

# Country Advice Pakistan

Pakistan – PAK40002 – Faisalabad – Women's Issues – Health Care – Tehrik-e-Taliban Pakistan (TTP)

23 March 2012

## 1. Please provide information on the general level of crime in Faisalabad.

Recent statistics have been published which refer to Faisalabad district having the highest level of reported crime for both Punjab province and all of Pakistan. In January 2012, the Free and Fair Election Network (FAFEN)<sup>1</sup> stated that 32,021 First Information Reports (FIRs)<sup>2</sup> had been filed across Pakistan during October 2011. The highest proportion of these FIRs had been filed in Faisalabad district, which had 11% of the nationwide total. The *Daily Times* provided the following list of the most prominent types of crime that had taken place in that district:

The highest number of FIRs in the district were lodged for murder, attempted murder, robbery and dacoity,<sup>3</sup> criminal trespass, criminal breach of trust, counterfeiting currency notes and bank notes, theft, motor vehicle lifting, forced marriages and other crimes.<sup>4</sup>

A *Dawn* report from July 2011 made reference to official statistics regarding the number of cases of "street crime" that were registered in each district of Punjab province in 2010. It was indicated that the definition of street crime included wallet snatching and cash snatching, along with "snatching of other effects". It was reported that the highest number of reported cases had occurred in Faisalabad district, with 1,015 registered cases.<sup>5</sup>

Crime levels in Faisalabad have remained high during the opening period of 2012. In an article from *The Express Tribune*, published on 4 March 2012, it was reported that police in

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The Free and Fair Election Network (FAFEN) is "a coalition of 42 civil society organisations working to strengthen all forms of democratic accountabilities in the country and governed by the Trust for Democratic Education and Accountability": 'FAFEN monitoring report Many police stations lack essential facilities' 2012, *Dawn*, 16 January <a href="http://www.dawn.com/2012/01/16/fafen-monitoring-report-many-police-stations-lack-essential-facilities.html">http://www.dawn.com/2012/01/16/fafen-monitoring-report-many-police-stations-lack-essential-facilities.html</a> – Accessed 19 March 2012.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> First Information Reports (FIRs) are written reports prepared by police in response to the report of an event or criminal incident brought to their attention. They are a record of the initial information that a complainant provides to the police: Immigration and Refugee Board of Canada 2010, *PAK103605.E – Pakistan: First Information Reports* (*FIRs*), 4 November <a href="http://www.irb-cisr.gc.ca:8080/RIR">http://www.irb-cisr.gc.ca:8080/RIR</a> RDI/RIR RDI.aspx?id=453213&l=e – Accessed 19 March 2012.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> The term "dacoity" refers to armed robbery, while a "dacoit" is a bandit: 'Dacoity' (undated), Webster's Online Dictionary <a href="http://www.websters-online-dictionary.org/definitions/dacoity">http://www.websters-online-dictionary.org/definitions/dacoity</a> – Accessed 19 March 2012.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> 'Faisalabad registers most of the FIRs in October' 2012, *Daily Times*, 3 January <a href="http://www.dailytimes.com.pk/default.asp?page=2012%5C01%5C03%5Cstory\_3-1-2012\_pg7\_14">http://www.dailytimes.com.pk/default.asp?page=2012%5C01%5C03%5Cstory\_3-1-2012\_pg7\_14</a> – Accessed 19 March 2012.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Ali, M. F. 2011, 'Street crime data 2010 Faisalabad, Lahore the most mugged districts', *Dawn*, 11 July <a href="http://www.dawn.com/2011/07/11/street-crime-data-2010-faisalabad-lahore-the-most-mugged-districts.html">http://www.dawn.com/2011/07/11/street-crime-data-2010-faisalabad-lahore-the-most-mugged-districts.html</a> – Accessed 19 March 2012.

Faisalabad district had already registered 5,476 criminal cases. The following information regarding the nature of some of the reported crimes was provided:

Of the cases registered in the two months, 87 were murder, 67 abduction, 412 robbery and 90 dacoity. Police record has revealed that 260 motorcycles and 16 cars were snatched from the people, while three gold 3 jewellery shops, three weaving factories and two mills were looted.

In robberies and dacoities, as many as 20 people, including four women, were injured, police record states. Cases were registered against 655 people for drug dealing and 533 for carrying illegal weapons, police said.<sup>6</sup>

Police had reportedly claimed that street crime had notably increased "over time across the district". Sadiq Dogar, senior superintendent of police (Operations), had also suggested that the "crime rate across the district was increasing."

Additional reports have been located which refer to an increasing level of crime in Faisalabad in recent times. On 2 October 2011, *Dunya News* reported that there had been a marked increase in crime in Faisalabad, with "[o]ver 100 dacoities, robberies, murders and kidnappings" having been reported across the city in the previous week. A *Pakistan Today* report from August 2011, which refers to the then-recent murders of two persons by torture in Faisalabad, stated that "[c]itizens have expressed their apprehensions about the growing incidents of violent crimes in the city." In April 2011, *The Express Tribune* reported that crime rates had increased in Faisalabad district during the first quarter of 2011, despite the allocation of additional funding for police by the Punjab provincial government. A March 2011 *Dunya News* report had also made reference to "the increasing crime rate" in the Faisalabad area.

A report from *The Express Tribune*, published on 7 January 2012, provides information which links the rise in crime in Faisalabad to the energy crisis which has afflicted Pakistan since late 2007. The economy of Faisalabad "has long been dominated by manufacturing, specifically in the textile sector". Therefore the energy crisis' impact on the city's electricity and gas supplies has resulted in what is estimated to be "tens of thousands" of labourers being laid off. Waheed Khaliq Raamay, the chairman of the Loom Owners Association Faisalabad chapter, was quoted as stating that the resulting unemployment, as well as inflation, had led to an increase in street crime. It was reported that, while there were no separate statistics available for Faisalabad, there had been "a dramatic increase in property crime" in Punjab province since the beginning of the energy crisis. In 2011, a total of 102,619 property crimes

http://tribune.com.pk/story/345023/crime-5476-cases-registered-in-two-months/ - Accessed 19 March 2012.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Islam, S. 2012, 'Crime: 5,476 cases registered in two months', *The Express Tribune*, 4 March <a href="http://tribune.com.pk/story/345023/crime-5476-cases-registered-in-two-months/">http://tribune.com.pk/story/345023/crime-5476-cases-registered-in-two-months/</a> – Accessed 19 March 2012. <sup>7</sup> Islam, S. 2012, 'Crime: 5,476 cases registered in two months', *The Express Tribune*, 4 March

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> 'Faisalabad crime surge reflects police inefficiency' 2011, *Dunya News*, 2 October <a href="http://dunyanews.tv/index.php?key=Q2F0SUQ9OCNOaWQ9NDI2MjM">http://dunyanews.tv/index.php?key=Q2F0SUQ9OCNOaWQ9NDI2MjM</a>= – Accessed 19 March 2012.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> 'Another body stuffed in sack found in Faisalabad' 2011, *Pakistan Today*, 26 August <a href="http://www.pakistantoday.com.pk/2011/08/26/news/national/another-body-stuffed-in-sack-found-in-faisalabad/">http://www.pakistantoday.com.pk/2011/08/26/news/national/another-body-stuffed-in-sack-found-in-faisalabad/</a> Accessed 19 March 2012.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Islam, S. 2011, 'Crime rates go up despite additional funding for police', *The Express Tribune*, 28 April <a href="http://tribune.com.pk/story/158250/crime-rates-go-up-despite-additional-funding-for-police/">http://tribune.com.pk/story/158250/crime-rates-go-up-despite-additional-funding-for-police/</a> – Accessed 19 March 2012.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> 'Faisalabad: Citizens protest against the constant rise in crime' 2011, *Dunya News*, 13 March <a href="http://dunyanews.tv/index.php?key=Q2F0SUQ9OCNOaWQ9MjIwNzE">http://dunyanews.tv/index.php?key=Q2F0SUQ9OCNOaWQ9MjIwNzE</a> – Accessed 19 March 2012.

were recorded by Punjab Police, which represented a 40% rise in four years. <sup>12</sup> Bilal Saddique Kamiana, the city police officer of Faisalabad, was reported in January 2012 to have also attributed the rise in street crime in the city to "unemployment and poverty". <sup>13</sup>

## 2. To what extent do the authorities provide protection against such criminal activity?

There are reports which indicate that the police in Faisalabad and Punjab province have made efforts to provide improved protection against crime. For example, a report from *The Nation*, published on 19 March 2012, made reference to the announcement by the Puniab Inspector General Police, Haji Habibur Rehmand, of a "phased Police Reform Programme" aimed at making Punjab "a crime free province". This reform programme involves the setting up of "100 model police stations" and reorganising the investigation system "on modern scientific lines". "[D]eterrent action" is also planned "against black sheep plaguing the disciplined police force". Rehmand also stated that "elimination of street crimes, providing protection and justice to people is the top priority of the present government". <sup>14</sup> In addition, a March 2012 report from *The Express Tribune* refers to the police in Faisalabad district having set up a monitoring cell, which "worked round the clock", in response to "the increasing number of complaints of street crime." In January 2012, Bilal Saddique Kamiana indicated that improvements had been made to the Faisalabad district's police patrolling system "to control street crimes and robberies". He also indicated that policemen involved in dacoities were being removed. 16 The US Department of State, in its 2010 Country Reports on Human Rights Practices, also noted that "[a]s in previous years, the Punjab provincial government conducted regular training and retraining in technical skills and protection of human rights for police at all levels."<sup>17</sup>

There is information available, however, which indicates that the police in Faisalabad have struggled to respond effectively to criminal activity in that city. In January 2012, it was reported that Faisalabad had failed to arrest 7,620 "most wanted criminals" during 2011. A police spokesman stated that "higher authorities repeatedly ordered subordinates to arrest outlaws". Despite their efforts to trace these persons, including through the offer of rewards, Faisalabad district police had not been successful in doing so. <sup>18</sup> There are reports which refer to the police in Faisalabad and in Punjab province being understaffed. Bilal Saddique Kamiana stated in January 2012 that "only 8,000 policemen have been deputed" to the city and that more were required "to control crime". The provincial capital, Lahore, had 30,000 policemen, despite Kamiana's claim that the crime ratio in Faisalabad was equal to that of Lahore. Kamiana also stated that "to control crime completely is impossible as hundreds of

Rana, I. 2012, 'Power outages: Energy crisis linked to rising crime in Punjab's industrial heartland', *The Express Tribune*, 7 January <a href="http://tribune.com.pk/story/317702/power-outages-energy-crisis-linked-to-rising-crime-in-punjabs-industrial-heartland/">http://tribune.com.pk/story/317702/power-outages-energy-crisis-linked-to-rising-crime-in-punjabs-industrial-heartland/</a> – Accessed 19 March 2012.
 Nizami, A. K. 2012, 'Police alone cannot control crime, admits CPO', *The Nation*, 4 January

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> Nizami, A. K. 2012, 'Police alone cannot control crime, admits CPO', *The Nation*, 4 January <a href="http://www.nation.com.pk/pakistan-news-newspaper-daily-english-online/national/04-Jan-2012/police-alone-cannot-control-crime-admits-cpo">http://www.nation.com.pk/pakistan-news-newspaper-daily-english-online/national/04-Jan-2012/police-alone-cannot-control-crime-admits-cpo</a> – Accessed 19 March 2012.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> 'IGP pledges to purge police of black sheep' 2012, *The Nation*, 19 March <a href="http://www.nation.com.pk/pakistan-news-newspaper-daily-english-online/national/19-Mar-2012/igp-pledges-to-purge-police-of-black-sheep">http://www.nation.com.pk/pakistan-news-newspaper-daily-english-online/national/19-Mar-2012/igp-pledges-to-purge-police-of-black-sheep</a> – Accessed 19 March 2012.

<sup>15</sup> Islam, S. 2012, 'Crime: 5,476 cases registered in two months', *The Express Tribune*, 4 March <a href="http://tribune.com.pk/story/345023/crime-5476-cases-registered-in-two-months/">http://tribune.com.pk/story/345023/crime-5476-cases-registered-in-two-months/</a> – Accessed 19 March 2012.

16 Nizami, A. K. 2012, 'Police alone cannot control crime, admits CPO', *The Nation*, 4 January <a href="http://www.nation.com.pk/pakistan-news-newspaper-daily-english-online/national/04-Jan-2012/police-alone-cannot-control-crime-admits-cpo">http://www.nation.com.pk/pakistan-news-newspaper-daily-english-online/national/04-Jan-2012/police-alone-cannot-control-crime-admits-cpo</a> – Accessed 19 March 2012.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> US Department of State 2011, *Country Reports on Human Rights Practices* 2010 – *Pakistan*, 8 April, Section 1.d. <sup>18</sup> '7,620 criminals at large in Faisalabad' 2012, *The News*, source: *Associated Press of Pakistan*, 2 January <a href="http://www.thenews.com.pk/article-29869-7,620-criminals-at-large-in-Faisalabad#">http://www.thenews.com.pk/article-29869-7,620-criminals-at-large-in-Faisalabad#</a> – Accessed 19 March 2012.

people visit the industrial city daily". <sup>19</sup> In May 2011, FAFEN reported that the police stations in Punjab province were understaffed, with 8% of sanctioned posts unfilled. <sup>20</sup>

Furthermore, reports refer to complaints from the residents of Faisalabad that the authorities have failed to respond adequately to criminal activity. In March 2012, "[d]ozens of residents" of the People's Colony protested over the "rising rate of robberies in the area". The protestors claimed that "the police had yet to take action against a gang of robbers operating in the area", despite several applications being made to the Batala Colony police for action to be taken. The protest ceased after the assurance was given by police that an armed robbery that had taken place that same day would be investigated.<sup>21</sup> No information was located indicating if this investigation has taken place. In October 2011, Pakistan Today reported that businessmen in Faisalabad had "expressed fears over the city's security situation" following the murder of Khawaja Javed Aziz, owner of Waqas Textiles, during a robbery. Traders and businessmen were said to have raised concerns about "poor law and order" in Faisalabad. Rana Arif Tauseef, the owner of the Pakistan Textile Exporters Association, stated that the city "had been left at the mercy of criminals." He also expressed the view that "the government had failed to provide them protection and that the criminals possessed more sophisticated weapons than the police". <sup>22</sup> An October 2011 Dunya News report refers to a recent crime surge in Faisalabad which had put "a big question mark on the efficiency of police."<sup>23</sup> In March 2011, it was reported that people had blocked the Jaranwala road in Faisalabad for two hours to protest "against the increasing crime rate" in the area. The protestors were said to have complained that "the police have not taken any action against the criminals which is why the criminal activity has increased."24

In addition, it should be noted that one report indicates that the Punjab Police Department is regarded as one of the most corrupt departments in Pakistan. A report from *The Nation*, published on 13 February 2012, stated that the Punjab Police Department "has maintained its place as the most corrupt department of the country for the last five years, except in the year 2011 when the Land Administration Department took the lead". 80 cases of corruption were filed against police officers in Punjab during 2011. Sahiwal, with 31 cases, saw the highest number of lodgments, while four cases were filed in Faisalabad.<sup>25</sup> The issue of police

<sup>-</sup>

Nizami, A. K. 2012, 'Police alone cannot control crime, admits CPO', *The Nation*, 4 January <a href="http://www.nation.com.pk/pakistan-news-newspaper-daily-english-online/national/04-Jan-2012/police-alone-cannot-control-crime-admits-cpo">http://www.nation.com.pk/pakistan-news-newspaper-daily-english-online/national/04-Jan-2012/police-alone-cannot-control-crime-admits-cpo</a> – Accessed 19 March 2012.
 Free and Fair Election Network 2011, *Police Stations Understaffed in Punjab, KP and Sindh: A Report Based on*

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> Free and Fair Election Network 2011, *Police Stations Understaffed in Punjab, KP and Sindh: A Report Based on Monitoring of 90 Police Stations in 62 Districts across Pakistan during January-March 2011*, source: Human Security Gateway, May, p. 1

http://www.humansecuritygateway.com/documents/FAFEN PoliceStationsUnderstaffedinPunjabKPandSindh.pdf – Accessed 19 March 2012.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> 'Robberies: Protest against police over rising crime' 2012, *The Express Tribune*, 6 March <a href="http://tribune.com.pk/story/345949/robberies-protest-against-police-over-rising-crime/">http://tribune.com.pk/story/345949/robberies-protest-against-police-over-rising-crime/</a> – Accessed 19 March 2012. 
<sup>22</sup> 'Spiralling crime haunts Faisalabad businessmen' 2011, *Pakistan Today*, 20 October

http://www.pakistantoday.com.pk/2011/10/20/news/national/spiralling-crime-haunts-faisalabad-businessmen/—Accessed 19 March 2012.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> 'Faisalabad crime surge reflects police inefficiency' 2011, *Dunya News*, 2 October <a href="http://dunyanews.tv/index.php?key=Q2F0SUQ9OCNOaWQ9NDI2MjM">http://dunyanews.tv/index.php?key=Q2F0SUQ9OCNOaWQ9NDI2MjM</a> – Accessed 19 March 2012.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> 'Faisalabad: Citizens protest against the constant rise in crime' 2011, *Dunya News*, 13 March <a href="http://dunyanews.tv/index.php?key=Q2F0SUQ9OCNOaWQ9MjIwNzE">http://dunyanews.tv/index.php?key=Q2F0SUQ9OCNOaWQ9MjIwNzE</a>= – Accessed 19 March 2012. 
<sup>25</sup> Hussain, J. S. 2012, 'Sahiwal police top corruption list', *The Nation*, 13 February

http://www.nation.com.pk/pakistan-news-newspaper-daily-english-online/lahore/13-Feb-2012/sahiwal-police-top-corruption-list – Accessed 19 March 2012.

corruption is not restricted to Punjab, however, reports have been located which indicate that this is a nationwide problem.<sup>26</sup>

3. Please provide information on the situation for older women living alone in Faisalabad (including in relation to their ability to maintain a household and whether there are any reports of such people being targeted for criminal activity).

Information has been located which indicates that elderly women living alone in Pakistan would face difficulties in maintaining a household for themselves. In October 2010, the Immigration and Refugee Board of Canada (IRB) received relevant information from "an assistant professor of political science at the Metropolitan State College of Denver". The Assistant Professor indicated that, in rural areas, "[w]omen are not recognized as an individual member of the community", but were instead "members of their male-dominated family." The Assistant Professor also stated that "[o]lder women with grown up children normally depend on their sons or daughters." In an October 2009 article in *Generations Review*, a publication of the British Society of Gerontology, Fariha Abdullah, "Programme manager Sustainable Systems Initiatives (elderly)" in Peshawar, states that "[t]aking care of our elders is an Islamic obligation and also an integral cultural norm in Pakistan." A 2007 report from the Indus Development Foundation similarly stated that in Pakistan "the elderly typically live with the younger generations of their families. They have few opportunities for employment, and depend on their children not only for food, but for medicines and other basic needs."

The Assistant Professor and a Professor of Law at the University of Warwick in the United Kingdom, who also provided relevant information to the IRB in October 2010, both indicated that "the ability of women to act independently differs depending on their level of education". The Assistant Professor provided the following information to illustrate this point:

[e]ducated urban, upper/middle class working women or housewives do not find it difficult to rent an apartment or to open a bank account or travel domestically or internationally. Women in the rural areas normally do not rent a house or any other place. Due to lack of education, they are normally accompanie[d] by a male member to open an account or to do other things in public sphere.<sup>30</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> Immigration and Refugee Board of Canada 2011, *PAK103867.E – Pakistan: Police corruption; the authorities responsible for receiving complaints against the police, including their effectiveness; the procedures to submit a complaint; police training programs, 30 November <a href="http://www.irb-cisr.gc.ca:8080/RIR\_RDI/RIR\_RDI.aspx?id=453706&l=e">http://www.irb-cisr.gc.ca:8080/RIR\_RDI/RIR\_RDI.aspx?id=453706&l=e</a> – Accessed 21 March 2012; Transparency International Pakistan 2011, <i>National Corruption Perception Survey 2011*, 28 December, pp. 6-7 <a href="http://www.transparency.org.pk/report/ncps2011/ncps2011.pdf">http://www.transparency.org.pk/report/ncps2011/ncps2011.pdf</a> – Accessed 21 March 2012; Ahmed, A. 2010, 'Pakistani police most frequent recipient of bribes: TI survey', *Dawn*, 10 December <a href="http://www.dawn.com/2010/12/10/pakistani-police-most-frequent-recipients-of-bribes-ti-survey-2.html">http://www.dawn.com/2010/12/10/pakistani-police-most-frequent-recipients-of-bribes-ti-survey-2.html</a> – Accessed 21 March 2012.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> Immigration and Refugee Board of Canada 2010, *PAK103608.E – Pakistan: Circumstances under which a woman has the legal right to get a divorce through the courts (judicial divorce) through her own initiative; circumstances under which single women can live alone, 17 November <a href="http://www.unhcr.org/refworld/docid/4dd1015f17.html">http://www.unhcr.org/refworld/docid/4dd1015f17.html</a> – Accessed 15 September 2011.* 

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> Abdullah, F. 2009, 'A model elderly home for the senior citizens of Pakistan', *Generations Review*, British Society of Gerontology website, October <a href="http://www.britishgerontology.org/DB/gr-editions-2/generations-review/a-model-elderly-home-for-the-senior-citizens-of-pa.html">http://www.britishgerontology.org/DB/gr-editions-2/generations-review/a-model-elderly-home-for-the-senior-citizens-of-pa.html</a> – Accessed 22 March 2012.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> Qureshi, A. 2007, 'Social Security Remains a Distant Reality for Most', Indus Development Foundation, Social Watch Website <a href="http://www.socialwatch.org/node/11039">http://www.socialwatch.org/node/11039</a> – Accessed 24 March 2011.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> Immigration and Refugee Board of Canada 2010, *PAK103608.E – Pakistan: Circumstances under which a woman has the legal right to get a divorce through the courts (judicial divorce) through her own initiative; circumstances* 

The Professor of Law indicated that, while there are no laws preventing a woman from opening her own bank account, her situation will impact on her ability, in particular "whether she's literate, has her own identification, and can travel alone".<sup>31</sup>

In addition, information is available which indicates that women living alone in Pakistan, including elderly women, could be at risk of being targeted for criminal activity. The aforementioned Professor of Law stated that "the absence of a male relative may make a woman "vulnerable" and added that "the worsening law and order situation" has made Pakistan "a generally unsafe place to be". The Professor of Law also indicated that "older women may find themselves taken advantage of by their helpers". The aforementioned Assistant Professor noted that "a woman "[1]iving alone in majority of the contexts such as rural (which is about 70% of Pakistan) and lower/middle class urban" would put herself at "risk for her safety and security". <sup>32</sup>

In this context, it is worth noting a March 2012 report from *The Express Tribune*, which provides statistics showing that there has been an increase in crimes against women in Faisalabad in recent years. In 2011, 1,842 of these crimes were reported, with 1,726 reported in 2010 and 1,193 in 2009. The following breakdown was provided of the crimes reported during 2011, with kidnappings reported to be the most prominent form of crime against women:

Of the crimes reported in 2011, 828 were of kidnapping, 196 of severe assault, 195 of sexual assault (52 gang rapes), 170 of murder, 43 of honour killing, 43 of suicide; 25 of burn injuries by acid attack or stove-explosion, 19 of sexual harassment, 13 of forcible abortion, five of trafficiking [sic] and three of genital mutilation.

These also included 21 attempted rapes, 87 attempted murders, 52 attempted kidnapping and 90 attempted suicides.<sup>33</sup>

While a woman could attract disapproval from their family and community if they lived alone, this issue would not arise in relation to an elderly woman. The aforementioned Assistant Professor advised the IRB that a woman living alone in a rural area is an "exceptional situation" that would earn the disapproval of her family or community. It was also indicated that a young or middle aged women find it "hard to live alone" in any context, as "[a]ll kind [of] gossips surround her and she is watched by everyone for every move she makes." The Assistant Professor did indicate, however, that "[i]f she is an older woman, in her 70s or 80s, it would not be a big problem in both contexts, rural and urban or in any class."

*under which single women can live alone*, 17 November <a href="http://www.unhcr.org/refworld/docid/4dd1015f17.html">http://www.unhcr.org/refworld/docid/4dd1015f17.html</a> – Accessed 15 September 2011.

Immigration and Refugee Board of Canada 2010, *PAK103608.E – Pakistan: Circumstances under which a woman has the legal right to get a divorce through the courts (judicial divorce) through her own initiative; circumstances under which single women can live alone, 17 November <a href="http://www.unhcr.org/refworld/docid/4dd1015f17.html">http://www.unhcr.org/refworld/docid/4dd1015f17.html</a> – Accessed 15 September 2011.* 

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> Immigration and Refugee Board of Canada 2010, *PAK103608.E – Pakistan: Circumstances under which a woman has the legal right to get a divorce through the courts (judicial divorce) through her own initiative; circumstances under which single women can live alone, 17 November <a href="http://www.unhcr.org/refworld/docid/4dd1015f17.html">http://www.unhcr.org/refworld/docid/4dd1015f17.html</a> – Accessed 15 September 2011.* 

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> Islam, S. 2012, 'Gender based crime: More violations of women's rights in 2011', *The Express Tribune*, 8 March <a href="http://tribune.com.pk/story/346986/gender-based-crime-more-violations-of-womens-rights-in-2011-lahore-city/">http://tribune.com.pk/story/346986/gender-based-crime-more-violations-of-womens-rights-in-2011-lahore-city/</a> Accessed 19 March 2012.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> Immigration and Refugee Board of Canada 2010, *PAK103608.E – Pakistan: Circumstances under which a woman has the legal right to get a divorce through the courts (judicial divorce) through her own initiative; circumstances* 

# 4. What support or protection is available to older women living alone, particularly in Faisalabad?

Information has been located which indicates that there is a scarcity of dedicated government and non-government support for elderly persons living in Pakistan. A 2007 report from the World Health Organisation (WHO) indicates that there is no separate health care system for the elderly in Pakistan. There are no formal or nongovernment schemes for community or domiciliary care for the elderly. Health visits by government practitioners or health care workers are not provided and families supporting elderly persons are not given financial or other forms of support. Appropriate housing and travel/leisure concessions are also not provided to the elderly. The relevant information from the WHO report reads:

In Pakistan no such separate health care system exists for the health care of the elderly population. There is total lack of rehabilitative services for the elderly. Physiotherapists practicing in general hospitals do not provide special services to elderly. Geriatrics is not accepted as a specialty. Short courses in geriatrics do not exist anywhere in the county. Drugs prescribed are those that happen to be available for use by the general population and as a result suitable therapy is not always available. There are no formal or nongovernmental schemes for community elderly care, and particularly no domiciliary care.

Health visits by government practitioners or health care workers are not provided. Neither is the family given any subsidies or other means of supporting its elderly members, irrespective of their state of health. Data on all aspects of elderly life demographic, social, health and economic is generally lacking particularly at national level. Specific forms of community support such as appropriate housing and concessions for travel/leisure do not exist. There is a lack of total coverage (at primary as well as hospital level) and consequently the inaccessibility by probably the neediest for the health services and the rural areas are at particular risk. The need for the elderly health care centers along with other important steps like training of the personnel for the health care of elderly including Geriatrics and Gerontology towards the complete Health Care for the Elderly population has been felt.<sup>35</sup>

The report states that there are "few centers in Pakistan giving long term care for the Elderly population". It makes specific reference to only three centres of this type, which are situated in Rawalpindi, Lahore and Karachi.<sup>36</sup>

Available information indicates that the provision of health care to the elderly in Pakistan has not improved since the WHO report was published in 2007. A *Dawn* report from July 2010 indicates that, despite having spent two years planning to provide free medical care to the elderly population, the Pakistani government had failed to develop a policy for this to occur. In a *Pakistan Today* article, published in January 2012, it was stated that "[f]or the present generation of hundreds of thousands of citizens aged fifty odd, there are no care facilities for an old age when they reach it without their children's support." Reference was made to the Edhi Centre for the Elderly in Karachi but this was described as "one of the few places

*under which single women can live alone*, 17 November <a href="http://www.unhcr.org/refworld/docid/4dd1015f17.html">http://www.unhcr.org/refworld/docid/4dd1015f17.html</a> – Accessed 15 September 2011.

<sup>35</sup> World Health Organisation 2007, *Health System Profile: Pakistan*, pp. 96-97

http://gis.emro.who.int/HealthSystemObservatory/PDF/Pakistan/Full%20Profile.pdf – Accessed 22 March 2012.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> World Health Organisation 2007, *Health System Profile: Pakistan*, p.97

http://gis.emro.who.int/HealthSystemObservatory/PDF/Pakistan/Full%20Profile.pdf - Accessed 22 March 2012.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> Yusufzai, A. 2010, 'Healthcare for Elderly a Dream Gone Sour', Global Action on Aging website, source: *Dawn*, 29 July <a href="http://www.globalaging.org/health/world/2010/dream.htm">http://www.globalaging.org/health/world/2010/dream.htm</a> – Accessed 22 March 2012.

providing aged care facilities". It was reported that "there are agencies that provide a roster of carers but most of these are untrained persons even at times young students." <sup>38</sup>

On its *travel.state.gov* website, the US Department of State provides a general description of the quality of emergency and non-emergency health care in Pakistan. This information states that "[a]dequate basic non-emergency medical care is available in major Pakistani cities but is limited in rural areas." It was indicated that "[f]acilities in the cities vary in level and range of services, resources, and cleanliness". In relation to emergency care, it was stated that "[e]ffective emergency response to personal injury and illness is virtually non-existent in Pakistan. Ambulances are few and are not necessarily staffed by medical personnel." In addition, it was noted that "[t]he quality of the locally produced medications is uneven."<sup>39</sup>

Access to pensions and social security benefits for the elderly in Pakistan is limited. A 2008 working paper from the Pakistan Institute of Development Economics (PIDE) stated that "budget allocations for pensions and social security are small and inadequate to meet the demand of increasing older and poor population." This means that "those who are covered get inadequate amount for survival." It should be noted, however, that the majority of elderly Pakistanis are not covered by pension and social security schemes. The PIDE working paper states that "a large section of population [sic] is not provided pension or old-age benefits". 41 Furthermore, eligibility for pension and social security payments is dependent on the nature of employment that the elderly person engaged in during their working life. Pension and social security coverage is confined to the "formal sector", which comprises both the public and private sectors, and is provided through "social insurance programmes and other employer benefit schemes". The 2008 PIDE working paper states that "the informal or unorganised sector fall outside the purview of the statutory provisions usually administered through registered public and private enterprises."<sup>42</sup> Therefore the social security schemes operating in the public and private sectors "cover a small proportion of old-age population [sic]", while "a significant proportion of the elderly population working in the informal sector remains largely unprotected by social security schemes."43 In October 2009, the Women in Informal Employment: Globalizing and Organizing (WIEGO) organisation<sup>44</sup> reported that the informal sector in Pakistan constituted 73% of non-agricultural jobs, with 45% of all workers in Pakistan working in agriculture. 45 Informal sector workers were defined as including "self-

http://www.pide.org.pk/pdf/Working%20Paper/WorkingPaper-42.pdf - Accessed 22 March 2012.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> Ahmed, R. 2012, 'Health care', *Pakistan Today*, 30 January

http://www.pakistantoday.com.pk/2012/01/30/comment/columns/health-care-2/ - Accessed 22 March 2012.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> US Department of State 2011, *Pakistan Country Specific Information*, 31 October <a href="http://travel.state.gov/travel/cis\_pa\_tw/cis/cis\_992.html#medical">http://travel.state.gov/travel/cis\_pa\_tw/cis/cis\_992.html#medical</a> – Accessed 22 March 2012.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup> Mahmoud, N. & Nasir, Z. M. 2008, *Pension and Social Security Schemes in Pakistan: Some Policy Options*, Pakistan Institute of Development Economics website, p. 8 <a href="http://www.pide.org.pk/pdf/Working%20Paper/WorkingPaper-42.pdf">http://www.pide.org.pk/pdf/Working%20Paper/WorkingPaper-42.pdf</a> – Accessed 22 March 2012.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> Mahmoud, N. & Nasir, Z. M. 2008, *Pension and Social Security Schemes in Pakistan: Some Policy Options*, Pakistan Institute of Development Economics website, p. 28 <a href="http://www.pide.org.pk/pdf/Working%20Paper/WorkingPaper-42.pdf">http://www.pide.org.pk/pdf/Working%20Paper/WorkingPaper-42.pdf</a> – Accessed 22 March 2012.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup> Mahmoud, N. & Nasir, Z. M. 2008, *Pension and Social Security Schemes in Pakistan: Some Policy Options*, Pakistan Institute of Development Economics website, p. 10 http://www.pide.org.pk/pdf/Working%20Paper/WorkingPaper-42.pdf – Accessed 22 March 2012.

<sup>43</sup> Mahmoud, N. & Nasir, Z. M. 2008, *Pension and Social Security Schemes in Pakistan: Some Policy Options*, Pakistan Institute of Development Economics website, p. v

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>44</sup> On its website, Women in Informal Employment: Globalizing and Organizing (WIEGO) describes itself as "a global action-research-policy network that seeks to improve the status of the working poor, especially women, in the informal economy": 'WIEGO' (undated), Women in Informal Employment: Globalizing and Organizing (WIEGO) website <a href="http://wiego.org/">http://wiego.org/</a> – Accessed 22 March 2012.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>45</sup> Budlender, D. 2009, *Informal Economy Budget Analysis in Pakistan and Ravi Town, Lahore*, Women in Informal Employment: Globalizing and Organizing (WIEGO) website, October, pp. 1-2

employed workers as well as wage workers doing jobs that range from petty trading to rickshaw drivers to shoe shiners."46

There is information which indicates that alternative forms of welfare are available to elderly persons not covered by the pension and social security schemes applicable to formal sector employees. According to the *Encyclopaedia Britannica*, the *zakat* and *ushr* taxes collected in Pakistan "are used to provide social welfare funds, which go to provincial, division, and district committees for distribution among organizations engaged in social welfare activities or directly to needy persons. This source also notes "[t]he development of a number of nongovernmental organizations in the country and the increasing use of private religious endowments to assist the needy". <sup>47</sup>

Country Advice PAK38486 (completed on 31 March 2011) also indicates that support for senior citizens who have not worked in the formal or public sectors include assistance under the state-based Zakat system, although this is limited to the Muslim community. Assistance is also available through Bait-ul-Mal, a quasi-autonomous charitable organisation established through the Ministry of Women's Development, Welfare and Special Education. Bait-ul-Mal benefits are not limited to Muslims. The largest Bait-ul-Mal program is a food support benefit that provides those in need with 3000 rupees per year in six-monthly instalments. Bait-ul-Mal also offers individual financial assistance of the following amounts to approved applicants for "general assistance", medical treatment, education and rehabilitation. Senior citizens were listed as a priority group for Bait-ul-Mal assistance.

The 2008 PIDE working paper, while also making reference to these alternative forms of welfare, does indicate that these do have certain limitations. The relevant information reads:

For workers employed in the informal sector, there are civil society organisations such as mosques, financial institutions, non governmental organisations, and private philanthropists which are involved in the distribution of social services besides government institutions. There is however no umbrella institution to coordinate the services provided by these institutions for better coverage and delivery. The social safety nets are heavily favourable to the workers in the urban formal sector whereas the majority of the population lives in rural areas and employed in the informal sector.<sup>49</sup>

As noted in the response to Question 2, the authorities in Faisalabad are struggling to provide an effective response to criminal activity there, with residents having complained that the authorities have failed to respond adequately to criminal activity in the city. The US Department of State, in its 2010 *Country Report on Human Rights Practices* for Pakistan, published on 8 April 2011, states that the Pakistani government has "established women's police stations, staffed by female officers, to offer women a safe haven where they could safely report complaints and file charges." The report indicated that there were "at least eight"

<u>http://wiego.org/sites/wiego.org/files/publications/files/Budlender-Budget-Briefing-Pakistan.pdf</u> – Accessed 22 March 2012.

March 2012.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>46</sup> Budlender, D. 2009, *Informal Economy Budget Analysis in Pakistan and Ravi Town, Lahore*, Women in Informal Employment: Globalizing and Organizing (WIEGO) website, October, p. 1 <a href="http://wiego.org/sites/wiego.org/files/publications/files/Budlender-Budget-Briefing-Pakistan.pdf">http://wiego.org/sites/wiego.org/files/publications/files/Budlender-Budget-Briefing-Pakistan.pdf</a> – Accessed 22

 <sup>47 &#</sup>x27;Pakistan – Health and welfare' (undated), Encyclopaedia Britannica
 http://www.britannica.com/EBchecked/topic/438805/Pakistan/23710/Health-and-welfare – Accessed 22 March 2012.
 48 RRT Country Advice 2011, Country Advice PAK38486, 31 March.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>49</sup> Mahmoud, N. & Nasir, Z. M. 2008, *Pension and Social Security Schemes in Pakistan: Some Policy Options*, Pakistan Institute of Development Economics website, p. 9 <a href="http://www.pide.org.pk/pdf/Working%20Paper/WorkingPaper-42.pdf">http://www.pide.org.pk/pdf/Working%20Paper/WorkingPaper-42.pdf</a> – Accessed 22 March 2012.

of these stations, the first having been established in Karachi in 1994. One of the stations was located in Faisalabad. The US Department of State did note, however, that these stations were "poorly staffed and equipped." Shirkat Gah, a women's resource centre, provided the following information to the IRB on 20 November 2009 detailing the difficulties faced by women's police stations in Pakistan:

The Women's Police Station faces many problems; they have only one vehicle for use with a very limited petrol allowance, they are understaffed and overburdened, and they have been granted less authority than their male counterparts; for example, they cannot register an FIR without the prior approval of the Deputy Superintendent of Police and Superintendent of Police. Even if the case has been registered the following investigation remains problematic. The investigation requires visiting the area of incidence, collecting evidence and arresting the accused, but lack of resources such as staff and transport make the task extremely challenging. No special treatment is afforded to female victims of violence, nor is any modern equipment made available to facilitate addressing their grievances.<sup>51</sup>

### 5. To what extent has the Taliban been active in Faisalabad?

On 8 March 2011, a car bomb was detonated near the main gate of an Inter Service Intelligence Agency (ISI) office in Faisalabad. The blast tore through a nearby gas station, resulting in the explosion of the station's gas cylinders. This resulted in at least 32 people being killed, with 125 injured. The Tehrik-e-Taliban Pakistan (TTP) claimed responsibility for the attack, stating that the ISI office was the target of the bombing. The TTP indicated that the bombing had been carried out in retaliation for the death of one of their members in ISI custody one year previously. While the *British Broadcasting Corporation (BBC)* reported that this was the first bombing to take place in Faisalabad in recent years, it did note that "pro-Taliban militant groups" had been "increasing in strength" in the city.

Reports are available which indicate that the TTP and pro-Taliban groups had been active in Faisalabad prior to the March 2011 bombing in that city. For example, Mullah Abdus Salam, "who was on the list of top 10 wanted Taliban commanders", was arrested in Faisalabad on 28 January 2010 with three other suspects. During interrogation, Salam disclosed the names of four other alleged terrorists in the city. <sup>57</sup> In October 2009, two central leaders of the Tehreek-e-Taliban Punjabi, Iqbal and Gul Muhammad, were arrested in Faisalabad after police had received information that they were residing in the city. The pair had reportedly confessed to their involvement in acts of terrorism in Punjab. <sup>58</sup> In June 2009, a police

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>50</sup> US Department of State 2011, Country Reports on Human Rights Practices 2010 – Pakistan, 8 April, Section 6.

Immigration and Refugee Board of Canada 2009, *PAK103284.E – Pakistan: Resources available to female victims of violence in Karachi, Islamabad and Lahore*, 26 November <a href="http://www.irb-cisr.gc.ca:8080/RIR">http://www.irb-cisr.gc.ca:8080/RIR</a> RDI/RIR RDI.aspx?id=452665&l=e – Accessed 22 March 2012.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>52</sup> Akhtar, S. 2011, 'Car Bomb kills 23 in Faisalabad', *The International News*, 9 March <a href="http://www.thenews.com.pk/TodaysPrintDetail.aspx?ID=4471&Cat=13&dt=3/8/2011">http://www.thenews.com.pk/TodaysPrintDetail.aspx?ID=4471&Cat=13&dt=3/8/2011</a> – Accessed 13 December 2011; 'Punjab Terror Assessment 2012 – Analysis' 2012, South Asia Terrorism Portal, 22 January.

<sup>53 &</sup>quot;At least 20 dead' in car bomb in Faisalabad, Pakistan' 2011, British Broadcasting Corporation (BBC), 8 March.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>54</sup> 'Punjab Terror Assessment 2012 – Analysis' 2012, South Asia Terrorism Portal, 22 January.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>55</sup> Akhtar, S. 2011, 'Car Bomb kills 23 in Faisalabad', *The International News*, 9 March <a href="http://www.thenews.com.pk/TodaysPrintDetail.aspx?ID=4471&Cat=13&dt=3/8/2011">http://www.thenews.com.pk/TodaysPrintDetail.aspx?ID=4471&Cat=13&dt=3/8/2011</a> – Accessed 13 December 2011.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>56</sup> "At least 20 dead" in car bomb in Faisalabad, Pakistan' 2011, British Broadcasting Corporation (BBC), 8 March.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>57</sup> 'Two alleged terrorists killed in Faisalabad 'encounter' 2010, *The Statesman*, 20 February <a href="http://www.thestatesmen.net/news/two-alleged-terrorists-killed-in-faisalabad-%E2%80%98encounter%E2%80%99/">http://www.thestatesmen.net/news/two-alleged-terrorists-killed-in-faisalabad-%E2%80%98encounter%E2%80%99/</a> – Accessed 20 March 2012.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>58</sup> 'Taleban reportedly active in Pakistan's Punjab province' 2009, *BBC Monitoring Service*, 24 October.

crackdown was initiated in Punjab province in response to reports that the TTP in Swat and Waziristan had "dispatched a number of suicide bombers who have already entered Karachi, Multan, **Faisalabad**, Lahore, Rawalpindi and Islamabad." The bombers had reportedly "been tasked to target important government buildings and installations, security forces personnel and headquarters, politicians and foreign missions and nationals". <sup>59</sup>

Further information has been located which refers to the presence of the Taliban and its affiliated groups in Punjab province. A report from the South Asia Terrorism Portal, published on 12 March 2012, states that "several militant outfits with headquarters in Punjab work in close collaboration with TTP [Tehrik-e-Taliban Pakistan] and al Qaeda." These groups include Lashkar-e-Jhangvi (LeJ), Sipah-e-Sahaba Pakistan (SSP), Jaish-e-Muhammad (JeM) and Harkat-ul Jihad-ul-Islami (HuJI). The Human Rights Commission of Pakistan, in its *State of Human Rights in 2010* report, published in April 2011, provides information regarding the presence of groups operating under the banner of the Punjabi Taliban in that province. The relevant information reads:

Interior Minister Rehman Malik was quoted as saying that the LJ [Lashkare-Jhangvi] and the SSP [Sipah-e-Sahaba Pakistan] were united under the banner of the Punjabi Taliban, with the southern districts of Punjab as their hub. The interior minister said 726 workers of the banned outfits were present in southern Punjab. One hundred most wanted militants belonged to this region and out of a total of 13,500 registered madrassas (seminaries) in Punjab, 7,281 were located there.<sup>61</sup>

In October 2009, Iqbal and Gul Muhammad reportedly confessed to the presence of "a 40-member Tehreek-e-Taliban Punjabi shura in Punjab, whose members reside in big cities in other provinces in addition to Punjab". <sup>62</sup> In an April 2009 article from the Belfar Center for Science and International Affairs at Harvard University, it was indicated that the TTP had drawn upon the knowledge of militants from Punjab in order to target cities in that province:

Between March 2005 and March 2007 alone, for example, about 2,000 militants from southern and northern Punjab Province reportedly moved to South Waziristan and started different businesses in an effort to create logistical support networks. Given their knowledge about Punjabi cities and security structure, they have proved to be valuable partners for the TTP as it targets cities in Punjab, such as Lahore, Rawalpindi and Islamabad... <sup>63</sup>

*Country Advice PAK39653* (completed on 13 December 2011) indicates that not all people who identify themselves as Pakistani Taliban are members of the TTP. The same advice does note, however, that reports rarely clarify whether persons referred to as Taliban are members of the TTP or not.<sup>64</sup>

## 6. What steps have the Pakistani authorities taken to address such activity?

Reports have been located which indicate the authorities in Punjab have made efforts to combat the activities of the Taliban in that province, including in Faisalabad. For example, following the 8 March 2011 bombing in Faisalabad, the police had arrested one suspect at the

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>59</sup> Ali, M. F. 2009, 'Dozens held in hunt for 'illegal' residents', *Dawn*, 1 June.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>60</sup> 'Punjab Terror Assessment 2012 – Analysis' 2012, South Asia Terrorism Portal, 22 January.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>61</sup> Human Rights Commission of Pakistan 2011, State of Human Rights in 2010, April, p. 173.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>62</sup> 'Taleban reportedly active in Pakistan's Punjab province' 2009, *BBC Monitoring Service*, 24 October.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>63</sup> UK Home Office 2011, Country of Origin Information Report: Pakistan, 29 September, p. 46.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>64</sup> RRT Country Advice 2011, Country Advice PAK39653, 13 December.

scene. 65 On 24 March 2011, *The Express Tribune* reported that four suspected militants had been arrested in connection with the same bombing, all of whom were said to "belong to the al Khalid group, a wing of the TTP-allied al Furqan group." 66 On 28 January 2010, Mullah Abdus Salam, who was reportedly one of the top 10 wanted Taliban commanders, was arrested in Faisalabad along with three other suspects. Salam provided the police with information regarding the presence of four other alleged terrorists in Faisalabad. These four suspects were intercepted the following month, with two arrested and two killed. 67 In October 2009, two central leaders of the Tehreek-e-Taliban Punjabi were arrested by police in Faisalabad. 88 In response to reports in June 2009 that the TTP in Swat and Waziristan had sent suicide bombers into Punjab, the provincial government directed police to conduct surveillance of persons of "Afghan and Pakhtun localities", arresting "many suspects for not having computerised national identity cards or other documents." There had also been an increased police presence at checkpoints along the border with North West Frontier Province (now Khyber Pakhtunkhwa province) and Balochistan province. Police had also set up pickets in the provincial capital, Lahore, to allow them to conduct identity checks there. 69

Despite these actions, however, the Pakistani authorities have generally struggled to respond effectively to the activities of militant groups in Punjab. A report from the *South Asian Intelligence Review*, published on 12 March 2012, states that, "[a]s in the past", the Pakistani government "also failed through 2011, to devise any coherent or unified strategy against mounting intimidation and violence by terrorist groups in Punjab." Information of a similar nature was provided by the South Asia Terrorism Portal in January 2012 in a 'Terror Assessment' for Punjab province. The relevant information reads:

Islamabad has evidently failed to devise a unified strategy against the mounting intimidation and violence of terrorist groups in Punjab, and no alternative voice can, today, find expression in the Province. The terrorists in Punjab have demonstrated, in the past year, that no high office is beyond the sweep of their lethal reprisals, and even the smallest voices of dissent against their extremist creed will be stifled with exemplary brutality.<sup>71</sup>

In the Pakistan chapter of its *World Report 2012*, Human Rights Watch (HRW) provided an overview of the security situation in Pakistan during 2011. This indicated that the Pakistani authorities have been unable to respond effectively to the activities of militant groups across the country. It reads:

Security continued to deteriorate in 2011, with militant and sectarian groups carrying out suicide bombings and targeted killings across the country. The Taliban

Page 12 of 17

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>65</sup> Akhtar, S. 2011, 'Car Bomb kills 23 in Faisalabad', *The International News*, 9 March <a href="http://www.thenews.com.pk/TodaysPrintDetail.aspx?ID=4471&Cat=13&dt=3/8/2011">http://www.thenews.com.pk/TodaysPrintDetail.aspx?ID=4471&Cat=13&dt=3/8/2011</a> – Accessed 13 December 2011

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>66</sup> 'Faisalabad suicide attack: Four militants of TTP-allied group arrested' 2011, *The Express Tribune*, 24 March <a href="http://tribune.com.pk/story/136856/faisalabad-suicide-attack-four-militants-of-ttp-allied-group-arrested/">http://tribune.com.pk/story/136856/faisalabad-suicide-attack-four-militants-of-ttp-allied-group-arrested/</a> – Accessed 13 December 2011.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>67</sup> 'Two alleged terrorists killed in Faisalabad 'encounter' 2010, *The Statesman*, 20 February <a href="http://www.thestatesmen.net/news/two-alleged-terrorists-killed-in-faisalabad-%E2%80%98encounter%E2%80%99/">http://www.thestatesmen.net/news/two-alleged-terrorists-killed-in-faisalabad-%E2%80%98encounter%E2%80%99/</a> – Accessed 20 March 2012.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>68</sup> 'Taleban reportedly active in Pakistan's Punjab province' 2009, *BBC Monitoring Service*, 24 October.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>69</sup> Ali, M. F. 2009, 'Dozens held in hunt for 'illegal' residents', *Dawn*, 1 June.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>70</sup> Singh, A. K. 2012, 'Teetering on the Brink', *South Asian Intelligence Review*, 12 March.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>71</sup> 'Punjab Terror Assessment 2012 – Analysis' 2012, South Asia Terrorism Portal, 22 January.

and affiliated groups targeted civilians and public spaces, including marketplaces and religious processions.<sup>72</sup>

HRW also reported that Sunni militant groups, including the LeJ, had "operated with impunity even in areas where state authority is well established, such as the Punjab province and Karachi". <sup>73</sup> The aforementioned March 2012 report from the *South Asian Intelligence* Review also indicated that "[1]imited legal action against terrorists has been far from effective". It also provided a summary of the reasons for this legal action being ineffectual, which reads:

The "independent" judiciary is haunted by the constant fear of retaliatory action by the militants. A US report in August 2011 noted that most terror suspects in Pakistan escaped conviction due to ineffective laws and prosecution. A report prepared by the Punjab Government, noting that at least 65 extremists were released in 2011, stated that most of the released extremists were back to their old ways, engaging in sectarian violence and terrorist activities again.<sup>74</sup>

Human Rights Watch 2012, World Report 2012 – Pakistan, 22 January.
 Human Rights Watch 2012, World Report 2012 – Pakistan, 22 January.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>74</sup> Singh, A. K. 2012, 'Teetering on the Brink', South Asian Intelligence Review, 12 March.

#### References

'7,620 criminals at large in Faisalabad' 2012, *The News*, source: *Associated Press of Pakistan*, 2 January <a href="http://www.thenews.com.pk/article-29869-7,620-criminals-at-large-in-Faisalabad#">http://www.thenews.com.pk/article-29869-7,620-criminals-at-large-in-Faisalabad#</a> – Accessed 19 March 2012.

Abdullah, F. 2009, 'A model elderly home for the senior citizens of Pakistan', *Generations Review*, British Society of Gerontology website, October <a href="http://www.britishgerontology.org/DB/gr-editions-2/generations-review/a-model-elderly-home-for-the-senior-citizens-of-pa.html">http://www.britishgerontology.org/DB/gr-editions-2/generations-review/a-model-elderly-home-for-the-senior-citizens-of-pa.html</a> – Accessed 22 March 2012.

Ahmed, A. 2010, 'Pakistani police most frequent recipient of bribes: TI survey', *Dawn*, 10 December <a href="http://www.dawn.com/2010/12/10/pakistani-police-most-frequent-recipients-of-bribes-ti-survey-2.html">http://www.dawn.com/2010/12/10/pakistani-police-most-frequent-recipients-of-bribes-ti-survey-2.html</a> – Accessed 21 March 2012.

Ahmed, R. 2012, 'Health care', *Pakistan Today*, 30 January <a href="http://www.pakistantoday.com.pk/2012/01/30/comment/columns/health-care-2/">http://www.pakistantoday.com.pk/2012/01/30/comment/columns/health-care-2/</a> – Accessed 22 March 2012.

Akhtar, S. 2011, 'Car Bomb kills 23 in Faisalabad', *The International News*, 9 March <a href="http://www.thenews.com.pk/TodaysPrintDetail.aspx?ID=4471&Cat=13&dt=3/8/2011">http://www.thenews.com.pk/TodaysPrintDetail.aspx?ID=4471&Cat=13&dt=3/8/2011</a> - Accessed 13 December 2011.

Ali, M. F. 2009, 'Dozens held in hunt for 'illegal' residents', *Dawn*, 1 June. (CISNET Pakistan CX227994)

Ali, M. F. 2011, 'Street crime data 2010 Faisalabad, Lahore the most mugged districts', *Dawn*, 11 July <a href="http://www.dawn.com/2011/07/11/street-crime-data-2010-faisalabad-lahore-the-most-mugged-districts.html">http://www.dawn.com/2011/07/11/street-crime-data-2010-faisalabad-lahore-the-most-mugged-districts.html</a> – Accessed 19 March 2012.

'Another body stuffed in sack found in Faisalabad' 2011, *Pakistan Today*, 26 August <a href="http://www.pakistantoday.com.pk/2011/08/26/news/national/another-body-stuffed-in-sack-found-in-faisalabad/">http://www.pakistantoday.com.pk/2011/08/26/news/national/another-body-stuffed-in-sack-found-in-faisalabad/</a> – Accessed 19 March 2012.

"At least 20 dead' in car bomb in Faisalabad, Pakistan' 2011, *British Broadcasting Corporation* (*BBC*), 8 March. (CISNET Pakistan CX262375)

Budlender, D. 2009, *Informal Economy Budget Analysis in Pakistan and Ravi Town, Lahore*, Women in Informal Employment: Globalizing and Organizing (WIEGO) website, October <a href="http://wiego.org/sites/wiego.org/files/publications/files/Budlender-Budget-Briefing-Pakistan.pdf">http://wiego.org/sites/wiego.org/files/publications/files/Budlender-Budget-Briefing-Pakistan.pdf</a> - Accessed 22 March 2012.

'Dacoity' (undated), Webster's Online Dictionary <a href="http://www.websters-online-dictionary.org/definitions/dacoity">http://www.websters-online-dictionary.org/definitions/dacoity</a> – Accessed 19 March 2012.

'FAFEN monitoring report Many police stations lack essential facilities' 2012, *Dawn*, 16 January <a href="http://www.dawn.com/2012/01/16/fafen-monitoring-report-many-police-stations-lack-essential-facilities.html">http://www.dawn.com/2012/01/16/fafen-monitoring-report-many-police-stations-lack-essential-facilities.html</a> – Accessed 19 March 2012.

'Faisalabad crime surge reflects police inefficiency' 2011, *Dunya News*, 2 October <a href="http://dunyanews.tv/index.php?key=Q2F0SUQ9OCNOaWQ9NDI2MjM">http://dunyanews.tv/index.php?key=Q2F0SUQ9OCNOaWQ9NDI2MjM</a>= – Accessed 19 March 2012.

'Faisalabad registers most of the FIRs in October' 2012, *Daily Times*, 3 January <a href="http://www.dailytimes.com.pk/default.asp?page=2012%5C01%5C03%5Cstory\_3-1-2012\_pg7\_14">http://www.dailytimes.com.pk/default.asp?page=2012%5C01%5C03%5Cstory\_3-1-2012\_pg7\_14</a> – Accessed 19 March 2012.

'Faisalabad suicide attack: Four militants of TTP-allied group arrested' 2011, *The Express Tribune*, 24 March <a href="http://tribune.com.pk/story/136856/faisalabad-suicide-attack-four-militants-of-ttp-allied-group-arrested/">http://tribune.com.pk/story/136856/faisalabad-suicide-attack-four-militants-of-ttp-allied-group-arrested/</a> – Accessed 13 December 2011.

'Faisalabad: Citizens protest against the constant rise in crime' 2011, *Dunya News*, 13 March <a href="http://dunyanews.tv/index.php?key=Q2F0SUQ9OCNOaWQ9MjIwNzE">http://dunyanews.tv/index.php?key=Q2F0SUQ9OCNOaWQ9MjIwNzE</a> – Accessed 19 March 2012.

Free and Fair Election Network 2011, *Police Stations Understaffed in Punjab, KP and Sindh: A Report Based on Monitoring of 90 Police Stations in 62 Districts across Pakistan during January-March 2011*, source: Human Security Gateway, May <a href="http://www.humansecuritygateway.com/documents/FAFEN\_PoliceStationsUnderstaffedinPunjab">http://www.humansecuritygateway.com/documents/FAFEN\_PoliceStationsUnderstaffedinPunjab</a> KPandSindh.pdf – Accessed 19 March 2012.

Human Rights Commission of Pakistan 2011, State of Human Rights in 2010, April.

Human Rights Watch 2012, *World Report 2012 – Pakistan*, 22 January. (http://www.hrw.org/world-report-2012/world-report-2012-pakistan)

Hussain, J. S. 2012, 'Sahiwal police top corruption list', *The Nation*, 13 February <a href="http://www.nation.com.pk/pakistan-news-newspaper-daily-english-online/lahore/13-Feb-2012/sahiwal-police-top-corruption-list">http://www.nation.com.pk/pakistan-news-newspaper-daily-english-online/lahore/13-Feb-2012/sahiwal-police-top-corruption-list</a> – Accessed 19 March 2012.

'IGP pledges to purge police of black sheep' 2012, *The Nation*, 19 March <a href="http://www.nation.com.pk/pakistan-news-newspaper-daily-english-online/national/19-Mar-2012/igp-pledges-to-purge-police-of-black-sheep">http://www.nation.com.pk/pakistan-news-newspaper-daily-english-online/national/19-Mar-2012/igp-pledges-to-purge-police-of-black-sheep</a> – Accessed 19 March 2012.

Immigration and Refugee Board of Canada 2009, *PAK103284.E – Pakistan: Resources available to female victims of violence in Karachi, Islamabad and Lahore*, 26 November <a href="http://www.irb-cisr.gc.ca:8080/RIR\_RDI/RIR\_RDI.aspx?id=452665&l=e">http://www.irb-cisr.gc.ca:8080/RIR\_RDI/RIR\_RDI.aspx?id=452665&l=e</a> – Accessed 22 March 2012.

Immigration and Refugee Board of Canada 2010, *PAK103605.E – Pakistan: First Information Reports (FIRs)*, 4 November <a href="http://www.irb-cisr.gc.ca:8080/RIR\_RDI/RIR\_RDI.aspx?id=453213&l=e">http://www.irb-cisr.gc.ca:8080/RIR\_RDI/RIR\_RDI.aspx?id=453213&l=e</a> – Accessed 19 March 2012.

Immigration and Refugee Board of Canada 2010, *PAK103608.E – Pakistan: Circumstances under which a woman has the legal right to get a divorce through the courts (judicial divorce) through her own initiative; circumstances under which single women can live alone, 17 November <a href="http://www.unhcr.org/refworld/docid/4dd1015f17.html">http://www.unhcr.org/refworld/docid/4dd1015f17.html</a> – Accessed 15 September 2011.* 

Immigration and Refugee Board of Canada 2011, *PAK103867.E – Pakistan: Police corruption;* the authorities responsible for receiving complaints against the police, including their effectiveness; the procedures to submit a complaint; police training programs, 30 November <a href="http://www.irb-cisr.gc.ca:8080/RIR\_RDI/RIR\_RDI.aspx?id=453706&1=e">http://www.irb-cisr.gc.ca:8080/RIR\_RDI/RIR\_RDI.aspx?id=453706&1=e</a> – Accessed 21 March 2012.

Islam, S. 2011, 'Crime rates go up despite additional funding for police', *The Express Tribune*, 28 April <a href="http://tribune.com.pk/story/158250/crime-rates-go-up-despite-additional-funding-for-police/">http://tribune.com.pk/story/158250/crime-rates-go-up-despite-additional-funding-for-police/</a> – Accessed 19 March 2012.

Islam, S. 2012, 'Crime: 5,476 cases registered in two months', *The Express Tribune*, 4 March <a href="http://tribune.com.pk/story/345023/crime-5476-cases-registered-in-two-months/">http://tribune.com.pk/story/345023/crime-5476-cases-registered-in-two-months/</a> – Accessed 19 March 2012.

Islam, S. 2012, 'Gender based crime: More violations of women's rights in 2011', *The Express Tribune*, 8 March <a href="http://tribune.com.pk/story/346986/gender-based-crime-more-violations-of-womens-rights-in-2011-lahore-city/">http://tribune.com.pk/story/346986/gender-based-crime-more-violations-of-womens-rights-in-2011-lahore-city/</a> – Accessed 19 March 2012.

Mahmoud, N. & Nasir, Z. M. 2008, *Pension and Social Security Schemes in Pakistan: Some Policy Options*, Pakistan Institute of Development Economics website <a href="http://www.pide.org.pk/pdf/Working%20Paper/WorkingPaper-42.pdf">http://www.pide.org.pk/pdf/Working%20Paper/WorkingPaper-42.pdf</a> - Accessed 22 March 2012.

Nizami, A. K. 2012, 'Police alone cannot control crime, admits CPO', *The Nation*, 4 January <a href="http://www.nation.com.pk/pakistan-news-newspaper-daily-english-online/national/04-Jan-2012/police-alone-cannot-control-crime-admits-cpo">http://www.nation.com.pk/pakistan-news-newspaper-daily-english-online/national/04-Jan-2012/police-alone-cannot-control-crime-admits-cpo</a> – Accessed 19 March 2012.

'Pakistan – Health and welfare' (undated), *Encyclopaedia Britannica* <a href="http://www.britannica.com/EBchecked/topic/438805/Pakistan/23710/Health-and-welfare">http://www.britannica.com/EBchecked/topic/438805/Pakistan/23710/Health-and-welfare</a> – Accessed 22 March 2012.

'Punjab Terror Assessment 2012 – Analysis' 2012, South Asia Terrorism Portal, 22 January. (CISNET Pakistan CX281438)

Qureshi, A. 2007, 'Social Security Remains a Distant Reality for Most', Indus Development Foundation, Social Watch Website <a href="http://www.socialwatch.org/node/11039">http://www.socialwatch.org/node/11039</a> – Accessed 24 March 2011.

Rana, I. 2012, 'Power outages: Energy crisis linked to rising crime in Punjab's industrial heartland', *The Express Tribune*, 7 January <a href="http://tribune.com.pk/story/317702/power-outages-energy-crisis-linked-to-rising-crime-in-punjabs-industrial-heartland/">http://tribune.com.pk/story/317702/power-outages-energy-crisis-linked-to-rising-crime-in-punjabs-industrial-heartland/</a> — Accessed 19 March 2012.

'Robberies: Protest against police over rising crime' 2012, *The Express Tribune*, 6 March <a href="http://tribune.com.pk/story/345949/robberies-protest-against-police-over-rising-crime/">http://tribune.com.pk/story/345949/robberies-protest-against-police-over-rising-crime/</a> – Accessed 19 March 2012.

RRT Country Advice 2011, Country Advice PAK38486, 31 March.

RRT Country Advice 2011, Country Advice PAK39653, 13 December.

Singh, A. K. 2012, 'Teetering on the Brink', *South Asian Intelligence Review*, 12 March. (CISNET Pakistan CX283212)

'Spiralling crime haunts Faisalabad businessmen' 2011, *Pakistan Today*, 20 October <a href="http://www.pakistantoday.com.pk/2011/10/20/news/national/spiralling-crime-haunts-faisalabad-businessmen/">http://www.pakistantoday.com.pk/2011/10/20/news/national/spiralling-crime-haunts-faisalabad-businessmen/</a> – Accessed 19 March 2012.

'Taleban reportedly active in Pakistan's Punjab province' 2009, *BBC Monitoring Service*, 24 October. (CISNET Pakistan CX235593)

Transparency International Pakistan 2011, *National Corruption Perception Survey 2011*, 28 December. <a href="http://www.transparency.org.pk/report/ncps2011/ncps2011.pdf">http://www.transparency.org.pk/report/ncps2011/ncps2011.pdf</a> – Accessed 21 March 2012.

'Two alleged terrorists killed in Faisalabad 'encounter' 2010, *The Statesman*, 20 February <a href="http://www.thestatesmen.net/news/two-alleged-terrorists-killed-in-faisalabad-web2%80%98encounter%E2%80%99/">http://www.thestatesmen.net/news/two-alleged-terrorists-killed-in-faisalabad-web2%80%98encounter%E2%80%99/</a> – Accessed 20 March 2012.

UK Home Office 2011, Country of Origin Information Report: Pakistan, 29 September.

US Department of State 2011, Country Reports on Human Rights Practices 2010 – Pakistan, 8 April.

US Department of State 2011, *Pakistan Country Specific Information*, 31 October <a href="http://travel.state.gov/travel/cis">http://travel.state.gov/travel/cis</a> pa tw/cis/cis 992.html#medical – Accessed 22 March 2012.

'WIEGO' (undated), Women in Informal Employment: Globalizing and Organizing (WIEGO) website <a href="http://wiego.org/">http://wiego.org/</a> - Accessed 22 March 2012.

World Health Organisation 2007, *Health System Profile: Pakistan* <a href="http://gis.emro.who.int/HealthSystemObservatory/PDF/Pakistan/Full%20Profile.pdf">http://gis.emro.who.int/HealthSystemObservatory/PDF/Pakistan/Full%20Profile.pdf</a> – Accessed 22 March 2012.

Yusufzai, A. 2010, 'Healthcare for Elderly a Dream Gone Sour', Global Action on Aging website, source: *Dawn*, 29 July <a href="http://www.globalaging.org/health/world/2010/dream.htm">http://www.globalaging.org/health/world/2010/dream.htm</a> - Accessed 22 March 2012.