



# General Assembly

Distr.: General  
30 July 2010

Original: English

---

## Human Rights Council

Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review

Ninth session

Geneva, 1-12 November 2010

### **Compilation prepared by the Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights in accordance with paragraph 15 (b) of the annex to Human Rights Council resolution 5/1**

#### **Bulgaria**

The present report is a compilation of the information contained in the reports of treaty bodies, special procedures, including observations and comments by the State concerned, and other relevant official United Nations documents. It does not contain any opinions, views or suggestions on the part of the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights (OHCHR), other than those contained in public reports issued by OHCHR. It follows the structure of the general guidelines adopted by the Human Rights Council. Information included herein has been systematically referenced in endnotes. The report has been prepared taking into consideration the four-year periodicity of the first cycle of the review. In the absence of recent information, the latest available reports and documents have been taken into consideration, unless they are outdated. Since this report only compiles information contained in official United Nations documents, lack of information or focus on specific issues may be due to non-ratification of a treaty and/or to a low level of interaction or cooperation with international human rights mechanisms.

## I. Background and framework

### A. Scope of international obligations<sup>1</sup>

<i>Universal human rights treaties<sup>2</sup></i>	<i>Date of ratification, accession or succession</i>	<i>Declarations /reservations</i>	<i>Recognition of specific competences of treaty bodies</i>
ICERD	8 August 1966	Declaration (arts. 17 and 18)	Individual complaints (art. 14): Yes
ICESCR	21 September 1970	Declaration (art. 26)	-
ICCPR	21 September 1970	Declaration (art. 48)	Inter-State complaints (art. 41): Yes
ICCPR-OP 1	26 March 1992	None	-
ICCPR-OP 2	10 August 1999	None	-
CEDAW	8 February 1982	None	-
OP-CEDAW	20 September 2006	None	Inquiry procedure (arts. 8 and 9): Yes
CAT	16 December 1986	None	Inter-State complaints (art. 21): Yes Individual complaints (art. 22): Yes Inquiry procedure (art. 20): Yes
CRC	3 June 1991	None	-
OP-CRC-AC	12 February 2002	Binding declaration under art. 3: 18 years	-
OP-CRC-SC	12 February 2002	None	-

*Core treaties to which Bulgaria is not a party: OP-ICESCR, OP-CAT, ICRMW, CRPD (signature only, 2007), CRPD-OP (signature only, 2008) and CED (signature only, 2008).*

<i>Other main relevant international instruments</i>	<i>Ratification, accession or succession</i>
Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide	Yes
Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court	Yes
Palermo Protocol <sup>3</sup>	Yes
Refugees and stateless persons <sup>4</sup>	Yes, except the 1954 and 1961 Conventions
Geneva Conventions of 12 August 1949 and Additional Protocols thereto <sup>5</sup>	Yes
ILO fundamental conventions <sup>6</sup>	Yes
UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education	Yes

1. In 2008, the Committee on the Rights of Child (CRC) recommended that Bulgaria ratify ICRMW, CED, CRPD and CRPD-OP, and OP-CAT.<sup>7</sup> In 2009, the Committee on Elimination of Racial Discrimination (CERD) encouraged Bulgaria to consider ratifying ICRMW.<sup>8</sup>

2. In 2010, UNHCR recommended that Bulgaria accede to the 1954 Convention relating to the Status of Stateless Persons, and the 1961 Convention on the Reduction of Statelessness.<sup>9</sup>

## **B. Constitutional and legislative framework**

3. In 2010, UNHCR indicated that international instruments ratified through the constitutionally established procedure would be considered part of the domestic legislation and prevail over any conflicting domestic legislation.<sup>10</sup> In 2009, CERD also noted this statement.<sup>11</sup>

4. In 2008, CRC was concerned that some aspects of the legislation were not consistent with the Convention, for example, with regard to family life and fair trial; Child Protection Act did not cover all areas of the Convention; and legislation was not effectively implemented in all areas of child's rights.<sup>12</sup>

5. CRC noted with appreciation the adoption of the Combating of Trafficking of Persons Act in 2003.<sup>13</sup> The ILO Committee of Experts on the Application of Conventions and Recommendations (ILO Committee of Experts) also noted with interest the adoption of this Act and the practical measures taken in this field.<sup>14</sup>

6. UNHCR noted the adoption of the Law on Protection against Discrimination in 2003.<sup>15</sup> CERD commended Bulgaria for the quality of legislation in relation to criminalizing acts of racial discrimination.<sup>16</sup>

7. UNHCR noted that legislation did not provide a legal definition of "stateless person" and that no legal framework or practical mechanism existed to determine whether a person is stateless.<sup>17</sup>

## **C. Institutional and human rights infrastructure**

8. Bulgaria does not have a national human rights institution accredited by the International Coordinating Committee of National Institutions for the Promotion and Protection of Human Rights (ICC).<sup>18</sup>

9. In 2004, the Committee against Torture (CAT) welcomed the entry into force of the Law on the Ombudsman (2004).<sup>19</sup> However, CRC regretted that the Ombudsman has not been accredited by the ICC.<sup>20</sup> It was concerned that the Office of the Ombudsman had no specific mandate to monitor, promote and protect the rights of the child.<sup>21</sup>

10. In 2009, CERD noted the establishment of various bodies and institutions with competence to combat discrimination, such as the Commission for Protection against Discrimination, the Ombudsman, and the National Council for Cooperation on Ethnic and Demographic Issues.<sup>22</sup> It recommended that Bulgaria strengthen the role of such bodies and institutions, in particular the Commission for Protection against Discrimination.<sup>23</sup> In 2010, the ILO Committee of Experts noted with interest that the Commission had increased its activities with regard to prevention of discrimination and adjudication of cases.<sup>24</sup>

## **D. Policy measures**

11. In 2005, Bulgaria adopted the United Nations Plan of Action (2005-2009) for the World Programme for Human Rights Education focusing on the national school system.<sup>25</sup>

12. CRC commended the programme's provision of free textbooks and meals for certain vulnerable groups of children. It also welcomed Bulgaria's declaration that education was a

priority for governmental policy, however it did not see this reflected in the budget allocations for education, which were still low.<sup>26</sup>

13. In 2008, UNDP noted that Bulgaria needed to systematically implement gender equality policy in all areas and that an important step would be the adoption of the Equal Opportunities Bill, which had been postponed since 2001.<sup>27</sup>

14. In 2007, ILO Committee of Experts noted the adoption of a National Action Plan for the Decade of Roma Inclusion (2005-15), which identifies education and employment as priority areas.<sup>28</sup> Nevertheless, CRC was concerned that the Programme for Equal Integration of Roma into Bulgarian Society lacked adequate strategic approach and sufficient coordination.<sup>29</sup> It recommended the provision of sufficient human resources, an adequate strategic approach, and effective coordination.<sup>30</sup>

15. CRC urged Bulgaria to develop mechanisms to adequately implement and review all plans of actions that were relevant for children.<sup>31</sup> While noting the increase in funds budgeted for child rights programmes, CRC was concerned about the inadequate annual State budget allocated for areas affecting children, which included health, education and social assistance. It recommended the prioritization of children's rights and welfare in Bulgaria's budget policy and a further increase in budget allocations for the implementation of the CRC, especially for health, education and family support.<sup>32</sup>

16. CERD noted with satisfaction the measures taken, and programmes implemented for the integration of persons belonging to minorities, the upbringing and education of Roma children, the promotion of the mother tongues of ethnic minorities, and the prevention of discrimination by State officials and the police against persons from ethnic minorities.<sup>33</sup>

## I. Promotion and protection of human rights on the ground

### A. Cooperation with human rights mechanisms

#### 1. Cooperation with treaty bodies

<i>Treaty body<sup>34</sup></i>	<i>Latest report submitted and considered</i>	<i>Latest concluding observations</i>	<i>Follow-up response</i>	<i>Reporting status</i>
CERD	2008	February 2009	Overdue since March 2010	Consolidated 20 <sup>th</sup> and 21 <sup>st</sup> report due 2012
CESCR	1996	November 1999	-	4 <sup>th</sup> and 5 <sup>th</sup> reports received in 2009
HR Committee	1993	July 1993	-	3 <sup>rd</sup> report received in 2009
CEDAW	1994	January 1998	-	4 <sup>th</sup> to 7 <sup>th</sup> reports due July 2010
CAT	2000	May 2004	Overdue since May 2005	Combined 4 <sup>th</sup> and 5 <sup>th</sup> report received in 2009
CRC	2007	May 2008	-	Consolidated 3 <sup>rd</sup> and 4 <sup>th</sup> report due July 2013.
OP-CRC-AC	2006	October 2007	-	-
OP-CRC-SC	2006	October 2007	-	-

## 2. Cooperation with special procedures

<i>Standing invitation issued</i>	Yes
<i>Latest visits or mission reports</i>	None
<i>Visits agreed upon in principle</i>	Special Rapporteur on the independence of judges and lawyers (in 2011); Independent expert on minority issues
<i>Visits requested and not yet agreed upon</i>	Special Rapporteur on the sale of children (requested in 2006); Special Rapporteur on freedom of religion (requested in 2006)
<i>Responses to letters of allegations and urgent appeals</i>	During the period under review, 8 communications were sent; the Government replied to 5 communications.
<i>Responses to questionnaires on thematic issues</i>	Bulgaria responded to 7 of the 23 questionnaires sent by special procedures mandate holders. <sup>35</sup>

## 3. Cooperation with the Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights

17. Bulgaria contributed financially to OHCHR in 2004, 2005, 2007 and 2008.<sup>36</sup>

## B. Implementation of international human rights obligations, taking into account applicable international humanitarian law

### 1. Equality and non-discrimination

18. In 2010, the ILO Committee of Experts noted that legislation reflected the assumption that the main responsibility for family care and the household lay with women, and therefore reinforced stereotypical attitudes regarding the roles of men and women, and existing gender inequality. It requested Bulgaria to, inter alia, ensure that measures were available to men and women workers with family responsibilities on an equal footing.<sup>37</sup>

19. UNDP indicated that there was horizontal gender segregation in the economy, where certain economic sectors tend to be “feminized,” but also vertical gender segregation, where a smaller percentage of women obtain leadership and management positions as compared to men.<sup>38</sup>

20. UNDP noted that the average wage for women fell behind the average wage for men.<sup>39</sup> In 2009 and 2010, the ILO Committee of Experts requested Bulgaria to provide information explaining the increase in the gender/wage gap in the public sector and the measures taken or envisaged to address this situation.<sup>40</sup>

21. CRC was concerned about the persistent discrimination against Roma children, children living in institutions, and children with disabilities, in particular with regard to access to education, health care and housing. CRC recommended that Bulgaria explicitly include specific provisions in its legislation to prohibit discrimination on the ground of disability, including in the Public Education Act.<sup>41</sup> It urged Bulgaria to, inter alia, initiate campaigns aimed at addressing the negative attitudes towards the Roma in society at large, and strengthen its efforts to remove discrimination.<sup>42</sup>

22. In 2007, the ILO Committee of Experts expressed concern about, inter alia, persisting labour market inequalities along ethnic lines, and reports of discriminatory practices against members of ethnic minorities, particularly Roma.<sup>43</sup> In 2010, it requested Bulgaria to, inter alia, continue and intensify its efforts to assess and monitor the employment situation of members of ethnic minority groups, particularly Roma and persons of Turkish origin.<sup>44</sup>

## 2. Right to life, liberty and security of the person

23. In 2004, CAT was concerned about the absence of a comprehensive definition of torture as set out in the Convention.<sup>45</sup> CAT also expressed concern over numerous allegations of ill-treatment of persons in custody, which might amount to torture and which disproportionately affected the Roma.<sup>46</sup> It recommended that Bulgaria strengthen the legal safeguards against ill-treatment and torture and pursue efforts to reduce incidents of ill-treatment by police and other officials.<sup>47</sup>

24. CERD was concerned at the cases of ill-treatment and excessive use of force by the police against persons from minority groups, in particular Roma. It encouraged Bulgaria to continue to take measures to combat abuse of authority and ill-treatment by the police against persons from minority groups, to ensure that such acts are prosecuted and punished, and to continue integrating Roma into the police.<sup>48</sup>

25. CRC expressed concern at the numerous allegations of children being ill-treated and the unavailability of data in this regard. It recommended that Bulgaria, inter alia, expand and facilitate children's ability to file complaints about ill-treatment in schools and detention centres, and ensure the prosecution of offences.<sup>49</sup>

26. While noting that corporal punishment was unlawful in the home, schools, the penal system, alternative care settings, and employment, CRC was concerned that children were still victims of corporal punishment in all of the above-mentioned settings.<sup>50</sup> It urged Bulgaria to enforce the ban on corporal punishment by, inter alia, promoting non-violent and participatory methods of child rearing and education, and bringing offenders before the competent administrative and judicial authorities.<sup>51</sup>

27. CRC was concerned at the increase in the rate of children subjected to abuse, including psychological, physical and sexual abuse, and that only a negligible number of cases reached the courts.<sup>52</sup> It recommended that Bulgaria, inter alia, develop and implement a comprehensive strategy for the prevention and reduction of child abuse and neglect, and prosecute and sentence perpetrators of these crimes.<sup>53</sup>

28. CERD expressed concern about acts of hatred and racism committed against members of minorities.<sup>54</sup> UNHCR made similar observations and referred to reported cases of vandalism of mosques and to anti-Semitism-related vandalism during the election campaign in July 2009.<sup>55</sup> CERD noted that the criminal provisions relating to racist acts were still infrequently applied.<sup>56</sup>

29. CRC expressed concern at the inadequate conditions prevailing in prisons and detention centres, including overpopulation and poor living conditions.<sup>57</sup> CAT was concerned about the poor material conditions of detention facilities.<sup>58</sup>

30. In 2006, a joint communication was sent by Special Rapporteurs on the sale of children, on trafficking of persons, and on violence against women regarding the trafficking of newborns from Bulgaria to neighbouring countries. Pregnant women, mostly from the Roma communities, were allegedly induced to travel to another country for work, where their newborn babies would be taken away and sold by members of criminal organizations.<sup>59</sup>

31. CRC remained concerned at the prevalence of human trafficking, especially of Roma children, young children and newborns.<sup>60</sup> It encouraged Bulgaria to, inter alia, continue and strengthen its awareness-raising campaigns and to increase protection provided to victims of trafficking.<sup>61</sup>

32. The ILO Committee of Experts noted that the Execution of Punishment Act contained a provision obliging prisoners to perform assigned work, and imposed disciplinary sanctions for the non-performance of work. It noted with interest Bulgaria's

statement that the principle of “voluntary nature of prison labour” would be introduced in the forthcoming amendments of the Act.<sup>62</sup>

33. CRC was concerned at the increase in the rate of children subjected to sexual exploitation and abuse, and that a negligible number of cases reach the courts.<sup>63</sup> It was also concerned that preventive measures against the exploitation of children, including prostitution, pornography and engagement of children in forced labour remained limited.<sup>64</sup> It recommended that Bulgaria, inter alia, identify the extent and root causes of sexual exploitation of children in order to facilitate the implementation of effective strategies; take measures to prosecute perpetrators of sexual exploitation of children and child abuse; and implement appropriate policies and targeted programs for the prevention, recovery and social reintegration of child victims.<sup>65</sup> CRC also encouraged Bulgaria to amend criminal law provisions so as to fully include all the offences regarding child prostitution and child pornography.<sup>66</sup>

34. CRC was concerned that there were a high number of children, predominantly Roma, living on the streets, and that street children were often placed in specialized institutions.<sup>67</sup> It urged Bulgaria to provide protection and assistance to street children and to elaborate and implement programmes to prevent children from leaving families and schools for the street.<sup>68</sup>

### **3. Administration of justice, including impunity, and the rule of law**

35. In 2008, CRC expressed concern that Bulgaria did not establish juvenile courts or chambers within existing settlements, and that the deprivation of liberty was not used as a means of last resort. It also expressed concern at the definition of “anti-social behaviour” and the high percentage of children placed in correctional-educational institutions.<sup>69</sup> It recommended that Bulgaria, inter alia, set up an adequate system of juvenile justice, including juvenile courts with specialized judges for children; use deprivation of liberty as a means of last resort, and amend the Criminal Procedural Code to withdraw the notion of anti-social behaviour.<sup>70</sup>

36. In 2008, regarding communication No. 257/2004 (*Nikolov vs. Bulgaria*), CAT found violations of articles 12 and 16 of the Convention related to the impartiality requirements of the investigation and ill-treatment by the police. It requested Bulgaria to provide the victim with an effective remedy, including fair and adequate compensation and medical rehabilitation.<sup>71</sup>

37. CAT expressed concern at the lack of an independent system to investigate complaints, and that allegations of ill-treatment were not always investigated promptly and impartially.<sup>72</sup> It recommended that Bulgaria establish an effective, reliable and independent complaint system to initiate prompt and impartial investigations into allegations of ill-treatment or torture, and to punish those found responsible.<sup>73</sup>

### **4. Right to privacy and family life**

38. CRC expressed concern at, inter alia, inadequate support provided to families with children, especially families in crisis situations, and the insufficient availability of family counselling services, parental education programmes, and professional staff trained to identify and address family problems.<sup>74</sup>

39. While noting Bulgaria’s efforts to deinstitutionalize children and to improve the situation of children in institutions, CRC was concerned at the limited progress achieved in reducing the large number of children, especially Roma children, placed in institutions. Furthermore, it was concerned at the insufficient and inadequately trained personnel working within these institutions, the inadequate budgetary allocations, and reports that many children lacking parental care. In particular, abandoned children were apprehended

and placed in the same closed facilities as children suspected or accused of criminal wrongdoing.<sup>75</sup>

40. CRC was concerned at the insufficient numbers and inadequate training provided to foster families, which resulted in a high proportion of children still placed in institutions. It was also concerned that coordination within the care system and the periodic review of placement were not a regular practice in all alternative care placements.<sup>76</sup>

41. CRC, while noting increased controls in the adoption process, was concerned about the insufficient resources provided to the central adoption authority, the high number of children awaiting adoption, and difficulties in placing Roma children. CRC recommended that Bulgaria strengthen the bodies dealing with the adoption process to, inter alia, ensure that Roma children are not discriminated against in the adoption process.<sup>77</sup>

**5. Freedom of religion or belief, expression, association and peaceful assembly, and right to participate in public and political life**

42. In 2009 the ILO Committee of Experts was of the view that the provisions of the Penal Code that stipulate sanctions of imprisonment for, inter alia, the propagation of “anti-democratic ideology,” using religion and church in propaganda against authorities, and conducting a public assembly, meeting or manifestation in violation of legislation were worded broadly enough to be used as a means of punishment for the expression of views.<sup>78</sup>

43. CERD was concerned about reports of the propagation by certain organizations, press and media outlets, and political parties of racist stereotypes and hatred towards persons belonging to minorities.<sup>79</sup> UNHCR made similar observations and indicated that a television network associated with a political party broadcast programs that targeted ethnic minorities and foreigners, and noted that there was no action taken against the television network, despite repeated complaints lodged by ethnic minorities’ representatives.<sup>80</sup> CERD recommended that Bulgaria penalize organizations, media and political parties that were guilty of such acts and promote tolerance among ethnic groups.<sup>81</sup>

**6. Right to work and to just and favourable conditions of work**

44. ILO Committee of Experts considered that the Labour Code permitted exceptions to the general standard of eight hours a day and 48 hours a week, which represented a real risk of abuse and a major threat for workers’ health and welfare.<sup>82</sup>

45. CRC welcomed the legislation restricting child labour and the development of a National Plan for Combating the Worst Forms of Child Labour. However, it was concerned at the large number of socially vulnerable children, especially Roma children, engaged in harmful and exploitative labour, particularly in agriculture, industry and domestic service.<sup>83</sup> It recommended that Bulgaria, inter alia, introduce monitoring mechanisms to ensure the enforcement of labour laws and protect children from economic exploitation.<sup>84</sup>

46. In 2008, the ILO Committee of Experts noted that the legislation granting work permission to persons under 18 years did not cover self-employed children. It requested Bulgaria to indicate the measures taken or envisaged to ensure the protection of self-employed children under 18 years.<sup>85</sup>

47. In 2008 and 2010, the ILO Committee of Experts noted the lack of legal protection for workers’ organizations against acts of interference by employers. It requested Bulgaria to take measures to ensure adequate protection against acts of interference by employers’ organizations.<sup>86</sup>

48. The ILO Committee of Experts considered that the requirement for organizations to be affiliated with a national organization in order to be able to conclude sectoral and branch-level collective agreements was incompatible with the principle of free and



voluntary collective bargaining. It requested Bulgaria to amend the Labour Code to eliminate this requirement.<sup>87</sup>

## 7. Right to social security and an adequate standard of living

49. In 2008, UNDP noted that major issues still persisted in the health-care sector where the management, efficiency and effectiveness of health services fail to meet the needs and expectations of the people.<sup>88</sup>

50. In 2008, CRC remained concerned at the limited and inequitable access to adequate health-care services, especially for Roma children and children in rural areas, reflected, inter alia, in the relatively high infant mortality rate, and segregation of Roma patients in hospitals. It recommended that Bulgaria, inter alia, develop a comprehensive programme to improve mother and child health, ensure that the Roma population and other vulnerable groups have equitable access to health services, and take steps to end segregation in hospitals.<sup>89</sup>

51. UNICEF noted that in areas with predominantly Roma or Turkish minority populations, the mortality rates of children under the age of five were twice the national average.<sup>90</sup> UNDP mentioned that underweight births were far more frequent among socially disadvantaged groups and adolescent mothers.<sup>91</sup> UNICEF indicated that vaccination coverage was above 96 per cent, except among Roma children, and 5 per cent of Roma children were not immunized against vaccine-preventable diseases.<sup>92</sup>

52. CRC was concerned about the high rate of early pregnancies and the high abortion rate among adolescents. Furthermore, it was concerned that the legal minimum age for medical treatment without parental consent was set at 16 years.<sup>93</sup>

53. UNICEF mentioned that incidence of HIV/AIDS was low, but there was little public awareness of how the virus is spread, especially in rural communities.<sup>94</sup> Nevertheless, CRC was concerned at the increase in the rates of sexually transmitted diseases (STDs), particularly syphilis and HIV/AIDS, amongst adolescents.<sup>95</sup> It recommended that Bulgaria, strengthen its preventive efforts by conducting campaigns and educational programmes, particularly within schools, in order to raise awareness on STDs and prevention methods.<sup>96</sup>

54. In 2009, a joint communication was sent by three special procedures mandate holders regarding the reported forced eviction and housing demolition of 40 Roma households. According to allegations, no meaningful consultation was held with the communities prior to the evictions, and no affected family was offered alternative housing.<sup>97</sup>

55. UNDP stated that urban and rural water supply systems covered 98.9 per cent of the population, however, establishment of sewerage networks and waste-water treatment facilities fell behind progress made in the water supply system.<sup>98</sup>

56. CRC noted that a large percentage of the population, especially children under 15 years, and Roma and Turkish children lived in poverty and social isolation, and were deprived of equal opportunities and access to essential services.<sup>99</sup> UNDP indicated that the Roma community continued to face several combined poverty risks stemming from low education, unemployment, poor housing and living conditions, life in underdeveloped rural regions, and large households.<sup>100</sup> CRC recommended that Bulgaria reinforce its efforts to alleviate poverty and to ensure support and material assistance with particular focus on the most marginalised and disadvantaged children and their families.<sup>101</sup>

## 8. Right to education and to participate in the cultural life of the community

57. UNICEF stated that primary school enrolment rates were above 95 per cent, except among the Roma community.<sup>102</sup> UNDP also referred to the high enrolment rate in primary education (97.8 per cent for elementary school and 83.7 per cent for junior high school).<sup>103</sup>

58. Human Rights Education was included in the National Educational Requirements for “civic education,” an interdisciplinary element of mandatory general education in schools.<sup>104</sup> However, CRC expressed concern that, inter alia, human rights and the child’s rights were still not included in the curricula at all education levels.<sup>105</sup>

59. UNDP referred to studies indicating that the quality of education in elementary schools was very good, but dropped in junior high schools.<sup>106</sup> It stated that factors such as, inter alia, lack of an independent system to evaluate the quality of education, and ineffective teachers’ qualification and career development system had a direct impact on the quality of education.<sup>107</sup> CRC also expressed concern about the quality of education<sup>108</sup> and recommended that it be improved it by, inter alia, the introduction of interactive teaching methods and teacher training.<sup>109</sup>

60. CRC noted that the high drop-out rates were not decreasing and that over 25 per cent of the children in rural areas did not even finish 8<sup>th</sup> grade.<sup>110</sup> UNDP noted disparities in terms of school attendance and quality of education for children living in cities and those in rural regions. Disparity was particularly noted for children from high mountain villages, who study in mixed classes in which 1<sup>st</sup> to 4<sup>th</sup> grade pupils are grouped together, and where children could not attend school regularly in winter, due to poor infrastructure.<sup>111</sup>

61. UNDP noted that the highest number of children outside the educational system, and the highest percentage of dropouts belong to the Roma minority.<sup>112</sup> UNICEF noted that nearly three quarters of school dropouts were Roma children.<sup>113</sup>

62. CRC noted Bulgaria’s efforts to better integrate Roma children in mainstream schools, but it remained concerned at the limited success of the efforts.<sup>114</sup> UNDP noted that Roma children accounted for more than 50 per cent of students in segregated schools. However, it also noted data indicating a growing inclusion of Roma members in mainstream education over the past couple of years.<sup>115</sup> CERD was concerned about the former practice of placing Roma children in special schools reserved for children with disabilities.<sup>116</sup> CRC recommended that Bulgaria strengthen its efforts to integrate Roma children into the general school system by, inter alia, enhanced teacher training and appropriate teaching and learning methods.<sup>117</sup>

63. In 2009, the Special Rapporteur on the right to education transmitted a communication concerning children with disabilities who received no effective education due to disability-based discrimination. It was reported that a very limited number of children living in Homes for Mentally Disabled Children (HMDC) were enrolled in schools and that mainstream schools were not adapted to accommodate these children’s needs. The educational system allegedly denied these children the right to education and the denial was discriminatory. The Government responded that, inter alia, it has made a concerted effort to implement policies on the issue, and that the situation had improved since 2005.<sup>118</sup>

64. CRC was concerned at the ongoing shortage of resources for the development of educational, social and health services for children with disabilities in their own living environment.<sup>119</sup> It was also concerned that many children with disabilities were still regarded as uneducable, and lived in special boarding schools which did not receive additional resources to assist these children appropriately.<sup>120</sup> CRC recommended that Bulgaria, inter alia, include children with disabilities in the general school system and reduce the number of schools for children with special educational needs to the unavoidable minimum.<sup>121</sup>

## 9. Minorities and indigenous peoples

65. CERD was concerned about the obstacles encountered by the Roma with regard to access to work, housing, health care and education. It recommended that Bulgaria continue to take positive measures to improve the living conditions of Roma with regard to access to work, health care, housing and education.<sup>122</sup>

66. CERD was concerned about the low representation of persons from certain minority groups, particularly Roma, in the various public administrations, army and police force, which may be due to discriminatory practices during selection and recruitment.<sup>123</sup>

67. CERD noted the measures aimed at promoting the teaching of the mother tongues of the various ethnic communities. It recommended that Bulgaria further develop structures and means for teaching ethnic communities their mother tongues.<sup>124</sup>

## 10. Migrants, refugees and asylum-seekers

68. In 2004, CAT welcomed the entry into force of the new Law on Asylum and Refugees (2002) and the establishment of the State Agency for Refugees as the single central refugee authority deciding on asylum.<sup>125</sup>

69. UNHCR was concerned that Bulgaria did not sufficiently distinguish asylum-seekers from illegal migrants.<sup>126</sup> UNHCR expressed concern about the legislation which stipulated that all asylum-seekers who lodged an asylum application at the borders, and who appeared to have entered Bulgaria illegally should be transferred by border guards to the Special Centre for Temporary Accommodation of Foreigners, not to the registration and reception centres (RRC) of the State Agency of Refugees (SAR). UNHCR stated that the legislation violated the rights of asylum-seekers, and recommended that it be amended.<sup>127</sup>

70. UNHCR also noted that since September 2009 all asylum-seekers have been first transferred from the borders to the SCTAF in Busmantzi, instead of to the RRC of SAR. Living conditions at SAR RRCs were still inadequate.<sup>128</sup> UNHCR recommended that Bulgaria, inter alia, take steps to introduce substantial improvements in the reception and living conditions of asylum-seekers and refugees at SAR RRCs in Sofia and Banya, in order to fully give meaning to the right to an adequate standard of living.<sup>129</sup>

71. UNHCR noted the inadequacy of safeguards relating to respect of the “non-refoulement” principle and expressed concern about an incident of “refoulement” which occurred in 2009.<sup>130</sup> In 2004, CAT recommended that Bulgaria, inter alia, ensure that no person is expelled, returned or extradited to a country where there are substantial grounds for believing that he/she would be in danger of being subjected to torture, and that exceptional circumstances are not invoked as justification for so doing.<sup>131</sup>

72. UNHCR noted that SAR continued the implementation of the National Programme for Integration of Refugees. In this respect it identified the need to improve the quality of the Bulgarian language training for refugees, and the importance of providing adequate Bulgarian language training for refugee children so as to facilitate their future enrolment in schools.<sup>132</sup>

## III. Achievements, best practices, challenges and constraints

73. In 2009, while welcoming the progress made in strengthening democracy and the rule of law, CERD was aware of the efforts that Bulgaria needed to make, in particular to enhance the independence of the judiciary and eliminate corruption.<sup>133</sup>

74. In 2008, CRC was concerned at the reported corruption in Bulgaria.<sup>134</sup> In a 2008 report, United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime noted that corruption was considered the

main social problem in Bulgaria, and referred to a study suggesting that corruption was on the increase, and that the majority of cases remained unresolved.<sup>135</sup>

#### IV. Key national priorities, initiatives and commitments

##### Specific recommendations for follow-up

75. CERD requested Bulgaria to provide information on its follow-up to the recommendations contained in paragraphs 13 (Roma children in school), 15 (discrimination of the Roma), 16 (ill-treatment of the Roma) and 18 (racist organizations) within one year of the adoption of the present concluding observations.<sup>136</sup> No response has been received.

76. CAT requested Bulgaria to provide, within one year, information in response to the Committee's recommendations in paragraph 6(b) (safeguards to the Code of Criminal Procedure), 6(c) (complaints procedure for allegations of ill-treatment), 6(d) (legal counsel), 6(i) (detention conditions) and 6(k) (review of life sentences).<sup>137</sup> No response has been received.

#### V. Capacity-building and technical assistance

77. CRC recommended that Bulgaria seek technical cooperation from various UN agencies with regard to implementing the recommendations of the United Nations Study on violence against children,<sup>138</sup> establishing a juvenile justice system,<sup>139</sup> effective prevention in the areas covered by OP-CRC-SC, and implementing awareness-raising campaigns on all areas covered by the Optional Protocol.<sup>140</sup>

#### Notes

<sup>1</sup> Unless indicated otherwise, the status of ratifications of instruments listed in the table may be found in Multilateral Treaties Deposited with the Secretary-General: Status as at 31 December 2006 (ST/LEG/SER.E.25), supplemented by the official website of the United Nations Treaty Collection database, Office of Legal Affairs of the United Nations Secretariat, <http://treaties.un.org/>

<sup>2</sup> The following abbreviations have been used for this document:

ICERD	International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial	Discrimination
ICESCR	International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights	
OP-ICESCR	Optional Protocol to ICESCR	
ICCPR	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights	
ICCPR-OP 1	Optional Protocol to ICCPR	
ICCPR-OP 2	Second Optional Protocol to ICCPR, aiming at the abolition of the death	penalty
CEDAW	Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women	
OP-CEDAW	Optional Protocol to CEDAW	
CAT	Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment	
OP-CAT	Optional Protocol to CAT	
CRC	Convention on the Rights of the Child	
OP-CRC-AC	Optional Protocol to CRC on the involvement of children in armed conflict	
OP-CRC-SC	Optional Protocol to CRC on the sale of children, child prostitution and child pornography	

ICRMW	International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families
CRPD	Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities
OP-CRPD	Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities
CED	International Convention for the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearance

- <sup>3</sup> Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children, supplementing the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime.
- <sup>4</sup> 1951 Convention relating to the Status of Refugees and its 1967 Protocol; 1954 Convention relating to the status of Stateless Persons; and 1961 Convention on the Reduction of Statelessness.
- <sup>5</sup> Geneva Convention for the Amelioration of the Condition of the Wounded and Sick in Armed Forces in the Field (First Convention); Geneva Convention for the Amelioration of the Condition of Wounded, Sick and Shipwrecked Members of Armed Forces at Sea (Second Convention); Convention relative to the Treatment of Prisoners of War (Third Convention); Convention relative to the Protection of Civilian Persons in Time of War (Fourth Convention); Protocol Additional to the Geneva Conventions of 12 August 1949, and relating to the Protection of Victims of International Armed Conflicts (Protocol I); Protocol Additional to the Geneva Conventions of 12 August 1949, and relating to the Protection of Victims of Non-International Armed Conflicts (Protocol II); Protocol Additional to the Geneva Conventions of 12 August 1949, and relating to the Adoption of an Additional Distinctive Emblem (Protocol III). For the official status of ratifications, see Federal Department of Foreign Affairs of Switzerland, at [www.eda.admin.ch/eda/fr/home/topics/intla/intrea/chdep/warvic.html](http://www.eda.admin.ch/eda/fr/home/topics/intla/intrea/chdep/warvic.html).
- <sup>6</sup> International Labour Organization Convention No. 29 concerning Forced or Compulsory Labour; Convention No. 105 concerning the Abolition of Forced Labour, Convention No. 87 concerning Freedom of Association and Protection of the Right to Organize; Convention No. 98 concerning the Application of the Principles of the Right to Organize and to Bargain Collectively; Convention No. 100 concerning Equal Remuneration for Men and Women Workers for Work of Equal Value; Convention No. 111 concerning Discrimination in Respect of Employment and Occupation; Convention No. 138 concerning the Minimum Age for Admission to Employment; Convention No. 182 concerning the Prohibition and Immediate Action for the Elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labour.
- <sup>7</sup> CRC/C/BGR/CO/2, 23 June 2008, para. 73.
- <sup>8</sup> CERD/C/BGR/CO/19, 23 March 2009, para. 21.
- <sup>9</sup> UNHCR submission to the UPR on Bulgaria, p. 8.
- <sup>10</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 1.
- <sup>11</sup> CERD/C/BGR/CO/19, 23 March 2009, para. 4.
- <sup>12</sup> CRC/C/BGR/CO/2, 23 June 2008, para. 8.
- <sup>13</sup> CRC/C/OPSC/BGR/CO/1, 21 January 2008, para. 4.
- <sup>14</sup> ILO Committee of Experts on the Application of Conventions and Recommendations, Individual Direct Request concerning Forced Labour Convention, 1930 (No. 29), 2009, Geneva, doc. No. (ILOLEX) 092009BGR029, 1<sup>st</sup> para.
- <sup>15</sup> UNHCR submission to the UPR on Bulgaria, p. 1.
- <sup>16</sup> CERD/C/BGR/CO/19, 23 March 2009, para. 6.
- <sup>17</sup> UNHCR submission to the UPR on Bulgaria, p. 3.
- <sup>18</sup> For the list of national human rights institutions with accreditation status granted by the International Coordinating Committee of National Institutions for the Promotion and Protection of Human Rights (ICC), see A/HRC/10/55, annex I.
- <sup>19</sup> CAT/C/CR/32/6, 11 June 2004, para. 4.
- <sup>20</sup> CRC/C/BGR/CO/2, 23 June 2008, para. 14.
- <sup>21</sup> *Ibid.*, para. 14.
- <sup>22</sup> CERD/C/BGR/CO/19, 23 March 2009, para. 7.
- <sup>23</sup> *Ibid.*, para. 12.
- <sup>24</sup> ILO Committee of Experts on the Application of Conventions and Recommendations, Individual

- Observation concerning Discrimination (Employment and Occupation) Convention, 1958 (No. 111), 2010, Geneva, doc. No. (ILOLEX) 062010BGR111, 1<sup>st</sup> para.
- <sup>25</sup> See General Assembly resolution 59/113B and Human Rights Council resolutions 6/24, 10/3 and 12/4. See also letters from the High Commissioner for Human Rights dated 9 January 2006 and 10 December 2007, letters from the Permanent Mission of Bulgaria and the Ministry of Education and Science of Bulgaria dated 7 June 2006 and 26 March 2008 respectively, at <http://www2.ohchr.org/english/issues/education/training/Summary-national-initiatives2005-2009.htm>, and the response of the Permanent Mission of Bulgaria to the questionnaire of the Human Rights Council Advisory Committee on the issue of the draft UN declaration on human rights education and training dated 8 March 2009, available at [http://www.2/ohchr.org.english/bodies/hrCouncil/advisorycommittee/HR\\_education\\_training.htm](http://www.2/ohchr.org.english/bodies/hrCouncil/advisorycommittee/HR_education_training.htm).
- <sup>26</sup> CRC/C/BGR/CO/2, 23 June 2008, para. 55.
- <sup>27</sup> UNDP, Millennium Development Goals Report, Bulgaria, 2008, available at [http://www.undp.bg/uploads/documents/2691\\_852\\_en.pdf](http://www.undp.bg/uploads/documents/2691_852_en.pdf), p. 72.
- <sup>28</sup> ILO Committee of Experts on the Application of Conventions and Recommendations, Individual Observation concerning Discrimination (Employment and Occupation) Convention, 1958 (No. 111), 2007, Geneva, doc. No. (ILOLEX) 062007BGR111, 5th para.
- <sup>29</sup> CRC/C/BGR/CO/2, 23 June 2008, para. 24.
- <sup>30</sup> *Ibid.*, para. 25.
- <sup>31</sup> *Ibid.*, para. 13.
- <sup>32</sup> *Ibid.*, para. 17.
- <sup>33</sup> CERD/C/BGR/CO/19, 23 March 2009, para. 8.
- <sup>34</sup> The following abbreviations have been used for this document:
- |              |  |
|--------------|--|
| CERD         | Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination  |
| CESCR        | Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights  |
| HR Committee | Human Rights Committee   |
| CEDAW        | Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women                                   |
| CAT          | Committee against Torture  |
| CRC          | Committee on the Rights of the Child   |
| CMW          | Committee on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families |
| CRPD         | Committee on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities   |
- <sup>35</sup> The questionnaires referred to are those reflected in an official report by a special procedure mandate holder issued between 1 January 2006 and 30 June 2010. Responses counted for the purposes of this section are those received within the relevant deadlines, and referred to in the following documents: (a) E/CN.4/2006/62, para. 24, and E/CN.4/2006/67, para. 22; (b) A/HRC/4/23, para. 14; (c) A/HRC/4/24, para. 9; (d) A/HRC/4/29, para. 47; (e) A/HRC/4/31, para. 24; (f) A/HRC/4/35/Add.3, para. 7; (g) A/HRC/6/15, para. 7; (h) A/HRC/7/6, annex; (i) A/HRC/7/8, para. 35; (j) A/HRC/8/10, para.120, footnote 48; (k) A/62/301, paras. 27, 32, 38, 44 and 51; (l) A/HRC/10/16 and Corr.1, footnote 29; (m) A/HRC/11/6, annex; (n) A/HRC/11/8, para. 56; (o) A/HRC/11/9, para. 8, footnote 1; (p) A/HRC/12/21, para.2, footnote 1; (q) A/HRC/12/23, para. 12; (r) A/HRC/12/31, para. 1, footnote 2; (s) A/HRC/13/22/Add.4; (t) A/HRC/13/30, para. 49; (u) A/HRC/13/42, annex I; (v) A/HRC/14/25, para. 6, footnote 1; (w) A/HRC/14/31, para. 5, footnote 2.
- <sup>36</sup> OHCHR, 2008 Report on Activities and Results, p. 188.
- <sup>37</sup> ILO Committee of Experts on the Application of Conventions and Recommendations, Individual Direct Request concerning Workers with Family Responsibilities Convention, 1981 (No. 156), 2010, Geneva, doc. no. (ILOLEX) 092010BGR156, 3<sup>rd</sup> para.
- <sup>38</sup> UNDP, Millennium Development Goals Report, Bulgaria, 2008, available at [http://www.undp.bg/uploads/documents/2691\\_852\\_en.pdf](http://www.undp.bg/uploads/documents/2691_852_en.pdf), p. 30.
- <sup>39</sup> *Ibid.*
- <sup>40</sup> ILO Committee of Experts on the Application of Conventions and Recommendations, Individual Direct Request concerning Equal Remuneration Convention, 1951 (No. 100), 2009, Geneva, doc. No. (ILOLEX) 092009BGR100, 1<sup>st</sup> para.; also ILO Committee of Experts on the Application of Conventions and Recommendations, Individual Direct Request concerning Equal Remuneration Convention, 1951 (No. 100), 2010, Geneva, doc. No. (ILOLEX) 092010BGR100, 1<sup>st</sup> para.

- 41 CRC/C/BGR/CO/2, 23 June 2008, paras. 24-25.
- 42 Ibid., para. 72.
- 43 ILO Committee of Experts on the Application of Conventions and Recommendations, Individual Observation concerning Discrimination (Employment and Occupation) Convention, 1958 (No.111), 2007, Geneva, doc. No. (ILOLEX) 062007BGR111, 2<sup>nd</sup>-4<sup>th</sup> paras.
- 44 ILO Committee of Experts on the Application of Conventions and Recommendations, Individual Observation concerning Discrimination (Employment and Occupation) Convention, 1958 (No. 111), 2010, Geneva, doc. No. (ILOLEX) 062010BGR111, 6<sup>th</sup> para.
- 45 CAT/C/CR/32/6, 11 June 2004, paras 5- 6.
- 46 Ibid., para. 5.
- 47 Ibid., para. 6.
- 48 CERD/C/BGR/CO/19, 23 March 2009, para. 16.
- 49 CRC/C/BGR/CO/2, 23 June 2008, para. 29.
- 50 Ibid., para. 31.
- 51 Ibid., para. 32.
- 52 Ibid., para. 41.
- 53 Ibid., para. 42.
- 54 CERD/C/BGR/CO/19, 23 March 2009, para. 18.
- 55 UNHCR submission to the UPR on Bulgaria, p. 7.
- 56 CERD/C/BGR/CO/19, 23 March 2009, para. 17.
- 57 CRC/C/BGR/CO/2, 23 June 2008, para. 68
- 58 CAT/C/CR/32/6, 11 June 2004, para. 6.
- 59 A/HRC/4/31/Add.1, paras. 32-33; A/HRC/4/34/Add.1, paras. 118-119; A/HRC/4/23/Add.1, paras. 55-56.
- 60 CRC/C/BGR/CO/2, 23 June 2008, para. 65.
- 61 Ibid., para. 66.
- 62 ILO Committee of Experts on the Application of Conventions and Recommendations, Individual Direct Request concerning Forced Labour Convention, 1930 (No. 29), 2009, Geneva, doc. No. (ILOLEX) 092009BGR029, 3<sup>rd</sup>-4<sup>th</sup> paras.
- 63 CRC/C/BGR/CO/2, 23 June 2008, para. 63.
- 64 CRC/C/OPSC/BGR/CO/1, 21 January 2008, para. 19.
- 65 CRC/C/BGR/CO/2, 23 June 2008, para. 64.
- 66 CRC/C/OPSC/BGR/CO/1, 21 January 2008, para. 24.
- 67 CRC/C/BGR/CO/2, 23 June 2008, para. 61.
- 68 Ibid., para. 62.
- 69 Ibid., para. 68.
- 70 Ibid., para. 69.
- 71 Communication No. 257/2004 (*Nikolov vs. Bulgaria*), CAT/C/41/D/257/2004.
- 72 CAT/C/CR/32/6, 11 June 2004, para. 5.
- 73 Ibid., para. 6.
- 74 CRC/C/BGR/CO/2, 23 June 2008, para. 34.
- 75 Ibid., para. 39.
- 76 Ibid., para. 35.
- 77 Ibid., para. 38.
- 78 ILO Committee of Experts on the Application of Conventions and Recommendations, Individual Direct Request concerning Abolition of Forced Labour Convention, 1957 (No. 105), 2009, Geneva, doc. No. (ILOLEX) 092009BGR105, 3rd para.
- 79 CERD/C/BGR/CO/19, 23 March 2009, para. 18.
- 80 UNHCR submission to the UPR on Bulgaria, p. 7.
- 81 CERD/C/BGR/CO/19, 23 March 2009, para. 18.
- 82 ILO Committee of Experts on the Application of Conventions and Recommendations ,Individual Direct Request concerning Hours of Work (Industry) Convention, 1919 (No. 1), 2010,Geneva, doc. No. (ILOLEX) 092010BGR001, 1<sup>st</sup> para.
- 83 CRC/C/BGR/CO/2, 23 June 2008, para. 59.
- 84 Ibid., para. 60.
- 85 ILO Committee of Experts on the Application of Conventions and Recommendations, Individual

- Direct Request concerning Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention, 1999 (No.182), 2008, Geneva, doc. No. (ILOLEX) 092008BGR182, 5<sup>th</sup> para.
- <sup>86</sup> ILO Committee of Experts on the Application of Conventions and Recommendations, Individual Observation concerning Right to Organise and Collective Bargaining Convention, 1949 (No. 98), 2008, Geneva, doc. No. (ILOLEX) 062008BGR098, 2<sup>nd</sup> para.; and ILO Committee of Experts on the Application of Conventions and Recommendations, Individual Observation concerning Right to Organise and Collective Bargaining Convention, 1949 (No. 98), 2010, Geneva, doc. No. (ILOLEX) 062010BGR098, 2<sup>nd</sup> para.
- <sup>87</sup> ILO Committee of Experts on the Application of Conventions and Recommendations, Individual Observation concerning Right to Organise and Collective Bargaining Convention, 1949 (No. 98), 2008, Geneva, doc. No. (ILOLEX) 062008BGR098, 3<sup>rd</sup> para.; and ILO Committee of Experts on the Application of Conventions and Recommendations, Individual Observation concerning Right to Organise and Collective Bargaining Convention, 1949 (No. 98), 2010, Geneva, doc. No. (ILOLEX) 062010BGR098, 3<sup>rd</sup> para.
- <sup>88</sup> UNDP, Millennium Development Goals Report, Bulgaria, 2008, available at [http://www.undp.bg/uploads/documents/2691\\_852\\_en.pdf](http://www.undp.bg/uploads/documents/2691_852_en.pdf), p. 6.
- <sup>89</sup> CRC/C/BGR/CO/2, 23 June 2008, para. 46.
- <sup>90</sup> UNICEF, Bulgaria Background, available at [http://www.unicef.org/infobycountry/bulgaria\\_background.html](http://www.unicef.org/infobycountry/bulgaria_background.html).
- <sup>91</sup> UNDP, Millennium Development Goals Report, Bulgaria, 2008, available at [http://www.undp.bg/uploads/documents/2691\\_852\\_en.pdf](http://www.undp.bg/uploads/documents/2691_852_en.pdf), p. 39.
- <sup>92</sup> UNICEF, Bulgaria Background, available at [http://www.unicef.org/infobycountry/bulgaria\\_background.html](http://www.unicef.org/infobycountry/bulgaria_background.html).
- <sup>93</sup> CRC/C/BGR/CO/2, 23 June 2008, para. 47.
- <sup>94</sup> UNICEF, Bulgaria Background, available at [http://www.unicef.org/infobycountry/bulgaria\\_background.html](http://www.unicef.org/infobycountry/bulgaria_background.html).
- <sup>95</sup> CRC/C/BGR/CO/2, 23 June 2008, para. 51.
- <sup>96</sup> Ibid, para. 52.
- <sup>97</sup> A/HRC/13/20/Add. 1, para. 13.
- <sup>98</sup> UNDP, Millennium Development Goals Report, Bulgaria, 2008, available at [http://www.undp.bg/uploads/documents/2691\\_852\\_en.pdf](http://www.undp.bg/uploads/documents/2691_852_en.pdf), p. 59.
- <sup>99</sup> CRC/C/BGR/CO/2, 23 June 2008, para. 53.
- <sup>100</sup> UNDP, Millennium Development Goals Report, Bulgaria, 2008, available at [http://www.undp.bg/uploads/documents/2691\\_852\\_en.pdf](http://www.undp.bg/uploads/documents/2691_852_en.pdf), p. 13.
- <sup>101</sup> CRC/C/BGR/CO/2, 23 June 2008, para. 54.
- <sup>102</sup> UNICEF, Bulgaria Background, available at [http://www.unicef.org/infobycountry/bulgaria\\_background.html](http://www.unicef.org/infobycountry/bulgaria_background.html).
- <sup>103</sup> UNDP, Millennium Development Goals, Bulgaria, 2008, available at [http://www.undp.bg/uploads/documents/2691\\_852\\_en.pdf](http://www.undp.bg/uploads/documents/2691_852_en.pdf), p. 18.
- <sup>104</sup> See General Assembly resolution 59/113B and Human Rights Council resolutions 6/24, 10/3 and 12/4. See also letters from the High Commissioner for Human Rights dated 9 January 2006 and 10 December 2007, letters from the Permanent Mission of Bulgaria and the Ministry of Education and Science of Bulgaria dated 7 June 2006 and 26 March 20080 respectively, at <http://www2.ohchr.org/english/issues/education/training/Summary-national-initiatives2005-2009.htm>, and the response of the Permanent Mission of Bulgaria to the questionnaire of the Human Rights Council Advisory Committee on the issue of the draft UN declaration on human rights education and training dated 8 March 2009, available at [http://www.2/ohchr.org/english/bodies/hrcouncil/advisorycommittee/HR\\_education\\_training.htm](http://www.2/ohchr.org/english/bodies/hrcouncil/advisorycommittee/HR_education_training.htm).
- <sup>105</sup> CRC/C/BGR/CO/2, 23 June 2008, para. 20.
- <sup>106</sup> [http://www.undp.bg/uploads/documents/2691\\_859\\_en.pdf](http://www.undp.bg/uploads/documents/2691_859_en.pdf), page 71.
- <sup>107</sup> UNDP, Millennium Development Goals, Bulgaria, 2008, available at [http://www.undp.bg/uploads/documents/2691\\_850\\_en.pdf](http://www.undp.bg/uploads/documents/2691_850_en.pdf), p.20.
- <sup>108</sup> CRC/C/BGR/CO/2, 23 June 2008, para. 55.
- <sup>109</sup> Ibid., para. 58.
- <sup>110</sup> Ibid., para. 55.
- <sup>111</sup> UNDP, Millennium Development Goals, Bulgaria, 2008, available at



- [http://www.undp.bg/uploads/documents/2691\\_852\\_en.pdf](http://www.undp.bg/uploads/documents/2691_852_en.pdf), p.22.
- <sup>112</sup> UNDP, Millennium Development Goals, Bulgaria, 2008, available at [http://www.undp.bg/uploads/documents/2691\\_852\\_en.pdf](http://www.undp.bg/uploads/documents/2691_852_en.pdf), p. 21.
- <sup>113</sup> UNICEF, Bulgaria Background, available at [http://www.unicef.org/infobycountry/bulgaria\\_background.html](http://www.unicef.org/infobycountry/bulgaria_background.html).
- <sup>114</sup> CRC/C/BGR/CO/2, 23 June 2008, para. 56.
- <sup>115</sup> UNDP, Millennium Development Goals, Bulgaria, 2008, available at [http://www.undp.bg/uploads/documents/2691\\_852\\_en.pdf](http://www.undp.bg/uploads/documents/2691_852_en.pdf), p. 21-22.
- <sup>116</sup> CERD/C/BGR/CO/19, 23 March 2009, para. 13.
- <sup>117</sup> CRC/C/BGR/CO/2, 23 June 2008, para. 58.
- <sup>118</sup> A/HRC/14/25/Add1., paras 7, 9, 18 and 29.
- <sup>119</sup> CRC/C/BGR/CO/2, 23 June 2008, para. 43.
- <sup>120</sup> Ibid., para. 56.
- <sup>121</sup> Ibid., para. 58.
- <sup>122</sup> CERD/C/BGR/CO/19, 23 March 2009, para. 15.
- <sup>123</sup> Ibid., para. 11.
- <sup>124</sup> Ibid., para. 14.
- <sup>125</sup> CAT/C/CR/32/6, 11 June 2004, para. 4.
- <sup>126</sup> UNHCR submission to the UPR on Bulgaria, p. 4.
- <sup>127</sup> Ibid., p. 4 - 8
- <sup>128</sup> Ibid., p. 4-6
- <sup>129</sup> Ibid., p. 8.
- <sup>130</sup> Ibid., p. 4.
- <sup>131</sup> CAT/C/CR/32/5, 11 June 2004, para. 6.
- <sup>132</sup> UNHCR submission to the UPR on Bulgaria, p. 6.
- <sup>133</sup> CERD/C/BGR/CO/19, 23 March 2009, para. 3.
- <sup>134</sup> CRC/C/BGR/CO/2, 23 June 2008, paras. 16-17.
- <sup>135</sup> UNODC, Crime and its impact on Balkans and affected countries, 2008, pp. 88 and 91.
- <sup>136</sup> CERD/C/BGR/CO/19, 23 March 2009, para. 27.
- <sup>137</sup> CAT/C/CR/32/6, 11 June 2004, para. 8.
- <sup>138</sup> CRC/C/BGR/CO/2, 23 June 2008, para. 30.
- <sup>139</sup> Ibid., para. 69.
- <sup>140</sup> CRC/C/OPSC/BGR/CO/1, 21 January 2008, para. 19.
-