

**Refugee Review Tribunal
AUSTRALIA**

RRT RESEARCH RESPONSE

Research Response Number: PAK33641
Country: Pakistan
Date: 15 August 2008

Keywords: Pakistan – Pakistan People’s Party – Shaheed Bhutto group – Ghinwa Bhutto – Political violence – Elections

This response was prepared by the Research & Information Services Section of the Refugee Review Tribunal (RRT) after researching publicly accessible information currently available to the RRT within time constraints. This response is not, and does not purport to be, conclusive as to the merit of any particular claim to refugee status or asylum. This research response may not, under any circumstance, be cited in a decision or any other document. Anyone wishing to use this information may only cite the primary source material contained herein.

Questions

- 1. Please provide information on the Pakistani People’s Party–Shaheed Bhutto group; such as when formed, why formed, constitution, aims, structure and people of note in the party?**
- 2. Please advise whether there is any information that all of its candidates were forced to withdraw at the last election?**
- 3. Is there evidence that Ghinwa Bhutto and other party members were bashed before the last election and, if so, by whom?**
- 4. Were any of their candidates elected at the last election?**
- 5. Is there any information on whether members of this party have suffered since the elections, and if so, by whom?**
- 6. What is their relationship like with the mainstream PPP party?**
- 7. Any other relevant information?**

RESPONSE

- 1. Please provide information on the Pakistani People’s Party – Shaheed Bhutto group; such as when formed, why formed, constitution, aims, structure and people of note in the party?**

The response to this question is provided in three sections, respectively dealing with: the formation of the Pakistan People’s Party – Shaheed Bhutto (PPP-SB); the constitution, aims, structure, and people of note in the PPP-SB; and recent developments regarding the PPP-SB.

Formation of Pakistan People’s Party – Shaheed Bhutto

The 2007 *Political Handbook of the World* provides background to the formation of the Pakistan People’s Party (Shaheed Bhutto), stating that the party was formed by Ghinwa (also

Ghinwa, Ghanwa) Bhutto in late 1996 in response to allegations that Benazir Bhutto's husband, Asif Ali Zardari, was implicated in the killing of Ghinwa's husband (and Benazir's brother) Murtaza Bhutto, in September 1996:

In December 1993 the PPP's executive council ousted Prime Minister Bhutto's mother, Begum Nasrat Bhutto, as party cochair. The action was the product of estrangement between the two over the political role of Benazir's brother, Murtaza Bhutto, who had returned from exile in November to take up a seat in the Sindh provincial legislature and who in March 1995 announced the formation of a breakaway faction of the PPP. Murtaza died in a fire with gunmen on September 20, 1996. Following the ouster of Prime Minister Bhutto in November, her husband, Asif Ali Zardari, was charged with complicity in the killing. ...at the end of 1996, allegations about the death of Murtaza Bhutto had led his widow, Ghinwa Bhutto, to form the Pakistan People's Party (Shaheed Bhutto), or PPP-SB, to challenge Benazir Bhutto's hold on the party. The subsequent national legislative campaign in early 1997 contained an added element of personal hostility between the two women, although both suffered disastrous defeats in the election (Banks, A., Muller, C. & Overstreet, W. (eds) 2007, *Political Handbook of the World: 2007*, CQ Press, Washington, D.C., p940 – Attachment 1).

A February 2008 election preview in the *Dawn* newspaper provides a slightly different version of events, stating that Murtaza Bhutto formed the PPP-SB before his death and that Ghinwa subsequently took over:

But the most significant challenger to the party's unity came from within the Bhutto family. In mid-1990s, Murtaza Bhutto, the estranged brother of Benazir Bhutto, returned from exile and formed his own faction of the PPP, adding Shaheed Bhutto as a suffix. He was killed in a police encounter in Karachi in 1996 during his sister's second tenure as prime minister. Ghinwa Bhutto, his wife, now heads that faction ('Party Profiles: The Party's On – Pakistan People's Party' 2008, *Dawn – Herald Election 2008*, February <http://www.dawn.com/weekly/herald/herald4.htm> – Accessed 11 August 2008 – Attachment 6).

For more background on the killing of Murtaza Bhutto, and on Ghinwa Bhutto and the PPP-SB, see: Dalrymple, W. 2008, 'In the Name of the Father', *Tehelka*, Vol. 5, No. 21, 31 May http://www.tehelka.com/story_main39.asp?filename=Ne310508in_the.asp – Accessed 11 August 2008 – Attachment 9; and di Giovanni, J. 2008, 'Power Crisis: The Bhutto Legacy' *Vogue*, Vol. 198; No. 3, March <http://www.janinedigiovanni.com/Vogue-bhutto.pdf> – Accessed 13 August 2008 – Attachment 29.

Constitution, aims, structure, and people of note in the PPP-SB

The PPP-SB does not appear to have an official website or online presence, so the constitution, aims and structure of the party are not available in any official form. Nor is a listing of prominent members of the party available. Nonetheless, the following assessment attempts to piece together information, mostly sourced from Pakistani media reports, to provide an overview of the PPP-SB, which is still headed by Ghinwa Bhutto as chairperson. Although not an official member of the party, Ghinwa's stepdaughter Fatima has a high profile in Pakistan through her outspoken anti-PPP and anti-Musharraf writings in the media, and campaigns with her mother for the PPP-SB in elections.

The most recent reference to a "manifesto" for the PPP-SB comes from a 27 June 2008 article in *Dawn* newspaper, which reports on a meeting of the party's central committee at the Bhutto family estate in Larkana, Sindh. Other than Ghinwa Bhutto, the report notes the

presence of “deputy general secretary Umar Sial” and the “president of the party’s Sindh chapter Meenhon Khan Rind”. Among the policy platforms proposed by the PPP-SB are free education and health care, land distribution “for rural and suburban population of the country”, providing agricultural materials “to farmers at low cost”, a western-style system of trial by jury, and local rather than centralised administration of police:

The Pakistan People’s Party-Shaheed Bhutto has mulled over drastic changes in its manifesto, proposing among several other things free of charge education and health facilities for people and land for rural and suburban population of the country.

...The draft envisaged liberating people from internal and external enslavement and aimed at achieving objectives by disapproving present ruling elite and empowering people at the lowest level of government hierarchy, it said.

The meeting said that the draft laid stress on implementing the land reforms announced by the government of Zulfikar Ali Bhutto in 1977, which had been put on the back burner after Gen Zia’s martial law, and proposed providing seeds, fertilisers and pesticides to farmers at low cost.

The draft envisioned a criminal justice system in which the decision on guilty or not guilty would be taken by a panel of citizens trusted by both the defence and the prosecution. The police should be put under the administration of the locally-elected councillors of a cluster of villages, union councils, towns and cities, it proposed.

...The committee held the previous government responsible for shortage of wheat and high prices of essential commodities and said that the government elected in Feb 2008 had also failed to stem the tide of rising inflation and unemployment.

It severely criticised the 2008-09 budget, which it said was for the ruling elite by the ruling elite. The peasants, labourers, teachers, low-salaried government servants and journalists had no share at all in the budget, which had raised their level of poverty and deprived them of any cash to buy food, pay rent or get medical assistance, the meeting said.

The committee paid tribute to valiant struggle of legal fraternity and acknowledged that the non-political struggle had infused a new sense of awakening among masses. The party praised media for playing positive role in creating awareness and expressed regret over delay in the murder case of late chairman of the party, Mir Murtaza Bhutto and his colleagues.

The meeting condemned the government for extending what it called undue concession to police officers involved in the Murtaza-murder case (‘PPP-SB draft manifesto vows free education’ 2008, *Dawn*, 27 June <http://www.dawn.com/2008/06/27/nat2.htm> – Accessed 11 August 2008 – Attachment 2).

An April 2008 article titled ‘Pakistan a divided society’, sourced from the On Line Opinion website, is credited to Mohammad Aslam Naru, described as a member of the Central Committee of the Pakistan People’s Party (Shaheed Bhutto). The article provides an outline of the PPP-SB manifesto: populist, socialist, opposition to feudally inherited political power, anti-big business and bureaucracy, and anti-PPP and Zardari:

Pakistan is a divided society in every respect. This vulgar division is so conspicuous and striking that it reflects a chaotic environs in all spheres of our lives. The elite – higher echelons of bureaucracy, generals, wealthy businessmen, feudal, politicians and so on – have their own exclusive schools, housing colonies, healthcare management system, transport etc. They have kept intact the huge gulf, associated with the colonial era, between themselves and

the majority of population of Pakistan. The institutions fostered by them are helping nobody except themselves – the elite.

...Most of the old political players, on the basis of their power of ill-gotten wealth, have returned to the assemblies: they have billions in assets abroad and are in control of the destiny of the nation. They are benighted, lack vision, and do not possess the ability to understand the unfolding of events of national importance in the contemporary world. One can fully understand all this based on their family backgrounds and the six decades of Pakistan's political history. The elite are not much concerned about the problems faced by the common man or the urgent need to act without delay. Nonetheless, they are alert for their own advantages.

It will, therefore, be a fallacy to pin much hope on them that they can bring about the desired change. In their selfishness they remain busy among themselves. This is evident from the empty package of relief by the present government. All we have had is just rhetoric which is not going to help our severely ailing society. I often wonder: how can those occupying the seats in parliament as the people's representatives, who have not earned a single day's bread in their lifetime, fathom and solve the real issues haunting the masses in their day to day lives? One needs life experiences to understand the common man's problems.

The election games that the ruling classes play among themselves are no more than gambling. No sincere and right thinking person has the courage and the money to jump into this kind of election fray, which is devoid of real manifestoes and has an absence of meaningful debate on issues directly affecting the lives of common man.

The political history of Pakistan is witness to the fact that, each time, when the people manifest their strong desire for a peaceful political change, the "mock" elections, which have nothing to do with people's representation, are held. In this way the people's wishes are subverted by both politicians and military rulers: then the countdown starts again until the situation once more comes to a head and the rulers are challenged. So the cycle continues. The system does not allow people to participate in the decision making process. Consequently, democratic culture cannot take root in our society and the people have no real choice but to elect the representatives they believe can bring the most urgent change.

It is unthinkable in 21st century that a teenage boy studying at Oxford and knowing nothing about Pakistan could be the head of our main political party. The people of Pakistan, no more than slaves, have been bequeathed to him. The media and the civil society activists should come forward to challenge the hold of a few families on our politics. The corrupt are carefully assembled in the top committees of our political parties and their rubberstamps approve all the undemocratic decisions taken by the party heads (Naru, A. 2008, 'Pakistan a divided society', On Line Opinion website, 15 April <http://www.onlineopinion.com.au/view.asp?article=7234&page=0> – Accessed 11 August 2008 – Attachment 3).

A 5 April 2008 article in *Dawn* newspaper reports on the commemoration of the 29th anniversary of the execution of Zulfikar Ali Bhutto, and on a PPP-SB public meeting addressed by Ghinwa Bhutto. At the meeting, resolutions were passed calling for the restoration of the 1973 Constitution, the reinstatement of judges removed from their positions by Musharraf, a halt to military operations in Baluchistan and tribal areas, autonomy for the provinces of Pakistan, and the repealing of the Hudood and National Reconciliation Ordinances:

Addressing a public meeting held in Garhi Khuda Bakhsh, Pakistan People's Party (SB) chairperson Ghinwa Bhutto said that people were still hostage to feudal lords and efforts were

needed to jolt them out of their apathy. “We want to bring people’s revolution and will not sit idle till the system is changed and goals are achieved.”

She alleged that Asif Ali Zardari and his friends had captured the PPP, which was now devoid of the spirit of Z.A. Bhutto. She said Prime Minister Yusuf Raza Gilani was a member of Gen Ziaul Haq’s Majlis-i-Shoora when Z.A. Bhutto was hanged. Ms Ghinwa praised the loyalty of Makhdoom Amin Fahim to the PPP.

RESOLUTIONS: The meeting adopted 13 resolutions calling for the release of Dr A.Q. Khan, Akhtar Mengal and other political workers. It called for reopening of the Z.A. Bhutto case and probe into the assassination of Benazir Bhutto, Akbar Bugti and Mir Balach Marri by judges of the superior courts. The meeting also called for regular hearing in the Murtaza Bhutto’s murder case and dismissal of Shoaib Saddle, Wajid Durrani, Shahid Hayat, Rai Tahir and others involved in the case.

It called for restoration of the 1973 Constitution in its originality and reinstatement of Justice Iftikhar Chaudhry and other judges. It also called for repealing the National Reconciliation Ordinance and the Hudood Ordinance. The meeting demanded an immediate halt to army operations in Balochistan and tribal areas and grant of complete autonomy to the provinces (Kalhoro, M.B. 2008, ‘Gilani vows to accomplish Bhuttos’ mission’, *Dawn*, 5 April <http://www.dawn.com/2008/04/05/top4.htm> – Accessed 11 August 2008 – Attachment 4).

A March 2008 report sourced from Pakistan Press International Information Services quotes Ghinwa Bhutto criticising the current Pakistani government for “blindly following the US policies”, and claiming that “the new Pakistani government would be formed on the dictation of Americans”:

Talking to the journalists here on Thursday, she blamed that the US officials were meeting Pakistani officials and politicians to convince them to support the US designs in the region. She accused the upcoming government of also blindly following the US policies like the last regime. She regretted that those politicians who had boasted of the supremacy of parliament were now assuring personal cooperation for the US-led war on terror.

Ghinwa Bhutto claimed that the new cabinet would be formed on the dictation of Americans. She charged that the new Pakistani government would facilitate the US to complete its unfinished expansionist agenda in the area. She said that the coming regime would also tailor interior and foreign policies suiting the American interests (‘Ghinwa criticises ‘US meddling’ 2008, *Pakistan Press International Information Services*, 28 March – Attachment 5)

A *BBC News* report from 8 February 2008 reports on the competing claims of the various Bhutto family members to the legacy of Benazir and Zulfikar Ali Bhutto. The report notes that “Bhutto and Bhutto-ism meant change”, and quotes founding member of the PPP Mumtaz Bhutto stating that “there was a very strong element of the working class in the PPP”, but that today “the focus is on just getting into power”. The report also quotes Ghinwa Bhutto stating that “the party compromised on principles to gain power”, and that Ghinwa “preaches social justice, economic equality, and power to the people”:

The PPP was founded in 1967 by Benazir’s father, Zulfikar Ali Bhutto – a feudal landowner who vowed to empower the rural poor. He also inspired middle-class intellectuals. For all, Bhutto and Bhutto-ism meant change. But there are competing claims to the party and legacy.

Zulfikar’s relative, Mumtaz Bhutto, was a founding member. He is also a feudal landlord, holding court on the terrace of his palatial estate to settle his tenants’ disputes. He left the PPP

long ago because, he says, it failed to bring change. “It was a party of the feudal elite right from the start,” he says. “But there was a very strong element of the working class in the PPP also. In the beginning the focus was on the manifesto, which promised the working classes a lot of benefit. Today the focus is on just getting into power, the feudal elite are the beneficiaries of the People’s Party, not the working class.”

Another Bhutto also believes the PPP betrayed its roots. Ghinwa is the widow of Zulfiqar’s son, Murtaza, and head of his breakaway party, the PPP-Shahid Bhutto. She says the party compromised on principles to gain power. In village courtyards crowded with gaunt peasants and dirty children, she preaches social justice, economic equality, and power to the people. In rural Sindh, such ideals are synonymous with Bhutto-ism. “We’re just the guardians,” she tells an attentive audience. “You and your hopes are Bhutto-ism, the hope that what seems impossible can become possible.”

Fatima Bhutto belongs to the younger generation of the family and she believes her grandfather Zulfiqar still inspires hope. Some see her as a future leader. But she rejects the idea that she, or her cousin Bilawal, or any Bhutto is Zulfiqar’s political heir. Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto never intended for his children or his nieces or his nephews or grandchildren to possess the Bhutto legacy,” she says, sitting in the shadow of an immense painting of her grandfather. “It’s the people who inherit the legacy of Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto, and it’s with them that the party must rest, so it doesn’t have to be a family member” (Plett, B. 2008, ‘Bhutto’s party fights for her legacy’, *BBC News*, 8 February http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/south_asia/7232270.stm – Accessed 11 August 2008 – Attachment 7).

An article written by William Dalrymple in the May 31 edition of the Indian *Tehelka* magazine provides a history of the Bhutto family, with emphasis on the killing of Murtaza Bhutto, and a profile of Murtaza and Ghinwa Bhutto’s daughter Fatima. Although Fatima is yet to enter political life, she has a high profile in Pakistan as a writer and as a member of the Bhutto family, and she campaigned for the PPP-SB beside her mother in the February 2008 election. See ‘recent developments’ below for details of speculation that Fatima and her brother and cousins are planning to re-launch their own branch of the PPP and reclaim the Bhutto political dynasty from Zardari. The report also claims that the PPP were responsible for “ballot box-stuffing” in the election:

...A small figure in a lavender-coloured dupatta, she was moving through the bazaars of Larkana. It was the last day before the polls opened – the election had been delayed because of the violence after Benazir’s death – and though Fatima was not standing for election herself, she was campaigning hard on behalf of her mother. Ghinwa was doing her best against the odds to keep afloat Murtaza’s political party, the PPP-SB. She had so far failed to retain the provincial assembly seat Murtaza had won when he was alive, but everyone seemed hopeful that this time she might succeed.

...I asked whether she would consider entering politics herself. “I am political, but I don’t think becoming an MP and sitting in Islamabad is necessarily the best way to influence people here. A writer has other options. There is much to be done. Power in Pakistan never changes hands – it’s only the victims who change. The people of this country are so dispossessed – they have no access to justice or basic necessities. There is so much corruption. We have to teach the people to stand together and protect themselves.”

“For now I want to be a writer. But if in the future there was a way I could serve my country that did not involve becoming yet another part of dynastic birthright politics, maybe I could envisage putting my name forward. If I stood I would want it to be on my own merits, not as a member of a dynasty.”

In the event, two days after we spoke, Ghinwa was wiped out at the ballot box, though only after some very blatant ballot-stuffing, some of which was captured on film. This was effected not by the pro-Musharraf parties, as had been expected, but in the case of Larkana by Zardari's PPP, which had won the largest share of the vote. Musharraf was being slowly eclipsed, and Fatima's nemesis, Zardari, was suddenly the biggest power in the land (Dalrymple, W. 2008, 'In the Name of the Father', *Tehelka*, Vol. 5, No. 21, 31 May http://www.tehelka.com/story_main39.asp?filename=Ne310508in_the.asp – Accessed 11 August 2008 – Attachment 9)

A 13 December 2007 article in *Dawn* newspaper states that the PPP-SB reached a "seat adjustment accord" with the Larkana chapter of the Pakistan Muslim League (Quaid-e-Azam) (PML(Q)), the party of President Musharraf, involving candidates from each party withdrawing from certain seats in the forthcoming national election. The article reports that the PPP-SB is supporting candidates from various parties for provincial seats, all of whom are opposing Pakistan People's Party (PPP) candidates, including candidates from the Sindh National Front (SNF) and the Pakistan Muslim League (Functional) (PML(F)) (Kalhor, M.B. 2007, 'PPP (SB), PML (Q) unite against Benazir', *Dawn*, 13 December <http://www.dawn.com/2007/12/13/nat15.htm> – Accessed 12 August 2008 – Attachment 8).

A December 2007 article in *Dawn* newspaper quotes Ghinwa Bhutto addressing several "corner meetings" during the PPP-SB election campaign. She outlined a "five-point agenda", involving educating youth, providing land to the poor, protecting civilians, ending corruption and giving provinces complete autonomy:

People will not get rid of poverty, sense of deprivation, illiteracy, injustice, and rule of rich without devolution of power from grass roots level, said Chairperson PPP (Shaheed Bhutto), Ghinwa Bhutto on Monday.

Speaking during different corner meetings in her constituency (NA-204) she said over centralisation of power will not only weaken national unity but also generate hatred among the provinces. She said the party's five-point agenda is employment to educated youth, land to landless haris, protection to people, complete provincial autonomy and end to corruption and price hike. She advocated empowering people at union council level, putting police, judiciary, and financial matters under its authority. At present these are being governed by federal and provincial government where rich, influential and feudal lords wield the power generating insecurity among the masses, she said ('Larkana: SNF doubts BB's promise about autonomy' 2007, *Dawn*, 17 December <http://www.dawn.com/2007/12/18/local22.htm> – Accessed 12 August 2008 – Attachment 10)

An October 2006 article from the Pakistani newspaper *The Post* quotes Ghinwa Bhutto on her party's claims for the need for provincial autonomy, and the repealing of amended sections of the Pakistani Constitution. The article also mentions two other office holders in the PPP-SB, "Dr Mubashir Hassan, President Pakistan Peoples Party (Shaheed Bhutto) Punjab and Javed Iqbal Muazaam, General Secretary":

Ghinwa said that their party demanded the government reverse amendments made in the 1973 Constitution after 1977. The provinces should be given autonomy and the National Economic Council and the National Finance Commission should be abolished. The powers to appoint inspectors general of police (IGPs), revenue affairs and corporations should also be given to the provinces, she said. Lottery schemes, highways and all criminal laws should be handled by provinces as currently the Centre was controlling these affairs.

The provinces should be autonomous in collecting and utilizing their revenues, as presently the federal government collected revenues and then distributed them to the provinces as charity. Sales, capitals gain, mineral resources and oil taxes should be collected by provinces and the customs tax should be in the authority of the federal government so that they could meet the cost of running of the federal, civil bureaucracy and the armed forces affairs, she said ('Country under crises due to lack of provincial autonomy: Ghinwa' 2006, *The Post*, 10 October

http://www.thepost.com.pk/Arc_ShortNews.aspx?shortid=2630&catid=3&date=10/10/2006&fcid=14 – Accessed 11 August 2008 – Attachment 11).

An April 2006 article in *Dawn* newspaper quotes Ghinwa Bhutto stating that 33 percent of seats in the legislature should be allocated to women and that they should be directly elected rather than selected by parties. According to this report, she also “called for a labour intensive policy dependent on agriculture instead of mega projects or big industries”:

She said that the PPP-SB stood for change in political culture which had been completely destroyed ever since the hanging of Zulfikar Ali Bhutto and society had become non-political.

...“Provinces do not have complete autonomy. Army and civil bureaucracy have hijacked common interests of people,” she said.

The PPP-SB leader supported 33 per cent representation of women in the legislature but, she said, women on the seats should be elected directly instead of being selected. She said that agricultural economy needed to be strengthened which would help eliminate poverty. “We must consider our 150 million people as our strength and not burden and only then we could move ahead fast,” she said.

She called for a labour intensive policy dependent on agriculture instead of mega projects or big industries. Disagreeing with theory that industrialisation could make Pakistan a model country, she said that it was a myth because it would rather lead to more poverty in the country in the shape of displacement of people and increase need of energy for industrial units and big dams.

She said that the poor people had been totally excluded from the political system ('Hyderabad: Ghinwa criticises political parties' 2006, *Dawn*, 30 April <http://www.dawn.com/2006/04/30/local7.htm> – Accessed 12 August 2008 – Attachment 13).

The broadleft.org website lists the PPP-SB among its 'Leftist Parties of the World – Pakistan', notes that it stood 18 candidates at the 2002 national elections, and states that the formation of the party was the result of a “leftist split from PPP in 1996” ('Leftist Parties of the World – Pakistan' 2004, broadleft.org website, 19 July <http://www.broadleft.org/pk.htm> – Accessed 11 August 2008 – Attachment 12.)

Recent Developments

Several reports from July 2008 suggest that the PPP-SB, Bhutto family members and estranged PPP figures are planning to reorganise and fight Zardari and take control of the PPP.

A 7 July 2008 article on the *Zee News* website claims that “there are talks that Fatima is trying to reorganise factions of the Pakistan People’s Party (PPP)”:

Though slain former Pakistan Premier Benazir Bhutto's niece Fatima Bhutto has said she does not want to take the plunge into politics, she seems to be learning the art of politicking fast... Fatima, who has been critical of Benazir's son Bilawal taking over the PPP mantle following his mother's assassination in December last year, has established contact with senior politician Elahi Buksh Soomro and sought his cooperation in reorganising the party ('Fatima Bhutto learning politics step by step' 2008, *Zee News*, 7 July <http://www.zeenews.com/articles.asp?aid=453772&sid=SAS> – Accessed 12 August 2008 – Attachment 17).

A 4 July 2008 report in the *PakTribune* claims that “[t]he Bhutto family, feeling sidelined by the emergence of Asif Ali Zardari as the main power player after Benazir Bhutto's death, is now bringing together many old PPP stalwarts to regain the Bhutto legacy”. The report notes the merger of the PPP-SB with the Sindh National Front (SNF) of Mumtaz Ali Bhutto, and suggests that the return to Pakistan of Sassui Bhutto, cousin to Fatima Bhutto and Ghinwa Bhutto's niece, heralds a uniting of anti-Zardari political forces:

Family sources say the stage is being set for the emergence of the PPP with the young Bhuttos spearheading a drive against the Zardaris. In this regard, Sassi Bhutto is going to lead a rally to Bhit Shah, the shrine of Shah Abdul Latif Bhitai, only a few kilometres from Amin Fahim's hometown of Hala on Saturday.

...“Sassi Bhutto is on a mission here in Pakistan – to get the politics, wealth, and property's possession back from the Zardaris. Fatima Bhutto has taken the initiative to bring Sassi back and she had herself travelled to London for the purpose to unite the real Bhuttos.” The source added the decision was finalised at a meeting of the elders of the Bhuttos along with party leaders and workers at 70-Clifton, Karachi, while the portraits of Zulfikar Ali Bhutto, Murtaza Bhutto and Shahnawaz Bhutto had also been displayed at the main gate of the building.

...“The real Bhuttos have a feeling that their ancestors and party loyalists have rendered sacrifices while the Zardari family has swept away the fruits,” said the source, adding the family thinks that the Zardaris had hijacked the party, property and the love of party workers, which were all assets of the Bhutto family.

...The source added Sassi Bhutto had already entered the political arena as she met hundreds of party workers, mostly old Jiyalas, at 70-Clifton, Karachi, during the last few days. In a bid to unite the family and discuss the issues, Fatima Bhutto hosted a dinner for the family that was attended by Sassi Bhutto, Zulfikar junior, Ghinwa Bhutto, Mumtaz Ali Bhutto and his younger son Ali Hyder.

On the other hand, the PPP-SB and the Sindh National Front (SNF) have agreed to a merger while Makhdoom Amin Fahim, Ghulam Mustafa Jatoi, Dr Ghulam Hussain and other senior leaders have assured Mumtaz Ali Bhutto of their total support. When contacted, the SNF spokesperson confirmed the developments, adding the decision of uniting the Bhutto family was also discussed at a dinner hosted by Ghulam Mustafa Jatoi on June 28 at his residence, which was attended by Mumtaz Ali Bhutto and Makhdoom Amin Fahim.

“All the issues were discussed in detail at the meeting while the senior PPP leaders assured their full support to the Bhutto family. They were of the view that the time was ripe for a practical move against the Zardaris. It was also decided that all the sidelined and disgraced leaders of the party, including Nahid Khan, Dr Safdar Abbasi and Ghulam Mustafa Khar, would also be brought back into the fold,” he said.

He added most of the Jiyalas, diehard workers and party sympathisers had been disappointed by the Zardari-led PPP, which had created wide gaps between the new government and the masses. “The leaders understand that the PPP has lost its public favour after the assassination of Benazir Bhutto and now the time is ripe to turn the public frustration into a positive political force,” the spokesman said. The founding leaders of the PPP, Dr Ghulam Hussain and Dr Mubashar Hassan, have also been in contact with Mumtaz Ali Bhutto and backed the idea of a merger, he added (‘Bhutto family, PPP stalwarts unite against Zardari’ 2008, *PakTribune*, 4 July <http://www.paktribune.com/news/index.shtml?202792> – Accessed 12 August 2008 – Attachment 16).

A 7 July 2008 report in the *Business Recorder* notes that Ghinwa Bhutto contested the installation of Zardari as PPP co-chair, and notes the tension in “PPP stalwarts” between “loyalty to their present leadership and their devotion to Bhuttoism”. The report goes on to claim that the “schism in the ranks of the party is bound to deepen when the real Bhuttos will make the call”, and that “there should be no doubt that if the Bhuttos mount the challenge [Zardari] would be stretched to his last limits to defend himself”:

Ghinwa Bhutto, the widow of Murtaza Bhutto, contested Zardari’s ascent to the PPP’s top slot. She claimed Murtaza’s daughter Fatima and son Zulfiqar Junior, to be the rightful inheritors of Bhuttoism. But in an ambience of ‘the king is dead, long live the king’ the streets of Larkana witnessed the disgraceful drama of Ghinwa and other Bhuttos being pushed aside by the new legatees. However, now it seems the narrative is going to change, the real Bhuttos, as they like to call themselves, have come back to lay claim to their inheritance.

...Reports say Ghinwa has met with some of the PPP old guard, including Mumtaz Bhutto and Ghulam Mustafa Jatoi, and discussed revival of a Bhutto-led PPP. She also plans to travel to Bhit Shah and then to Larkana and the family graveyard at Garhi Khuda Bakhsh, where Sassi’s father is buried along side her grandfather Z.A. Bhutto, uncle Murtaza and aunt Benazir. In the rural Sindh, a daughter visiting her father’s graveside in circumstances surrounded by folklore as popular as Bhuttos’, she is bound to send shivers down many spines.

The family tragedy that now runs into three generations, lends Bhuttos a cultic stature and has turned each Bhutto into an iconic figure, which Asif Ali Zardari and his company would find hard to dislodge. And more so now that a storm against Zardari and his hand-picked government is already brewing.

...A growing number of his detractors are from the PPP itself and mostly from Sindh. Erstwhile PPP stalwarts like Amin Faheem, Nawab Yousuf Talpur, Safder Abbasi and Raza Rabbani are indeed torn apart between their loyalty to their present leadership and their devotion to Bhuttoism. That schism in the ranks of the party is bound to deepen when the real Bhuttos will make the call. Nobody should underestimate Zardari’s resilience; he is a man of crisis and has weathered huge storms. But there should be no doubt that if the Bhuttos mount the challenge he would be stretched to his last limits to defend himself (‘The return of Bhuttos’ 2008, *Business Recorder*, 7 July – Attachment 16).

2. Please advise whether there is any information that all of its candidates were forced to withdraw at the last election?

No information was located suggesting that PPP-SB candidates were forced to withdraw at the last election (February 2008).

According to the Pakistan Election Commission website, 22 candidates from the PPP-SB stood in the February 2008 national election ('Election Results: Pakistan People's Party (Shaheed Bhutto)' (undated), Election Commission of Pakistan website <http://www2.ecp.gov.pk/vsite/ElectionResult/Candidates.aspx> – Accessed 13 August 2008 – Attachment 21).

Three press reports mention that Ghinwa Bhutto and other PPP-SB candidates stood in the February 2008 election:

- A February 2008 election preview in *Dawn* newspaper states that Ghinwa Bhutto is standing as a candidate for constituency NA 204 in Larkana, and that she had stood for this seat in the 1997 election:

Ghinwa Bhutto faces the PPP juggernaut in the form of Shahid Bhutto, whose support base matches that of the late Benazir Bhutto in this constituency that includes Larkana city and Bakrani town. In the 1997 elections, Ghinwa Bhutto, the PPPSB chief, lost by a huge margin to Nisar Khuhro, a stalwart of the PPP. That contest was largely one-sided even though people were then emotionally charged in the wake of Mir Murtaza Bhutto's recent assassination. This time around promises to be no different. Shahid Bhutto's position has been further consolidated after the December 27 assassination of the PPP chief and his opponent, Ghinwa Bhutto, does not stand much of a chance ('District Profile: Upper Sindh – Larkana', *Dawn – Herald Election 2008*, February <http://www.dawn.com/weekly/herald/herald67.htm> – Accessed 13 August 2008 – Attachment 18).

- A 22 February article in Pakistani newspaper *The News* lists Ghinwa Bhutto as one of many prominent political figures who lost their election security deposits for failing to secure 12.5 percent of the vote in their constituency (Manzoor, U. 2008, 'Humayun Akhtar, Wasi Zafar, many others lose deposits', *The News*, 22 February http://www.thenews.com.pk/top_story_detail.asp?Id=13127 – Accessed 13 August 2008 – Attachment 19).
- A 20 February report in *Dawn* newspaper quotes Ghinwa Bhutto claiming that "rigging" was committed in the election, and calling "for major amendments to election laws offering equal opportunities to the poor, women and minorities" ('Ghinwa's reaction to poll results' 2008, *Dawn*, 20 February <http://www.dawn.com/2008/02/21/nat13.htm> – Accessed 13 August 2008 – Attachment 20).

In an October 2003 interview with *Dawn* newspaper, Ghinwa Bhutto claims that PPP-SB "candidates and our people were taken away" in the 2002 national election, although it is not clear what she is claiming to have happened. She states that "[t]hey disqualified me because of the graduation condition", or because she did not have a university degree:

In the last elections we were almost made to give up. They could not say it to us straight but basically this is what they did by their actions. They disqualified me because of the graduation condition. We were fought against tooth and nail. Our candidates and our people were taken away. Pressure tactics were used to make us stay back. I am not going to put all the blame on that because manipulations can only take place when there is no political slogan which attracts the whole country. Once you have a political party which has a programme which embraces the whole country, then manipulation becomes very difficult. Those who

manipulate have taken advantage of the fact that people are disappointed with political parties. There isn't still any political party which could reach all the people and therefore they took advantage of this and made it even more difficult for us to reach out. We have not yet reached out to everybody ('Country in state of civil disobedience: Ghinwa' 2003, *Dawn*, 4 October <http://www.dawn.com/2003/10/04/fea.htm> – Accessed 12 August 2008 – Attachment 14).

3. Is there evidence that Ghinwa Bhutto and other party members were bashed before the last election and, if so, by whom?

No information was located suggesting that Ghinwa Bhutto and other party members were assaulted before the last election. One source reports that a PPP-SB member was killed by police during an alleged armed robbery, and two articles from February 2006 report of a “scuffle” at a polling booth on election day between Ghinwa Bhutto and an electoral rival.

One report was located, from *Dawn* newspaper, which stated that a PPP-SB member had been killed by police “in an alleged armed robbery”:

The chairperson of Pakistan People's Party-Shaheed Bhutto, Ms Ghinwa Bhutto, said on Wednesday that the country had been turned into a police state due to non-existence of a true democratic system and urged the people to struggle for change. She made the remarks while offering condolences to the family of party activist, Ghulam Nabi Channa alias Karo, who was gunned down by police in an alleged armed robbery two days ago in Latifabad Unit-7.

She blamed improper training of police for the recurrence of such incidents in different parts of the country and stressed awareness among people to struggle against injustices. Ms Ghinwa said that police not only in Sindh but all over the country were required to be given proper training and urged the heirs of the deceased, Ghulam Nabi, to raise their voice against injustice. She said that only political and democratic struggle could guide people to secure their fundamental rights but police were never held accountable in the country ('Hyderabad: Country has become police state: Ghinwa' 2007, *Dawn*, 29 August <http://www.dawn.com/2007/08/30/local24.htm> – Accessed 13 August 2008 – Attachment 22).

Two articles from February 2008 report an incident that took place between Ghinwa Bhutto and her PPP adversary at a polling booth on election day. The Canadian *National Post* states that “[o]ne of the few dramatic highlights of election day was a wild physical and verbal confrontation in a polling station between a PPP candidate and Ghinwa Bhutto”, and that “Ghinwa Bhutto loudly denounced members of her sister's party for taking care of themselves rather than putting the interests of the country first”. The Pakistan *Daily Times* provided more detail of the incident:

A scuffle took place between Pakistan People's Party-Shaheed Bhutto (PPP-SB) chairwoman Ghinwa Bhutto and PPP-Parliamentarians leader Nisar Ahmed Khuhro during polling at Sheikh Zaid Colony polling station No12 here. Ghinwa visited the said polling station and raised the issue of registration of National Identity Card (NIC) numbers on the voter lists. PPP leader Nisar Ahmed Khuhro also arrived at the polling station.

Uproar ensued, in which PPP-SB activists manhandled Khuhro, while Ghinwa used abusive language. Ghinwa snatched the NIC of a female voter, whose name was registered on the voter list while her NIC number was not. Ghinwa asked to stop the polling, while Khuhro was adamant on continuing it. Discussion between the leaders was still underway when a PPP-SB activist, Inayat Hussain Umrani, ran forward to punch Khuhro. Khuhro's clothes were torn in the tussle, and he received minor injuries on the face (Khuhro, G.M. 2008, 'Ghinwa, Khuhro

trade hot words', *Daily Times*, 19 February http://www.dailytimes.com.pk/default.asp?page=2008\02\19\story_19-2-2008_pg7_5 – Accessed 13 August 2008 – Attachment 23; Fisher, M. 2008, 'Opposition parties already celebrating, confident of victory', *National Post* (source: Canwest News Service), 18 February <http://www.nationalpost.com/news/world/story.html?id=317332> – Accessed 13 August 2008 – Attachment 24).

4. Were any of their candidates elected at the last election?

No candidates of the PPP-SB were elected at the February 2008 election, nor in the June 2008 by-elections, at either a national or provincial level (for a summary of elected candidates at a national level see: Pakistan Election Commission 2008, 'Party Position Summary', Pakistan Election Commission website, 28 June <http://www.ecp.gov.pk/pps.pdf> – Accessed 13 August 2008 – Attachment 25; for a summary of elected candidates at a provincial level, see: Pakistan Election Commission 2008, 'Provincial Assemblies: Party Position Including Reserved Seats', Pakistan Election Commission website, 28 June <http://www.ecp.gov.pk/PAPosition.pdf> – Accessed 13 August 2008 – Attachment 26).

5. Is there any information on whether members of this party have suffered since the elections, and if so, by whom?

Two reports were located which referred to the mistreatment of PPP-SB members since the February 2008 elections.

Two sources report a July 2008 "encounter" killing in which a member of the PPP-SB was killed by police. A 12 July 2008 "urgent appeal" issued by the Asian Human Rights Commission (AHRC) states that the police officer involved in the killing "has a notorious reputation for his involvement in what are believed to be fake police encounters". The AHRC appeal describes the killed man as an "activist of the Pakistan People's Party (Shaheed Bhutto faction)":

Mr. Ali Gohar Chandio, 36, a property dealer and activist of the Pakistan Peoples' Party (Shaheed Bhutto faction) was going to his business with his driver, Mr. Ghulam Nabi Chandio, on July 10. When they reached the Abul Hassan Isphani road, Karachi, a car with plain cloth police officers intercepted their car and stopped them. Without warning or any explanation as to why the car had been stopped Mr. Ishaq Lashari, Inspector Investigation officer of Feroz Abad police station, came out with his accomplices and fired at the rear windscreen. Mr. Ali Gohar and Mr. Ghulam tried to get out of the car and take shelter. When Mr. Ali Gohar Chandio came out from the car, Inspector Ishaq Lashari opened fire at him, killing him at the spot. The driver was later on shot and injured and the police would not allow anybody to assist him. He succumbed to injuries before reaching the hospital. This incident took place at noon and the police issued its version of police encounter in the late evening. Police said that a police party chased the car from Ferozabad police station, P.E.C. Housing Society, a distance of almost 12 kilometres from the original place of incident, and stopped the car, the occupant of car dodged the police and fired some shots.

...Inspector Ishaq Lashari has a notorious reputation for his involvement in what are believed to be fake police encounters... Inspector Lashari and the other police officers involved were jailed through the Suo Motu action of the then Chief Justice Iftikhar Choudhry. However, after Mr. Choudhry was relieved of his post the new judiciary, handpicked by President Musharraf, released all the police officers ('Pakistan: Two persons were killed in police encounter' 2008, Asian Human Rights Commission website, 12 July

<http://www.ahrchk.net/ua/mainfile.php/2008/2928/> – Accessed 13 August 2008 – Attachment 27).

A 14 July article in the Sindh *Regional Times* reports the comments of Sindh National Front (SNF) leaders on the killing of Ali Gohar Chandio, described as a “PPP-SB central leader”:

The President of Sindh National Front (SNF) Larkana City, Muzafar Sahtio and its central leaders including, Hout Khan Merali in their joint press statement issued on Sunday have alleged that the Karachi police has allegedly killed PPP-SB central leader, Ali Gohar Chandio in a fake encounter. They strongly condemned that act of the police and demanded of the concerned authorities to conduct a neutral inquiry in the matter (Gorar, G.R. & Khoso, A. 2008, ‘Bhutto community condemns statements of PPP ministers against Mumtaz Bhutto’ *Regional Times* website, 14 July

<http://www.regionaltimes.com/14jul2008/heartland/bhutto.php> – Accessed 13 August 2008 – Attachment 28).

6. What is their relationship like with the mainstream PPP party?

Sources suggest that the relationship between the PPP-SB and the PPP is hostile, although no sources were located indicating that this translates to recent violence between party members, apart from the February 2008 polling day “scuffle” reported in Question 3 above. See Question 1 above on the formation of the PPP-SB as a reaction to the perceived involvement of Asif Ali Zardari, husband of Benazir Bhutto, in the killing of her brother Murtaza, who had started a rival faction of the PPP. Ghinwa Bhutto, the chairperson of the PPP-SB, has reportedly maintained a lasting enmity against Benazir Bhutto for her perceived role in her husband’s death, and has consistently criticised the PPP for reneging on the socialist principles espoused by its founder, Benazir and Murtaza’s father, Zulfikar Ali Bhutto. The conflict between the PPP and the PPP-SB is largely based around a struggle over the legacy of the Bhutto name, and the political and economic resources that flow from this. Recent reports, a selection of which follow below, indicate that Ghinwa and her stepdaughter Fatima are attempting to organise disaffected PPP stalwarts and the younger Bhuttos to form a new PPP faction (see also Question 1 above for more recent reports on PPP-SB activity).

A March 2008 article from *Vogue* magazine profiles the Bhutto family:

A family feud ripped the Bhutto siblings apart, and now Benazir’s niece Fatima Bhutto, the 25-year-old daughter of Mir Murtaza, talks about its repercussions.

...“We were very close when I was a child,” she says of herself and Benazir, “but I was a very strong critic of her government and her politics.” As far as her record with women was concerned, says Fatima, “a lot of women placed hope in her because they thought she would tackle the Hudood Ordinances, but she didn’t.” She openly condemned her aunt’s October return to Karachi, in which more than 140 people were killed in a suicide bombing, as exposing people to attack, calling it “personal theatre.” She is also adamant that politics should not be controlled by a few elite families. Fatima, a graduate of Columbia University and London’s School of Oriental and African Studies, is a frequent columnist for Pakistan’s *The News International*; her columns have also appeared in *The Los Angeles Times*. She has written two books—one about the victims of the Kashmir earthquake, and, after her father’s death, a book of poetry—and she speaks in rapid-fire sound bites. With her intelligence and impressive achievements, you cannot help thinking she would be the perfect heir apparent to the Bhutto dynasty... “I have always said it is not a birthright,” she says pointedly. “Politics in this country is held hostage to the very few.”

She saw her cousin Bilawal at his mother's funeral. "He's a nice boy, a sweet boy," she says, but you can tell by the tone of her voice that she does not approve of his political inheritance. She says that her family is more interested in social activism and grassroots work than power. They have set up medical tents in the villages to bring treatment to thousands of people. Her seventeen-year-old half-brother, Zulfikar, who was named after his grandfather, seems more interested in environmental issues than in politics. ...Fatima also works in the slums of Karachi and in the women's prison that is just outside the gates of the Bhutto compound.

Meanwhile, Ghinwa Bhutto is running in parliamentary elections in a constituency adjacent to Benazir's. Her party is an offshoot of the PPP called the PPPSB, named in memory of her late father-in-law. The house is full of ghosts, and while Ghinwa and Fatima are careful not to be too brutal in their criticism, there is a history here. Fatima's father had long been a political rival for PPP power. He was mysteriously killed in a police shoot-out in Karachi in 1996, for which Ghinwa and his children blame Benazir, if not for the actual killing, then for doing little to prevent it or to aid the investigation. It gets murkier. There are rumours that Benazir's husband, Zardari, was behind it; there are rumours that Benazir wanted the power of the PPP simply for herself. There is also the elusive question of why all the Bhuttos die such horrific deaths: Benazir's youngest brother, Shahnawaz Bhutto, was found dead at 27 in the south of France in 1985 with a broken bottle of poison next to him.

...Meanwhile, Ghinwa is hoping to open up another Bhutto political front. Her following is small, but she is optimistic. "This is the legacy of the Bhuttos," she says after dinner, leading us through the long hallway to the outer courtyard. "To make the impossible possible" (di Giovanni, J. 2008, 'Power Crisis: The Bhutto Legacy' *Vogue*, Vol. 198; No. 3, March <http://www.janinedigiovanni.com/Vogue-bhutto.pdf> – Accessed 13 August 2008 – Attachment 29).

A January 2008 report from *ABC News* quotes Ghinwa Bhutto stating that she will attempt to convince Bilawal Zardari, Benazir Bhutto's son and co-chair of the PPP, to defect to the PPP-SB.

Ghinwa Bhutto has been estranged from the former premier since her husband, Benazir's younger brother Murtaza, was gunned down amid shady circumstances in Karachi 12 years ago while Ms Bhutto was still in power. In the latest twist to the feuding that has torn the country's "royal family" apart, Lebanese-born Ghinwa Bhutto says she now hopes to woo Ms Bhutto's 19-year-old son Bilawal to her side.

"We'll try to bring him to our party," she told AFP at her sprawling home in the southern town of Larkana – a portrait of her husband on one side of her and a photograph of a young Benazir on the other. Asked how she intended to get the Oxford undergraduate to defect, she said: "I don't know, with love and affection and education. Maybe when he comes back he might like our set-up better than the set-up of the other party."

Any such move would be fiercely resisted by the Pakistan People's Party (PPP), which kept the leadership in the family for a third generation by naming Bilawal and his father Asif Ali Zardari as co-chairmen after Ms Bhutto's death.

...Nevertheless she said that without Ms Bhutto at its helm, the PPP could split, adding that her party would welcome Bilawal when he returns to Pakistan because it is the rightful heir to the legacy of his grandfather, Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto.

"I don't know what would be left of the other party. And if he sees I'm making a party here for everybody to work with...to deliver this legacy to the people, he might like it," she said.

“He seems to be a nice boy.” She described Bilawal as a “sweet child, always willing to get in touch, always willing to speak, always willing to hug and kiss his cousins and even me” despite the strains in the family.

Those cousins include a young woman widely seen in Pakistan as another potential heir to the Bhutto heritage – and one who had continued the feud with Ms Bhutto’s side of the family: Murtaza’s 25-year-old daughter Fatima.

...Benazir’s death has though failed to heal the split with the 73-year-old patriarch of the Bhutto tribe, Mumtaz Ali Bhutto, who also lives in the Larkana area. Mumtaz told Britain’s Guardian newspaper last week that the PPP’s new choice of leadership was “most unfortunate,” particularly reserving his scorn for Ms Bhutto’s widower, Mr Zardari. “He will not be able to conduct himself as the same level as Benazir,” he told the newspaper.

For Ghinwa, however, the important thing is to unify a family whose history has been stained in blood and rancour since the execution of former premier Zulfikar Ali Bhutto in 1979 by a military regime. “Why should there be a conflict?” she said when asked if she thought the feud would seep down into Bilawal and Fatima’s generation. “I do hope that these young kids will just tell the grown-ups to stay out of it. They’ll know how to get along” (‘Sister-in-law wants Bhutto’s son to defect’ 2008, *ABC News* (source: AFP), 9 January <http://www.abc.net.au/news/stories/2008/01/09/2134935.htm?section=world> – Accessed 13 August 2008 – Attachment 30).

A July 2008 report on the *boloji.com* news website claims that “[t]he number of opponents of assassinated former prime minister Benazir Bhutto’s widower Zardari is increasing, with some key party stalwarts weighing the option of creating a new faction in the PPP and to install someone from the Bhutto family as head of what is arguably the country’s most popular political party”.

Three days after Benazir’s assassination, Zardari hyphenated her surname to his own and to those of his three children. Thus, Bilawal is now called Bilawal Bhutto-Zardari. However, this has been rejected by other Bhutto family members, who have started lobbying for naming someone from the Bhutto family as head of the PPP. Now, with the arrival of Bhutto’s niece Sassi in Pakistan, speculation is rife that anti-Zardari elements in the PPP and the Bhutto family are getting together and may make things difficult for Zardari’s supporters in the PPP.

...However, 11 closely related members of the Bhutto family had met to discuss the family issues, the source added.

...“Everyone knows what’s happening in the country... and people are looking towards the Bhutto family,” Ghinwa told IANS from Karachi, adding that all members of the Bhutto family were discussing “family issues”. Asked if this gathering was meant to divide the family assets, she said “there are certain issues” that were being discussed. The Lebanese-Syrian widow of Murtaza said her cousins in Pakistan warmly welcomed Sassi and “she’s here to meet family members and offer prayers at the family graveyard”.

Replying to a question whether estranged PPP leader Amin Fahim or any other party stalwarts had contacted her, she said: “Many from the party are talking to me...their names will be known at the appropriate time” (Najeeb, M. 2008, ‘Pakistan People’s Party seeks Return to Roots – to the Bhutto family’, *boloji.com* website (source: IANS), 5 July <http://news.boloji.com/2008/07/22379.htm> – Accessed 13 August 2008 – Attachment 31).

See also Question 1 above, as several reports quoted provide detail of Ghinwa Bhutto’s objections to the PPP and the perceived betrayal of its founding principles, which she claims

the PPP-SB is now bearing. A February 2008 *BBC News* report details these claims, and a December 2007 article in *Dawn* reported that the PPP-SB had reached ““seat adjustment accord[s]” with many parties opposed to the PPP, including the PML-Q of President Musharraf, in the February 2008 elections (see Plett, B. 2008, ‘Bhutto’s party fights for her legacy’, *BBC News*, 8 February http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/south_asia/7232270.stm – Accessed 11 August 2008 – Attachment 7; and Kalhoro, M.B. 2007, ‘PPP (SB), PML (Q) unite against Benazir’, *Dawn*, 13 December <http://www.dawn.com/2007/12/13/nat15.htm> – Accessed 12 August 2008 – Attachment 8).

7. Any other relevant information?

No other relevant information was located.

List of Sources Consulted

Internet Sources:

Government Information & Reports

UK Home Office <http://www.homeoffice.gov.uk/>

US Department of State <http://www.state.gov/>

United Nations

UNHCR Refworld <http://www.unhcr.org/cgi-bin/texis/vtx/refworld/rwmain>

Non-Government Organisations

Human Rights Watch <http://www.hrw.org/>

Amnesty International <http://www.amnesty.org>

International Crisis Group <http://www.crisisgroup.org>

International News & Politics

BBC News <http://news.bbc.co.uk>

Region Specific Links

Asian Centre for Human Rights website <http://www.achrweb.org/>

Dawn website www.dawn.com

Pakistan Election Commission website www.ecp.gov.pk/

Pakistan Times <http://www.pakistantimes.net>

The Daily Times website <http://www.dailytimes.com.pk>

The Nation <http://www.nation.com.pk>

Topic Specific Links

Pakistan People’s Party website <http://www.ppp.org.pk>

Search Engines

Google <http://www.google.com>

Databases:

FACTIVA (news database)

BACIS (DIAC Country Information database)

REFINFO (IRBDC (Canada) Country Information database)

ISYS (RRT Research & Information database, including Amnesty International, Human Rights Watch, US Department of State Reports)

RRT Library Catalogue

List of Attachments

1. Banks, A., Muller, C. & Overstreet, W. (eds) 2007, *Political Handbook of the World: 2007*, CQ Press, Washington D.C.
2. 'PPP-SB draft manifesto vows free education' 2008, *Dawn*, 27 June <http://www.dawn.com/2008/06/27/nat2.htm> – Accessed 11 August 2008.
3. Naru, A. 2008, 'Pakistan a divided society', On Line Opinion website, 15 April <http://www.onlineopinion.com.au/view.asp?article=7234&page=0> – Accessed 11 August 2008.
4. Kalhoro, M.B. 2008, 'Gilani vows to accomplish Bhuttos' mission', *Dawn*, 5 April <http://www.dawn.com/2008/04/05/top4.htm> – Accessed 11 August 2008.
5. 'Ghinwa criticises 'US meddling'' 2008, *Pakistan Press International Information Services*, 28 March. (FACTIVA)
6. 'Party Profiles: The Party's On – Pakistan People's Party' 2008, *Dawn – Herald Election 2008*, February <http://www.dawn.com/weekly/herald/herald4.htm> – Accessed 11 August 2008.
7. Plett, B. 2008, 'Bhutto's party fights for her legacy', *BBC News*, 8 February http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/south_asia/7232270.stm – Accessed 11 August 2008.
8. Kalhoro, M.B. 2007, 'PPP (SB), PML (Q) unite against Benazir', *Dawn*, 13 December <http://www.dawn.com/2007/12/13/nat15.htm> – Accessed 12 August 2008.
9. Dalrymple, W. 2008, 'In the Name of the Father', *Tehelka*, Vol. 5, No. 21, 31 May http://www.tehelka.com/story_main39.asp?filename=Ne310508in_the.asp – Accessed 11 August 2008.
10. 'Larkana: SNF doubts BB's promise about autonomy' 2007, *Dawn*, 17 December <http://www.dawn.com/2007/12/18/local22.htm> – Accessed 12 August 2008.
11. 'Country under crises due to lack of provincial autonomy: Ghinwa' 2006, *The Post*, 10 October http://www.thepost.com.pk/Arc_ShortNews.aspx?shortid=2630&catid=3&date=10/10/2006&fcid=14 – Accessed 11 August 2008.
12. 'Leftist Parties of the World – Pakistan' 2004, broadleft.org website, 19 July <http://www.broadleft.org/pk.htm> – Accessed 11 August 2008.
13. 'Hyderabad: Ghinwa criticises political parties' 2006, *Dawn*, 30 April <http://www.dawn.com/2006/04/30/local7.htm> – Accessed 12 August 2008.
14. 'Country in state of civil disobedience: Ghinwa' 2003, *Dawn*, 4 October <http://www.dawn.com/2003/10/04/fea.htm> – Accessed 12 August 2008.
15. 'Bhutto family, PPP stalwarts unite against Zardari' 2008, *PakTribune*, 4 July <http://www.paktribune.com/news/index.shtml?202792> – Accessed 12 August 2008.

16. 'The return of Bhuttos' 2008, *Business Recorder*, 7 July. (FACTIVA)
17. 'Fatima Bhutto learning politics step by step' 2008, *Zee News*, 7 July
<http://www.zeenews.com/articles.asp?aid=453772&sid=SAS> – Accessed 12 August 2008.
18. 'District Profile: Upper Sindh – Larkana', *Dawn – Herald Election 2008*, February
<http://www.dawn.com/weekly/herald/herald67.htm> – Accessed 13 August 2008.
19. Manzoor, U. 2008, 'Humayun Akhtar, Wasi Zafar, many others lose deposits', *The News*, 22 February http://www.thenews.com.pk/top_story_detail.asp?Id=13127 – Accessed 13 August 2008.
20. 'Ghinwa's reaction to poll results' 2008, *Dawn*, 20 February
<http://www.dawn.com/2008/02/21/nat13.htm> – Accessed 13 August 2008.
21. 'Election Results: Pakistan People's Party (Shaheed Bhutto)' (undated), Election Commission of Pakistan website
<http://www2.ecp.gov.pk/vsite/ElectionResult/Candidates.aspx> – Accessed 13 August 2008.
22. 'Hyderabad: Country has become police state: Ghinwa' 2007, *Dawn*, 29 August
<http://www.dawn.com/2007/08/30/local24.htm> – Accessed 13 August 2008.
23. Khuhro, G.M. 2008, 'Ghinwa, Khuhro trade hot words', *Daily Times*, 19 February
http://www.dailytimes.com.pk/default.asp?page=2008\02\19\story_19-2-2008_pg7_5
– Accessed 13 August 2008.
24. Fisher, M. 2008, 'Opposition parties already celebrating, confident of victory', *National Post* (source: Canwest News Service), 18 February
<http://www.nationalpost.com/news/world/story.html?id=317332> – Accessed 13 August 2008.
25. Pakistan Election Commission 2008, 'Party Position Summary', Pakistan Election Commission website, 28 June <http://www.ecp.gov.pk/pps.pdf> – Accessed 13 August 2008.
26. Pakistan Election Commission 2008, 'Provincial Assemblies: Party Position Including Reserved Seats', Pakistan Election Commission website, 28 June
<http://www.ecp.gov.pk/PAPosition.pdf> – Accessed 13 August 2008.
27. 'Pakistan: Two persons were killed in police encounter' 2008, Asian Human Rights Commission website, 12 July <http://www.ahrchk.net/ua/mainfile.php/2008/2928/> – Accessed 13 August 2008.
28. Gorar, G.R. & Khoso, A. 2008, 'Bhutto community condemns statements of PPP ministers against Mumtaz Bhutto' *Regional Times* website, 14 July
<http://www.regionaltimes.com/14jul2008/heartland/bhutto.php> – Accessed 13 August 2008.

29. di Giovanni, J. 2008, 'Power Crisis: The Bhutto Legacy' *Vogue*, Vol. 198; No. 3, March <http://www.janinedigiovanni.com/Vogue-bhutto.pdf> – Accessed 13 August 2008.
30. 'Sister-in-law wants Bhutto's son to defect' 2008, *ABC News* (source: AFP), 9 January <http://www.abc.net.au/news/stories/2008/01/09/2134935.htm?section=world> – Accessed 13 August 2008.
31. Najeeb, M. 2008, 'Pakistan People's Party seeks Return to Roots – to the Bhutto family', *boloji.com* website, 5 July <http://news.boloji.com/2008/07/22379.htm> – Accessed 13 August 2008.