village of Galashki, Sunzha district of Ingushetia.

From interviews with the victim’s relatives:

It was about 4 am. Everyone in the house was asleep. Beslan Arapkhanov’s wife, Rima, was woken up by knocking at the door. She opened it, and armed camouflaged people in masks ran into the room and jumped at Beslan, who was still asleep. They handcuffed him and began to beat him with rifle butts. The woman showed them Beslan’s passport, but they only looked at it and tossed it aside.

Then she was forced to leave the room. The house was searched. Soldiers found an automatic gun in one of the rooms. Rima explained that in 1999 Beslan’s brother, father of 4 children, was killed on the Chechen border, and that Beslan had bought the gun for taking revenge, but never used it.

Arapkhanov’s 7 children slept in one room. Rima was taken to them. The older children slept on the floor due to a lack of beds. Pointing at them, the soldiers yelled at Rima: “This is not children! This is boyeviks! You made beds on the floor for boyeviks. Where are they?” The woman and her children were then locked in the room. The frightened children heard how their father was beaten and questioned: “Where are the boyeviks? Where are the weapons?” Through a crack they saw how he, covered in blood, was led outside, then back into the house, then outside again. Everyone heard gunfire...

Arapkhanov was shot dead in the yard of this house. The next-door neighbor watched the scene from his window. He did not see him directly, but he could see how soldiers came to a single spot one by one and fired their guns. Later Beslan’s dead body was found there.

All neighbors were awakened by the amount of cars that had approached Arapkhanovs’ house. People tried to come out, but near the gates they were stopped by soldiers, who blocked the entire street. Beslan’s cousin who managed to come out anyway was stopped and beaten by soldiers. They checked his passport and asked him, pointing to Arapkhanovs’ house: “Do you know the people who live there?” - “Yes, it is Beslan Arapkhanov, my cousin.”

The soldiers became nervous: “It can’t be Arapkhanov!” - “It is Arapkhanov,” the young man

continued to assert. After some confusion one of the soldiers said: “A mistake.”

After the murder three unmasked soldiers approached Rima, who did not yet know that she was a widow. One of them showed an ID showing the name K. Kostenko, investigator from RI (Republic of Ingushetia) UFSB from Zheleznovodsk. The two others, Alexander Gavrilov and Andrei Ershov, were witnesses. Kostenko presented a search warrant for the house of Ruslan Khuchbarov, 7 Partizanskaya street, and asked Rima to sign it.

“We are not the Khuchbarovs, we are the Arapkhanovs,” she answered, “And our house is number 1, not 7.”

“Shut up, bitch! What do you mean, the Arapkhanovs?”

Ruslan Khuchbarov practically did not live in this village. His parents are divorced and the house at 7 Partizanskaya St. is occupied only by his father. On the entire street, only houses 1 and 7 did not have a sign with house number.

The woman was taken outside, to a freshly dug garden. (The family had dug up potatoes a few days before.) “You hid weapons here! Dig!” Rima picked up the shovel, but she had no strength to dig. One of the soldiers took mercy on her, took the shovel and began to dig himself.

Later, Rima was taken back into the house and was shown a bag with a grenade inside. “It was found in your home. You must sign this.” Despite the fact that this was a lie, the exhausted woman signed the paper.

At 9 a.m., representatives of the local administration and local police arrived at the scene. The unidentified armed people in masks and camouflage, who had committed the execution in the night, were still here. They pointed to Beslan’s body, with the automatic gun nearby, and said that he was killed when trying to escape.

The murder of Beslan Arapkhanov, a harvester driver, had a significant resonance in the village and in the republic. The following day the family was visited by a delegation from the President of Ingushetia, that offered initial financial assistance and promised to take care of the family from then on. However, this first visit has been the last one so far.

The day after the murder, the prosecutor’s office of the Sunzha district of Ingushetia initiated the criminal case #1460044 on the murder of Beslan Arapkhanov. According to his relatives, a new document has suddenly surfaced in the case: a search warrant for the house of Beslan Arapkhanov, suspected of participation in illegal armed formations. The warrant appears to be signed by Beslan’s wife, Rima. She claims that the signature on the document is not hers.

2 August 2004, Ordzhonikidzevskaya. Special operation on passport verification in the IDP camp “Konservnyy Zavod” (“Cannery”). Torture and beatings of the detained IDPs. “Disappearance” of Sultan Khatuev (b.1962)

On 2 August 2004, at around 8 pm, the IDP camp “Konservny Zavod“ in Ordzhonikidzevskaya, Zelyonaya street 3, was surrounded by a large number of BTR (armored carriers) and cars (there were “Niva”, “Zhiguli” and “UAZ”-tabletka cars). One hundred to one hundred fifty armed persons penetrated into the camp and without presenting any kind of authorization began to examine the passports of the camp’s inhabitants. According to the IDPs’ statements, they were either Russian or

Ingush. Nearly all of them wore masks, they behaved very rudely, insulted women and children and forced several camp inhabitants to lay on the ground, face down. During the operation 7 persons were detained:

- Muslim Khatchukaev (born in 1983)
- Adlan Khatchukaev
- Umar Akiev
- Aslan Akiev
- Umalat Israilov (born in 1975, the head of the camp)
- Sultan Khatuev (born in 1962)

The detained men were put into to a “UAZ“ car (“tabletka“). When it became evident that they were about to be taken away, the father of the Akiev brothers, Rukman Akiev, decided to stay with his sons and got into the “tabletka” of his own free will. The wife of Sultan Khatuev, Luiza, wanted to do the same, but was not allowed to do so.

The same evening, the camp residents went to the police station of the Sunzha district, where they waited until midnight. During this time, the Akiev brothers as well as their father were released. Later, an officer told the residents, that the other detained persons will be released the next morning. Yet when the IDPs returned to the police station on the morning of 3 August, they were informed that all detained were brought to the regional administration of the Federal Security Service (FSB) in Magas.

Upon their arrival to the FSB administration in Magas, they met with an FSB officer, who presented himself as the deputy head of the regional administration of the FSB in the Republic of Ingushetia. He listened to what the relatives of the detained had to say and released Muslim and Adlan Khatchukaev. He furthermore assured the relatives that Umalat Israilov had already been released previously. The officer went on, saying that Sultan Khatuev was not in Magas and that he did not have any information of the whereabouts. He gave the advice to make inquiries at the police station of the Sunzha district.

The Khatchukaevs were severely beaten and tortured with electric shocks. When they were released, they were warned that they would be killed in case they tell what did happen to them and how they were treated. The torturers wanted them to admit their participation in the armed raids on Ingushetia on 21-22 June. The Khatchukaevs could report that the last time they saw Khatuev was, when they were led out of the police station. After that, they had all plastic bags put over their heads, so that they could not see him in the FSB premises, but still were able to hear his cries and groans when he was tortured.

Umalat Israilov, brutally beaten and tortured, was thrown into the trunk of a car and taken to a dump near Ordzhonikidzevskaya. There he was laid on the ground and ordered not to move for ten minutes until the car was gone.

Khatuev’s whereabouts still remain unknown. The Sunzha district state prosecutor’s office opened investigations into his case (# 04600054), according to article 126 of the penal code of the Russian Federation. Police officers assure the relatives that in the night of 3 August he was brought, together with his neighbors, to the FSB, whereas the FSB insists in not having detained Khatuev at all.

Excerpts from the correspondence between Luiza Khatueva and the law-enforcement bodies:

9 August 2004, N X-50

The acting chairman of the Regional Administration of the Federal Security Service in the Republic of Ingushetia, F.I. Molyakov

“After having examined your case, I herewith inform you that the Administration does not have any information on an eventual detention of Sultan Khatuev or on his current whereabouts. We will inform you, when we receive additional information.”

The acting Minister of the Interior of the Republic of Ingushetia, B.L. Khamkhoev

“Upon your request to examine the disappearance of your husband Sultan Khatuev, residing in Ordzhonikidzevskaya, Zelyonaya Str. 3, we inform you that the investigation ascertained the following:

*On 2 August 2004, on the “**Konservnyy Zavod**” premises of the Ordzhonikidzevskaya village, where a temporary camp for persons having left the Chechen Republic is established, members of the FSB Administration in the Republic of Ingushetia, of the Police Department of the Sunzha district, of the Armed Forces and of the special purpose units of the Ministry of Interior of the Russian Federation, carried out an investigative and prophylactic operation. Its purpose was to reveal and to detain members of illegal armed groups, who are hiding in zones of compact settlement of displaced persons from the Chechen Republic. In the course of this operation eight persons were brought to the police station of the Sunzha district, among them your husband S. Khatuev.*

An examination of the affiliation of those persons to illegal armed groupings was carried out, which led to the release of four of the detained persons. Yet the remaining four persons, among them your husband S.A. Khatuev, were brought away from the police station, as ordered by the head of the FSB unit, Mikhail Yuryevitch Evdokimov. Currently we are carrying out further investigations in order to establish the whereabouts of Sultan Khatuev.”

Luiza Khatueva reported that in the beginning of November 2004 a man from Argun visited her and told her that one month ago he had been released by the FSB in Magas, where he had been detained together with her husband. She gave him a photo, which showed three men, Sultan Khatuev among them, and asked, which of the three was Sultan. The man pointed immediately on Sultan and replied: “He is just not so portly any more”. He furthermore told Luiza that he was beaten there because of his brother, who is searched for a reported affiliation with an armed resistance group.

Luiza Khatueva also said that the last time when she went to the prosecutor’s office, the prosecutor told her angrily: “He is at the FSB. Do you think, **we** would fight against them?”

September 2004. Fourteen doctors repeatedly mistakenly accused of being terrorists²

Fourteen local Ingush medical doctors³, working for *International Medical Corps (IMC)*, a prominent international organization with its headquarters in Los Angeles (USA) were repeatedly mistakenly labeled as terrorist suspects on Ministry of Interior/FSB leaflets and Internet sites in the Russian Federation. After the Ministry of Interior apologized for the publication of leaflets in the spring 2004 (but without offering any compensation), the leaflet reappeared slightly modified on 9 September 2004, a week after the Beslan hostage tragedy. It includes the names and photos of the same medical doctors.

The leaflet re-appeared in the news column of the popular web resource www.rambler.ru⁴, and showed pictures of 17 women, who were said to be wanted by the FSB and the Ministry of Internal Affairs on suspicion of their involvement in terrorist activities on the territory of the Russian Federation. It was also published on at least two other popular web-pages⁵ and in the North-Ossetian newspaper *Slovo Nahis*⁶. Together with the fourteen medical doctors, the leaflet displayed the names and photos of three women who are suspected of involvement in terrorist attacks, two of whom have already been arrested.⁷

Below is the English translation of the said leaflet as featured at www.rambler.ru:

Attention! These women are wanted on suspicion of their involvement in terrorist activities in the territory of the Russian Federation.

On suspicion of their involvement in terrorist activities in the territory of the Russian Federation, the following persons are wanted by the law-enforcement agencies:

*If you have any information on their whereabouts or have seen either of them, do not undertake any independent actions but call **the hotline of the joint operative headquarters of the FSB and the Ministry of Internal Affairs of the Russian Federation at (0195) 914-2222** to report this. You can also call the police station nearest to you.*

(Photographs and names of the suspects)

One of the fourteen women met by mission members gave the following comment to the IHF:

In that leaflet, they actually used the pictures that we had submitted to the IMC along with our job applications. For the IMC files, our pictures with our names spelled out in English and

² The main part of this description is based on the IHF statement "Ingushetia: Doctors Employed by International Medical Corps Wrongly and Repeatedly Exposed as Suspected Terrorists", 27 September 2004. The statement was based on the findings of an IHF mission to Ingushetia in September 2004.

See at: http://www.ihf-hr.org/viewbinary/viewhtml.php?doc_id=6099

³ Their names are: Ludmilla Ausheva; Fatima Malsagova; Tamara Yandieva; Maddan Albogachieva; Khava Dolgieva; Motya Mogushkova; Maremm Yusupova; Birlant Shishkhanova; Radimkhat Yandieva; Madina Khutieva; Fatima Mukhieva; Anna Uzhakhoeva; Maryam Timurzieva; Zinaida Batalova.

⁴ It can be found under <http://news.mail.ru/news.html?658452>

⁵ The two websites are <http://www.regions.ru/article/bulletins/id/1627264.html> and http://www.federalpost.info/russia/issue_17013.html

⁶ Slovo Nahis, Nr. 96 (9433), 16 September 2004

⁷ The names of these three women are Luisa Magomedova, Medni Musaeva and Maryam Taburova. Magomedova and Musaeva were arrested already in the beginning of September for allegedly belonging to a network of potential suicide bombers, and Taburova is the roommate of those three women who are suspected in

our hiring dates were saved on a computer disk and forwarded to the Moscow office of our employer-organization. In the “wanted” leaflet, everything is printed exactly like it was in that particular file. It says under each photograph: Doctor (NAME) and the relevant date. The only exception was the photo of Mrs. Uzhakhova under which it was also written in Russian that she was the first wife of Shamil Basaev (In fact Mrs Uzhakhova is married and has five children).

The Ingush Deputy of the Russian Federation State Duma, B. Kodzoev addressed an inquiry⁸ to the Prosecutor General of the Russian Federation, V. Ustinov, transmitting the reports of the women “*that their pictures were put up in Moscow along with “wanted” signs in connection with their alleged involvement in terrorist organizations*”, and that “*such leaflets could be seen at police stations, at the operative search unit of the Moscow Police Department, at several metro stations, at the Sheremetyevo-1 and Sheremetyevo-2 airports, and in the supermarket ‘Stolitsa’ located in the South of Moscow*”. Mr Kodzoev further requested to inform him on which grounds the women were wanted by police. He expressed his concern that their rights were violated by law-enforcement officials.

The answer to his request indicates that “*the information on the alleged participation of the aforementioned women in acts of sabotage and terrorism, as well as their color photos, was sent to the Center ‘T’ under the GUBOP SKM Department of the Russian Federation Ministry of Internal Affairs by the Federal Security Service (FSB) of Russia. From thereon, the pictures were sent to the Moscow City Police Department to be used in the operative-search activities of anti-terrorist nature.*” It concludes by assuring that “*at the present time, all units of the Moscow City Police Department were ordered to destroy the photographs of the aforesaid persons.*”⁹

After an extensive exchange of letters by different state bodies the “misunderstanding” finally appeared to be corrected, and it was officially stated that all the necessary measures were taken to void the pictures from public domain. The Ombudsman of the Russian Federation V. Lukin could inform the Chair of the People’s Assembly of Ingushetia, M. Sakalov, that “*at the moment, an internal investigation into the issue is being conducted by the Moscow City Prosecutor’s Office*”, and that “*V. Pronin, Police Lieutenant-General and Head of the Chief Department of the Internal Affairs in the City of Moscow, sent his regrets to the doctors of the International Medical Corps.*”

Law-enforcement agencies claimed that the list of women and their photographs were found in an illegal weapon storage belonging to Kh. Tazabaev, head of a terrorist group that actively used suicide bombers.¹⁰ This official version does not sound very convincing, but even if it would be true, it would very negligent to publish the leaflets without running at least a preliminary check on the identities of the given women by contacting the relevant registration authorities of Ingushetia and Chechnya. With the addresses and professions of all the women the authorities could have easily and fast found out that they are all peaceful citizens of Ingushetia and Chechnya.

the two plane bombings of 24 August and the 31 August bombing near Moscow’s Rizhskaya metro station, but whose identity is still not finally established.

⁸ The inquiry of B. Kodzoev, Deputy of the Russian Federation State Duma from the Republic of Ingushetia, addressed to the Prosecutor General of the Russian Federation, V. Ustinov, is from 21 April 2004.

⁹ From the 25 May 2004 letter by A. Ivanov, First Deputy-Head of the Moscow City Police Department to I. Kostoev, member of the RF Federation Council.

When the old leaflet reappeared now with the revisions described above, the fourteen female doctors were quite frightened by this development and actually called the number given in the leaflet, indicating that they were the very individuals wanted by the joint operative headquarters of the FSB and the Ministry of Internal Affairs of the Russian Federation. The response they got was to call back in one week. And when the women then went to the Ingushetia FSB in the town of Magas, the security guard did not let them into the building but emphasized nevertheless that if they had not been guilty they would not have been wanted either.

The doctors have signed a complaint to the Nazran regional court. On 14 December 2004, it came to a decision that the actions of the Ministry of Internal Affairs of the Russian Federation and those of Moscow police department were illegal when they demonstrated photographs of employees of the IMC in public places of Moscow as subjects to search for terrorist activity. The court ordered the Ministry of Internal Affairs of RF to instruct all its subordinate departments in excluding the photographs from official search lists, as well as in canceling all active search data having to do with the case.

Despite this, according to the IMC, the poster was seen again, at least on one occasion, in a public place in Moscow on 14 February 2005 among photographs of other wanted persons. Representatives from the IMC managed to take photographs of the poster and complained to the Ingush administration which led to a meeting with the President of Ingushetia. Subsequently, a meeting was arranged between the doctors and high-level officials in Moscow, which took place on 4 March 2005 at the Duma. Present at the meeting were the Deputy Chair of the Federation Council, the Deputy Minister of the Interior, a representative of the Federal Security Services (FSB), a Federation Council Member, representatives from the Duma Committee on Human Rights and journalists.¹¹

At the meeting, while acknowledging that the allegations against the doctors were unfounded, reportedly neither the Ministry of Internal Affairs nor the FSB were prepared to take responsibility. However, both agreed to the demands of the Deputy Chair of the Federation Council that all the posters should be removed, including those from websites. Additionally, the Ministry of Internal Affairs have since issued the doctors with picture ID cards stating that they have no criminal or "terrorist" associations.¹²

The Ministry of Internal Affairs appealed to the Supreme Court of Ingushetia the decision of the Nazran district court of Ingushetia of December 2004. On 10 March 2005 a judicial collegiate for civil cases of the Supreme Court of Ingushetia upheld the initial decision by the Nazran district court. It seems unlikely that the Ministry of Internal Affairs will make a further appeal. Separately, the doctors are seeking compensation for the moral harm suffered.¹³

¹⁰ From the 20 May 2004 letter by A. Bragin, First Deputy-Head of the Second Department of the FSB to B. Kozdov, Deputy of the State Duma.

¹¹ Amnesty International, MEDICAL ACTION UPDATE. Ingushetia, Russian Federation: Doctors publicly branded as terrorists, AI Index: EUR 46/018/2005, 1 May 2005, see at: <http://web.amnesty.org/library/Index/ENGEUR460182005?open&of=ENG-RUS>

¹² Ibid.

¹³ Ibid.

3 September 2004. Nesterovskaya. Enforced “disappearance” of Alaudi Khashiev (b.1974)

On 3 September 2004, at about noon, three cars with around a dozen camouflaged, armed and masked persons (only two were without masks) showed up at the box-garage of the car repair center of Alaudi Khashiev (1974) in Nesterovskaya (Sunzha District, Ingushetia). They took position in the garage, and then took him away without presenting an arrest warrant or revealing their identities. At the time of the abduction of Khashiev, seven to eight more persons were present in the garage (his brother Hamzat, four workers, and some clients). They all had to stand with their arms in the back and hands on the wall, while Khashiev was taken away.

When the three cars, with Alaudi Khashiev in one of them, left, his brother Hamzat tried to follow, but as they were driving in different directions he lost them. He spoke to the men of the check-point on the road to Karabulak, and they told him that the drivers of the car had shown an ID of the FSB. Without further checking, the cars could continue on their way, most likely to the FSB headquarters in Magas.

The cars were Zhigulis model 9 and had no license plates. Some men were Ingush and some Russian. One man had a white shirt and short sleeves and the group included two *Spetsnaz* police officers with anti-bullet helmets and jackets.

In the week before, on 27 August there had already been a search in the box, when a joint group of around 100 men (OMON, RUBOP, FSB) blocked the whole neighborhood and searched the box without identifying themselves. One OMON officer told Khamzat Khashiev, that they had received a call that something was illegal there, and that therefore they made this check-up operation. Two hours before the search there had been a grave car accident, killing the village head of Sernovodsk, and injuring his bodyguard. The workers of Khashiev’s repair center helped taking the people out of the crashed cars, and by doing so also found a pistol and patrons beside the bodyguard. One of the workers put some of them in his pocket, but not the gun. In the search these patrons were found. This worker had to stand with his hands behind the neck for two hours till his mother brought his passport, and then he was given over to the local police, where he could explain the whole story and then could go home. During this search they stole a telephone, four mobile telephones, 100 USD and 1.500 RUR from the changing-room of the workers. One of the cars used in this search was a Zhiguli model 9, the car plate contained the number ‘936’, with the regional code 06 (for Ingushetia).

Khashiev, who is a lawyer and who has recently received a degree in economics, originally comes from the Galashki village and rented the box only some months before.

They went to the local police in Sunzha region (ROVD), to the Ministry of Interior in Nazran, and then to the prosecutors office of the Sunzha region, where a criminal case was opened on 9 September (on Article 126/2 of the Criminal Code, abduction).

The family members also wrote letters to President Zyazikov, the FSB of Ingushetia, the Prosecutor General of the Russian Federation, Vladimir Ustinov, and to the Acting Minister of Internal Affairs of Ingushetia.

10 October 2004. Nazran. 11 civilians, including 8 children are wounded in a special operation against an armed fighter¹⁴

On 10 October at about 5:30 p.m., in Gamurzievsk (in the city of Nazran) representatives of Russian power structures carried out a special operation in detaining a suspected group of armed fighters at 19 Chabiev street.

Staff members of the Human Rights Center “Memorial” found out that Said-Magomed Khashiev (b.1977) was temporarily residing at this address with his 2 wives and 4 children. Two days before, on 8 October, his distant relative, Magomed Khashiev, arrived with his wife and 4 children and asked Said-Magomed to host them for a few days. It is known that the security services of the Republic of Ingushetia considered Magomed Khashiev to be one of the participants of the 21/22 June armed raid on Ingushetia, and suspected his involvement in a number of crimes as well.

Initially Said-Magomed did not want to allow his relative to stay. He explained that he had good relations with all power structures and did not want to damage them. The men almost got into a fight. But Magomed finally convinced the host to allow him and his family to stay just for one day.

According to the official version, on Sunday night - i.e. on 10 October – the security services received the information that in one of the houses in Nazran armed fighters from Shamil Basaev’s group were hosted. Policemen and special servicemen surrounded the house and asked the armed fighters to surrender, but the armed fighters began to fire. As a result, two of them were killed, one detained, and two policemen were wounded.¹⁵

According to unofficial sources, witnesses and Khashiev family members, in the evening of 10 October special troops of the Ministry of Interior used armored vehicles to block the area near 19 Chabiev street. They ordered people in nearby houses to leave the territory, and asked those who lived further away to refrain from leaving their buildings. About seven soldiers in masks entered one side of the house (a wall split the house into two parts which shared a corridor), where women and children lived. Having quickly looked at the rooms, the soldiers left without offering women and children to follow them. After this, a massive fire attack on the house began.

When the shooting stopped, Khava Khashieva (b.1977), wife of Magomed Khashiev, ran across the corridor into the second part of the house, where the men had been located: her husband, his driver, their host Said-Magomed and some other Magomed. Soon she returned and told Fatima Khamatkhanova (b.1978), one of Said-Magomed’s wives, that their husbands are not in that room. Magomed Khashiev’s driver followed Khava into the women’s room, jumped out of the window and ran away.

Soon, the military renew their attack, now using grenades in addition to regular firearms. A few times during the attack Fatima screamed at the soldiers through the window that there were children in the house. But the gunfire continued until the roof of the building collapsed. The debris covered eight children and three women.

¹⁴ See also: Human Rights Center “Memorial”, <http://www.memo.ru/hr/hotpoints/caucas1/index.htm>

¹⁵ Interfax. 11 October 2004

Khava Khashieva was the first to climb out of the ruins, together with her four children and Fatima's infant. Then, with difficulty, Fatima and 3 more children climbed out. The soldiers did not try to help them. On the contrary, they yelled at the wounded women and children to get out faster. But they did carry out Madina, who had lost consciousness. The same soldiers brought warm blankets from nearby houses and gave them to the women and children. They asked Khava if she needed anything. After some time they left.

After about 40 minutes, they were replaced by representatives of the Ingush police, who called an ambulance, which brought the women and the children to the central hospital of Nazran.

The dead bodies of Magomed Khashiev and Said-Magomed Khashiev were discovered under the ruins.

The men in the house had been firing at the military as well. Fatima Khamatkhanova says that she saw Magomed Khashiev with a gun. The third man, who had escaped from the house, was detained later on. Interfax, referring to a source in the law enforcement organs, reported that it was Mukhamet Kastoev, an armed fighter from the village of Eltievo, Ingushetia.

The house where the Khashievs lived was completely destroyed. According to official information, unexploded mines and firearms remained in the ruins, and on the following day policemen began clearing the mines.

The Minister of Health of Ingushetia, Boris Komurzoev, informed Interfax that 9 persons were wounded as a result of the fight: 2 military men and 7 civilians. According to the Human Rights Center "Memorial", though, 13 people have been wounded: 2 military men (Ivanov, b.1975 and Vinogradov, b.1968, both have bullet shots of medium level of seriousness), 3 women and 8 children. They are as follows:

1. Fatima Khamatkhanova, b.1978 (chest wound, left side)
2. Ibragim Khashiev, b. 2000
3. Khava Khashieva, b. 2004 (wound in the forehead area)
4. Shafiyat Khashieva, b. 2002 (skin scratches)
5. Madina Khashieva, b.1987 (head wound)
6. Nazir Khashiev, b.1999 (multiple wounds of body and head)
7. Khadizhat Malsagova, b. 2000 (Fatima's child from her first marriage)
8. Khava Khashieva, b.1977 (wound of right shoulder)
9. Amir Khashiev, b.1999 (wound of head)
10. Abdul-Malik Khashiev, b. 2000 (skin scratches)
11. Maria Khashieva, b. 2001 (light wound in the chest area)

4 November 2004. Special operation near the Ordzhonikidzevskaya train station. Beating, abuse of human dignity, abuse of religious feelings

On 4 November 2004 at 7:30 pm, armed and camouflaged persons of an unknown enforcement

structure carried out a special operation, checking passports on the square in front of the train station. During the operation the square was closed off and everyone who happened to be there - sellers, passengers - was checked. In addition, those who had gathered in the nearby mosque were forced to come out of the mosque and ordered to lie on the ground. To note, they had gathered for the Friday prayer, an especially important ritual during the month of Ramadan.

The operation was conducted in connection with an armed fight that had taken place near the train station a short time before. From a position hidden in a house, an armed fighter had opened fire and wounded a number of Russian servicemen, and then managed to escape.

From the interview with a train station employee:

It was almost the end of the prayer when we heard gunfire and noise. We looked out and saw that we are surrounded by armed persons. There were about 40 of us. After the prayer was over, they told us: "Come out with your hands in the air. Lie down."

It was a cold wet day. Mud and puddles on the street. Everyone lied down, including the elderly. One of us tried to tell them: "I am captain of the 6th department..." He was rudely interrupted: "Lie down, bandit, there are hundreds of captains like you."

There were about 40 of them as well. They were armed with hand guns and automatic guns. The whole square was surrounded. When Kharon Tsoroev, one of the armed guards of the station went to some booth to get something to eat, they jumped in: "Stand! Lie!" He answered: "Stand what? I am a guard, do you want to see some documents?" He was pushed to the ground and beaten with rifle butts and feet.

Also here on the square they grabbed a young man about thirty years of age and put him in a car. They did not even check his documents when they grabbed him. After the twenty-four hours he spent with them, the man is still on sick leave. He refuses to say what happened, we know only that he was in bed for a long time afterwards.

We stayed on the ground for about 30 minutes. Only then they asked for our documents and checked the cars on the square. Finally, they told us to get up, keep our hands in the air, go back into the mosque and stay there for 15 minutes. We realized that they want to leave. They were Russians, with and without masks. They told us: "You are bandits, you are all the same!"

Only later we found out that they had a problem some time before. So they were checking all houses near the station, beating people there, even teenagers. They took away everything they wanted and did not let anyone say a word.

So, this is security?!

III. Cases in North Ossetia – Alania and Kabardino-Balkaria

3 August 2004. Nazran, Ingushetia and Vladikavkaz, North Ossetia. Unlawful detention and torture of Adam Parchiev (b.1974)

On 3 August 2004 at around 5 p.m., unidentified armed persons arrested Adam Parchiev (b.1974), living in Nazran, 68 Gikalo street. The persons who took Adam Parchiev away did not wear any masks. However, they neither introduced themselves, nor did they show any documents revealing their identity or the reason for A. Parchiev's detention.

His relatives were convinced that he had been abducted, but they did not know by whom. They hired a lawyer, Mr. Bakhtiev, who immediately addressed the Nazran police department. He was told that no file on A. Parchiev existed, and that he was not detained. The lawyer took up investigations at the Ingush Interior Ministry and the pre-detention facilities, yet in vain.

Only four days after the arrest, the relatives finally obtained information on Adam Parchiev's place of detention. First, he had been detained in the Nazran police department, and then was transferred to the pre-trial detention facility of Vladikavkaz.

Extract from the interview with A. Parchiev's relatives:

Immediately after Adam's detention, we wrote a complaint to the Nazran police department and the Ingush State Prosecutor's Office describing the abduction. In a second complaint we explained that we could present evidence that he was not in any way involved in the 21-22 June events. The only official reply we got, was a letter from the State Prosecutor's Office, confirming the reception of our letter from 3 August.

Later we found out, that in the morning of 3 August, the Tsechoev brothers were arrested. One of them was released after being tortured, and cannot walk until today. The second one was, apparently forced under torture, to blacken Adam and another man from Nazran called Tsurov. As a result Adam and this other man were arrested in the evening of the same day, Adam around 6 p.m. and Tsurov one hour later.

Tsurov was released some days ago. His lawyer told us, how the system works. The detained are given sheets of paper, and the officers tell them: "Read this and report one another". That is their system. Tsurov and Adam were meant to give testimony against each other, but Adam refused. He said: "How could I say that I saw him in the rows of the fighters, when I never was there?"

Finally, he was accused for four crimes: terrorism, murder, illegal arms possession and attacks on federal security forces. They try to force him to confess that he participated in the 21-22 June armed raid on Ingushetia. Still, he denies all involvement and refuses to give any testimony before the beginning of the trial. Now his case has been transferred to an Ingush court. But we got all this information from other people, as we do not get any information from official sources. We do not even know, when the trial is scheduled to start.

Not only our relatives, but also our neighbors can testify that he was at home in the night of the 21st June. They wrote a letter confirming this.

Through lawyers and unofficial sources we got to know what happened in detention and how badly the inmates are treated. In a separate room they are beaten, cellophane bags are put on their heads, so that they cannot breathe, and they are tortured with electric shocks. They are told: "If you want to stay alive, you have to blacken this or that person".

We know that after the events in Beslan the security forces gave Adam pictures of some persons and told him to state that he knows them. At the same time they beat him. We called the Ingush Red Cross, but they said that there is a long queue of those who have to be visited in the pre-detention facilities.

We have engaged a lawyer, but he was not allowed to see Adam.

Extract from the letter of A. Parchiev's lawyer Beslan Bakhtiev to the Ombudsman of the Russian Federation, V.P. Lukin, from 10 August 2004:

I accepted to defend the rights and the interests of Adam Bagaudinovich Parchiev, case # 433, on 5 August 2004.

On 3 August at 6:30 p.m., Nazran police officers arrested the citizen of the Russian Federation and inhabitant of the Ingush Republic, Adam Bagaudinovich Parchiev. At the moment of the arrest the security forces did not present any justifications for the detention. Until 7 of August 2004, the authorities refused to provide the detainee and me with information on his whereabouts, which led me to write a complaint to the State Prosecutor's Office of the Republic of Ingushetia.

In contradiction to A.D. Parchiev's constitutional right on qualified judicial assistance, the senior investigator of the Northern Caucasus prosecutor's office, M.N. Lapotnikov, refused to accept me as A. Parchiev's defence counsel. He justified this step with the fact that I was called not by the detainee himself, but that his brother, Alikhan Parchiev, signed the contract and that there is no consent of the detainee to my assistance.

Meanwhile, the persecution organs involve the detainee in investigations without my assistance, which makes the evidence gained during these investigations inadmissible in court. Furthermore, I got the information that my client is exposed to physical and psychical pressure from the persecution organs.

A letter of the same content was two times addressed to the General Prosecutor's Office of the Russian Federation to the attention of V. Ustinov.

A trial against Adam Parchiev has started in the meantime. And as of the publication date of this report it is still ongoing.

2 October 2004. Mayskoe village. Illegal detention and beating of Magomed Khamkhoev (b.1980).

On 2 October 2004, four armed persons in a UAZ car (license plate includes the number 970, from the 15th region) arrived at Khamkhoev's house (Mayskoe, wagon 77) at 8:40 am. They asked Magomed (b.1980) to come out of the house and to get into their car "for a conversation" without presenting any documents. Magomed had to sit in the back between two men. As soon as the car drove away, the driver asked: "To the office or to the woods?" - "To the woods," was the answer.

The strangers began to question Magomed in the car, hitting him on the head. They asked where he was during the night of 21/22 June and if he had any relationship with the events in Beslan. They were not interested in Magomed's answers or explanations, continuing to beat and verbally abuse him. One of the men sitting next to him showed him a hand grenade and told him: "This was yours."

Magomed was taken to the woods in the area of the so-called Lysaya Gora, where he was taken out of the car and beaten with feet, hands and a gun-butt. He lost consciousness from the pain. When he regained it, he asked to be taken to a hospital. After this the beating became even more cruel.

After some time, he was told that he would no longer be beaten if he signed some documents. But as the men did not have these documents on them, they had to return to the village of Oktyabrskoye. Magomed was put in the car and abused again. In this village, one of the attackers went into an apartment building and came back with a document file. They told Magomed to sign the papers, but he asked to read them first. He was subjected to another cruel beating. He fainted again, and later woke up in the car. He was thrown out near the Mayskoe village at noon.

Khamkhoev was hospitalized in the Nazran hospital in a bad condition with the following diagnosis: closed brain wound, brain concussion, closed stomach wound, multiple wounds of soft tissues, head, spine, hands and feet.

From interview with Magomed Khamkhoev:

Until autumn 1992, we lived in the Oktyabrskoye village, Prigorodny region, North Ossetia. Then, after the conflict we lived in this small center for refugees in Mayskoe. I and my brother worked at construction sites, it's our income. Although after what happened it is much harder to work: I do not hear well, and my head is constantly hurting.

They came to my house in the morning and knocked on the window. My mother came out. They asked her to call me. I came out. There were four of them, all in civilian clothes, only the driver in camouflage, all armed. They did not introduce themselves, only said that they want to talk to me and offered me to get into their car. (Actually the previous day someone was also asking for me, but I was not at home.)

I got in. The inside of the car smelled like alcohol. They were drunk. They spoke Ossetian among themselves. The two between whom I was sitting began to beat me right away, asking me where I was on 21 June and during the events in Beslan.

On the night of 21 June we all went to the village police station to find out what was going on in Nazran. I was there, both people and policemen saw me.

I told them: "My father's brother was killed that night!" They answered: "You are all bandits, and your uncle was a Vakhabit too!"

When Beslan started, on 1 September, people came together with our policeman to check my passport. I think they checked all young men in the village that day. I tried to explain this, but they would not listen.

In the forest I was beaten and abused. It was such torture that if I could get away, I would jump from the precipice instead of surviving that! I asked them: "If you want to kill me, kill me, but do not torture me!"

When it got really bad, I asked: "Take me to a hospital!" One of them answered: "I am your hospital." And they began to beat even harder. I lost consciousness a number of times, then got it back again. This went on for 1 – 1.5 hours. Then a mobile phone rang. One of them picked up and asked: "What should we do with him now?" I heard the voice from the phone: "Kill him!"

I wish I knew what it was all for! I think they did it on purpose. They were without masks, and I remember their faces. They think that if I see them, I won't contain myself, I won't let it all slip away. And I would cause a conflict, which is what they need.

But they are mistaken.

On the third day, as soon as I regained consciousness in the hospital, I wrote to the prosecutor's office. The prosecutor of the Prigorodny district called and through a local policeman asked me to show up. But I got no summons to court. Only a phone number was passed to me through the village administration. It was written on a label from eggplant paste. I do not even know if a criminal case was started in Ossetia.

My mother was told that I should leave, that I am in danger to be killed. But where can I go? I live in a wagon with my family, I have only the money I make with my own hands. And now I am also ill.

November 2004. Mayskoe, Prigorodny district, North Ossetia. Psychological pressuring of Mamed Daskiev (b.1982) to become an informer

After the events of 21/22 June, the Daskiev house on Dzhabagiev Street became a place of interest for some unknown persons, who sometimes wore camouflage, sometimes regular civilian clothes. They began coming to the house and, without introducing themselves, asking about Mamed Daskiev (b.1982).

From the interview with Mamed's mother, Debikhan Daskieva:

We are double refugees. Before the conflict of 1992 we lived in the village of Kurtat. After the events in the Prigorodny region we moved to Grozny. In 1994, when the war started there as well, we moved here to Mayskoe.

We make our living by renting land, planting potatoes and then selling them. Due to constant wars, my children did not get a normal education. I have two sons, Mamed and Taisum. Taisum is handicapped because of his eyes.

When we first moved here, I registered my children at my parents' address, in the Plievo village, Ingushetia. I thought they would be better off like that.

After the events of 21/22 June, representatives of security services began to visit us. They already came four to five times. They change cars. Sometimes they drive a UAZ, sometimes a "Niva". Sometimes they wear civilian clothes, sometimes camouflage. Among them are Ossetians and Russians, and once an Ingushi was among them as well. But they never introduce themselves and do not show any documents.

During the night Ingushetia was attacked, Mamed was at Bagaudin Bekhkiev's wedding. It's not far from here, in a 5-storey building. He came home at dawn. After two weeks, these people arrived. They called Mamed and asked him: "Where were you that night? Why did you come

home so late?" He answered: "I was at a wedding. There are witnesses. I came home late because I was drunk and did not want my parents to see me like that."

They checked his registration of residence: "Why are you registered in Plievo and live here?" At this point, I couldn't stand it any longer. I came out and told them: "What do you want? Coming and scaring people!" It irritated them; they told me: "Watch out, you will regret this."

Our nerves are no longer stable, and it seems that is exactly what they want. They come, they do not show documents, they always ask for my sons: "Where is Mamed? Where is your Taisum?"

Taisum has problems with his eyes. He is trying to cure them in Rostov. He does not see without his glasses at all. How could he participate in those events with such a poor sight? Plus, Ingushetia's police can confirm that he was at home during the night of 21-22 June.

Once, Mamed exploded: "What do you want from me? So what if I am registered in Plievo? My parents live here. Don't I have a right to live with my parents?" As if they were waiting for this, they said: "Aha, get into the car, we will show you."

They put him into the car and took him to the Oktyabrskoye police station (ROVD), where he stayed from 10 am to 4 pm. They did not beat him there, but they offered him to work for them, to inform them where drug addicts lived, etc. He refused.

They know that he is not well educated, he finished only five or six grades. They gave him a paper and told him to write down his name. He did. Then, he asked: "Now what?" - "Nothing. Just sign at the bottom." He did. And now we do not know what they are writing on that piece of paper.

On 26 November at 3:30 pm, they came again. On a military UAZ. In civilian clothes. They called Mamed again. As always, no documents were presented. They asked the same questions: "Why are you not in the army?" - "I was not drafted." - "Why not? Do you have a registration of residence?"

They stood in the yard without entering: "Where is Taisum?" Mamed explained that Taisum had come home for the holidays in the middle of November and then returned to the hospital in Rostov. "Why do you need my brother?" - "There are reasons."

Then, they offered Mamed to accompany them to a sauna in Nazran. Of course, he refused. It is hard to understand what they want. It seems like they are looking for anything suspicious at all. Sometimes their car is standing at the corner. They keep us in constant tension. Everyone knows how many unjust things happen around us. How many boys are abducted, beaten, become handicapped. And people do not complain after this: they are afraid.

4 November 2004, Nalchik. Illegal detention of the juvenile Marina Korigova (b.1988)

On 4 November 2004, in the town of Nalchik (Kabardino-Balkaria), unidentified persons in camouflage uniforms detained Marina Korigova (b. 1988), residing in Ingushetia, Malgobek district, Sagopshi village, Tsetchoev street, and took her with them in an unknown direction. She is a student of the law faculty of the civil engineering college in Nalchik.

On 4 November, Marina did not come to school. When her classmates tried to figure out the reason for her absence, they were told that two men had come to the flat, which she rented in Nalchik, and had taken her with them. Who those men were and where they have taken Marina remained unknown.

Only one week after her disappearance, the prosecutor's office of the Malgobek district informed her parents that she was held in a pre-trial detention facility in Vladikavkaz. The girl drew suspicion upon her, because she received calls on her mobile phone from a mobile phone, which belonged to Musa Tsetchoev, one of the Beslan terrorists. Soon, the investigation found out that in both families all family members, long before the tragic events in Beslan, used the respective mobile phones. Tsetchoev is a neighbor and a distant relative of the Korigov family. Still, the girl was held in detention for unclear reasons. Soon, her parents were "informed" that she would be released if her brother, Ramzan Korigov, were to come to the North Ossetia prosecutor's office. Ramzan was not wanted by law enforcement bodies, neither did he hide from them; and he never received an official order to come to the investigators.

The detention of a juvenile girl had a resonance in the republic. President Zyazikov, Ingush senator Kostoev and several deputies of the Ingush Parliament inquired about Marina at the General Prosecutor's Office of the Russian Federation. The press became interested in the case as well.

An excerpt from an article published in the Russian daily newspaper *Kommersant* and titled "30 days in detention for making phone calls. An Ingush girl had to suffer for the Constitution":

(...) the only person detained for 'complicity' is a 16-year-old girl from the Ingush village Sagopshi, Marina Korigova. Yet, the girl's detention follows merely didactic aims, as admitted by the head of the investigation unit, Tkachev. "I have no intention to bring an accusation against her", -- explains Mr. Tkachev, -- 'she had all those problems only because she refused to co-operate with the investigation officers. We just asked the girl to tell us what she talked about with a terrorist on her mobile phone, and she refused to give any testimony. Then, we acted strictly according to the law and detained Marina for 30 days. We have this right according to the law on the fight against terrorism. Now, everything is perfectly clear – Marina had no conversations with fighters from the first to the third of September".

So, Marina just had bad luck that the Ingush families in Sagopshi have quite many members and quite low incomes. The problem is that the Siemens phone, which was found in the school in Beslan, and the Motorola phone, which was confiscated from Marina upon her detention, were both used by more than a dozen persons from the Korigov and Tsetchoev families.

"If she would have explained everything to us from the very beginning, then we would not have detained her at all" – states the head of the investigation unit, Igor Tkachev."¹⁶

So, the investigation authorities admitted that Marina Korigova was innocent, but they still continued to hold her in custody for "educational reasons". It is not difficult to imagine, what every additional day in jail means to a young girl. Furthermore, the investigation officer refers to the law on terrorism. Yet its implementation must not contradict the constitution or legal procedures, which is, however, exactly what happened in this case:

¹⁶ *Kommersant*, # 217 (# 3056), 19 November 2004, see at: <http://www.kommersant.ru/doc.html?DocID=526152&IssueId=18450>

- the girl's parents were not informed that their minor daughter was detained
- the girl was interrogated by investigation officers without presence of the parents or a representative of a specially empowered body (the district education administration).

Finally, on 23 November, the head of the Beslan investigation commission Alexandr Torshin stated in an interview on the radio station "Echo of Moscow" that Marina Korigova had been released. He said in particular: "There still are some questions to be answered but the fact that she is innocent is perfectly clear. The issue is closed." But still, the girl remained in prison. Some days later, Torshin gave another interview admitting that he had given wrong information because he had been misinformed himself.

A lawyer from Ingushetia, who prefers to remain anonymous, explained the real cause for Marina's detention:

"The authorities know very well that it is a tragedy for the whole family when their young girl is in prison. Therefore they hoped that they would give up and give their son in exchange for the daughter. They just asked for the son to come and give testimony, but they would do things to him and finally he would admit to having killed John F. Kennedy. The parents have to hold out for 30 days. Hopefully, their nerves will endure this..."

Excerpt from an interview with Marina Korigov's father:

This summer, Marina passed the federal university entrance exams and entered the faculty of law of a college in Nalchik. On 1 September, my sister and I brought her to Nalchik. There, we found a two-room apartment for her with another two girls near the bus station. We left our daughter there and returned home. Everything was OK. Marina began her studies and on weekends she returned home.

On 4 November, a young Ingush, who studies on the same faculty with Marina, called some friends of ours and told them that some men took Marina with them. And those friends repeated his words to us. I went to the police station of the Malgobek district, but they had no information at all. They called the police in Nazran – they were not informed either. Then, they promised to contact the police in Nalchik. When I came back the other day, there was still no reply from Nalchik. I wrote a complaint to the public prosecutor and sent a telegram to the Ingush deputies Kostoev and Ustinov. Three days after my letter to the prosecutor, on 11 November, Belkhoroev, the public prosecutor for the Malgobek district, called my brother, who works in the police force, and officially informed him that our daughter was suspected of involvement with terrorist and held in custody in Vladikavkaz. So, I hired a lawyer in Nazran, Sherip Tersaev, and my sister in Vladikavkaz hired another one, Janna Serdakova. On 14-15 November, my brother, the policeman, told me that an investigator from Vladikavkaz came to the Malgobek police station. I don't know his surname; his first name is Anzar.

I approached him, introduced myself and said: "She is a young girl; how can she know something? Perhaps I can help you?" He answered: "She does not tell us anything. We need to coerce her to talk." I asked him: "How do you want to coerce her? Let me come with you and she will tell me everything. Then, perhaps, you will find out some new details." He thought for a while and said to me: "I will return, discuss this with the others and then I will call you up."

But he did not call and did not tell me to come. On 19 November, I went with Tepsaev, my lawyer, to Vladikavkaz. We went to the prosecutor's office. The lawyer introduced me to the investigator who was in charge of the case.

Tepsaev told him: "This is the father of the girl. He is here to assist at the interrogation." But he just shrugged and said: "I do not need him. I do not need him as a father." He stood up and went off. I caught up with him at the stairs and said: "I am her father. What do you expect from my daughter? She does not know anything, she just cannot know anything. And you are saying she is involved with terrorists. She just does not know. If you need some information, perhaps I could help you. My brother, a police colonel, was killed by bandits not so long ago, so, how could she be linked to terrorists?" He then said: "I surely will not discuss those issues with you. " And went off.

Then, we read the article in the "Kommersant" and finally got to know what the whole story was about. Supposedly, Musa Tsetchoev had Marina's number in the address book of his mobile phone. That was not a new telephone, though. My sister had bought it already last spring. When we left Marina in Nalchik my sister gave her the phone, so that she could call home. It is true what they have written in the article – that phone was used virtually by the whole village. And Tsetchoev, a distant relative of us, lived three houses away from our house. He was a farmer, made hay and had some flour business. Who could know that he was a terrorist? The law enforcement structures should have known it and should have arrested him timely.

And now I was told that they wanted my son to come to them. But they did not send any official order, and my son is not hiding from them.

On 1 December 2004, even before the 30-day term elapsed, Marina Korigova was released. Her father signed a declaration that he did not have any claims against the authorities concerning his daughter's detention.

22 March 2005. Nalchik, Kabardino-Balkaria, and Vladikavkaz, North Ossetia. Unlawful detention, beatings, torture of Osman Bogatyrev (b.1976)

On 22 March 2005, Osman Bogatyrev, resident of Ingushetia, disappeared in Nalchik, capital of Kabardino-Balkaria. Osman's father, Abu Bogatyrev, reported that he put his son on the minibus to Nalchik, from where Osman intended to take the train to Moscow on the same day. At 11 a.m., Osman called his father and told him that he bought a ticket for the afternoon train to Moscow.

Two days later, the relative, who was to pick up Osman at the train station in Moscow, called to inform the parents that Osman was not on the train. Via unofficial channels, the family got the information that he was arrested by members of law enforcement structures and was detained in the FSB premises in Nalchik.

According to the Human Rights Center "Memorial", the Bogatyrev family learnt on 30 March that Osman had been transferred to the pre-trial detention facility of the Ministry of the Interior in Vladikavkaz, North Ossetia.

On 2 April, a lawyer hired by the parents managed, although with major difficulties, to arrange a meeting with his client. The lawyer stated that Osman Bogatyrev was subjected to ill-treatment – he was beaten several times -- and torture. The investigator, a certain Ruslan, who assisted at Osman’s meeting with the lawyer, refused access to the detainee’s file to the lawyer, saying that Osman Bogatyrev had another lawyer assigned by the authorities. Furthermore, the investigator refused to give Osman the possibility to speak privately with the lawyer.

As of 15 April, the lawyer had no information, which crime his client was accused of. Osman himself told that when he had been detained someone had planted a grenade in his bag.

1 April 2005. Malgobek, North Ossetia. Unlawful detention and torture of Hassan Egiev (b.1978)¹⁷

On 1 April at 3:30 p.m., in the village of Malgobek, North Ossetia, members of an unidentified armed structure abducted Hassan Egiev (b. 1978), residing 65, Kievskaya street.

Hassan Egiev’s mother reported that her son was arrested on the bus, on his way to a sheep farm in Voznesensk in the Malgobek district, where he intended to help her with work. Four or 6 cars (some of them -- UAZ) stopped the bus. Two armed men entered the bus, took Hassan Egiev, tied up his arms, dragged him out of the bus and drove him away in an unknown direction. Hassan only managed to call out his name to the people sitting in the bus.

For one day, the relatives did not know anything about Hassan’s whereabouts. He did not answer his mobile phone, although the phone was not turned off.

In the night of 2 April, Hassan Egiev’s cousin received a phone call from someone claiming to be Hassan’s lawyer. He told him that Hassan was in custody in a detention facility in Vladikavkaz (North Ossetia). Thereupon, the relatives hired the lawyer Kh. Yandieva.

On 6 April, Yandieva met Krivorotov, an investigator at the state prosecutor’s office and asked to have access to her client’s files. The investigator refused to show her the file and said: “*I have no doubts that Egiev is a bandit*”. At least, Yandieva could arrange a meeting with Hassan Egiev. He told her that when he had been arrested, someone had put a grenade into his pocket. During the interrogation, he was ill-treated and tortured. He was tied upside down to the ceiling, beaten with a bottle on his head, and had needles driven under his nails. Under torture, Hassan signed a paper where he confessed of having found the grenade. The lawyer described Hassan’s state as appalling: his face and body were covered with bruises and he could hardly move because of the beatings on his feet and severe injuries.

The lawyer filed a complaint on the ill-treatment and torture of his client with the Deputy Prosecutor General of the Russian Federation, N.I. Shepel, the head of the Prosecutor General's Department for the Northern Caucasus, N.Z. Khazikov, and the Prosecutor of North Ossetia, A.A. Bigulov. The relatives wrote complaints to the Prosecutor of Ingushetia, M. Kalimatov, and to the Ombudsman of Ingushetia, K.-S.A. Kokurkhaev.

¹⁷ Information provided by the Human Rights Centre „Memorial”

IV - Conclusion

The varied and disturbing cases described, demonstrate that the wide range of gross and systemic human rights violations which used to be localized in Chechnya have been steadily spilling out into the neighboring Ingushetia and then into other republics of the Northern Caucasus. The worsening of the human rights climate and the impunity of security forces for their lawless actions contribute to the over-all deterioration of the security situation in the entire Northern Caucasus region. These developments represent a serious danger to the Russian Federation and, consequently, to the European community as a whole.