

# Rights of the Child in Bolivia



# The aim of OMCT country reports are to prevent torture

In its reports on children's rights, OMCT aims to analyse national law in terms of the international commitments that a government has made. For example, in some countries families are not informed when their child is detained and this removes a precious safeguard against abuse. The absence of such safeguards facilitates situations where the torture of children can and does occur.

In other words, the reports aim to point out where, often unknowingly, legislation facilitates grave abuses against children.

The legal analysis is supported, where possible, by urgent appeals on the torture of children documented by OMCT. These urgent appeals (OMCT intervenes almost daily on such cases) are the foundation of all our work.

The reports are not legal semantics for their own sake, but represent, in addition to the urgent actions, another side of our strategy to end torture. The reports include meaningful and feasible recommendations for legal reform aimed at reducing the incidence of child torture.

The reports are presented to the United Nations Committee on the Rights of the Child who use them to analyse how well a country is fulfilling its international commitments with regards to children. Their recommendations on the issue of torture, drawing from OMCT's reports, send a strong message from the international community on the need for action to end the torture of children.

# Table of contents

I.	Introduction	7
II.	International standards	ç
III.	DEFINITION OF THE CHILD	I
IV.	Discrimination	I
	4.1 DISCRIMINATION AGAINST GIRLS	I
	4.2 DISCRIMINATION AGAINST INDIGENOUS PEOPLE	12
V. Pi	ROTECTION FROM TORTURE AND OTHER CRUEL, INHUMAN OR DEGRADING TREATMENT OR PUNISHMENT	I
	5.1 Bolivia's legal framework	I
	5.2 Practice	ΙΔ
VI.	PROTECTION FROM OTHER FORMS OF VIOLENCE	16
	6.1 VIOLENCE IN THE FAMILY	16
	6.2 SEXUAL ABUSE AND EXPLOITATION	I'
	6.3 CHILD LABOUR AND EXPLOITATION	20
	6.4 CHILDREN LIVING IN PRISONS WITH THEIR PARENTS	2
	6.5 CHILD SOLDIERS	24
VII.	CHILDREN IN CONFLICT WITH THE LAW	2
	7.1 Age of criminal responsibility and jurisdiction	2
	7.2 Grounds of arrest and detention	26
VIII.	Conclusion and Recommendations	29
Conc	CLUDING OBSERVATIONS OF THE COMMITTEE ON THE RIGHTS OF THE CHILD	3:



OMCT would like to express its gratitude to **Defensa de los Niños Internacional Bolivia (DNI - Bolivia)** for their help with the research of the present report.

# COMMITTEE ON THE RIGHTS OF THE CHILD 38th Session - Geneva, January 2005

Report on the implementation of the Convention on the Rights of the Child by Bolivia

Researched and written by Nathalie Perroud Co-ordinated and edited by Séverine Jacomy

Director of the publication: Eric Sottas

# I - Introduction

The situation of human rights in Bolivia, and in particular of children's rights, must be considered in relation to the political, economic and social context of the country.

Poverty constitutes the biggest problem facing Bolivia today. It does the greatest damage by disintegrating homes. Children are not acknowledged in the family, they suffer from emotional neglect, violence and interfamily sexual abuse. A strategy to reduce poverty has been established by the State with the participation of the civil society until the year 2015. Concerning children and adolescents, the strategy plans to increase the number of teachers, social workers and health specialists in order to develop projects aimed at improving the situation of women and children. Yet, about two-thirds of the population still live in poverty. The great majority of the poor are under the age of 18. In 2001, the total population of Bolivia was 8.5 million<sup>3</sup>. Children under the age of 18 are calculated at 3.7 million and children under the age of 5 at 1.2 million<sup>4</sup>. "Of the total population of the country, it is estimated that about two million children and adolescents are at risk.

living out their childhood in poverty and marginalisation".<sup>5</sup>

In Bolivia, there is an important ethnic and cultural diversity: 37 linguistic groups and 10 linguistic families<sup>6</sup>. According to the 2001 Population and Housing Census, 709,817 persons over 15 years of age have identified their cultural allegiance and identity in the following ways: 195,561 identify themselves as Quechua; 155,167 as Aymara; 9,584 as Guaraní; 16,012 as Chiquitano; 5,603 as Mojeño; 10,430 as other and 31,7460 do not identify themselves with any of these<sup>7</sup>. Differences depend on regions,

See: http://www.ebrp.gov.bo

- 3 See *Bolivia Data Profile* of The World Bank, available at: www.worlbank.org
- 4 According to Ecpat's statistics, avalable at: www.ecpat.com
- 5 See Bolivia Country Report, p.16 CRC/C/125/Add.2
- 6 See Programa de la Naciones Unidas para el Desarrollo, available at: http://www.pnud.bo/Perfil/Index.html
- 7 See Bolivia Country Report, p.16, CRC/C/125/Add.2

<sup>1 -</sup> See Bolivia Country Report, p.17 CRC/C/125/Add.2

<sup>2 -</sup> Estrategia Boliviana de Reducción de la Pobreza (EBRP). The aim of the strategy is to reduce poverty and promote human development, with particular emphasis on the population that can rely on very few means. It includes better access to markets, to basic public services, better social protection and security and the promotion of the participation and integration of the population, in a context of development that takes into account the rational use of natural resources.

rural and urban areas and ethnic origins. Processes of exclusion are common especially in rural areas and marginal zones and among indigenous people. In those groups, children and young people are particularly vulnerable.

The infant mortality rate has dropped in the past years thanks to the government's policy of expanding the Basic Health Insurance to provide all services to pregnant women, to new mothers up to six months after childbirth and to children up to five years of age<sup>8</sup>. However, in rural areas it still remains high. Malnutrition of children under three years of age still persists. According to UNICEF, approximately 800,000 children under 18 are working. Some children live in institutions, such as prisons, orphanages, etc., where their basic rights are not respected.

There are also over 2,500 children living on the street of major cities (Cochabamba, La Paz, Santa Cruz, etc.). Domestic violence, especially the abuse and mistreatment of children, is a growing concern<sup>10</sup>.

OMCT welcomes the third report submitted by Bolivia to the Committee on the Rights of the Child (thereafter the Committee) in accordance with article 44 (1) b of the Convention on the Rights of the Child (CRC). OMCT's alternative report Committee covers the provisions of the CRC which fall under the mandate of OMCT, namely the right to life, the right to be protected from torture and other cruel, inhuman, or degrading treatment or punishment, the rights of children in conflict with the law, and the right to be protected from any form of violence and discrimination.

UNICEF, Bolivia at a glance. See www.unicef.org/infobycountry/bolivia.html

<sup>9 -</sup> Ibid.

### II. INTERNATIONAL STANDARDS

Bolivia ratified the Convention on the Rights of the Child (CRC) on 26 June 1990. It is one of the first countries to have ratified the CRC. This fact shows that there is political will, at least theoretically, to protect children.

At the international level, Bolivia is party to most of the principal international human rights treaties. It has ratified the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination on 22 September 1970 and the Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment on 12 April 1999, which entered into force at the national level on 11 May 1999. It has also ratified the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women, on 8 June 1990 and the Hague Convention of 1996 on parental responsibility and protection of children in 2001.

However, Bolivia has not yet ratified the Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of the Child on the involvement of children in armed conflicts. It has signed, but not ratified, the Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of the Child on the sale of children, child prostitution and child pornography.

Bolivia ratified the Convention 138 (Minimum Age Convention) of the International Labor Organisation (ILO) on 11 June 1997. But it has not ratified the Convention 182 of the on Worst Forms of Child Labour of 1999.

At the regional level, Bolivia is party to the American Convention on Human Rights ("Pact of San José", Costa Rica), ratified on 20 June 1979. It has signed but not ratified the Inter-American Convention to prevent and punish torture on 9 December 1985. OMCT strongly suggests that the government ratify it.

### III. DEFINITION OF THE CHILD

Article 2 of the Code of Childhood and Adolescence<sup>11</sup> states that every human being from his/her birth to the age of 12 is considered a child and every human being between 12 and 18 is considered an adolescent<sup>12</sup>. OMCT also notes with satisfaction that article 4 of the Civil Code was modified in 2000, establishing that majority is attained at the age of 18. <sup>13</sup> These provisions are thus in full conformity with article 1 of CRC for which "a child means every human being below the age of eighteen years (...)".

Article 126 of the Code of Childhood and Adolescence sets the minimum age for employment at 14. However, recent research shows that there is a large number of children under the age of 14 who work regularly 14 (see chapter 6.3).

<sup>11 -</sup> Código del Niño, Niña y Adolescente, 27 October 1999.

<sup>12 -</sup> Código del Niño, Niña y Adolescente, art. 2 : "Se considera niño o niña a todo ser humano desde su concepción hasta cumplir los doce años y adolescentes desde los doce a los dieciocho años de edad cumplidos".

<sup>13 -</sup> Ley N. 2089 5 May 2000, art. 4: "La mayoría de edad se adquiere a los dieciocho años cumplidos".

<sup>14 -</sup> International Labour Organisation, "Bolivia, Trabajo Infantil en la Caña de Azúcar: Una Evaluación Rapida", May 2002.

### IV. DISCRIMINATION

#### 4.1 Discrimination against girls

Article 53 of the Family Code<sup>15</sup> establishes that a minor cannot marry without parental consent. In addition, according to article 44 of the Family Code, men can marry at 16, while women can do so at 14<sup>16</sup> and a judge may grant exemption from the age requirement if there are serious and justified grounds for doing so.<sup>17</sup> Hence, despite the recommendation made in 1998 by the Committee<sup>18</sup>, minimum legal ages for access to marriage are still not in full compliance with the CRC, which exposes children to abuses and early pregnancy related problems.

OMCT also believes that article 44 of the Family Code is discriminatory, since it sets different ages for access to marriage for boys and girls, which implies that girls stop their education or employment earlier than boys if they can be married at a lower age. As such, OMCT suggests that the government increases the minimum legal age for marriage for both boys and girls to the age of 18.

With the implementation of the Educational Reform<sup>19</sup> in the past years, great efforts have been made to reduce inequality between boys and girls as far as education is concerned. However, in some regions, in particular in rural areas, girls are still discriminated in access to primary education. In many rural communities, preference is still given to boys in terms of allowing them to attend school. The government should therefore make further efforts to guarantee girls' access to education in rural areas.

<sup>15 -</sup> Código de Familia, art. 53: "El menor de edad no puede casarse sin el asentimiento de su padre y de su madre(...)."

<sup>16 -</sup> Código de Familia, 4 April 1988, art. 44: "El varón antes de los dieciseis años cumplidos y la mujer antes de los catorce años cumplidos, no pueden contraer matrimonio".

<sup>17 -</sup> Código de Familia, art. 44: "El juez puede conceder dispensa de edad por causas graves y justificadas".

<sup>18 -</sup> Concluding observations of the Committee on the Rights of the Child: Bolivia 26/10/98, CRC/C/15/Add.95.

<sup>19 -</sup> Reforma educativa de Bolivia. It is a programme of the State supported by the World Bank, aimed at offering better quality and equality in primary education. The implementation of this project began in 1996.

# 4.2 Discrimination against indigenous people

OMCT is concerned about discrimination against indigenous peoples, including children. In educational systems to which indigenous children have access, traditional and cultural values of indigenous populations are not taken into account. This contributes to the fact that illiteracy rates among indigenous populations are very high. Indigenous populations have less access to basic education than the rest of the population. A UN report<sup>20</sup> shows that instruction levels of indigenous people are equivalent to three degrees less than non-indigenous people.

In the area near Cochabamba (called "Trópico de Cochabamba") indigenous people are permanently subject to severe human rights violations committed by police and military forces, as a result of activities related to cocaine eradication. Men, women and children suffer detentions and illegal persecutions, as well as physical and psycho-

logical violence. 21 Back in 2001, OMCT was informed about the violations of the rights of the Chiquitano indigenous people of Santa Cruz de la Sierra over the territory of Monte Verde. 22 It was reported that individuals hired by an oil company that had been trying to acquire land in the territory of Monte Verde for many years, had entered the territory and cleared around 300 ha of forest. As a result, indigenous organisations had reinstalled check points in order to prevent the entry of private individuals into the indigenous territory of Monte Verde and the destruction of the forests. Indigenous people received death threats from those individuals. Moreover, stock farmers attacked the legal representative of the indigenous people, who was responsible for the attribution of title deeds regarding the territory of Monte Verde.

OMCT expresses its concern about the nonrespect of the economic, social and cultural rights and the fundamental freedoms of indigenous peoples and urges the government to guarantee a better implementation International of the Covenant Economic, Social and Cultural Rights as well as ILO Convention No. 169 concerning Indigenous and Tribal Peoples Independent Countries.

<sup>20 -</sup> ONU Report. Poblaciones indígenas: un desafío para la comunidad internacional, October 2002. Available at: www.un.org/spanish/hr/pobla.htm.

<sup>21 -</sup> Dignidad y Juegos de Poder en el Trópico de Cochabamba, CASDEL and DNI (Publication of Terre des Hommes, Germany), Cochabamba, December 2002, p. 7.

<sup>22 -</sup> See OMCT Appeal Bolivia: Violence and Denial of the Rights of the Chiquitano Indigenous People over the Territory of Monte Verde, 24 September 2001, Case BOL 240901, ESCR

# V. PROTECTION FROM TORTURE AND OTHER CRUEL, INHUMAN OR DEGRADING TREATMENT OR PUNISHMENT

OMCT regrets that the government's report to the Committee does not address the problem of torture. The report provides no information on *de facto* torture or ill-treatment affecting children and *de jure* protection from such practices. Therefore, OMCT believes that the Committee should be provided with further information thereupon.

#### 5.1 Bolivia's legal framework

Torture is explicitly prohibited by article 12 of the Constitution<sup>23</sup>. Ill-treatment, applied specifically to children, is defined by article 108 of the Code of Childhood and Adolescence, which constitutes the most important instrument for the protection of children and young people in Bolivia. Article 108 provides that any act of violence committed by parents, State officials, third parties and/or institutions against children and adolescents constitutes ill-treatment.<sup>24</sup>

The Penal Code provides that any person part of a criminal organisation that permanently perpetrates crimes, such as genocide, abduction of children and the disabled, deprivation of liberty, torture, etc. must be sentenced to one to three years imprisonment. <sup>25</sup> It also states that the sentence must be increased by one-third when the victims are minors or when the act of torture is committed by a State official in charge of the prevention, investigation and judgment of the crimes perpetrated. <sup>26</sup>

- 23 Constitución política del Estado (1995), art. 12: "Queda prohibida toda especie de torturas, coacciones, exacciones o cualquier forma de violencia física o moral, bajo pena de destitución inmediata y sin perjuicio de las sanciones a que se harán pasibles quienes las aplicaren, ordenaren, instigaren o consintieren".
- 24 Código del Niño, Niña y Adolescente, art. 108: "Constituye maltrato todo acto de violencia ejercido por padres, responsables, terceros y/o instituciones, mediante abuso, acción, omisión o supresión, en forma habitual u ocasional, que atente contra los derechos reconocidos a niños, niñas y adolescentes por este Código y otras leyes; violencia que les ocasione daños o perjuicios en su salud física, mental o emocional".
- 25 Código penal, art. 132 bis, par.1: "El que formare parte de una asociación de tres o más personas organisada de manera permanente, bajo reglas de disciplina o control, destinada a cometer los siguientes delitos: genocidio, (...), sustracción de un menor o incapaz, privación de libertad, vejaciones y torturas, secuestro, (...), o se aproveche de estructuras comerciales o de negocios, para cometer tales delitos, será sancionado con reclusión de uno a tres años".
- 26 Código penal, art. 132 bis, par.3: "La pena se aumentará en un tercio cuando la organisación utilice a menores de edad o incapaces para cometer los delitos a que se refiere este articulo, y cuando el miembro de la organisación sea un funcionario público encargado de prevenir, investigar o juzgar la comisión de delitos".

But, as pointed out by the Committee against Torture<sup>27</sup>, the Penal Code does not clearly define the crime of torture. In fact it does not cover some of the situations included in article 1 of the Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment. In addition, the penalty prescribed (one to three years imprisonment) is not consistent with the seriousness of the crime, OMCT, reiterating the recommendations made by the Committee against Torture, strongly suggests that Bolivia introduce a clear definition of torture in the criminal legislation as set forth in the Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment, to make torture a crime and stipulate penalties commensurate with its seriousness.

#### 5.2 Practice

Violent repression of social protests, including allegations of torture or cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment, have been reported in Bolivia on several occasions over the past years. A considerable increase in psychological violence as a result of the anti-drugs policies in the area near Cochabamba ("Trópico de Cochabamba") was reported by several NGOs<sup>28</sup>. According to this information, the eradication programme "Plan coca Dignidad", undertaken by the government, did not contribute to substitute the coca economy with other products that allow poor farmers to live adequately. This plan increased the violence and the systematic violations of the rights of farmers living in that region. In the year 2000, important roads were blocked in the "Trópico de Cochabamba" as a result of compromises found by the government in relation to issues such as alternative development, coca eradication and human rights. There were a great number of human damages: 7 people died, 1 member of the street police force disappeared, 78 people were injured with guns, tear-gas and beatings, and 44 people were detained arbitrarily. 16 people reportedly underwent physical and psychological torture, inhuman and degrading treatments. The responsibility of those acts was attributed to members of the security forces. There was allegedly a lack of investigations about complaints of torture and other illtreatment by police and military forces in charge of the implementation of the law. The

<sup>27 -</sup> Concluding observations of the Committee against Torture: Bolivia, 10/05/2001, A/56/44, par. 89-98.

<sup>28 -</sup> Dignidad y Juegos de Poder en el Trópico de Cochabamba, CASDEL and DNI (Publication of Terre des Hommes, Germany), Cochabamba, December 2002, p. 21-22-24-27-42.

indiscriminate use of tear-gas inflicted irreversible damage to a great number of people. Some cases of forced disappearances were also reported in Chimoré.

In January 2003, OMCT reported dramatic incidents that took place in the Chapare region, where the police forces and the army reportedly used disproportionate and excessive force to curb demonstrations and road blocks led by persons from different sectors of society - including retired people, coca growers, farmers and students<sup>29</sup>. As a result, four persons died and arbitrary arrests and detentions, as well as forms of cruel, inhuman and degrading treatment, were reported. Though indirectly, such acts affected children as well.

#### OMCT urges the government to:

- implement effective procedures for internal monitoring and disciplining of the behaviour of public officials, including in cases of repression of social protests;
- enforce appropriate sanctions for public officials who are found to have made excessive use of force and/or to be responsible of acts of torture, or cruel, inhumane or degrading treatment and punishment;
- ensure that victims obtain redress and have an enforceable right to fair and adequate compensation.

<sup>29 -</sup> See OMCT Appeal Bolivia: excessive and disproportionate use of force against social protests, 17 January 2003, Case BOL 170103. ESCR

### VI. PROTECTION FROM OTHER FORMS OF VIOLENCE

"Indexes for child abuse and violence against children are high in Bolivia. Unfortunately, a culture of respect for children does not exist and in certain areas of the country children are not considered 'persons' until they are over three years old". 30

#### **6.1** Violence in the family

Article 19 of the CRC requires children's protection "(...) from all forms of physical or mental violence, injury or abuse, neglect or negligent treatment, maltreatment or exploitation, including sexual abuse, while in the care of parent(s), legal guardian(s) or any other person who has the care of the child".

Violence in the family is a serious problem in Bolivia, as the culture of "machismo" is widely spread in the country. Young women are often beaten by theirs husbands and there is no legal protection for them. Women are mainly subject to physical, sexual and psychological abuse. Physical violence, comprising battery, homicide, attempted homicide and murder, represents 53,6% of domestic violence; psychological violence, produced by the lack of economic assistance, adultery, bigamy, etc. represents 40,2% of domestic violence; the remaining 6,2% of domestic violence cases is represented by sexual violence, including rape, sexual abuse and incest.<sup>31</sup>

As a response to the high rate of domestic violence, in 1995 the Bolivian government promulgated the "Law against violence within the family or domestic violence". However, according to information received<sup>33</sup>, the provisions of this law are *de facto* rarely implemented. Law enforcement officials, members of the judiciary and health care workers entrusted to apply the law are frequently unaware of or do not comply with its provisions. Women themselves are often unaware of the existence of this law and can not therefore invoke its provisions.<sup>34</sup>

<sup>30 -</sup> UNICEF, Bolivia at a glance. See <u>http://www.unicef.org/infobycountry/bolivia\_1871.html</u>

<sup>31 -</sup> OMCT, 10 reports/year 2001, Violence against Women, 2002, p.42.

<sup>32 -</sup> Ley contra la violencia en la familia o doméstica, Ley no.1674, 15 de diciembre de 1995.

<sup>33 -</sup> Information received from Centro de Información y Desarrollo de la Mujer (CIDEM).

<sup>34 -</sup> OMCT, 10 reports/year 2001, Violence against Women, 2002, p.44.

There is a lack of information in Bolivia on how violence against women in the homes affects children, as well as a lack of information on domestic violence against children themselves. The government also recognises that its policies, including those against the use of corporal punishment, are still very limited<sup>37</sup>.

OMCT would therefore encourage the government to undertake in-depth research on the nature and incidence of violence against children in the home and to develop a comprehensive prevention, intervention and rehabilitation strategy, accordingly.

#### 6.2 Sexual abuse and exploitation

The CRC provides that "States Parties undertake to protect the child from all forms of sexual exploitation and sexual abuse. For these purposes, States Parties shall in particular take all appropriate national, bilateral and multilateral measures to prevent:

- (a) The inducement or coercion of a child to engage in any unlawful sexual activity;
- (b) The exploitative use of children in prostitution or other unlawful sexual practices;
- (c) The exploitative use of children in pornographic performances and materials".

In that respect, OMCT is particularly concerned by article 317 of the Bolivian Penal Code. This article provides that there shall be no punishment in the cases of rape, sexual abuse or kidnapping when the perpetrators marry their victims, with free consent, before the execution of the judgment<sup>38</sup>. Since the minimum legal age for

<sup>35 -</sup> Ibid.

<sup>36 -</sup> Violencia por razones de sexo, Base de Datos Sobre Derechos de la Mujer, Comisión Andina de Juristas (CAJ). http://www.cajpe.org.pe

<sup>37 -</sup> See Bolivia Country Report, p.13-14 CRC/C/125/Add.2

<sup>38 -</sup> Código penal, art. 317 "No habrá lugar a sanción, cuando los reos, en los casos respectivos, no teniendo impedimento alguno, contrajeren matrimonio con las ofendidas, antes de la sentencia que cause ejecutoria".

marriage is currently 14 in article 44 of the Family Code, there are serious grounds to fear that sexually abused girls be forced to marry their rapist in order to preserve their family's "honour"<sup>39</sup>.

Commercial sexual exploitation is also an area of concern. In Bolivia, the average age of entry into prostitution is 16. Most of the prostituted youth are between 17 and 20. Young children tend to enter prostitution because of experiences of abuse or violence; older children are forced to prostitute themselves because of economic pressures. <sup>40</sup>

According to ECPAT, "Most child prostitution takes place in Bolivia's populated urban centres. Many of the children involved in the biggest cities in the country (La Paz, Cochabamba and Santa Cruz) do not come from these cities originally - the children move around between the cities to avoid being identified in their hometown. Prostitution in general is becoming more visible in Bolivian cities because of the proliferation of brothels, generally inhabited by adult prostitutes. These adult prostitutes confirm the recent increase in demand for, and availability of, prostituted children.

Most prostituted children come from the lower social classes and from broken families. Only 12.6% of prostituted children have any education, leaving them with few opportunities should they try to leave and perpetuating low self-esteem. As a result, many remain in the sex trade despite wanting to exit. Approximately one third of girls and adolescents in prostitution have between one and five children, mostly under the age of 5.

There are different types of child prostitution, varying with the economic power of the client and the age of the child. Upper-class clients tend to seek adolescents between ages 16 and 20. Reportedly these children come from eastern Bolivia and from outside of the country. In some cases the sexual contact takes place at the client's house. This type of prostitution is organised by closed networks, and is subject to very few controls. Adolescents from all parts of the country are exploited in local bars or pubs, mainly for middle-class clients. Street prostitution involves women of all ages who typically enter the trade when they are between the ages of 12 and 15 years. Finally, there is a form of "hidden" prostitution, which can involve children as young as 8 years, often in exchange for drugs or some kind of treat or toy. During the day, they stay in the street often working as street vendors, domestic

<sup>39 -</sup> See also OMCT 10 reports/year 2001, Violence against Women, 2002, p. 45.

<sup>40 -</sup> ECPAT International. Bolivia - Perfil de la exploitación sexual commercial de la niñez.

servants or waitresses. At night they go to dance clubs or sell alcohol in the street. Clients of this type of prostitution are generally adults or adolescents with little money.

Bolivian health regulations require prostitutes to have regular health check-ups, but more than one-third do not show up for their appointments. Most of the prostitutes, especially children, do not realise that the health problems they experience are probably due to sexually transmitted diseases like syphilis or gonorrhoea. There is apparently little concern among prostituted children of contracting HIV or AIDS; reportedly, a client can pay more to have unprotected sex. The biggest fear among prostituted children and adolescent is pregnancy, since this means that their income will be lost for a period of time". 41

OMCT would therefore urge the government of Bolivia to undertake the following:

- urgently amend article 317 of the Penal Code providing that there shall be no punishment in the cases of rape, sexual abuse or kidnapping when the perpetrators marry their victims, with free consent, before the execution of the judgment
- ratify the Optional Protocol to the CRC on

- the Sale of Children, Child Prostitution and Child Pornography
- collect reliable and complete data on sexual violence against children in Bolivia in order to set up a comprehensive policy aimed at fully implementing the requirement of article 34 of the CRC;
- adopt and implement a criminal policy which seeks to investigate and punish those responsible for sexual violence against children, including service providers, customers and intermediaries in child prostitution, child trafficking and child pornography;
- adopt preventive measures, through education, training, information and other forms of awareness raising, health services and monitoring mechanisms;
- supply information on concrete measures aimed at providing assistance and protection to child victims, and in particular sexually exploited children;
- provide for recovery and reintegration of child victims through, *inter alia*, social, medical, psychological and other support, effective actions to prevent or remove

social stigmatisation and legal criminalisation, and the promotion of alternative means of livelihood.

#### 6.3 Child labour and exploitation

In addition to article 19 of the CRC already mentioned, which protects children against any form of violence, article 32 paragraph 1 specifically recognises "the right of the child to be protected from economic exploitation and from performing any work that is likely to be hazardous or to interfere with the child's education, or to be harmful to the child's health or physical, mental, spiritual, moral or social development". For this purpose, article 32 para. 2 requires States Parties to "take legislative, administrative, social and educational measures to ensure the implementation of the present article (...)".

Although the Code of Childhood and Adolescence provides that the minimum age for admission to employment is 14 years old<sup>43</sup>, a great number of children enter into the workforce at a very early age.

In the cane-growing regions of Santa Cruz and Tarija, the sugarcane harvest (zafra), mobilizes a great number of workers and their families every year from May to October. These families migrate temporarily in an attempt to alleviate their extreme poverty. Investigations made by the ILO, through the International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC)<sup>44</sup>, show that the Santa Cruz zafra mobilizes over 30,000 persons, nearly 7,000 of which are children and adolescents under the age of 18. The Tarija zafra mobilizes 5,500 individuals, including 2,860 young persons under the age of 18. Overall, this productive activity involves nearly 10,000 children and adolescents. The employment of children in cane-growing activities constitutes a violation of current legal provisions, which not

In Bolivia "unacceptable forms of exploitation of children at work exist and persist, but they are particularly difficult to research due to their hidden, sometimes illegal or even criminal nature."

<sup>42 -</sup> Frans Röselaers, Director of the International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC), International Labour Office, Geneva 2001.

<sup>43 -</sup> Código del Niño, Niña y Adolescente, art. 126.

<sup>44 -</sup> ILO, International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC), Bolivia, Child Labour in Sugarcane: A Rapid Assessment, Guillermo Dávalos, May 2002, Geneva.

only establish 14 years as the minimum working age<sup>45</sup>, but also prohibit children from working in the sugarcane harvest.<sup>46</sup> Both national and international legislation expressly prohibit child labour in sugarcane harvesting. Yet, according to ILO, because the State does not implement specific policies to deal with the problem, in practice, there is a complete failure to comply with current legal standards.<sup>47</sup>

"Both in Tarija and Santa Cruz the youngest age of children and adolescents directly involved in harvesting work is nine years old. (...) Boys, girls and adolescents, together with the adult females, attend to stacking, peeling and, to a lesser extent, cutting cane. They are thus considered harvesters' helpers (cuartas). In most cases, employment contracts are verbal and are established by the contractor with the adult male harvester. Children and adolescents usually do not enter into any type of contract and therefore do not receive social benefits. (...) The vast majority of children and adolescents are not remunerated directly, since they are considered "helpers". They are subject to psychological mistreatment because they are under pressure to finish work assigned to them and because they fear not to reach established production quotas. (...).

In Tarija, the average percentage of children and adolescents who do not attend school is 90 per cent. In Santa Cruz, 55 per cent of boys and 33 per cent of girls are excluded from the right to education. Access to school for children living and working in the sugarcane harvest is also difficult because of the great distances between the harvesters' camps and the schools.

Children and adolescents who work in the sugarcane harvest encounter health problems linked to their living and working conditions. In general they live in overcrowded encampments without access to basic services, such as drinking water and solid waste management systems. (...) Children work for long hours (12 hours per day) and are exposed to inclement weather and to the risk of illnesses and accidents. Their diet is deficient in calories, proteins and minerals, which render them highly vulnerable to infectious diseases and to respiratory and gastrointestinal disorders."<sup>48</sup>

<sup>45 -</sup> Código del Niño, Niña y Adolescente, art.134 (Trabajos peligrosos e insalubres): "Son trabajos peligrosos, insalubres:

<sup>....
16. .</sup> El trabajo en actividades de recolección de algodón, castaña y zafra de caña."

<sup>46 -</sup> Código del Niño, Niña y Adolescente, art.126.

<sup>47 -</sup> ILO, International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC), Bolivia, Child Labour in Sugarcane: A Rapid Assessment, Guillermo Dávalos, May 2002, Geneva, p. vii.

Another traditional labour carried out by poor Bolivian girls is domestic labour, which they start when they are as young as 7 years old. 49 In 1999 girls working in Bolivian homes were estimated at 114,000. Almost all of those girls are indigenous people from rural areas and they do not speak Castilian when they arrive in the city. Generally, those girls do not go to school, they work every day during long hours (49 hours per week on average) and are subject to ill-treatment, discrimination and sexual exploitation.<sup>50</sup>

A great number of Bolivian children also work in mines. They begin their occupation when they are 8. They work for 10-12 hours per day and have to deal with high temperatures and heavy loads and are in contact with toxic and dangerous substances such as nitrates for explosives, mercury and toxic gases.<sup>51</sup>

Another activity carried out by children in Bolivia is gold searching in the river, which is called "barranguilla". North of La Paz, children spend hours in the water in search of gold among stones and earth. They begin this activity when they are 5 years old and learn it as a game when they accompany their mothers. This is one of the reasons for which the labour of children in the "barranguilla" and in the mine is not seen as a real job and the risks to which children are exposed are not given consideration.<sup>52</sup>

In the last years, child trafficking for labour exploitation has been a major subject in Bolivia. Some reports show that Bolivian children and adolescents between 8 and 19 have been carried by Bolivian adults to illegal textile workshops in Argentina and kept in slavery conditions.<sup>53</sup> Children are attracted with lies and then they are forced to work in the textile workshops in inhuman conditions (only one meal per day, 5 hours of sleep per night, 25 children in a dormitory of 4m x 4m, and they are often beaten and insulted). Moreover, as they find themselves in an illegal situation, they depend on their kidnappers.

OMCT welcomes the efforts undertaken by the government to address the situation of working children, but it remains deeply preoccupied, in particular by child sugar-

http://www.attacmadrid.org/d/2/020701194028.php and http://www.almeria-solidaria.com/page92.html

<sup>49 -</sup> Ceaser, M. Bolivia: ¿Criada o esclava? In Noticias Aliadas, 28 June 1999.

<sup>50 -</sup> See Diagnóstico sobre la situación de niñas, niños y adolescents en 21 países de América Latina Save the Children Sweden, p.49, available at: http://209.45.121.167/pdf/24e.pdf

<sup>51 -</sup> See http://www.almeria-solidaria.com/page92.html

<sup>52 -</sup> Chacón, M. (2002) Trabajo infantil: Pequeños buscadores de oro bolivianos. Available at:

<sup>53 -</sup> Boletín Nº 09-2000. Cuarenta niños bolivianos rescatados de la explotación laboral en Argentina. 3 July 2000. Bolivia Press (CEDIB). Available at: www.cedib.org

cane harvesters, child miners and domestic girls. OMCT would recommend the government of Bolivia to:

- ratify and implement the ILO Convention 182 concerning the Prohibition and Immediate Action for the Elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labour;
- take immediate measures to guarantee the physical and psychological integrity of all child workers in Bolivia, including proper investigation of cases of violence against children as well as the adoption of enforcement measures, including penal sanctions, ensuring the accountability of perpetrators;
- develop a reliable monitoring and assistance system which would be available to all children victims of exploitation and slavery; and
- guarantee children from the age of 14 the right to adequate contracting and salaries (as allowed by Art.2.4. of the ILO 138 Minimum Age Convention) with full protection from any form of heavy, unhealthy or exploitative labour until 18.

# 6.4 Children living in prisons with their parents

In Bolivian's prisons more than 1000 children under the age of 5 live permanently with their parents and almost half of them leave the prison only to attend classes<sup>54</sup>. They live in crowded conditions and are deprived of their most basic rights.<sup>55</sup> In 1999, a campaign<sup>56</sup> to take children away from prisons was launched, but had no significant results. In fact, the government did not respond with the necessary infrastructure to welcome those children. As a result, mothers and fathers living in prison prefer to keep the children with them rather than allow them to end up in the street as "niños de la calle".

The murder of an eight-year-old girl was reported in 1998.<sup>57</sup> She was living in the prison

<sup>54 -</sup> See Diagnóstico sobre la situación de niñas, niños y adolescents en 21 países de América Latina Save the Children Sweden, p.25, available at: http://209.45.121.167/pdf/24e.pdf

<sup>55 -</sup> See Bolivia Country Report, p.17.

<sup>56 - &</sup>quot;No encarceles mi niñez". It constitutes a program of the Bolivian government aimed at preventing that children grow up in prisons. It was planned to take children away from prisons, where they were living with their parents, and give them a safe place to live.

<sup>57 -</sup> See Niñez y violencia: Castigo corporal, maltrato y abuso sexual infantil. Save the Children - Sweden, p. 30. Available at: http://209.45.121.167/publicaciones-00/publicacion19/scs-pub-es-diagnostico.pdf

of San Pedro<sup>58</sup> with her parents and was throttled and raped to death by a prisoner. The little girl arrived in prison with her mother, who had taken advantage of a special permit for Christmas, which allowed members of the family to spend some time with the prisoners. The little girl began to wander around the prison and the murderer attracted her to his cell with lies. This case showed the dangers encountered by children living in prison with their parents.

OMCT thus recommends the government of Bolivia to develop alternatives to imprisonment for parents of infants and school-age children, in particular mothers.

OMCT further recommends the government to fully guarantee the rights of children, whose parents are held in detention, with particular attention to those living in prisons with their parents.

#### 6.5 Child soldiers

According to the Constitution, all Bolivians have a fundamental duty to undertake military service as provided for by national law. <sup>59</sup> The minimum age for military service is 18 and the period of service is one year. <sup>60</sup>

However, according to the NGO Coalition to Stop the Use of Child Soldiers, soldiers under the age of 18, half of which may be under 16, constitute 40% of the armed forces. <sup>61</sup> Poor adolescents are reported to be especially targeted for conscription.

OMCT thus urges the government of Bolivia to ratify the Optional Protocol to the CRC on the involvement of children in armed conflicts and to effectively implement it.

<sup>58 -</sup> The prison of San Pedro lies in La Paz. It constitutes a community of almost 230 prisoners, who live together no matter what the importance of the crime is.

<sup>59 -</sup> Constitución politica del Estado (1995), art. 213: "Todo boliviano está obligado a prestar servicio militar de acuerdo a ley".

<sup>60 -</sup> Decreto Ley No. 13907 of 27 August 1976.

<sup>61 -</sup> Coalition to stop the use of Child Soldiers. See: <u>www.child-soldiers.org</u>

## VII. CHILDREN IN CONFLICT WITH THE LAW

# 7.1 Age of criminal responsibility and jurisdiction

Bolivia's legal framework for children in conflict with the law is the Code of Childhood and Adolescence. This Code establishes that the State guarantees access to justice, in the same conditions, to all children and adolescents<sup>62</sup> and that every child and adolescent has the right to free assistance from the Children's Ombudsman Office (Defensoría de la Niñez y Adolescencia) or a defence lawyer. 63 Article 222 establishes that social responsibility is applicable to adolescents aged between 12 and 16, if they commit an act classified as an offence in the Penal Code. 64 Exemption of civil responsibility is given to children under the age of 12. Particular measures of protection are applicable to children [i.e. under 12] who infringe the law and there cannot be a deprivation of liberty under any circumstances. 65 Special protection is applicable to children aged between 16 and 21: they are subject to the ordinary adult legislation, but they will have special legal protection.<sup>66</sup> In practice, this appears to mean that children are held responsible for penal offences from the age of 12 and can be judged as adults from the age of 16.

OMCT would urge the Bolivian government to clarify the nature and consequences of "social responsibility" as defined in the Code of Childhood and Adolescence and extend its application up to the age of 18.

OMCT urges the government to develop a specific set of responses to each type of

<sup>62 -</sup> Código del Niño, Niña y Adolescente, art. 213: "El Estado garantiza a todo niño, niña y adolescente el acceso, en igualdad de condiciones, a la justicia en todas las instancias".

<sup>63 -</sup> Código del Niño, Niña y Adolescente, art. 216: "Se prestará la asistencia gratuita e integral a todo niño, niña o adolescente que lo precise, por medio de la Defensoría de la Niñez y Adolescencia o abogado de oficio".

<sup>64 -</sup> Código del Niño, Niña y Adolescente, art. 222: "La responsabilidad social se aplicará a los adolescentes comprendidos desde los doce años hasta los dieciséis años, al momento de la comisión de un hecho tipificado como delito en el Código Penal o leves penales especiales (...)".

<sup>65 -</sup> Código del Niño, Niña y Adolescente, art.223, par.1, 2: "Las niñas y niños que no hubieren cumplido los doce años de edad, están exentos de responsabilidad civil, (...) al niño o niña que infrinja la Ley Penal, previa investigación, debe aplicarse las medidas de protección previstas en el presente Código. Por ningún motivo se dispondrá medida privativa de libertad".

<sup>66 -</sup> Código del Niño, Niña y Adolescente, art. 225: "Los mayores de dieciséis años y menores de veintiún años serán sometidos a la legislación ordinaria, pero contarán con la protección que se refieren las normas del presente título".

penal offences when committed by children (from 12 to 18), excluding deprivation of liberty for all minor offences and non-violent crimes and proposing child-specific mediation and rehabilitation processes for grave crimes.

- 67 Código del Niño, Niña y Adolescente, art. 231: "La libertad del adolescente y todos los derechos y garantías que le son reconocidos por la Constitución Política del Estado, por este Código y otros Instrumentos Internacionales, sólo podrán ser restringidos con carácter excepcional, cuando sean absolutamente indispensables para la averiguación de la verdad, el desarrollo del proceso y la aplicación de la Ley".
- 68 Código del Niño, Niña y Adolescente, art. 231: "La libertad del adolescente y todos los derechos y garantías que le son reconocidos por la Constitución Política del Estado, por este Código y otros Instrumentos Internacionales, sólo podrán ser restringidos con carácter excepcional, cuando sean absolutamente indispensables para la averiguación de la verdad, el desarrollo del proceso y la aplicación de la Ley". Código del Niño, Niña y Adolescente, art. 233 par.1 (Detención preventiva): "Medida excepcional que puede ser determinada por el Juez de la Niñez y Adolescencia como una medida cautelar, a partir del momento en que recibe la acusación y cuando se presenten cualesquiera de las siguientes circunstancias:
  - Que el delito tenga prevista pena privativa de libertad, cuyo máximo legal sea de cinco años o más;
  - 2. Exista el riesgo razonable de que el adolescente evada la acción de la justicia;
  - 3. Exista peligro de destrucción u obstaculización de la prueba; y
  - 4. Exista peligro para terceros". par. 2: "En ningún caso se podrá imponer esta medida por más de cuarenta y cinco días, en todos los casos el Juez deberá analizar si es posible sustituir la detención preventiva por otra medida más favorable".

# 7.2 Grounds of arrest and conditions of detention

Article 231 of the Code of Childhood and Adolescence provides that the deprivation of liberty of adolescents is an exceptional measure that can be applied only when it is absolutely necessary to establish the truth, to allow the procedure of process and the application of the law. 67 Article 233 establishes that pre-trial detention of children and adolescents constitutes a provisional measure taken by the Judge of Childhood and Adolescence when he receives the accusation and when there is the risk that the child or the adolescent evades justice, destroys the proof or when there is some risk for third parties. Pre-trial detention cannot be applied for more than 45 days and the Judge should take into account the possibility of substituting it with a more favourable measure.<sup>68</sup>

However, in practice, the length of pre-trial detention is reportedly not respected, while conditions of detention are clearly contrary to article 40 of the CRC and the United Nations Rules for the Protection of Juveniles Deprived of the Liberty. In May 2001, the UN Committee Against Torture concluded its session on Bolivia by stating that "information [...] regarding the inhuman conditions

under which prisoners are held in the facilities known as *carceletas* in the Chapare area, Santa Cruz, Cochabamba and other cities in which, in addition to the illegal nature of the so-called 'legal deposit' imprisonment which does not exist in domestic law, detainees are held in subhuman conditions for *indeterminate periods*, *sometimes lasting several months*, and where juvenile and adult detainees are held together, as are prisoners awaiting trial and those already serving sentences [emphasis added]. In addition, the disciplinary confinement in punishment cells of the kind known as *el bote* (the can) is, in the Committee's view, tantamount to torture".<sup>69</sup>

OMCT strongly recommends the Committee to:

- request further information on the administration of juvenile justice in general, notably on the degree of specialisation of the system and on the actual implementation of existing legal provisions to ensure that the deprivation of liberty is a last resort for all children in conformity with article 37(b) of the CRC;
- request information regarding the training activities developed for professionals involved in the system of juvenile justice, on

the provisions of the CRC and other relevant international instruments in the field of juvenile justice, including the "Beijing Rules", the "Riyadh Guidelines" and the United Nations Rules for the Protection of Juveniles Deprived of their Liberty;

- request disaggregated data on children in conflict with the law, including age, gender and ethnic/indigenous background;
- request an up-date on the situation of juveniles in detention as described by the CAT in May 2001 and on measures taken by the government to address this situation;
- ensure that child detainees are kept separately from adults, unless it is in their best interests not to do so;
- ensure that living conditions in all police stations and child institutions be in conformity with article 37 of the CRC and the UN Rules for the Protection of Juveniles Deprived of their Liberty, in particular by resolving overcrowding problems, poor hygiene, lack of food and restrictions on family visits;

- guarantee that the duration of deprivation of liberty either in detention facilities or in child institutions be clearly determined, communicated to the child and monitored, so as to ensure that it be used only for the shortest appropriate period of time in conformity with article 37b of the CRC; and
- provide for adequate alternative measures to detention and pre-trial detention, so as to stop keeping children in conflict with the law incarcerated.

# VIII. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The International Secretariat of OMCT is profoundly concerned with some aspects of the situation of children in Bolivia and believes that a number of safeguards, both legal and practical, must be further implemented in order to fully guarantee the rights of children enshrined in the CRC.

Regarding **discrimination**, OMCT recommends that the Committee on the Rights of the Child urge the Bolivian Government to:

- amend articles 44 and 53 of the Family Code so as to increase the minimum legal age for marriage to 18 for both boys and girls;
- make further efforts to guarantee girls' access to education in rural areas;
- guarantee the protection of the rights of indigenous people, notably by better implementing of the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights as well as the ILO Convention No. 169 concerning and Tribal Indigenous Peoples in Independent Countries.

Regarding torture and other cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment of children, OMCT recommends that the Committee on the Rights of the Child urge the Bolivian Government to:

- ratify the Inter-American Convention to prevent and punish torture;
- introduce in the criminal legislation a clear definition of torture as set forth in the Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment, to make torture a crime and stipulate penalties commensurate with its seriousness;
- implement effective procedures for internal monitoring and disciplining of the behaviour of public officials, including in cases of repression of social protests;
- enforce appropriate sanctions for public officials who are found to have made excessive use of force and/or to be responsible of acts of torture, or cruel, inhumane or degrading treatment and punishment;

 ensure that victims obtain redress and have an enforceable right to fair and adequate compensation.

Regarding **violence** in the family, OMCT recommends that the Committee on the Rights of the Child urge the Bolivian Government to:

- undertake in-depth research on the nature and incidence of violence against children in the home; and
- develop a comprehensive prevention, intervention and rehabilitation strategy to fight all forms of domestic violence.

Regarding **sexual abuse and exploitation of children**, OMCT recommends that the Committee on the Rights of the Child urge the Bolivian Government to:

- ratify the Optional Protocol to the CRC on the sale of children, child prostitution and child pornography;
- urgently amend article 317 of the Penal Code which currently provides that there shall be no punishment in the cases of rape, sexual abuse or kidnapping when the perpetrators marry their victims, with free consent, before the execution of the judgment;

- collect reliable and complete data on sexual violence against children in Bolivia in order to set up a comprehensive policy aimed at fully implementing the requirement of article 34 of the CRC;
- adopt and implement a criminal policy which seeks to investigate and punish those responsible for sexual violence against children, including service providers, customers and intermediaries in child prostitution, child trafficking and child pornography;
- adopt preventive measures, through education, training, information and other forms of awareness raising, health services and monitoring mechanisms;
- supply information on concrete measures aimed at providing assistance and protection to child victims, and in particular sexually exploited children;
- provide for recovery and reintegration of child victims through, *inter alia*, social, medical, psychological and other support, effective actions to prevent or remove social stigmatisation and legal criminalisation, and the promotion of alternative means of livelihood.

Regarding **child labour and exploitation**, OMCT recommends that the Committee on the Rights of the Child urge the Bolivian Government to:

- ratify and implement the ILO Convention 182 concerning the Prohibition and Immediate Action for the Elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labour;
- take immediate measures to guarantee the physical and psychological integrity of all child workers in Bolivia, including proper investigation of cases of violence against children as well as the adoption of enforcement measures, including penal sanctions, ensuring the accountability of perpetrators;
- develop a reliable monitoring and assistance system which would be available to all children victims of exploitation and slavery; and
- guarantee to children from the age of 14 the right to adequate contracting and salaries (as allowed by article 2.4. of the ILO 138 Minimum Age Convention) with full protection from any form of heavy, unhealthy or exploitative labour until 18.

Regarding **children living in prisons**, OMCT recommends that the Committee on

the Rights of the Child urge the Bolivian Government to:

- develop alternatives to imprisonment for parents of infants and school-age children, in particular mothers; and
- fully guarantee the rights of children whose parents are held in detention, with particular attention to those living in prison with their parents.

Regarding **child soldiers**, OMCT recommends that the Committee on the Rights of the Child urge the Bolivian Government to:

• ratify the Optional Protocol to the CRC on the involvement of children in armed conflicts and effectively implement it.

Regarding the **administration of juvenile justice**, OMCT recommends that the Committee on the Rights of the Child urge the Bolivian Government to:

- clarify the nature and consequences of "social responsibility" as defined in the Code of Childhood and Adolescence and extend its application up to the age of 18;
- develop a specific set of responses to each type of penal offences when committed by children (from 12 to 18), excluding de-

privation of liberty for all minor offences and non-violent crimes and proposing child-specific mediation and rehabilitation processes for grave crimes;

- provide further information on the administration of juvenile justice in general, notably on the degree of specialisation of the system and on the actual implementation of existing legal provisions to ensure that the deprivation of liberty is a last resort for all children in conformity with article 37(b) of the CRC;
- provide information regarding the training activities developed for professionals involved in the system of juvenile justice, on the provisions of the CRC and other relevant international instruments in the field of juvenile justice, including the "Beijing Rules", the "Riyadh Guidelines" and the United Nations Rules for the Protection of Juveniles Deprived of their Liberty;
- provide disaggregated data on children in conflict with the law, including age, gender and ethnic/indigenous background;
- request an up-date on the situation of ju-

- veniles in detention as described by the CAT in May 2001 and on measures taken by the government to address this situation;
- ensure that child detainees are kept separately from adults, unless it is in their best interests not to do so;
- ensure that conditions in all police stations and child institutions be in conformity with article 37 of the CRC and the UN Rules for the Protection of Juveniles Deprived of their Liberty, in particular by resolving overcrowding problems, poor hygiene, lack of food and restrictions on family visits;
- guarantee that the duration of deprivation of liberty - either in detention facilities or in child institutions - be clearly determined, communicated to the child and monitored, so as to ensure that it be used only for the shortest appropriate period of time in conformity with article 37b of the CRC; and
- provide for adequate alternative measures to detention and pre-trial detention, so as to stop keeping children in conflict with the law incarcerated.

COMMITTEE ON THE RIGHTS OF THE CHILD 38th Session - Geneva, January 2005

Concluding Observations of the Committee on the Rights of the Child:

Bolivia

# Consideration of reports submitted by States parties under article 44 of the Convention on the Rights of the Child

1. The Committee considered the third periodic report of Bolivia (CRC/C/125/Add.2) at its 1019th and 1020th meetings (see CRC/C/SR.1019 and 1020), held on 25 January 2005, and adopted, at its 1025th meeting (see CRC/C/SR. 1025), held on 28 January 2005, the following concluding observations.

#### A. Introduction

2. The Committee welcomes the submission of the State party's third periodic report, which follows the guidelines for reporting (CRC/C/15/Add.95), the written replies to its list of issues (CRC/C/Q/BOL/3) and additional information provided. The Committee also notes with appreciation the frank and open dialogue with the high-level delegation of the State party, which allowed for a better understanding of the situation of children in Bolivia.

#### B. Follow-up measures undertaken and progress achieved by the State party

- The Committee welcomes a number of positive developments in the reporting period, including:
  - (a) The entry into force of the Code for Children and Adolescents in June 2000 (Law 2026 of 1999);
  - (b) The promulgation of the Law on Municipalities (Law 2028 of 1999) under which municipal governments are to establish local children's authorities for the implementation of children's rights (defensorías municipales de la niñez y adolescencia);
  - (c) The amendment to article 4 of the Civil Code, which sets the age of majority at 18;
  - (d) The establishment of the Vice-Ministry for Youth, Children and the

Elderly under the Ministry for Sustainable Development;

- (e) The implementation in cooperation with ILO/IPEC, of a programme to eradicate the worst forms of child labour:
- (f) The ratification of the Hague Convention on Protection of Children and Cooperation in Respect of Intercountry Adoption in January 2002;
- (g) The ratification of the Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment in May 1999 and of the International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families in July 2003;
- (h) The ratification of the Optional Protocols to the Convention on the Rights of the Child on the sale of children, child prostitution and child pornography, in July 2003, and on the involvement of children in armed conflict, in December 2004.

# C. Factors and difficulties impeding progress in the implementation of the Convention

4. The Committee notes that a number of factors continue to negatively affect the situation of children and impede the full implementation of the Convention, including political instability, difficulties and conflict in the social and economic spheres, structural poverty and large disparities in income distribution.

# D. Principal subjects of concern, suggestions and recommendations

#### 1. General measures of implementation

The Committee's previous recommendations

5. While noting that the first part of the report provides specific reference to the concluding observations, the Committee regrets that some of the recommendations it made (see CRC/C/15/Add.95) on the State party's second periodic report (CRC/C/65/Add.1) have not been sufficiently addressed, including those contained in paragraphs 23 (conditions

- of children living in institutions), 28 and 29 (economic and sexual exploitation of children) and 30 (juvenile justice).
- 6. The Committee urges the State party to make every effort to address the previous recommendations, which have been only partly implemented or not implemented at all, and the list of recommendations contained in the present concluding observations.

#### Legislation and implementation

- 7. While welcoming the measures taken to bring national legislation into conformity with the Convention, such as the adoption of the Code for Children and Adolescents, the Committee is concerned that national legislation in some areas is still not in full conformity with the Convention. It is also concerned that new legislation is not fully implemented in practice.
- 8. The Committee urges the State party to take all necessary measures to fully harmonize its legislation with the Convention and to ensure the effective implementation of all legislation relevant to the

rights of the child, taking into account training needs, monitoring mechanisms and the provision of adequate resources. The Committee also urges the State party to ensure that the rights of the child are incorporated into the new Constitution currently under consideration.

#### Coordination

- The Committee expresses concern at the limited capacity of existing institutions, such as the Vice-Ministry for Youth, Children and the Elderly, to ensure an intersectoral and integrated approach to the implementation of policies for children. It regrets, in this respect, that the National Council for Children, provided for in the Code for Children and Adolescents of 1999, has not been established yet. The Committee takes note that the Council is due to be established in February 2005 by a presidential decree specifying the multisectoral composition of the Council, which will include civil society organizations as well as children and youth.
- 10. The Committee recommends that the State party strengthen the institutional

capacity of existing institutions, including the Vice-Ministry for Youth, Children and the Elderly, inter alia by increasing their human and financial resources. It also recommends that the State party pursue its efforts towards the creation of the National Council for Children, and of subnational councils in all departments and municipalities of the country. The State party is encouraged to seek technical assistance from, among others. UNICEF and the American Children's Institute in this regard.

## Independent monitoring structures

- 11. While appreciating the work done by the Office of the Ombudsperson (*Defensor del Pueblo*) in the area of children's rights, the Committee notes the absence of a national independent mechanism with a specific mandate to receive complaints from children and regularly monitor and evaluate progress in the implementation of the Convention.
- 12. The Committee recommends that the State party establish either a deputy ombudsperson, a section within the Office

- of the Ombudsperson, or a separate children's ombudsperson, supported with sufficient human and financial resources, for an independent and effective monitoring of the implementation of children's rights in accordance with the Committee's general comment No. 2 (2002) on the role of independent national human rights institutions in the promotion and protection of the rights of the child.
- 13. While welcoming the establishment of local children's authorities for the implementation of children's rights (*defensorías municipales de la niñez y adolescencia*), the Committee regrets that this decentralized service designed to protect the rights of the child still does not cover all regions, and that adequate funding has not been allocated to these institutions to ensure their effective functioning.
- 14. The Committee recommends that the State party take the necessary measures to achieve the establishment of *defensorías* in all municipalities, as envisaged in the Code for Children and Adolescents, and to ensure their effective functioning, including by raising

awareness among municipal authorities of the importance of these bodies to the protection of children.

### National Plan of Action

- 15. While noting the existence of various parallel national programmes and plans of action, such as the National Plan of Action on Children and Adolescents at Risk and the Project for the Defence of the Rights of Children and Adolescents, the Committee regrets that subsequent to the Ten-Year Plan of Action for Women and Children (1992-2002), no new national plan of action on children has, as yet, been formulated.
- 16. The Committee recommends that the State party adopt a comprehensive National Plan of Action on Children and ensure that it is rights based, reflects cultural diversity, covers all areas of the Convention, and takes into account the outcome document "A world fit for children", adopted by the General Assembly at its special session on children held in 2002. The State party should allocate sufficient resources towards its realization and the effective

functioning of the body that will be charged with its promotion, coordination and monitoring. The State party should also ensure the coordinated and integrated implementation of the different national programmes and plans of action for children and allocate sufficient resources to their implementation.

#### Data collection

- 17. Despite some improvements in the system of data collection, the Committee remains concerned about inadequate mechanisms to collect, systematize and analyse disaggregated statistical data on children and adolescents. In particular, it regrets the lack of data on education, children with disabilities, children who need special protection and indigenous children.
- 18. The Committee recommends that the State party continue to strengthen its efforts to develop a system for the comprehensive collection of comparative and disaggregated data on the Convention. The data should cover all children below the age of 18 years and be disaggregated by sex and by groups of children who are

in need of special protection. The Committee recommends that the State party develop indicators to effectively monitor and evaluate progress achieved in the implementation of the Convention and assess the impact of policies that affect children. The State party is encouraged to seek technical assistance from UNICEF and the Inter-American Children's Institute in this respect.

### Resources for children

- 19. The Committee notes with concern that budget allocations for children, including public policies for the protection of rights, social services and education, are insufficient to implement the rights of all children. The low execution rate of budgets in the social area is also a cause for concern.
- 20. The Committee recommends that the State party strengthen its efforts to significantly increase the proportion of the budget allocated to the realization of children's rights to the "maximum extent ... of available resources", including through international cooperation,

giving special attention to children belonging to economically disadvantaged groups. The State party should ensure that international cooperation in its various forms supports national plans to implement the Convention.

## Training/dissemination of the Convention

- 21. While welcoming the translation of the Convention into Aymará, Quechua and Guaraní and the production of a popular version of the Convention, the Committee remains concerned about the low awareness of the Convention among professionals working with and for children and among the general public, especially among children themselves.
- 22. The Committee encourages the State party:
  - (a) To take effective measures to disseminate information on the Convention and its implementation among children and parents, civil society and all sectors and levels of government:

- (b) To develop systematic and ongoing training programmes on human rights, including children's rights, for all persons working for and with children (e.g. judges, lawyers, law enforcement officials, civil servants, local government officials, teachers, social workers, health personnel and, especially, children themselves);
- (c) To seek international assistance from UNICEF, the Inter-American Children's Institute, international NGOs and other international organizations.

### 2. Definition of the child

- 23. While welcoming the abandoning of the use of a biological criterion for puberty and the age of maturity, in line with its previous recommendations (CRC/C/ 15/ Add. 95, para. 16), the Committee is concerned at the low legal minimum age for contracting marriage and that different minimum legal ages for marriage are set for girls (14) and boys (16).
- 24. The Committee recommends that the State party set the minimum age for

marriage for girls and for boys at a higher and equal level. The State party is also advised to undertake awareness-raising campaigns and other measures to prevent early marriages.

# 3. General principles

Non-discrimination

- 25. The Committee is deeply concerned about the significant disparities in the State party in the implementation of the rights enshrined in the Convention, reflected in a range of social indicators like enrolment in and completion of education, infant mortality rates and birth registration, indicating persistent discrimination against indigenous children, girls, children with disabilities and children living in rural areas.
- 26. In light of article 2 of the Convention, the Committee recommends that the State party intensify its efforts to prevent and eliminate all forms of de facto discrimination against indigenous children, children with disabilities, girls and children living in rural areas.

### Best interests of the child

- 27. The Committee notes that the Code for Children and Adolescents stipulates that the principle of the best interests of the child, contained in article 3 of the Convention, is a primary consideration in all measures concerning children. However, the Committee is concerned that this principle is not given adequate attention in national legislation and policies and that awareness of its significance is low among the population.
- 28. The Committee recommends that the State party take measures to raise awareness of the meaning and practical application of the principle of the best interests of the child and ensure that article 3 of the Convention is duly reflected in its legislation and administrative measures.

## Respect for the views of the child

29. The Committee welcomes the efforts of the State party to promote and implement the right of children to express their views and actively participate at various levels of society. However, it

- remains concerned at the persistence of traditional attitudes in the State party which, among other things, limit children's right to participation and to express their views. It notes with concern the limited possibilities available to children to participate in and express their views in decision-making procedures affecting them, particularly in schools and communities.
- 30. In light of article 12 of the Convention, the Committee recommends that the State party:
  - (a) Strengthen its efforts to promote within the family, schools, and other institutions respect for the views of children, especially girls, and facilitate their participation in all matters affecting them;
  - (b) Strengthen national awareness-raising campaigns to change traditional attitudes that limit children's right to participation;
  - (c) Continue to strengthen children's participation in councils, forums, children's parliaments and the like;

(d) Regularly review the extent to which children's views are taken into consideration, including their impact on relevant policies and programmes.

## 4. Civil rights and freedoms

#### Birth registration

- 31. While noting the efforts made by the State party to ensure that all births are registered and that all children are issued birth certificates, the Committee is concerned that a large number of children in the State party do not have a birth certificate. It also notes with concern the large proportion of indigenous children who are not registered with the Civil Registry.
- 32. The Committee recommends that the State party strengthen its efforts to ensure that children are registered at birth and organize, through special measures and in accordance with the law, the registration of children who were not registered at birth, giving special attention to indigenous children, including by providing for such registra-

tion free of charge. The Committee also recommends that the State party undertake efforts to raise awareness of the importance of birth registration for children for the full enjoyment of their rights.

Torture and other cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment

- 33. The Committee is concerned at reported cases of police brutality against children in the State party.
- 34. The Committee recommends that the State party adopt measures to prevent and eliminate all kinds of institutional violence. It also recommends that the State party ensure that alleged cases of police brutality against children are duly investigated and that those responsible for such crimes are prosecuted.

# Corporal punishment

35. The Committee expresses deep concern that, despite its prohibition in the Code for Children and Adolescents, corporal punishment is still widely used within

- the family and in schools and other institutions.
- 36. The Committee recommends that the State party take effective measures, including through public awareness campaigns, to promote positive, participatory and non-violent forms of discipline as an alternative to corporal punishment at all levels of society, and to effectively implement the law prohibiting corporal punishment.

# 5. Family environment and alternative care

Children deprived of their family environment

- 37. The Committee is concerned about the large number of children separated from their parents who are living in institutions in the State party, despite the State party's intention to reduce the number of institutionalized children. It also notes with concern that parents in some cases place their children in institutions for economic reasons.
- 38. The Committee recommends that the

State party take effective measures to reduce institutionalization of children by undertaking well-targeted efforts to return children to their parents and by strengthening and supporting the system of foster care and, whenever appropriate, domestic adoption. The State party should ensure that placements in institutions are periodically reviewed.

#### Children with an imprisoned parent

- 39. The Committee reiterates its concern about the situation of children living in prisons with one of their parents and about the living conditions of these children and the regulation of their care if they are separated from their parent in prison.
- 40. The Committee recommends that the State party develop and implement clear guidelines on the placement of children with their parent in prison, in instances where this is considered to be in the best interest of the child (e.g. the age of the children, the length of stay, contact with the outside world and movement in and outside the prison) and ensure that the living conditions in prisons are adequate

for the child's development, as required by article 27 of the Convention. It further recommends that the State party develop and implement adequate alternative care for children who are removed from prison, which is regularly supervised and allows the child to maintain personal relations and direct contact with its parent remaining in prison.

## Adoption

- 41. The Committee welcomes measures taken to strengthen the protection of the rights of adopted children. However, the Committee is concerned about the limited understanding and acceptance in the State party that domestic adoptions are more desirable than intercountry adoptions, the lack of mechanisms to prepare prospective adoptive parents, and the lack of mechanisms to follow up and monitor the situation of adopted children and children placed in foster care. The Committee is also deeply concerned about the continuing occurrence of illegal adoptions.
- 42. The Committee recommends that the State party develop and implement a

comprehensive adoption policy and raise awareness of the importance of domestic adoption. As stipulated in article 21 (b) of the Convention, intercountry adoption should be considered an alternative means of childcare only if an adoptive family or foster care placement cannot be found within the country. Effective mechanisms to review, monitor and follow up adoption of children should be established. The Committee urges the State party to strengthen its efforts to prevent illegal adoptions and to ensure that its legislation and practice on national and international adoptions is brought into line with article 21 of Hague Convention and the Convention, respectively. The central authorities should be provided with adequate resources to regulate and monitor the activities of international adoption agencies in the State party.

# Abuse and neglect, maltreatment and violence

43. The Committee remains deeply concerned at the extent of abuse and violence within the family. While noting that new legal protection measures have been introduced by the Code for

Children and Adolescents, the Committee regrets the lack of a clear national policy to combat these phenomena.

- 44. The Committee recommends that the State party strengthen its current efforts to address the problem of domestic violence and child abuse, including through:
  - (a) Ensuring the effective implementation of the relevant provisions of the Code for Children and Adolescents;
  - (b) Public education campaigns about the negative consequences of ill-treatment, and prevention programmes, including family development programmes, that promote positive, nonviolent forms of discipline;
  - (c) Ensuring that all victims of violence have access to counselling and assistance with recovery and reintegration;
  - (d) Providing adequate protection to child victims of abuse in their homes.

#### 6. Basic health and welfare

Children with disabilities

- 45. The Committee regrets the lack of official data on the number of children with disabilities in the State party and that children with disabilities continue to face various forms of discrimination. The Committee also notes with concern the lack of public assistance and special education for children with disabilities; the large number of children with disabilities who do not attend any form of school education, especially in rural areas; and the lack of an integration policy in general for these children.
- 46. The Committee recommends that the State party take all necessary measures:
  - (a) To address all issues of discrimination, including social discrimination and discrimination against children with disabilities in rural areas;
  - (b) To collect accurate statistical data on children with disabilities;
  - (c) To ensure and monitor the implementation of the Equality of

Opportunity Act and Policy and to take into consideration the Standard Rules on the Equalization of Opportunities for Persons with Disabilities (General Assembly resolution 48/96, annex);

(d) To provide equal educational opportunities for children with disabilities, including by providing the necessary support and ensuring that teachers are trained to educate children with disabilities within regular schools.

#### Basic health and welfare

47. The Committee welcomes the improvement of primary health-care coverage, including the basic health insurance scheme (SUMI) that provides free medical care for children up to 5 years of age and their mothers. The Committee is concerned, however, that not all children, especially indigenous children, benefit from SUMI. It also remains deeply concerned that post-natal health care is still inadequate and that mortality rates and other health indicators are significantly worse in rural areas. The Committee is further concerned that, despite a significant decrease, infant

mortality rates remain very high, and well above the regional average. Furthermore, the Committee is deeply concerned at the high levels of malnutrition among children in the State party and at the limited use of breastfeeding. While noting that the prevalence rate of HIV/AIDS is relatively low in the State party, the Committee expresses concern at its considerable increase in recent years.

48. The Committee recommends that the State party continue to strengthen its efforts in improving the health situation of children in the State party and their access to quality health services in all areas of the country, particularly rural areas. It also recommends that the State party take measures to ensure that all children benefit from SUMI. Furthermore, the State party should ensure that mothers are encouraged to rely exclusively on breastfeeding for six months after birth, with the addition of appropriate infant diet thereafter. The Committee also recommends that the State party complete and implement the draft law on HIV/AIDS.

#### Adolescent health

- 49. The Committee is concerned about the large number of teenage pregnancies and sexually transmitted infections (STIs), as well as the lack of programmes on sexual and reproductive health. It is also concerned at the high incidence of alcohol and tobacco abuse in the State party.
- 50. The Committee recommends that the State party pay close attention to adolescent health, taking into account the Committee's general comment No. 4 (2003) on adolescent health and development in the context Convention on the Rights of the Child. In particular, the State party is encouraged to strengthen sexual and reproductive health education for adolescents, especially in schools, with a view to reducing the incidence of teenage pregnancies and STIs, and to provide teenage pregnant girls with the necessary assistance and access to health care and education. The Committee also recommends that the State party continue and strengthen measures to address the issue of alcohol and tobacco abuse among children.

Social security and childcare services and facilities; standard of living

- 51. While welcoming the formulation of Bolivia's poverty reduction strategy, which sets out a national plan of action up to 2015, the Committee notes with concern the persistent high rate of poverty in the State party, especially in rural areas.
- 52. The Committee recommends that the State party take the necessary measures to ensure the continuing implementation of the national poverty reduction strategy, targeting the most disadvantaged regions and groups and ensuring that the needs of all children are met and their rights duly protected. The State party is encouraged to seek international cooperation and assistance whenever necessary.

# 7. Education, leisure and cultural activities

Education, including vocational training and guidance

- 53. While welcoming the recent reform of the education system and the increase in coverage of both primary and secondary education achieved in the last years, the Committee is concerned at continuing low enrolment rates, especially among girls and indigenous children; the considerable disparities in the coverage and quality of education between urban and rural areas; and high dropout rates and persistently high illiteracy rates, particularly among rural and indigenous children and girls. The Committee is also concerned at the low percentage of children enrolled in pre-primary education. The lack of access to educational programmes for juvenile offenders is also a cause of concern.
- 54. The Committee encourages the State party:
  - (a) To provide sufficient funding to ensure free education at all levels of primary and secondary education;

- (b) To strengthen efforts to bridge the gaps in the coverage and quality of education throughout the country;
- (c) To strengthen efforts to bridge the gender disparity in education, giving special attention to promoting the education of rural girls;
- (d) To take measures to identify the causes of the high dropout rate in schools, particularly in rural areas, and to take steps to address the situation;
- (e) To strengthen educational and vocational programmes for children who do not attend regular school education;
- (f) To ensure that all juvenile offenders have access to adequate educational and vocational programmes in detention centres:
- (g) To ensure the accessibility of preschool programmes with the assistance of communities at the local level;
- (h) To take steps to provide adequate training to teachers and improve the quality of teaching and learning methods;

(i) To ratify the UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education of 1960.

## Aims of education

- 55. The Committee notes the absence of a national educational plan for human rights education in the State party.
- 56. The Committee recommends that the State party adopt and implement a national educational plan for human rights education, taking into account the Committee's general comment No. 1 (2001) on the aims of education.

## 8. Special protection measures

### Refugee children

57. The Committee notes with concern the lack of specific procedures for providing special care and assistance to children, in particular unaccompanied minors and separated children, under the refugee determination system. 58. The Committee recommends that the State party establish a fully functioning and comprehensive refugee status determination mechanism, ensuring full respect for the principle of non-refoulement, and, in particular, introduce specific procedures for the treatment of unaccompanied and separated minors.

## Economic exploitation

- 59. While welcoming the measures taken by the State party to combat the worst forms of child labour, including through cooperation with ILO/IPEC, Committee expresses its deep concerned at the widespread occurrence of child labour in the State party and at the absence of rights-based policies to protect the rights of children and adolescents involved in child labour. The Committee is particularly concerned about the large number of child domestic workers, who are vulnerable to abuse, and about children working in mines, on sugar cane plantations and in other hazardous conditions.
- 60. The Committee urges the State to strengthen measures to combat child

labour. It recommends, in this regard, that the State party formulate, in a participatory manner, a strategy and plan of action to eliminate the worst forms of child labour as well as to safeguard the rights of working children. Committee also recommends that the State party strengthen the labour inspectorate to ensure the effective implementation of child labour laws, including the prohibition against employing children under the age of 18 in harmful or hazardous work. The State party is encouraged to give priority to children working in the sugar cane and mining industries and to child domestic workers, with special attention to the rights of the girl child, and to continue to seek assistance from ILO/IPEC in this respect.

## Use of harmful substances

- 61. The Committee notes with concern the increasing number of children who use drugs and harmful substances in the State party.
- 62. The Committee recommends that the State party:

- (a) Formulate a rights-based plan of action for the protection of children and adolescents from the dangers of drugs and harmful substances, and involve children in its formulation and implementation;
- (b) Provide children with accurate and objective information about the harmful consequences of substance abuse;
- (c) Ensure that children using drugs and harmful substances are treated as victims and not as criminals;
- (d) Develop recovery and reintegration services for child victims of substance abuse;
- (e) Seek cooperation with and assistance from WHO and UNICEE.

## Sexual exploitation and trafficking

63. The Committee is concerned about the extent of sexual exploitation and trafficking of children for this or other purposes, in particular economic exploitation, in the State party and about the lack of effective programmes to address this problem.

- 64. In light of articles 34 and 35 and other related articles of the Convention, the Committee recommends that the State party:
  - (a) Conduct a comprehensive study to assess the causes, nature and extent of trafficking in children for various purposes including commercial sexual exploitation;
  - (b) Proceed with plans to amend the Penal Code so as to make the exploitation and trafficking of children criminal offences;
  - (c) Strengthen measures and adopt multidisciplinary and multisectoral approaches to prevent and combat trafficking in children and sexual exploitation of children and adolescents;
  - (d) Undertake awareness-raising campaigns, particularly for parents;
  - (e) Ensure that trafficked children and children who have been subjected to sexual and economic exploitation are always treated as victims and that perpetrators are prosecuted;

- (f) Provide adequate programmes of assistance and reintegration for sexually exploited and/or trafficked children in accordance with the Declaration and Agenda for Action and the Global Commitment adopted at the 1996 and 2001 World Congresses against Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children;
- (g) Ratify the Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children, supplementing the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime, signed by the State party in December 2000;
- (h) Collaborate with NGOs working on these issues and seek technical assistance from, among others, the Inter-American Children's Institute and UNICEE

#### Street children

65. The Committee expresses concern at the rise in the number of street children in the State party.

66. The Committee recommends that the State party strengthen its efforts to provide assistance to street children, including health care; reintegration services for physical, sexual and substance abuse; services for reconciliation with families; and education, including vocational and life-skills training. The Committee also recommends that the State party cooperate and coordinate its efforts with civil society and undertake a study on the nature and extent of the problem. The State party is encouraged to seek technical assistance from, among others, UNICEE.

## Administration of juvenile justice

67. The Committee welcomes the legislative improvements in the rules applicable to children in conflict with the law. However, it is concerned that the juvenile justice system still has serious shortcomings in practice, such as the lack of adequate alternatives to pre-trial and other forms of detention, the very poor living conditions of juveniles detained in police stations or other institutions, the length of pre-trial detention and the fact

- that according to the information provided in the written replies thousands of persons below the age of 18 are detained with adults.
- 68. The Committee recommends that the State party take the necessary measures to ensure that the rules, regulations and practice of the juvenile justice system are in conformity with articles 37, 39 and 40 of the Convention and other relevant international standards and are applied with respect to all persons below 18 years who are in conflict with the law. In this regard, the Committee more specifically recommends that the State party:
  - (a) Develop and implement alternatives to pre-trial and other forms of detention in order to ensure that deprivation of liberty is really a measure of last resort for the shortest time possible;
  - (b) Develop and implement adequate socio-educational programmes and appropriate probation and parole arrangements for juvenile offenders;
  - (c) Take the necessary measures to significantly improve the living conditions

of juveniles deprived of their liberty and ensure that they are separated from adults;

- (d) Ensure that new detention centres for juveniles are not located in remote areas and are equipped with the necessary facilities for the rehabilitation of juveniles;
- (e) Continue and strengthen the training on the Convention and other relevant legislation for those responsible for administering juvenile justice;
- (f) Seek assistance from, inter alia, the Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights, the Centre for International Crime Prevention, regional institutions and UNICEE.

# 9. Follow-up and dissemination

## Follow-up

69. The Committee recommends that the State party take all appropriate measures to ensure the full implementation of the present recommendations, inter alia by transmitting them to the members of the National Congress, departmental councils and municipal governments for appropriate consideration and further action.

#### Dissemination

70. The Committee further recommends that the third periodic report, the written replies submitted by the State party and the related recommendations (concluding observations) adopted by the Committee be made widely available, including (but not exclusively) through the Internet, to the public at large, civil society organizations, youth groups and children in order to generate debate and awareness of the Convention, its implementation and monitoring.

## 10. Next report

71. The Committee expects to receive the fourth periodic report of the State party, which should not exceed 120 pages (see CRC/C/118), on 2 September 2007, the date on which it is due.