



Australian Government
Refugee Review Tribunal

Country Advice

Pakistan

Pakistan – PAK37775 – Turis – Bangash –
Syyed – Shi'ite Pashtuns – Kurram Agency
– Kohat – Hangu – Safe havens –
Internally Displaced Persons – Internal
relocation

14 January 2011

- 1. Are there any examples of members of the Turi tribe being targeted for harm in Pakistan's major cities? Please provide recent, relevant information concerning the relocation of Shi'ite Pashtuns from FATA/NWFP to other parts of Pakistan.**

No sources have been located that state that the Shi'ite Pashtun Turis have been specifically targeted for harm outside of their home region of Kurram Agency. However, there are reports of Shi'ite Pashtuns being specifically targeted in regions where large numbers of Turi and Bangash internally displaced persons (IDPs) have relocated. This response therefore discusses the issue of relocation of Shi'ite Pashtuns by examining recent events in cities in Pakistan with large Pashtun and Shi'ite populations. The response also provides a brief background to the conflict that has displaced the two main Shi'ite Pashtun tribes in Pakistan, the Turi and the Bangash.

Background

The Turi are a Pashto-speaking tribe who have historically lived in the Upper Kurram Valley of Kurram Agency, Pakistan. Unlike the overwhelming majority of Pashtuns, the Turi are almost exclusively Shi'ite Muslims. A number of clans within the Bangash tribe are also Shi'ite.¹

The Turi have a long history of conflict with Sunni members of the Bangash tribe and, more recently, the Haqqani Network, a major faction of the Afghani Taliban.^{2 3} Recently adding further to the complexity of conflict in Kurram is the presence of Tehrik-i-Taliban Pakistan (TTP), whose members have established themselves in Kurram and neighbouring Orakzai following major offensives by the Pakistan Army in South Waziristan in late 2009/early 2010.⁴ Both the Haqqani Network and the TTP have thrown their military

¹ Chandran, S. 2008, 'Sectarian Violence in Pakistan's Kurram Agency', Pakistan Security Research Unit (PSRU), Brief Number 40, 22 September, p.3
<http://spaces.brad.ac.uk:8080/download/attachments/748/Brief+40.pdf> – Accessed 23 November 2010 – Attachment 1

² Khan, M.I. 2010, 'The Pakistani tribe that is taking on the Taliban', *BBC News*, 7 October
<http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-south-asia-11486528> – Accessed 14 October 2010 – Attachment 2

³ 'Siraj Haqqani sheltering in Kurram, near area of US helicopter strikes' 2010, *The Long War Journal*, , 22 October http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2010/10/siraj_haqqani_shelte.php – Accessed 11 November 2010 – Attachment 3

⁴ 'Kurram Agency and the U.S. and Pakistan's Divergent Interests' 2010, *Stratfor Global Intelligence*, 2 November

support behind Sunni Bangash clans in their long running conflict with the Turi regarding land and other resources.

Both the Haqqani Network and the TTP adhere to a strict Deobandi theology that is violently opposed to Shia Islam, as well as the more moderate Barelvi Islam that is practiced by the majority of Sunni Pakistanis. As a consequence of their fierce resistance to the Haqqani and the TTP, the Turi tribe have gained an international profile and have raised the ire of Deobandi militants throughout South Asia.⁵ Furthermore, large numbers of Turi have become internally displaced, with most internally displaced persons (IDPs) relocating to either the Upper Kurram headquarters of Parachinar, or the districts of Hangu and Kohat in nearby Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa, which have their own sizeable Pashtun Shi'ite populations.

In September and October 2010, sources report that the Haqqani Network is actively seeking a peace deal with the Turi and their two known militias, the Kurram Hizbullah and the Mahdi militia.^{6 7 8} In November 2010 it was also reported that secret talks have been held between Kurram elders, Haqqani Network senior commanders, and the TTP in Islamabad. In late November 2010 *Dawn* reported that these talks failed to reach a peace deal due to the Turi's refusal to allow Afghan Taliban forces to use the Thall-Parachinar road.⁹

Further complicating the situation for the Turi, and indeed for NATO objectives in Afghanistan, is the fact that the Haqqani Network has very close links with Pakistan's Inter-Services Intelligence (ISI), who support the network in the hope of providing Islamabad with leverage in any post-conflict government in Kabul, which they believe will inevitably include members of the Afghan Taliban.^{10 11 12} This places the Turi at odds with the top security/intelligence organisation in the country, adding another dimension to their well-being. According to Stratfor Global Intelligence, Islamabad and the ISI would

http://www.stratfor.com/analysis/20101101_kurram_agency_and_us_and_pakistans_divergent_interests – Accessed 11 January 2010 – Attachment 4

⁵ Khan, M.I. 2010, 'The Pakistani tribe that is taking on the Taliban', *BBC News*, 7 October

<http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-south-asia-11486528> – Accessed 14 October 2010 – Attachment 2

⁶ 'Taliban in peace talks with Kurram's Turi tribe' 2010, *Daily Times*, 29 October

http://www.dailytimes.com.pk/default.asp?page=2010%5C10%5C29%5Cstory_29-10-2010_pg7_3 – Accessed 24 November 2010 – Attachment 5

⁷ Ali, Z. 2010, 'Taliban trying to end tribal clashes in Kurram', *Dawn*, 16 September

<http://news.dawn.com/wps/wcm/connect/dawn-content-library/dawn/the-newspaper/front-page/taliban-trying-to-end-tribal-clashes-in-kurram-690> – Accessed 24 November 2010 – Attachment 6

⁸ 'Taliban may strike deal with Turi tribe' 2010, *The News*, 29 October <http://www.thenews.com.pk/29-10-2010/National/12684.htm> – Accessed 24 November 2010 – Attachment 7

⁹ 'Kurram elders hold talks with TTP, Haqqani commanders' 2010, *Dawn*, 30 November

<http://news.dawn.com/wps/wcm/connect/dawn-content-library/dawn/the-newspaper/front-page/kurram-elders-hold-talks-with-ttp-haqqani-commanders-010> – Accessed 11 January 2010 – Attachment 8

¹⁰ Waldman, M. 2010, *The Sun In The Sky: The Relationship Between Pakistan's ISI and Afghan Insurgents*, Crisis States Research Centre, Discussion Paper 18, June, p.3

<http://www.crisisstates.com/download/dp/DP%2018.pdf> – Accessed 13 January 2011 – Attachment 9

¹¹ 'Siraj Haqqani sheltering in Kurram, near area of US helicopter strikes' 2010, *The Long War Journal*, 22 October http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2010/10/siraj_haqqani_shelte.php – Accessed 11 November 2010 – Attachment 3

¹² 'U.S. concerns grow as militants move bases along Pakistan border' 2010, *The Los Angeles Times*, 7

November <http://www.latimes.com/news/nationworld/world/la-fg-pakistan-haqqani-20101108.0.7180350.story> Accessed 9 November 2010 – Attachment 10

prefer a peaceful settlement between the Turi and the Haqqani Network.¹³ The previous 2008 Murree Agreement has never been implemented.¹⁴

The Central FATA agencies and neighbouring districts of Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa are home to various other Shi'ite Pashtun tribes. There is also a sizeable Shi'ite Pashtun minority living in Peshawar; however, precise numbers have not been located. These Shi'ite Pashtun communities were the primary destinations for Shi'ite Pashtun IDPs from Kurram and Orakzai. The following sections examine whether these districts constitute safe-havens for FATA's Shi'ite IDPs. Also examined is whether other centres outside of Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa with large Pashtun populations might also constitute safe-havens.

NB: The law in Pakistan provides for freedom of movement within the country; however, the US Department of State writes that the Pakistani government limits this right in practice.¹⁵

Kohat

Kohat has a large Shi'ite Pashtun minority, especially in the towns of Chikarkot Bala, Sherkot, Kachai and Usterzai Payan. Usterzai Payan reportedly has the largest Shia population in the district and is home to the Shia run Al-Asar College and a large Shia Bangash population. Other villages with Shia Bangash populations include Chiker Kot Bala, Ali Zo, Khadi Zai, Sher Kot, Usterzai Bala, Khwaja, Khizar, Jauzara, Raisan, Lodikhel, Imbrhamzi, and Kachai.¹⁶

Relief Web, the United Nations Office for the Coordination of Humanitarian Affairs (OCHA) information service, reported in February 2010 that Shia IDPs in Kohat were "terrified" of officially registering, with many expressing fear of venturing outdoors altogether. So strong is this fear that only 1,300 of the estimated 3,300 Shi'ite IDP families from the FATA in the district have registered for assistance. Relief Web adds that local Kohat Shi'ites believe that the presence of Shia IDPs from Kurram and Orakzai has increased their own risk of being harmed by extremists.¹⁷

There is evidence to suggest that this fear is not simply a symptom of post-traumatic stress disorder (PTSD). On 17 April 2010 an IDP camp for Shi'ites in Kacha Pakha, Kohat was hit by two suicide bombs, killing 41 people. The IDPs were reportedly standing in a registration queue when the first attack took place. According to one source, "the second suicide bomber struck minutes later when people rushed to the spot to help the injured." Lashkar-e-Jhangvi al Alami claimed responsibility for the attacks. Kacha Pakha was also

¹³ 'Kurram Agency and the U.S. and Pakistan's Divergent Interests' 2010, Stratfor Global Intelligence, 2 November

http://www.stratfor.com/analysis/20101101_kurram_agency_and_us_and_pakistans_divergent_interests – Accessed 11 January 2010 – Attachment 11

¹⁴ Munir, A. 2010, 'Ending Kurram's sectarian strife', *The Express Tribune*, 25 June

<http://tribune.com.pk/story/23495/ending-kurrans-sectarian-strife/> – Accessed 29 October 2010 – Attachment 12

¹⁵ US Department of State 2010, *Country Reports on Human Rights Practices for 2009 – Pakistan*, March, Section 2(d) – Attachment 52

¹⁶ 'Kohat' 2010, WordPress.com, 30 April <http://meetcornor.wordpress.com/2010/04/page/2/> – Accessed 11 January 2011 – Attachment 13

¹⁷ 'PAKISTAN: Shia IDPs fearful of being targeted' 2010, Relief Web, 11 February

<http://www.reliefweb.int/rw/rwb.nsf/db900SID/AMMF-82KMC8?OpenDocument> – Accessed 12 January 2011 – Attachment 14

hit by a suicide bomber in September 2009, in which 33 people, mostly Shi'ite Pashtuns, were killed.¹⁸

Hangu

Hangu is home to a large community of both Shia and Sunni Bangash. Religious affiliation among the Bangash appears to be divided along clan lines, with Alizai, Ibrahimzai, Jawz, Lodhi Khel, Marai, Mussa Khel, Raisan, Shawo, Sher Kot, and Ustarzai clans all believed to be exclusively Shia. The Hangu clan is unusual in that it is both Shia and Sunni.¹⁹

Like Kohat, Hangu is also home to a large number of Sunni and Shia IDPs from the neighbouring FATA agencies. Precise demographic information on these IDPs is not available as, like their counterparts in Kohat, almost all Shia IDPs in the district are unregistered. According to a February 2010 report on behalf of IDP service providers, Shia IDPs in Hangu strongly fear that they will be targeted for harm in Sunni dominated areas, where the majority of registration centres are based.²⁰ Again, this fear is not without foundation. According to Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa government statistics, in 2009 16 Shia were killed and 19 injured in Hangu in targeted attacks.²¹ In 2010 there have been a number of further targeted attacks, including:

- In December 2010 a suicide bombing happened at the Al-Zahra Hospital in the Shia region of Pas Kalay, Hangu. Estimates of fatalities resulting from the blast range between 10 and 17. The hospital is owned and operated by a Shia NGO, the Al-Zahra Trust. According to reports, the blast also destroyed a number of houses in the vicinity.^{22 23}
- In mid-December 2010 rockets were reportedly fired on a Shi'ite Ashura parade in Hangu, killing 9 people.²⁴
- In March 2010, 12 Shia IDPs in Hangu returning to Parachinar in Kurram on a bus were killed by a bomber.²⁵

¹⁸ 'Life in Kurram and Orakzai Agencies of FATA' 2010, Geo Tau Aisay website, 31 May
<http://www.geotauaisay.com/2010/05/life-in-kurram-and-orakzai-agencies-of-fata/> – Accessed 11 January 2011 – Attachment 15

¹⁹ 'Program For Culture & Conflict Studies – Tribe: Bangash' 2010, Naval Postgraduate School, 8 April, p.3
<http://www.nps.edu/programs/ccs/Docs/Pakistan/Tribes/Bangash.pdf> – Accessed 12 January 2011 – Attachment 16

²⁰ 'Kohat and Hangu; Inter-Cluster Mission to Kohat & Hangu 28th January – 30th January' 2010, One Response website, 5 February, pp.7-8
<http://oneresponse.info/Countries/Pakistan/Coordination/publicdocuments/FINAL-Inter%20cluster%20assessment%20Kohat%20Hangu%2028th%20Jan%202010.pdf> – Accessed 12 January 2011 – Attachment 17

²¹ 'Internal Security Situation; Presentation to the Prime Minister of Islamic Republic of Pakistan' 2010, Government Of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Provincial Disaster Management Authority website, 4 March, p.16
http://www.pdma.gov.pk/PaRRSA/documents/Internal_Security_Situation.pdf – Accessed 12 January 2011 – Attachment 18

²² 'Suicide attack on Al- Zahra Hospital Hangu Pass Kalay' 2010, FATA Research Center
<http://www.frc.com.pk/Suicide%20attack%20on%20Al-%20Zahra%20Hospital%20Hangu%20Pass%20Kalay.htm> – Accessed 11 January 2011 – Attachment 19

²³ 'Terror Watch-Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (Pakistan)' 2011, Calcutta Tube, 9 January
<http://calcuttatube.com/terror-watch-khyber-pakhtunkhwa-pakistan/137845/> – Accessed 11 January 2011 – Attachment 20

²⁴ Dempsey, E. 2010, 'Rockets Fired in Hangu, 9 People Killed', Digital Journal, 17 December
<http://www.digitaljournal.com/article/301509> – Accessed 12 January 2011 – Attachment 21

For a comprehensive list of terrorism related incidents in Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa in 2010, see the South Asia Terrorism Portal Timeline for that year.²⁶

Kohat and Hangu were two of the worst affected regions by the 2010 flooding. This flooding is believed to have caused further displacement of both Sunni and Shia IDPs, some of whom have relocated to Pakistan's major cities.²⁷

Peshawar

Peshawar has been a major destination for both Shi'ite and Sunni Pashtuns fleeing conflict in the FATA and various parts of Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa (most recently Bajaur and Swat). Some of the largest IDP camps are located in the greater Peshawar area. Since anti-militant operations began in FATA agencies and Swat in 2009, people and places in Peshawar have become significant targets for terrorists. Some of the most significant events include:

- In April 2010 a suicide bomber detonated himself at a rally, killing over twenty, including a senior Shiite police officer and a local leader of the Jamaat-e-Islami, Pakistan's oldest Islamic party.²⁸
- The previous day two suicide bombers dressed in Burqas blew themselves up at an IDP camp near Peshawar, killing at least 41 and injuring dozens more.²⁹
- A suicide bombing in a market in Peshawar on 9 October 2009 killed more than 50 people.³⁰

In March 2010 the Internal Displacement Monitoring Centre reported that 40,000 IDPs who had fled FATA agencies to villages on the outskirts of Peshawar abandoned their camps after insurgents forced out of the Central FATA "began patrolling Peshawar".³¹

In December 2010 Turi and Bangash Shi'ite IDPs were reportedly informed by police in Peshawar that they would not be permitted to participate in the city's Ashura processions commemorating the month of Muharram.³² The Ashura procession is one of the important

²⁵ 'Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Timeline' 2010, South Asia Terrorism Portal <http://www.satp.org/satporgrp/countries/pakistan/nwfp/timeline/index.html> – Accessed 12 January 2011 – Attachment 22

²⁶ 'Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Timeline' 2010, South Asia Terrorism Portal <http://www.satp.org/satporgrp/countries/pakistan/nwfp/timeline/index.html> – Accessed 12 January 2011 – Attachment 22

²⁷ Internal Displacement Monitoring Centre 2010, *Pakistan: Flooding worsens situation for people displaced by conflict in north-west*, 6 September [http://www.internal-displacement.org/8025708F004BE3B1/\(httpInfoFiles\)/719B7634A7238264C12577960032832C/\\$file/Pakistan+-+September+2010.pdf](http://www.internal-displacement.org/8025708F004BE3B1/(httpInfoFiles)/719B7634A7238264C12577960032832C/$file/Pakistan+-+September+2010.pdf) – Accessed 23 November 2010 – Attachment 23

²⁸ Tavernise, S. 2010, 'Bomber Strikes Near Pakistan Rally; Police Officer Seen as Target', *The New York Times*, 19 April <http://www.nytimes.com/2010/04/20/world/asia/20pstan.html> – Accessed 20 April 2010 – Attachment 25

²⁹ Ali, L. 2010, 'Burqa bombers kill 41 at Pakistan camp', Google News, source: *AFP*, 18 April – Attachment 26

³⁰ UK Home Office 2010, *Country Of Origin Information Report – Pakistan*, 18 January, Section 8.17 – Attachment 24

³¹ Internal Displacement Monitoring Centre 2010, *Pakistan: Flooding worsens situation for people displaced by conflict in north-west*, 6 September [http://www.internal-displacement.org/8025708F004BE3B1/\(httpInfoFiles\)/719B7634A7238264C12577960032832C/\\$file/Pakistan+-+September+2010.pdf](http://www.internal-displacement.org/8025708F004BE3B1/(httpInfoFiles)/719B7634A7238264C12577960032832C/$file/Pakistan+-+September+2010.pdf) – Accessed 23 November 2010 – Attachment 23

³² 'Shia Turi Bangash tribes vows to observe Ayam-e-Aza of Muharram' 2010, Shia News website, 9 December <http://babulilmilibrary.com/news/shia-turi-bangash-tribes-vows-to-observe-ayam-e-aza-of-muharram> – Accessed 11 January 2011 – Attachment 27

rituals for Shi'ite males; however, in the past the processions have resulted in violence between Shi'ites and Sunnis across Pakistan, and Muharram is a month of heightened tensions between the two communities. As Shi'ite Turi and Bangash have proven formidable opponents of both Afghan and Pakistan Deobandi militants, it is highly likely that the police fear that their presence in Peshawar Ashura parades heightened the risk of militant attacks on these processions. At least one attack on Ashura processions in Peshawar in December 2010 was reported in the media; *Dawn* reported that a grenade attack a procession on 16 December killed a 2 year old child and injured 26 others.³³

Dera Ismail Khan

The city of Dera Ismail Khan (DIK) in southern Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa has sizeable Shia Pashtun minority population and the city has also attracted a number of Shia IDPs from FATA agencies. The city has, however, witnessed a number of attacks of Shi'ite Pashtuns, perhaps as a consequence of its location close to South Waziristan, considered to be home to the largest concentration of TTP affiliated groups.

Major attacks on Pashtun Shi'ites in DIK include:

- In February 2009 an explosion at a procession marking the death of Shia religious leader Imam Hussain killed 15 people and injured dozens.
- Later that same month approximately 25 people were killed and over 150 injured by a bomb at the funeral of a local Shia leader who had been killed by militants the previous day.³⁴

In 2009 a total of 55 Shia were killed and 196 were injured in attacks in DIK.³⁵ According to Relief Web, the Shia of DIK are seen by TTP affiliated organisations such as Laskar-e-Jhangvi (LeJ) and Jaish-e-Mohammad (JEM) as allies of the Americans.³⁶ It is also likely that these attacks are due to their violent opposition to Shia Islam.

Rawalpindi/Islamabad

The Rawalpindi/Islamabad conurbation is home to a Pashtun community, however, no recent statistics of the city's Shi'ite Pashtun population have been located; the Population Census Organization's most recent publicly available statistics date from 1998 and do not include a breakdown of each ethnic group's religion.³⁷ According to the City of Islamabad

³³ 'Peshawar grenade attack on Shia parade kills toddler' 2010, *Dawn*, source: *AFP*, 16 December <http://www.dawn.com/2010/12/16/low-intensity-explosion-at-yadgar-chowk-peshawar.html> – Accessed 11 January 2011 – Attachment 28

³⁴ Minority Rights Group International 2010, *State of the World's Minorities and Indigenous Peoples – Pakistan*, UNHCR Refworld, 1 July <http://www.unhcr.org/refworld/docid/4c33310cc.html> – Accessed 12 January 2011 – Attachment 29

³⁵ 'Internal Security Situation; Presentation to the Prime Minister of Islamic Republic of Pakistan' 2010, Government Of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Provincial Disaster Management Authority website, 4 March, p.16 http://www.pdma.gov.pk/PaRRSA/documents/Internal_Security_Situation.pdf – Accessed 12 January 2011 – Attachment 18

³⁶ 'PAKISTAN: Shia IDPs fearful of being targeted' 2010, Relief Web, 11 February <http://www.reliefweb.int/rw/rwb.nsf/db900SID/AMMF-82KMC8?OpenDocument> – Accessed 12 January 2011 – Attachment 14

³⁷ Population Census Organization website <http://www.census.gov.pk/PUNJAB/RAWALPINDI.htm> & <http://www.census.gov.pk/ibd.htm>

website, Pashtuns constitute 10.51 percent of that city's 1.2 million residents.³⁸ No official statistics have been located concerning the size or makeup of Rawalpindi's Pashtun community; however, Pashto is recorded as the mother tongue of only 1.15 percent of the population of Punjab as a whole.³⁹ Given its proximity to Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa, and recent conflicts there, it is highly likely that the Pashtun population of the city is considerably higher than the provincial average.

No sources have been located that describe targeted killings of Shi'ites in Islamabad and Rawalpindi in recent years. However, as the seat of national government and army GHQ respectively, the two cities have witnessed a large number of terrorist attacks and assassinations in recent years, most recently the assassination of the Governor of Punjab, Salman Taseer, on 4 January 2011. Taseer was murdered by his body guard due to the minister's vocal opposition to Pakistan's blasphemy law, which has been used by Sunnis to target Shi'ites, Ahmadis and Christians.⁴⁰

The most recent attack on a religious site in the two cities was the 4 December 2009 attack on a Sunni mosque in Rawalpindi. According to *BBC News*, 35 people were killed in the attack.⁴¹ For more information on general security incidents in Rawalpindi and Islamabad, including terrorist attacks, see *Research Response PAK35162*.⁴²

Karachi

The devastating flooding of Pakistan in July 2010 caused a significant number of FATA IDPs in Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa to be displaced once again. The Norway based Internal Displacement Monitoring Centre (IDMC) reports that while some of these IDPs reluctantly returned to FATA agencies, an unspecified number have moved to Karachi.⁴³ Karachi's attraction to Pashtun IDPs is that it now constitutes the largest urban community of Pashtuns in South Asia; conservative estimates currently put the Pashtun population of Karachi at over four million.⁴⁴ Some estimates place the Pashtun population of the city at over seven million.⁴⁵

No statistics have been located indicating what percentage of the Karachi Pashtun population is Shi'ite; however, it is likely that it reflects the overall Pashtun population, approximately 1 percent.⁴⁶ The Jamestown Foundation's *Terrorism Monitor* reported in

³⁸ 'Islamabad Demographics' 2009, City of Islamabad website <http://www.visitislamabad.net/islamabad/files/file-detail.asp?var=demographics> – Accessed 12 January 2011 – Attachment 53

³⁹ 'POPULATION BY MOTHER TONGUE' (undated), Population Census Organization website <http://www.census.gov.pk/MotherTongue.htm> – Accessed 13 January 2011 – Attachment 30

⁴⁰ 'Punjab Governor Salman Taseer assassinated in Islamabad' 2011, *BBC News*, 4 January <http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-south-asia-12111831> – Accessed 13 January 2011 – Attachment 31

⁴¹ 'Pakistan mosque attack 'kills 35'' 2009, *BBC News*, 4 December http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/south_asia/8394694.stm – Accessed 13 January 2011 – Attachment 32

⁴² MRT Research & Information 2009, *Research Response PAK35162*, 24 September – Attachment 33

⁴³ Internal Displacement Monitoring Centre 2010, *Pakistan: Flooding worsens situation for people displaced by conflict in north-west*, 6 September, p.10 [http://www.internal-displacement.org/8025708F004BE3B1/\(httpInfoFiles\)/719B7634A7238264C12577960032832C/\\$file/Pakistan+-+September+2010.pdf](http://www.internal-displacement.org/8025708F004BE3B1/(httpInfoFiles)/719B7634A7238264C12577960032832C/$file/Pakistan+-+September+2010.pdf) – Accessed 23 November 2010 – Attachment 23

⁴⁴ Ahmed, K. 2010, 'The Pakhtun in Karachi', *The Express Tribune*, 28 August <http://tribune.com.pk/story/43827/the-pakhtun-in-karachi/> – Accessed 29 October 2010 – Attachment 34

⁴⁵ Obaid-Chinoy, S. 2009, 'Pakistan: Karachi's Invisible Enemy City potent refuge for Taliban fighters', *PBS* (USA), 17 July http://www.pbs.org/frontlineworld/rough/2009/07/karachis_invisi.html – Accessed 29 April 2010 – Attachment 35

⁴⁶ Schetter, C. 2003, 'Ethnicity and the Political Reconstruction in Afghanistan', Arbeitsgemeinschaft Afghanistan website, 21 May, p.2 <http://www.ag-afghanistan.de/arg/arp/schetter.pdf> – Accessed 5 January 2011 – Attachment 36

July 2010 that Shi'ites of various ethnic backgrounds constituted approximately 30 percent of Karachi's Muslim population.⁴⁷

No reports have been located that state that Shi'ite Pashtun tribes and sub-clans such as the Turi and Bangash have been specifically targeted for harm in Karachi. There are, however, numerous examples of both Shi'ites groups and individuals being targeted for harm for both ethnic and sectarian reasons.

Recent examples of mass attacks on Shi'ites in the city include the 27 December 2009 roadside bomb attack on an Ashura procession that injured at least 26 persons. The attack was attributed to Lashkar-e-Jhangvi. Two days later a suicide bomber attacked a second Shi'a religious procession in the city, killing 25 and injuring more than 50.⁴⁸

Equally significant has been a campaign of targeted assassinations of Shi'ite professionals in the city; Jamestown Foundation's *Terrorism Monitor* states that in the first six months of 2010, most targeted killings in Karachi were of Shia professionals.⁴⁹ According to *IRIN News*, these are part of a wider campaign of such killings across Pakistan; including the murder of at least 85 Shi'ite doctors.⁵⁰ Other Shia technocrats have also been targeted according to respected author Ahmed Rashid, writing in *The National Interest*; "politicians, doctors, architects, bureaucrats and judges—have been singled out for assassination in all major cities".⁵¹

In Karachi at least 26 Shi'ite doctors have been assassinated according to a 2010 report on violence in the city.⁵² The authors of *The Open City: Social Networks And Violence In Karachi* argue that these assassinations are part of "a systematic campaign to target educated professionals within the Shia community – presumably in the expectation that this would lower the community's morale and encourage its members to seek emigration."⁵³

These targeted killings of Shi'ites are likely to be linked to the large number of TTP affiliated Deobandi extremists from FATA and Swat who have reportedly found refuge in the city.⁵⁴ The International Crisis Group (ICG) reports that since 2007 three violently anti-Shia organisations, Sipah-e-Sahaba Pakistan (SSP) Lashkar-e-Jhangvi (LJ), and Lashkar-e-Tayyaba (LeT) have all openly held public meetings in Karachi. Another, Jaish-e-Mohammed, runs a large madrasa in the Karachi suburb of Ehsanabad. It was at

⁴⁷ Shah, T.A. 2010 'Karachi Emerges as Pakistan's New Tinderbox of Violence and Extremism', *Jamestown Foundation Terrorism Monitor*, Volume VIII, Issue 26, 1 July, pp.5-6 – Attachment 37

⁴⁸ US Department of State 2010, *International Religious Freedom Report – Pakistan*, 17 November – Attachment 38

⁴⁹ Shah, T.A. 2010 'Karachi Emerges as Pakistan's New Tinderbox of Violence and Extremism', *Jamestown Foundation Terrorism Monitor*, Volume VIII, Issue 26, 1 July, pp.5-6 – Attachment 37

⁵⁰ 'Sectarianism infects hospital wards' 2010, UNHCR Refworld, source: *IRIN News*, 24 October <http://www.unhcr.org/refworld/docid/4cc673001e.html> – Accessed 11 January 2011 – Attachment 39

⁵¹ Rashid, A. 2010, 'The Anarchic Republic of Pakistan', *The National Interest*, 24 August <http://nationalinterest.org/article/anarchic-republic-pakistan-3917?page=show> – Accessed 7 January 2011 – Attachment 40

⁵² Budhani, A.A. et al 2010, *The Open City: Social Networks And Violence In Karachi*, Crisis States Research Centre, Working Paper no. 70, March, p.4 <http://www.crisisstates.com/download/wp/wpSeries2/WP70.2.pdf> – Accessed 7 January 2011 – Attachment 41

⁵³ Budhani, A.A. et al 2010, *The Open City: Social Networks And Violence In Karachi*, Crisis States Research Centre, Working Paper no. 70, March, p.7 <http://www.crisisstates.com/download/wp/wpSeries2/WP70.2.pdf> – Accessed 7 January 2011 – Attachment 41

⁵⁴ 'Taliban arrest spotlights militant nexus in Karachi' 2010, *Dawn*, 18 February <http://news.dawn.com/wps/wcm/connect/dawn-content-library/dawn/news/pakistan/16-taliban-arrest-spotlights-militant-nexus-in-karachi-hs-07> – Accessed 11 January 2011 – Attachment 42

this madrasa that Daniel Pearl's kidnappers were arrested. The ICG reports that due to threats against Shia Imam Bara made by Sunni Imams in nearby mosques, the former president of the mosque turned it "into a fortress, with armed guards on the rooftop during Friday prayers".⁵⁵

Also included in the calculus of risk to Pashtun Shi'ites relocating to Karachi is the fact that the city is now considered the primary place of hiding for senior members of the Afghanistan Taliban, who the Shi'ite Turi and Bangash have fought in Kurram. The US Congressional Research Service even states that there is a genuine possibility that the Afghan Taliban leader Mullah Omar is hiding in the city, with the support of Pakistan's Inter-Services Intelligence (ISI) agency. The Service states that the megacity's sprawl and large Pashtun suburbs "provide ideal hideouts for both Afghan and Pakistani Taliban fighters. Such militants are said to have established 'mafia-like' criminal syndicates in Karachi to raise millions of dollars to sustain their insurgencies through kidnapping, bank robberies, and extortion."⁵⁶ A November 2010 report in *Foreign Policy* states that the so-called Quetta Shura, the ruling council of the Afghanistan Taliban, has actually been based in Karachi for over three years with the cooperation of the ISI.⁵⁷

A 2009 article published by *Bloomberg* states that while Karachi is home to working women, entrepreneurs in million-dollar homes, shopping malls, cafes and "jeans-clad teenagers", districts of the city such as Sohrab Goth and Baldia Town openly display signs stating "Welcome welcome Taliban" and "Long live Taliban." Fateh Muhammad Burfat, head of criminology at Karachi University, is quoted by *Bloomberg* arguing that "Karachi has more bombs, dynamite and Kalashnikovs than any other city in Pakistan." Urban planner and author of 'Understanding Karachi', Arif Hasan states that "[t]he unmapped slums are perfect hiding places for Taliban seeking respite from the fighting... In a city as large as Karachi, anyone can hide."⁵⁸

Not all Pashtuns living in Karachi are supportive of the Afghan or Pakistan 'Taliban'. The influx of Pashtuns has also boosted the political fortunes of the secular Pashtun political organisation the Awami National Party (ANP). The growing power of the ANP has brought it into direct conflict with the Muhajir Quami Movement (MQM), the party which has its powerbase among the Muhajirs, descendants of Urdu-speaking migrants from India. *Foreign Affairs* reported that due to this rivalry, in 2010 approximately 1,400 Muhajirs and Pashtuns were killed in Karachi in targeted killings by MQM and ANP militia members.⁵⁹

An October 2010 report by *IRIN News* states that Pashtuns hurt in religious, political or ethnic violence face another obstacle once they arrive in Karachi's hospitals, the threat of harm to either the victim or the medical staff by MQM cadres or sometimes Islamic militants. One doctor in the emergency ward of Civil Hospital Karachi told *IRIN News*

⁵⁵ International Crisis Group 2009, *Pakistan: The Militant Jihadi Challenge*, Asia Report N°164, 13 March, p.15 – Attachment 43

⁵⁶ Kronstadt, K.A. 2010, 'Pakistan: Key Current Issues and Developments', Congressional Research Service Report for Congress, 1 June, p. 16 – Attachment 44

⁵⁷ Chishti, A.K. 2010, 'The Karachi Project', *Foreign Policy*, 3 November http://www.foreignpolicy.com/articles/2010/11/03/is_pakistan_finally_cracking_down_on_al_qaeda – Accessed 11 January 2011 – Attachment 45

⁵⁸ Mangi, N.A. & Sharif, F. 2009, 'Taliban Hole Up in Karachi as Pakistan Weeds Out Swat Valley', *Bloomberg*, 19 June <http://www.bloomberg.com/apps/news?pid=conewsstory&tkr=UL:US&sid=aFdl.CMmw.Sw> – Accessed 10 July 2009 – Attachment 46

⁵⁹ Khan, T. 2011, 'Letter From Karachi: The Violent Fallout of Pakistan's Urban Bridge', *Foreign Affairs*, 6 January <http://www.foreignaffairs.com/node/67173> – Accessed 11 January 2011 – Attachment 47

that “[a]fter a terrorism incident, we are under intense pressure... we had the activists of various political parties threatening us in the emergency department to not treat the patients of their rival groups. They use all sorts of delay tactics, be it blocking the entrance to pounding on the doors and abusing the staff. Now, we also get calls [from the militants].” In a reference to the MQM the doctors states that “[o]ne ethnic-based party is so strong that it makes sure that the duty doctors are unable to carry out their work once the injured start arriving. We have doctors and other staff who are from that party within the premises. Time and again we have been told not to treat Pushtun injured, who are very easy to identify due to their language and beards. We already face a shortage of staff, medicines and medical equipment... It’s just a mess here. [But] all professionalism and ethics aside, how can you expect me to save someone when my life is in danger?”⁶⁰

Quetta

Quetta, the capital of Baluchistan, is home to both a large Pashtun population and a large Shi’ite community. Over the past decade Quetta has become one of the most dangerous cities in South Asia for Shi’ites and subsequently it does not constitute a safe-haven for Pashtun Shi’ites.

The largest Shi’ite community in Quetta is the Hazara community. As a consequence of their demographic dominance of the Shi’ite community in the city, attacks and assassinations directed at Shi’ites in the city have been resulted in a high proportion of Hazaran victims.^{61 62 63 64}

Attachments

1. Chandran, S. 2008, ‘Sectarian Violence in Pakistan’s Kurram Agency’, Pakistan Security Research Unit (PSRU), Brief Number 40, 22 September <http://spaces.brad.ac.uk:8080/download/attachments/748/Brief+40.pdf> – Accessed 23 November 2010.
2. Khan, M.I. 2010, ‘The Pakistani tribe that is taking on the Taliban’, *BBC News*, 7 October <http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-south-asia-11486528> – Accessed 14 October 2010.
3. ‘Siraj Haqqani sheltering in Kurram, near area of US helicopter strikes’ 2010, *The Long War Journal*, 22 October http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2010/10/siraj_haqqani_shelte.php – Accessed 11 November 2010. (CISNET Pakistan CX253234)
4. ‘Kurram Agency and the U.S. and Pakistan’s Divergent Interests’ 2010, Stratfor Global Intelligence, 2 November

⁶⁰ ‘Sectarianism infects hospital wards’ 2010, UNHCR Refworld, source: *IRIN News*, 24 October <http://www.unhcr.org/refworld/docid/4cc673001e.html> – Accessed 11 January 2011 – Attachment 39

⁶¹ Department of Foreign Affairs & Trade 2010, *The Hazara Community*, 20 May – Attachment 48

⁶² Akbar, M.S. 2009, ‘Hazara tribesmen under attack in Quetta’, *Daily Times*, 6 February http://www.dailytimes.com.pk/default.asp?page=2009\02\06\story_6-2-2009_pg7_15 – Accessed 29 March 2010 – Attachment 49

⁶³ Department of Foreign Affairs & Trade 2010, *Conditions for Asylum Caseloads: Hazaras in Quetta*, 30 July – Attachment 50

⁶⁴ Hughes, M. 2010, ‘Suicide attack death toll reaches 73 in Quetta Pakistan’, *The Examiner*, 4 September <http://www.examiner.com/afghanistan-headlines-in-national/suicide-attack-death-toll-reaches-73-quetta-pakistan-video> – Accessed 8 October 2010 – Attachment 51

- http://www.stratfor.com/analysis/20101101_kurram_agency_and_us_and_pakistans_divergent_interests – Accessed 11 January 2010.
5. ‘Taliban in peace talks with Kurram’s Turi tribe’ 2010, *Daily Times*, 29 October http://www.dailytimes.com.pk/default.asp?page=2010%5C10%5C29%5Cstory_29-10-2010_pg7_3 – Accessed 24 November 2010.
 6. Ali, Z. 2010, ‘Taliban trying to end tribal clashes in Kurram’, *Dawn*, 16 September <http://news.dawn.com/wps/wcm/connect/dawn-content-library/dawn/the-newspaper/front-page/taliban-trying-to-end-tribal-clashes-in-kurram-690> – Accessed 24 November 2010.
 7. ‘Taliban may strike deal with Turi tribe’ 2010, *The News*, 29 October <http://www.thenews.com.pk/29-10-2010/National/12684.htm> – Accessed 24 November 2010.
 8. ‘Kurram elders hold talks with TTP, Haqqani commanders’ 2010, *Dawn*, 30 November <http://news.dawn.com/wps/wcm/connect/dawn-content-library/dawn/the-newspaper/front-page/kurram-elders-hold-talks-with-ttp,-haqqani-commanders-010> – Accessed 11 January 2010.
 9. Waldman, M. 2010, *The Sun In The Sky: The Relationship Between Pakistan’s ISI and Afghan Insurgents*, Crisis States Research Centre, Discussion Paper 18, June <http://www.crisisstates.com/download/dp/DP%2018.pdf> – Accessed 13 January 2011.
 10. ‘U.S. concerns grow as militants move bases along Pakistan border’ 2010, *The Los Angeles Times*, 7 November <http://www.latimes.com/news/nationworld/world/la-fg-pakistan-haqqani-20101108,0,7180350.story> Accessed 9 November 2010. (CISNET Pakistan CX253030)
 11. ‘Kurram Agency and the U.S. and Pakistan’s Divergent Interests’ 2010, Stratfor Global Intelligence, 2 November http://www.stratfor.com/analysis/20101101_kurram_agency_and_us_and_pakistans_divergent_interests – Accessed 11 January 2010.
 12. Munir, A. 2010, ‘Ending Kurram’s sectarian strife’, *The Express Tribune*, 25 June <http://tribune.com.pk/story/23495/ending-kurrans-sectarian-strife/> – Accessed 29 October 2010.
 13. ‘Kohat’ 2010, WordPress.com, 30 April <http://meetcornor.wordpress.com/2010/04/page/2/> – Accessed 11 January 2011.
 14. ‘PAKISTAN: Shia IDPs fearful of being targeted’ 2010, Relief Web, 11 February <http://www.reliefweb.int/rw/rwb.nsf/db900SID/AMMF-82KMC8?OpenDocument> – Accessed 12 January 2011.
 15. ‘Life in Kurram and Orakzai Agencies of FATA’ 2010, Geo Tau Aisay website, 31 May <http://www.geotauaisay.com/2010/05/life-in-kurram-and-orakzai-agencies-of-fata/> – Accessed 11 January 2011.
 16. ‘Program For Culture & Conflict Studies – Tribe: Bangash’ 2010, Naval Postgraduate School, 8 April <http://www.nps.edu/programs/ccs/Docs/Pakistan/Tribes/Bangash.pdf> – Accessed 12 January 2011.

17. 'Kohat and Hangu; Inter-Cluster Mission to Kohat & Hangu 28th January – 30th January' 2010, One Response website, 5 February
<http://onerresponse.info/Countries/Pakistan/Coordination/publicdocuments/FINAL-Inter%20cluster%20assessment%20Kohat%20Hangu%2028th%20Jan%202010.pdf> – Accessed 12 January 2011.
18. 'Internal Security Situation; Presentation to the Prime Minister of Islamic Republic of Pakistan' 2010, Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Provincial Disaster Management Authority website, 4 March
http://www.pdma.gov.pk/PaRRSA/documents/Internal_Security_Situation.pdf – Accessed 12 January 2011.
19. 'Suicide attack on Al- Zahra Hospital Hangu Pass Kalay' 2010, FATA Research Center <http://www.frc.com.pk/Suicide%20attack%C2%A0on%20Al-%20Zahra%20Hospital%C2%A0Hangu%20Pass%C2%A0Kalay.htm> – Accessed 11 January 2011.
20. 'Terror Watch-Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (Pakistan)' 2011, Calcutta Tube, 9 January
<http://calcuttatube.com/terror-watch-khyber-pakhtunkhwa-pakistan/137845/> – Accessed 11 January 2011.
21. Dempsey, E. 2010, 'Rockets Fired in Hangu, 9 People Killed', Digital Journal, 17 December <http://www.digitaljournal.com/article/301509> – Accessed 12 January 2011.
22. 'Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Timeline' 2010, South Asia Terrorism Portal
<http://www.satp.org/satporgrp/countries/pakistan/nwfp/timeline/index.html> – Accessed 12 January 2011.
23. Internal Displacement Monitoring Centre 2010, *Pakistan: Flooding worsens situation for people displaced by conflict in north-west*, 6 September [http://www.internal-displacement.org/8025708F004BE3B1/\(httpInfoFiles\)/719B7634A7238264C12577960032832C/\\$file/Pakistan+-+September+2010.pdf](http://www.internal-displacement.org/8025708F004BE3B1/(httpInfoFiles)/719B7634A7238264C12577960032832C/$file/Pakistan+-+September+2010.pdf) – Accessed 23 November 2010.
24. UK Home Office 2010, *Country of Origin Information Report – Pakistan*, 18 January.
25. Tavernise, S. 2010, 'Bomber Strikes Near Pakistan Rally; Police Officer Seen as Target', *The New York Times*, 19 April
<http://www.nytimes.com/2010/04/20/world/asia/20pstan.html> – Accessed 20 April 2010.
26. Ali, L. 2010, 'Burqa bombers kill 41 at Pakistan camp', Google News, source: *AFP*, 18 April.
27. 'Shia Turi Bangash tribes vows to observe Ayam-e-Aza of Muharram' 2010, Shia News website, 9 December <http://babulilmilibrary.com/news/shia-turi-bangash-tribes-vows-to-observe-ayam-e-aza-of-muharram> – Accessed 11 January 2011.
28. 'Peshawar grenade attack on Shia parade kills toddler' 2010, *Dawn*, source: *AFP*, 16 December <http://www.dawn.com/2010/12/16/low-intensity-explosion-at-yadgar-chowk-peshawar.html> – Accessed 11 January 2011.
29. Minority Rights Group International 2010, *State of the World's Minorities and Indigenous Peoples – Pakistan*, UNHCR Refworld, 1 July
<http://www.unhcr.org/refworld/docid/4c33310c.html> – Accessed 12 January 2011.

30. 'POPULATION BY MOTHER TONGUE' (undated), Population Census Organization website <http://www.census.gov.pk/MotherTongue.htm> – Accessed 13 January 2011.
31. 'Punjab Governor Salman Taseer assassinated in Islamabad' 2011, *BBC News*, 4 January <http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-south-asia-12111831> – Accessed 13 January 2011.
32. 'Pakistan mosque attack 'kills 35'' 2009, *BBC News*, 4 December http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/south_asia/8394694.stm – Accessed 13 January 2011.
33. MRT Research & Information 2009, *Research Response PAK35162*, 24 September.
34. Ahmed, K. 2010, 'The Pakhtun in Karachi', *The Express Tribune*, 28 August <http://tribune.com.pk/story/43827/the-pakhtun-in-karachi/> – Accessed 29 October 2010.
35. Obaid-Chinoy, S. 2009, 'Pakistan: Karachi's Invisible Enemy City potent refuge for Taliban fighters', *PBS (USA)*, 17 July http://www.pbs.org/frontlineworld/rough/2009/07/karachis_invisi.html – Accessed 29 April 2010.
36. Schetter, C. 2003, 'Ethnicity and the Political Reconstruction in Afghanistan', Arbeitsgemeinschaft Afghanistan website, 21 May <http://www.ag-afghanistan.de/arg/arp/schetter.pdf> – Accessed 5 January 2011.
37. Shah, T.A. 2010 'Karachi Emerges as Pakistan's New Tinderbox of Violence and Extremism', *Jamestown Foundation Terrorism Monitor*, Volume VIII, Issue 26, 1 July.
38. US Department of State 2010, *International Religious Freedom Report – Pakistan*, 17 November.
39. 'Sectarianism infects hospital wards' 2010, UNHCR Refworld, source: *IRIN News*, 24 October <http://www.unhcr.org/refworld/docid/4cc673001e.html> – Accessed 11 January 2011.
40. Rashid, A. 2010, 'The Anarchic Republic of Pakistan', *The National Interest*, 24 August <http://nationalinterest.org/article/anarchic-republic-pakistan-3917?page=show> – Accessed 7 January 2011.
41. Budhani, A.A. et al 2010, *The Open City: Social Networks And Violence In Karachi*, Crisis States Research Centre, Working Paper no. 70, March <http://www.crisisstates.com/download/wp/wpSeries2/WP70.2.pdf> – Accessed 7 January 2011.
42. 'Taliban arrest spotlights militant nexus in Karachi' 2010, *Dawn*, 18 February <http://news.dawn.com/wps/wcm/connect/dawn-content-library/dawn/news/pakistan/16-taliban+arrest+spotlights+militant+nexus+in+karachi-hs-07> – Accessed 11 January 2011.
43. International Crisis Group 2009, *Pakistan: The Militant Jihadi Challenge*, Asia Report N°164, 13 March.

44. Kronstadt, K.A. 2010, 'Pakistan: Key Current Issues and Developments', Congressional Research Service Report for Congress, 1 June.
45. Chishti, A.K. 2010, 'The Karachi Project', *Foreign Policy*, 3 November http://www.foreignpolicy.com/articles/2010/11/03/is_pakistan_finally_cracking_down_on_al_qaeda – Accessed 11 January 2011.
46. Mangi, N.A. & Sharif, F. 2009, 'Taliban Hole Up in Karachi as Pakistan Weeds Out Swat Valley', *Bloomberg*, 19 June http://www.bloomberg.com/apps/news?pid=conewsstory&tkr=UL:US&sid=aFdI.CMmw_Sw – Accessed 10 July 2009.
47. Khan, T. 2011, 'Letter From Karachi: The Violent Fallout of Pakistan's Urban Bridge', *Foreign Affairs*, 6 January <http://www.foreignaffairs.com/node/67173> – Accessed 11 January 2011.
48. Department of Foreign Affairs & Trade 2010, *The Hazara Community*, 20 May. (CISNET Pakistan CX243899)
49. Akbar, M.S. 2009, 'Hazara tribesmen under attack in Quetta', *Daily Times*, 6 February http://www.dailytimes.com.pk/default.asp?page=2009\02\06\story_6-2-2009_pg7_15 – Accessed 29 March 2010.
50. Department of Foreign Affairs & Trade 2010, *Conditions for Asylum Caseloads: Hazaras in Quetta*, 30 July. (CISNET Pakistan CX246851)
51. Hughes, M. 2010, 'Suicide attack death toll reaches 73 in Quetta Pakistan', *The Examiner*, 4 September <http://www.examiner.com/afghanistan-headlines-in-national/suicide-attack-death-toll-reaches-73-quetta-pakistan-video> – Accessed 8 October 2010.
52. US Department of State 2010, *Country Reports on Human Rights Practices for 2009 – Pakistan*, March.
53. 'Islamabad Demographics' 2009, City of Islamabad website <http://www.visitislamabad.net/islamabad/files/file-detail.asp?var=demographics> – Accessed 12 January 2011.