

**Refugee Review Tribunal
AUSTRALIA**

RRT RESEARCH RESPONSE

Research Response Number: PAK33485
Country: Pakistan
Date: 28 July 2008

Keywords: Pakistan – Pakistan People’s Party (PPP) – Benazir Bhutto – Lahore – “Dance parties” – Alcohol – Police – State protection

This response was prepared by the Research & Information Services Section of the Refugee Review Tribunal (RRT) after researching publicly accessible information currently available to the RRT within time constraints. This response is not, and does not purport to be, conclusive as to the merit of any particular claim to refugee status or asylum. This research response may not, under any circumstance, be cited in a decision or any other document. Anyone wishing to use this information may only cite the primary source material contained herein.

Questions

- 1. In recent times have there been any reports that ordinary workers of the PPP have been targeted for harm by state authorities or other groups?**
- 2. Is there any information on dance parties in Lahore and surrounding districts? Are they tolerated by the community? Are there any reports that persons involved in these parties might be subject to attacks by religious conservatives?**
- 3. Would the police provide protection to persons who are involved in organising dance parties with alcohol and mixed socialising?**
- 4. Is Time social magazine widely read and distributed in Pakistan?**

RESPONSE

- 1. In recent times have there been any reports that ordinary workers of the PPP have been targeted for harm by state authorities or other groups?**

According to information in the latest UK Home Office report, there were reports of Pakistan People’s Party (PPP) workers being targeted in the lead-up to the February 2008 parliamentary elections, and after the assassination of PPP leader, Benazir Bhutto, in December 2007. In the February 2008 parliamentary elections the two main opposition parties – PPP and Pakistan Muslim League-Nawaz (PML-N) – gained a clear majority and later agreed to form a coalition government. Yousaf Raza Gillani, the vice-chairman of the PPP, was elected Prime Minister. A search of the available information found no reports of PPP workers having been targeted for harm by state authorities since the PPP became part of the ruling coalition. Some recent media articles report that there have been clashes between PPP workers and other groups, resulting in deaths. A July 2008 article also reports that two

PPP workers in Karachi were shot at in a “target killing”; however, there is no indication in the report as to the identity of the shooter (for information on the elections and the aftermath, see: UK Home Office 2008, *Country of Origin Information Report: Pakistan*, 29 April, Section 4 – Attachment 1; for reports of clashes between PPP workers and other groups, see: Khan, M. 2008, ‘Three shot dead in separate incidents’, *The Nation*, 18 July <http://www.nation.com.pk/pakistan-news-newspaper-daily-english-online/Regional/Karachi/18-Jul-2008/Three-shot-dead-in-separate-incidents> – Accessed 22 July 2008 – Attachment 2; for the recent shooting of PPP workers, see: ‘PPP worker among two killed’ 2008, *The International News*, 17 July http://www.thenews.com.pk/daily_detail.asp?id=124608 – Accessed 22 July 2008 – Attachment 3).

In a June 2008 article titled ‘Pakistan Amidst the Storms’, Graham Usher states that “[l]ess than three months after being formed, Pakistan’s coalition government is in trouble.” Usher describes the growing protests and discontent with government actions. According to this, in May 2008, nine PML-N ministers resigned. More recent media reports emphasise that the alliance is continuing to face difficulties, with an article dated 22 July stating that “some senior leaders of the two major parties of the ruling coalition -- the PPP and the PML-N -- admit that the alliance is becoming more dysfunctional and wobbly with each passing day” (Usher, G. 2008, ‘Pakistan Amidst the Storms’, *Middle East Report Online*, 27 June <http://www.merip.org/mero/mero062708.html> – Accessed 22 July 2008 – Attachment 4; ‘Pakistan People’s Party and Pakistan Muslim League Nawaz leaders pessimistic over coalition’ 2008, *Pakistan Daily*, 22 July <http://www.daily.pk/national/nationalnews/88-nationalnews/5893-pakistan-peoples-party-and-pakistan-muslim-league-nawaz-leaders-pessimistic-over-coalition.html> – Accessed 22 July 2008 – Attachment 5).

For a brief background of events in Pakistan to the end of June this year, see the International Crisis Group’s (ICG) *CrisisWatch* database for Pakistan. This does not report any targeting of PPP members in the months since the February elections (International Crisis Group 2008, ‘CrisisWatch – Pakistan’, updated 1 July http://www.crisisgroup.org/home/index.cfm?action=cw_search&l=1&t=1&cw_country=86&cw_date – Accessed 22 July 2008 – Attachment 6).

Recent media articles

A search of recent news articles located the following in relation to violence and/or other issues involving PPP workers (presented in chronological date order).

Most recently, a *BBC News* article dated 23 July 2008 reports that in Karachi a “Pakistan People’s Party (PPP) activist and security chief for party leader Asif Zardari has been killed by unknown gunmen” (Khan, M. 2008, ‘Former Bhutto bodyguard shot dead’, *BBC News*, 23 July http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/south_asia/7520749.stm – Accessed 24 July 2008 – Attachment 46).

An article dated 20 July 2008 reports that the Punjab Chief Minister ordered that all cases registered against PPP workers following Bhutto’s assassination be withdrawn:

Punjab Chief Minister Shahbaz Sharif on Saturday ordered an immediate withdrawal of all cases against the Pakistan People’s Party (PPP) workers registered on December 27 after the assassination of former prime minister Benazir Bhutto in Rawalpindi.

Shahbaz said the PPP workers had rendered many sacrifices against the dictatorship for democracy and justice in the country, and the assassination of late Benazir Bhutto was one of them ('Shahbaz orders withdrawal of all cases against PPP workers' 2008, *Daily Times*, 20 July

http://www.dailytimes.com.pk/default.asp?page=2008%5C07%5C20%5Cstory_20-7-2008_pg7_8 – Accessed 22 July 2008 – Attachment 7).

An article dated 18 July 2008 reports that in Karachi “a clash between two parties led to the death of Raheem, a PPP activist, and the injury of two others. According to the SP of Gulshan Town, Sohail Zafar Chatta, a tussle between the activists of the Muttahida Qaumi Movement (MQM) and the Pakistan People’s Party (PPP) led to the firing, which resulted in the death of PPP activist Raheem”. UK Home Office information indicates that the MQM is a “pro-Musharraf ethnic political party” ('MQM-PPP activists’ tussle claims a life’ 2008, *The International News*, 18 July http://www.thenews.com.pk/daily_detail.asp?id=124732 – Accessed 22 July 2008 – Attachment 8; UK Home Office 2008, *Country of Origin Information Report: Pakistan*, 29 April, Section 4.02 – Attachment 1).

Another article dated 18 July 2008, also reporting on Karachi, states:

Fresh violence claimed three lives and wounded four others including a rangers official in separate incidents here on Thursday.

Town Police Officers (TPO) Gulshan-e-Iqbal said that two people including a teenage bystander were killed when a clash occurred between the activists of Pukhtoon Student Federation and the PPP at Abulhassan Isfahani Road, Sohrab Goth. In the indiscriminate firing, Sahid Rind, an activist of PPP sustained bullet injuries and died on the way to hospital. After his assassination, intense exchange of fire took place between the two groups resulting in the death 17-year-old Yasir Abbas, who was standing at the balcony of his apartment.

Meanwhile, an armed clash between the activists of the MQM and the PPP at Safoora Cowrangi claimed the life Shahid Hussain and injured four people including Shani, Salman, Khurram, Ashi, and Imran alias Kala.

The police have registered separate cases (Khan, M. 2008, ‘Three shot dead in separate incidents’, *The Nation*, 18 July <http://www.nation.com.pk/pakistan-news-newspaper-daily-english-online/Regional/Karachi/18-Jul-2008/Three-shot-dead-in-separate-incidents> – Accessed 22 July 2008 – Attachment 2).

An article dated 17 July 2008 reports that a PPP member in Karachi had been killed and another injured “when two armed men riding a motorcycle opened fire on them outside the residence” of one. The article states that “police also said that the deceased and the injured were workers of the PPP and added that it was target killing” ('PPP worker among two killed’ 2008, *The International News*, 17 July http://www.thenews.com.pk/daily_detail.asp?id=124608 – Accessed 22 July 2008 – Attachment 3).

An article dated 15 July 2008 reports that a “PPP worker... was shot dead a few days ago in Lahore”. The article gives no indication of the reason behind the shooting ('PM says workers like Javed Hafeez keeps PPP alive’ 2008, *Associated Press of Pakistan*, 15 July http://www.app.com.pk/en /index.php?option=com_content&task=view&id=45380 – Accessed 22 July 2008 – Attachment 9).

An article dated 14 July 2008 reports on a PPP-supported union protest which turned violent in Karachi, while police allegedly refrained from acting. According to this information, “Eye-witnesses said that a political leader of PPP directed the city police not to touch the

protesters” (Zaidi, E. & Malik, I. 2008, ‘PPP-backed union workers paralyse MCB operations’, *The Nation*, 14 July – Attachment 10).

An article dated 8 July 2008, from the Indian based news service Khabrein.Info, states:

Police netted down several suspects for their alleged links to a series of low-intensity bomb blasts that rocked Pakistan’s commercial port city of Karachi on Monday.

More than 10 suspects have been arrested so far, police sources told KUNA. At least seven bomb blasts of low-intensity exploded in different areas of Karachi city Monday evening. According to Provincial Interior Ministry Secretary, Arif Ahmed Khan, the blasts did not kill anyone but more than 40 were wounded.

Chief Minister Sindh, Syed Qaim Ali Shah, said that the wounded also included ruling Pakistan Peoples Party (PPP) activists. He confirmed that at least two persons were killed.

Home Minister Zulfikar Mirza said that the explosions were aimed at triggering ethnic strifes in the city but people foiled this conspiracy. Addressing a press conference he said that the blasts were carried out by helmet wearing terrorists riding on three motorcycles. He said that a team has launched investigations and confirmed the arrests of at least four suspects (‘Police arrests several in Karachi bomb blasts’ 2008, Khabrein.Info, 8 July

http://www.khabrein.info/index.php?option=com_content&task=view&id=15161&Itemid=57 – Accessed 22 July 2008 – Attachment 11).

An *International News* article dated 4 July 2008 states:

The Sindh High Court (SHC) has directed the police to not arrest a former provincial assembly legislator, Sadaqat Ali Jatoi, and his nephew, Karim Ali Jatoi, in a murder case until their acquittal case is placed before SHC’s division bench for hearing.

The SHC’s single bench, comprising Justice Khawaja Naveed Ahmed, was hearing the bail application of the two Jatois who were facing murder and attempt to murder charges. Both men were accused of involvement in the murder of Pakistan People’s Party (PPP) activist Shahjehan Qureshi who was killed on February 8, 2008, during an election campaign in Dadu. The complainant alleged that armed supporters of Sadaqat Ali Jatoi’s opened fired at PPP supporters, killing Qureshi and injuring four others.

The counsel of the accused, Raja Qureshi, said that his clients were being involved in the case due to political enmity. He sought protective bail for them from the court (‘Former MPA granted interim protection by SHC’ 2008, *The International News*, 4 July http://www.thenews.com.pk/daily_detail.asp?id=122062 – Accessed 22 July 2008 – Attachment 12).

An article dated 28 June 2008, reporting on by-elections, states that “Reports of sporadic poll-related violence in Punjab are disturbing. The worst incident took place in Mandi Bahauddin, where PPP activists allegedly kidnapped an assistant presiding officer and rival groups exchanged gunfire. The parties involved need to look into these incidents and make an effort to improve discipline” (‘By-poll message’ 2008, *The International News*, 28 June http://www.thenews.com.pk/daily_detail.asp?id=120955 – Accessed 22 July 2008 – Attachment 13).

There have been a number of suicide bombings this year around Pakistan, including in Lahore. The targets have been varied. South Asia Terrorism Portal (SATP) notes that one of the March 2008 suicide bombings in Lahore occurred at an office located near the office of the PPP ('Suicide Attacks in Punjab' 2008, South Asia Terrorism Portal, last updated 11 March <http://satp.org/satporgtp/countries/pakistan/Punjab/datasheet/suicideattack.htm> – Accessed 22 July 2008 – Attachment 14).

On 27 December 2007 the leader of the PPP, Benazir Bhutto, and over 20 others were killed during a political rally in Rawalpindi. In October 2007 a previous assassination attempt was made on Bhutto, killing over 140 party workers in Karachi. ICG reports that after both incidents, the PPP criticized the security provided and raised questions about official complicity. The US Department of State report on human rights states that "according to the PPP, they faced increased intimidation following the assassination of Benazir Bhutto...The PPP reported that 1,627 cases were registered against 510,351 of their activists in one district of Hyderabad" (International Crisis Group 2008, 'Reforming Pakistan's Police', *Asia Report N° 157*, 14 July, p. 14 – Attachment 15; International Crisis Group 2008, 'After Bhutto's Murder: A Way Forward for Pakistan', *Asia Briefing N° 74*, 2 January – Attachment 16; US Department of State 2008, *Country Reports on Human Rights Practices for 2007 – Pakistan*, March, Section 3 – Attachment 17).

A previous research response, dated 26 February 2008, includes extracts from reports found on the PPP's website alleging that party leaders and workers had "suffered violence, harassment and intimidation by government officials as well as by the political supporters of the Musharraf regime" in the lead up to the elections on 18 February 2008. Reports of violence against the PPP in February 2008 from HRW, CNN and *The Economist*, amongst others, are also included as extracts in this response ('PPP Warns Against Continued Spate of Violence Against The Party' 2008, Pakistan People's Party website, 14 February http://www.ppp.org.pk/news_event/feb/15-2-2008.html – Accessed 26 February 2008 – Attachment 18; see Question 1 of RRT Research & Information 2008, *Research Response PAK32938*, 26 February – Attachment 19).

Another research response, dated 19 February 2008, provides detailed information on recent government responses to pro-democracy and anti-Musharraf demonstrations, as well as government treatment of those detained (Question 1); treatment of pro-democracy activists by Pakistani police and the army (Question 2). This includes information on PPP members (RRT Research & Information 2008, *Research Response PAK32942*, 19 February – Attachment 20).

The latest UK Home Office country information report (April 2008) has collated relevant information giving a rundown on political events in 2007 to April 2008 (UK Home Office 2008, *Country of Origin Information Report: Pakistan*, 29 April, Section 4 – [Attachment 1](#)).

2. Is there any information on dance parties in Lahore and surrounding districts? Are they tolerated by the community? Are there any reports that persons involved in these parties might be subject to attacks by religious conservatives?

A number of media articles were found reporting on dance parties in and around Lahore. The information found is conflicting. Pakistan is a country in which Islamic law plays a prominent role and dance parties are described as an "immoral activity" by a Force

Commander of the Anti Narcotics Force (ANF) in a January 2008 article. On the other hand, there are numerous seemingly casual references in the media to dancing, partying and sometimes drinking. A May 2008 article discusses a prominent Pakistani cricketer taking drugs and attending dance parties in Lahore. Photos of the local “who’s who” and party-goers at various parties and functions are easily found on the internet, for example on the social pages of the Lahore based *Sunday* magazine website. Most articles do specify that it is the “elite” who engage in this lifestyle. A review for the novel *Moth Flame* (set around Lahore’s upper-class) states that “the economic divide is so vast that the wealthy can insulate themselves from the rules that bind the rest of society”. An April 2008 article reports that dancing and/or drinking are opposed by “religious conservatives”. An April 2007 article reports an attack by “Islamists” on Punjab University because it planned to hold a dance party. While an April 2008 article states that Lahore is “a generally liberal Muslim city”, so far this year there has been a number of suicide bombings in the city resulting in over 60 deaths and over 400 people injured, according to information from the SATP website (‘ANF warns hotels, clubs, guest houses owners to clamp down on immoral activities’ 2008, *The Baluchistan Times*, 15 January – Attachment 21; Mir, A. 2008, ‘Shoaib is no diabetic: PCB’, *DNA*, 18 May – Attachment 22; ‘Eye Spy’ 2007, *Sunday* magazine website, 16 February, accessed through Internet Archive http://web.archive.org/web/20070216215747/www.dailytimes.com.pk/sunday/default.aspx?c=eye_spy_a.html – Accessed 23 July 2008 – Attachment 23; ‘Review of Mohsin Hamid’s *Moth Smoke*’ 2001, BrothersJudd.com, 1 October http://www.brothersjudd.com/index.cfm/fuseaction/reviews.detail/book_id/412/Moth%20Smoke.htm – Accessed 23 July 2008 – Attachment 24; ‘Pakistan’s beloved kite festival lost to violence’ 2008, *MSNBC*, source: *Associated Press*, 11 April <http://www.msnbc.msn.com/id/24072396/> – Accessed 22 July 2008 – Attachment 25; for reports of attacks on a dance party, see: ‘Islamists attack festival in Pakistan University’ 2007, *Indo-Asian News Service*, 15 April – Attachment 26; ‘Suicide Attacks in Punjab’ 2008, South Asia Terrorism Portal, last updated 11 March <http://satp.org/satporgtp/countries/pakistan/Punjab/datasheet/suicideattack.htm> – Accessed 22 July 2008 – Attachment 14).

Basant

Many of the media reports of dance parties and drinking in Lahore centre around the spring festival of Basant. A 2007 article in *The Hindu* (an Indian paper) states: “Nothing presses the fun button in Pakistanis as Basant, the spring festival. It all happens in Lahore, though, for a month from Febraury [sic] 15 to March 15. People dance and sing, and the rich party and yes, drink, like there is no tomorrow”. The article further notes that “there are some dark mumblings from some quarters about how Basant itself is un-Islamic but no one is taking that seriously”. The article also notes that, although alcohol is banned for Muslims, it “is widely available, you just have to know where to get it” (Subramanian, N. 2007, ‘Kite-flying in the time of high spirits’, *The Hindu*, 18 February <http://www.hindu.com/mag/2007/02/18/stories/2007021800150400.htm> – Accessed 22 July 2008 – Attachment 27).

This year, however, an April 2008 *MSNBC* article reports that the festival was delayed due to the assassination of Bhutto and the February elections, and then “indefinitely put on hold after three suicide attacks struck Lahore last month, including two that killed 27 people and wounded more than 200 on March 11”. The article also notes that the festival is opposed by “religious conservatives”. The article states:

In the past, Lahore's youth send thousands of brightly colored kites into the sky during Basant, which means yellow in Hindi — a reference to the mustard flowers that blossom in the region in early spring.

Crowds of Lahoris typically clamber onto rooftops to watch. Well-heeled guests from around the country pack city hotels for a few days of late-night partying.

But even before the recent bloodshed and political upheaval, the region's kite-flying tradition was threatened.

Religious conservatives oppose the festival because it is a reminder of Pakistan's pre-Islamic past and say it encourages drinking and dancing. Lahore, a generally liberal Muslim city, was home to many Hindus before Pakistan's partition from India in 1947.

Others oppose the festival and kite flying on public safety grounds ('Pakistan's beloved kite festival lost to violence' 2008, *MSNBC*, source: *Associated Press*, 11 April <http://www.msnbc.msn.com/id/24072396/> – Accessed 22 July 2008 – Attachment 25).

Previous media reports of the festival of Basant seem to suggest that it is accepted and enjoyed by most "Lahorites". A 2006 article in *Dawn* reports on the party atmosphere surrounding the main Basant activity of kite-flying, which was banned by the Supreme Court in 2006 because of accidents. Despite this, "Lahorites and their guests, who came from all over the country and abroad, could not resist the temptation to fly kites after Saturday midnight and flouted the ban till sunset on Sunday". The article also notes the "dance parties for the elite":

The hide-and-seek between police and the kite buffs continued till 2am on Sunday during which cellular phones were used to alert friends and relatives to a raid.

It seemed that the fireworks show at the three famous havelis where dinner receptions, musical and dance parties for the elite were arranged on Saturday night, motivated people to come to their rooftops as a number of enthusiasts restored to firing in the air in Walled City areas soon after it (Siddiqui, Z. 2006, 'Basant frenzy grips Lahore', *Dawn*, 13 March <http://www.dawn.com/2006/03/13/nat7.htm> – Accessed 22 July 2008 – Attachment 28).

A 2006 *Guardian* article notes contradictions in Pakistan society between what is taboo and what is tacitly accepted or ignored (in relation to homosexuality):

A ban on kite-flying failed to dampen the spirits of party-goers in Lahore at the weekend, where hundreds of parties took place to celebrate the age-old Basant festival. But one gathering stood out.

Under a starry sky filled with fireworks, about 150 gay men clambered to the roof of an apartment building for an exuberant party. Bollywood music spilled into the streets as dress-wearing men twisted and whirled flamboyantly. Some older men with moustaches and wearing traditional shalwar kameez stared silently from the sidelines. But most of the party-goers were in their 20s, dressed in jeans and T-shirts, and looking for a good time. "We just want to have fun," said one of the organisers, known as the "hot boyz".

Homosexuality is taboo in Pakistani society, where sexual orientation is rarely discussed and the gay rights debate is non-existent. Sodomy is punishable by up to

life in jail, and religious leaders condemn gay men as an aberration of western corruption.

When President Pervez Musharraf boasted of empowering minorities, during a press conference with George Bush in Islamabad 10 days ago, he was unlikely to have been referring to gay emancipation. Yet many homosexuals say their community is quietly thriving, often with the tacit acceptance of a society which prefers to look the other way. Assaults on gay men are rare; sodomy laws are seldom invoked.

Communities of Hijra – a transsexual group, with roots which stretch back to the Mughal empire – are found in all major cities. “In a bizarre way homosexuality is condemned but not opposed,” said a gay man from Karachi. “There is an indulgence here, a cultural ability to live and let live.”

...The apparent open-mindedness is at odds with Pakistan’s austere and socially conservative image abroad. Last year Punjabi authorities briefly banned female participants in marathon races, while sex outside marriage between men and women is punishable by death (Walsh, Declan 2006, ‘Pakistani society looks other way as gay men party’, *The Guardian*, 14 March <http://www.guardian.co.uk/pakistan/Story/0,,1730227,00.html> – Accessed 28 March 2006 – Attachment 29).

An April 2005 article reports anti-government and anti-American criticisms by the chief of the religio-political alliance, Mutahida Majlis-e-Amal (MMA), who states that “Musharraf is playing American game and no one is resisting. He did not go to Muzaffarabad on Kashmir Day, instead celebrated Basant in Lahore. By organising the dance parties an impression is being given to the world that Pakistan has been converted into a moderate and enlightened country” (‘Sardari System, Mily Rule Ruined Country: MMA’ 2005, *The Nation*, 11 February – Attachment 30).

New Year’s Eve

The following two December 2007 articles, from *Dawn* and *The Daily Times*, mention New Year’s Eve dance parties in Lahore in a matter-of-fact manner.

A 31 December 2007 article reports on the cancellation of New Year’s Eve dance parties in Lahore after the assassination of Benazir Bhutto. The article states that “Lahore is known for throwing parties on the New Year eve”:

Amidst the pall of gloom for Benazir Bhutto’s assassination, dance parties arranged in Lahore to celebrate the New Year Night have been cancelled, sources in entertainment world told Dawn on Monday.

The young generation of Lahore, mostly from elite and upper middle class, arranges a number of parties and get together to celebrate New Year Night but the shocking incident of Ms Bhutto’s murder has left everybody sad and upset. Most of the parties had been arranged at Cavalry and Defence clubs, a haveli in the Walled City and farmhouses on Badian Road but now they have been cancelled.

They said that parties might be re-organised after a week or so. Shakir Mehmood, a noted socialite of Lahore, said he also had arranged a get-together to celebrate the occasion but the tragic incident of former premier’s murder had left him in a state of deep gloom. “I tell you the truth the murder news of Ms Bhutto was so shocking that now no one even thinks of holding a party or a fun bash at the moment,” he said.

Lahore is known for throwing parties on the New Year eve but this year the sad happening has put a stop to all such activities since the entire nation is too upset and sad over the present state of affairs in the country ('Too sad to celebrate New Year Night' 2008, *Dawn*, 1 January <http://www.dawn.com/2008/01/01/nat29.htm> – Accessed 22 July 2008 – Attachment 31).

A 29 December 2007 *Daily Times* article reports on New Year's Eve within the Defence Housing Authority (DHA) in Lahore. The article indicates that private dance parties seem to be reasonably accepted in this area, as long as they are not in a public place. The article also seems to suggest that the "strong contingents of police" are there for residents protection (for a description of the DHA as residence for Lahore's elite, see below). *The Daily Times* article states:

The Defence Housing Authority (DHA) officials said on Thursday that no one would be allowed to take the law in his/her hands on the New Year's night.

They said they had issued strict directions to 25 cafés and clubs for this purpose. On the New Year's night, they said, strong contingents of police would be deployed at the DHA's entry and exit points.

On the other hand, a large number of Lahori youngsters have already booked cafes for arranging dance parties and get-togethers on the New Year's night.

The DHA officials said they had already issued special instructions to hotel administrations to inform them about their customers. They said they would take strict action against the administration of any hotel where somebody was found staying without registration.

On the New Year's night, they said, extra contingents of the police would be deployed at shopping malls and places of entertainment.

They said, "People can arrange parties at their houses, but no one can use a public place for any 'unhealthy' purpose" (Farooq, H. 2007, 'DHA to be stern on New Year', *Daily Times*, 29 December http://www.dailytimes.com.pk/print.asp?page=2007%5C12%5C29%5Cstory_29-12-2007_pg7_43 – Accessed 22 July 2008 – Attachment 32).

A description of DHA Lahore found on the Maps of the World website states:

Originally built for the army officers, the DHA has developed into one of the best and sophisticated living areas of the city. It is one of the posh lodging destinations, populated by the elite class including promising businessmen, celebrities, high military officers, politicians and foreigners of Pakistani origin ('DHA Lahore' (undated), Mapsofworld.com <http://www.mapsofworld.com/cities/pakistan/lahore/dha.html> – Accessed 22 July 2008 – Attachment 33).

Other "dance party" references in the media

A May 2008 article reports on allegations of drug use by Pakistani cricketer, Shoaib Akhter. According to this article, it is alleged that "Shoaib often visits a Badian Road farmhouse on the outskirts of Lahore to attend private dance parties where he also takes drugs. The farmhouse reportedly is owned by his friend Kamran aka Kami, an official in the Federal Investigation Agency" (Mir, A. 2008, 'Shoaib is no diabetic: PCB', *DNA*, 18 May – Attachment 22).

In Punjab, an April 2007 article reports that a “group of Islamists attacked a social festival in Pakistan’s Punjab University and beat up boys, girls and the teachers”. The activists of the Islami Jamiat Talaba (IJT) were protesting against “vulgarity, obscenity and immorality”. The article states:

They sabotaged the celebrations owing to its “un-Islamic” nature, the daily said.

“They entered the campus and declared war against the administration for allegedly promoting (the festival),” an official said.

The university authorities informed the nearest police station but the police reached the festival “after the activists had already wreaked havoc”, the daily said.

A college official said the activists “wanted to impose their particular philosophy of Islamisation”. He said no event was organised during the five-day festival that was offensive to Islam.

However, IJT’s Muhammad Ayub said the festival had been attacked because a “dance party” had been scheduled for the night. He added that female students of the varsity were being “forced” to participate in it.

Punjab University vice chancellor Arshad Mahmood told Daily Times that the IJT was an illegal body that wanted to impose its particular philosophy of Islamisation over the university’s students.

“The college administration will not allow any Talibanisation in this varsity,” he said, adding that stern action would be taken against the attackers.

He said the police had failed to provide adequate protection to the students (‘Islamists attack festival in Pakistan University’ 2007, *Indo-Asian News Service*, 15 April – Attachment 26).

A 2003 article describes the changing legalities and attitudes to the dancing girls of Heera Mandi in Lahore:

For centuries the dancing girls claimed many an important patron, but today they have lost their political clout. Eunuchs have become male prostitutes and have fallen to the very bottom of Pakistani society. But the dancers’ fortunes really began to wane under the Islamic dictatorship of General Zia-ul Haq. In 1975 Heera Mandi was surrounded by police and closed for the Muslim fasting month of Ramadan, as it has been every year since. The stigma Zia’s regime attached to prostitution forced the trade underground, kept the middle classes out of Heera Mandi and forced the girls to scatter throughout the city.

It is legal to dance in Heera Mandi from the hours of 11 p.m. to 1 a.m., but prostitution is officially against the law. Police surround the district in the evening — their main role seems to be to demand bribes from visitors and dancers alike.

... Ten years ago there were 16,000 female sex workers in Heera Mandi, local health workers say. Today, there are just 2,000 working here, many of whom live outside the area and make only occasional visits for **dance parties** (‘Lahore’s dancing girls fall on hard times’ 2003, *Daily Times*, 22 August

http://www.dailytimes.com.pk/default.asp?page=story_22-8-2003_pg7_15 – Accessed 22 July 2008 – Attachment 34).

A 2002 article reports that two men were facing up to 10 years in prison after being arrested and charged with blasphemy after holding a dance party in Lahore. The report does seem to indicate that the fact that the young men “obtained a government permit to hold a religious ceremony marking the traditional birthday of the Prophet Muhammad but instead threw a dance party” was the most serious issue, rather than the dance party in itself, although the article does note that the party involved “dancing by members of the opposite sex.” It is also noted that “police learned of the party after an Islamic cleric lodged a complaint and provided video footage of the dancing” (‘Pakistani police arrest two men for holding dance party instead religious ceremony’ 2002, *Associated Press*, 9 August – Attachment 35).

Other relevant articles

A 2007 article reports that a “weekend party at an elite club in Lahore” was gate-crashed and disrupted “by two dozen men [with guns] reportedly led by the nephew of a federal minister” (Qaiser, A. 2007, ‘Why have we come to this?’, *Dawn*, 21 May <http://www.dawn.com/2007/05/21/fea.htm#4> – Accessed 22 July 2008 – Attachment 36).

A 2006 article reports on attitudes towards dancing girls and mixed dancing at parties:

LAHORE • Whether watching dance girls perform is illegal or not or a personal act, Samanabad Town Nazim Mian Javed Ali faces a major dilemma as his reputation is on the line, his close friends have disclosed.

The nazim was attending a birthday party hosted by a friend a week ago and came across dance girls hired by the organisers, his aides said.

Someone at the function took a picture of the nazim being garlanded by one, they said, and sold the picture to the nazim’s political opponents, who got the picture published in newspapers. The opponents were now demanding Javed Ali be removed from office because his practice was un-Islamic and illegal. Muttahida Majlis-e-Amal legislator Ehsanullah Waqas took the issue up in the Punjab Assembly and Local Government Minister Basharat Raja told the house that an inquiry would be initiated into the incident.

It has been found that Pakistan’s constitution does not deem watching dance girls perform illegal. Justice (Retd) Malik Abdul Qayyum said such an act was not illegal and dances were performed in all major hotels, to entertain foreign delegations and even at President’s House because they were part of Pakistan’s culture. “I saw the Samanabad nazim’s picture,” he said. “He was not touching a girl, although a girl was touching him.”

He said the nazim’s act was not unlawful in any way. “What is unlawful is violating someone’s privacy, which the constitution ensures.” Cleric Dr Israr Ahmed said that under Islamic law, dancing with men or watching them dance was lawful. “However, Islam does not support men and women dancing together,” he said.

Asked what the Quran and Sunnah had to say about it, he said, “I don’t know. But if we keep modesty in mind, men and women dancing together is definitely not preferred” (‘Pakistan official in dilemma over dancing girls’ 2006, *The Peninsula*, source: Internews, 20 November

http://www.thepeninsulaqatar.com/Display_news.asp?section=World_News&subject=Pakistan+%26+Sub-Continent&month=November2006&file=World_News2006112084935.xml – Accessed 22 July 2008 – Attachment 37).

A 2004 article reports on Lahore's "crazy, vibrant party scene". Again, it seems that this is largely an elite activity as a "private party can cost anywhere between Rs 0.6 million to Rs 1.5 million. More, if one is willing". The article states:

Planning parties as a profession, managing events, started with the commercialisation of Basant. "Soon multinationals were involved and it all turned into a massive corporate-cultural event," said man-about-town Mian Yusuf Salahuddin.

Mr Salahuddin, who has been hosting Basant...for at least three decades, entertaining everyone from Imran and Jemima and Mick Jagger to Javed Sheikh and Resham, recalls the 1960s when the bars were flowing and you could catch the cabaret at any number of clubs and hotels.

"It was completely different then," said Mr Salahuddin. "Sure we had parties, but they were all daytime affairs." He said Gen Zia-ul-Haq's pious military regime did not succeed in snuffing spirits."So there was prohibition. It didn't stop us from partying, everything just went underground." The Musharraf-era is righting wrongs.

Shaukat Aziz's economic miracle has given us a people who are much happier and much wealthier. There are parties and GTs (that's get-togethers for the uninitiated) galore—at farmhouses, rented-out restaurants and havelis. "The last two years the economy has been good," said Omar Satee of J&S Events. "Greater economic transaction with the rest of the world has broadened the general outlook towards life."

Mr Satee should know. The event management company he runs with Mr Salahuddin's son Jalal is the last word in revelry. Their new year's throwdown at the Baroodkhana was the hottest ticket in town—a single ticket cost Rs 6,000. But it's not just the economy. It's also greater exposure to the larger world out there.

"You can't discount the invasion of foreign media," said Mr Satee. Watching people one's own age having clean, wholesome fun does give one ideas. No party is complete without those Matrix jackets and J-Lo gogs. The Internet and its socio-cultural impact cannot be downplayed either. That chat programme, mIRC, allows students and young professionals (and pervs) to meet in virtual space away from the arched brow of society (Bhutta, S. 2004, 'The good times keep on rolling', *Daily Times*, 24 January http://www.dailytimes.com.pk/default.asp?page=story_24-1-2004_pg7_10 – Accessed 22 July 2008 – Attachment 38).

Although it is referring to gay men in Pakistan, an article on the GlobalGayz website notes the use of security at private parties. The article states: "among Pakistan's urban elite, there is a growing community of men who've come out as homosexual. They meet on the Internet or at **private parties with heavy security**" ('Homosexuality apparently thriving in Pakistan despite severe punishments' 2004, *National Public Radio*, GlobalGayz website, 3 August <http://www.globalgayz.com/pak-news01-04.html#article19> – Accessed 22 July 2008 – Attachment 47).

A 2003 article reports on the tensions between "conservative Muslim groups" and "the efforts of President Musharraf to present Pakistan as moderate Muslim country". The article states:

FASHION shows have been banned in Pakistan. Models have been told that their catwalk displays are an affront to Islamic values and will no longer be tolerated.

Zafarullah Jamali, the Prime Minister, personally issued a decree banning the shows, which have proved popular in hotels in Islamabad and Karachi. It is the first time Pakistani authorities have imposed such a restriction.

The ban came after a row over fashion events that took place on the eve of Ramadan, Islam's holy month. A fashion show followed by a dance party at a hotel in Islamabad last month drew strong criticism from conservative Muslim groups and right-wing newspapers. The event, sponsored by a tobacco company, was attended by senior government officials and members of the cricket teams of Pakistan and South Africa.

"The show was in total disregard to the Islamic values," a local newspaper said. Hardline Islamic groups demanded action against the cricketers and a lawsuit was filed against some of the players, including the fast bowler Shoaib Akhtar.

Another event at Lahore Fort, featuring a Turkish dance troupe, further infuriated the mullahs.

Electoral success has encouraged attempts by Islamists to suppress activities deemed un-Islamic. But human rights groups say that the ban is a setback to the efforts of President Musharraf to present Pakistan as moderate Muslim country (Hussain, Z. 2003, 'Pakistan forbids fashion shows', *The Times*, 14 November <http://www.timesonline.co.uk/tol/news/world/article1016825.ece> – Accessed 22 July 2008 – Attachment 39).

Other information

An April 2008 *Pakistan Times* article reports on "Club Caramel" (in Karachi and Lahore), which "is a unique event focusing on live performances, sound and light extravaganza, and a DJ/post-party, giving the feel of a dance club. The 2007 event proved to be very successful and was attended by several stars of the Pakistani media". The article states:

Events like these play a significant role in portraying the true nature of the country to the outside world; of a modern country with a forward-looking, progressive population. Club Caramel is a positive development for improving Pakistan's image abroad ('Wateen Powers the Entertainment Scene' 2008, *Pakistan Times*, 5 April <http://pakistantimes.net/2008/04/08/national5.htm> – Accessed 23 July 2008 – Attachment 40).

A weblog describes partying as part of every-day life in Lahore ('Party time!' 2008, Deep Thoughts web log, 8 March http://deephoughtsbyinsha.blogspot.com/2008_03_01_archive.html – Accessed 23 July 2008 – Attachment 41).

3. Would the police provide protection to persons who are involved in organising dance parties with alcohol and mixed socialising?

No recent specific information was found on whether the police would provide protection to persons who are involved in the actual organising of dance parties with alcohol and mixed socialising. As noted above, the information on societal and official tolerance for "un-Islamic activities" is conflicting. In addition, sources indicate that Pakistan's police force is corrupt and inefficient. The latest ICG report, discussing the future of Pakistan's police force, states

that “after decades of misuse and neglect, Pakistan’s police force is incapable of combating crime, upholding the law or protecting citizens and the state against militant violence”. A January 2008 article quoted previously notes that it is mainly those “from elite and upper middle class” who arrange parties and get together. A December 2007 article quoted previously reports on police apparently providing security for those living in the elite areas. The ICG report also quotes a police officer who states that “60 per cent of the Islamabad police at present is engaged in protecting VIPs and providing security to diplomats. Hardly any real police strength is, therefore, available to fight crime and maintain order.” Aside from this, some of the activities surrounding dance parties are actually illegal. Alcohol is banned for Muslims, non-marital sex is a crime, and prostitution is against the law. The available information does indicate that bribery of the police to avoid charges is common (International Crisis Group 2008, ‘Reforming Pakistan’s Police’, *Asia Report N° 157*, 14 July – Attachment 15; ‘Too sad to celebrate New Year Night’ 2008, *Dawn*, 1 January <http://www.dawn.com/2008/01/01/nat29.htm> – Accessed 22 July 2008 – Attachment 31; Farooq, H. 2007, ‘DHA to be stern on New Year’, *Daily Times*, 29 December http://www.dailytimes.com.pk/print.asp?page=2007%5C12%5C29%5Cstory_29-12-2007_pg7_43 – Accessed 22 July 2008 – Attachment 32; for information on laws, see: UK Home Office 2008, *Country of Origin Information Report: Pakistan*, 29 April, Section 11 – Attachment 1).

Some of the following articles have already been quoted in the previous question; however, they are referred to again here.

A *Baluchistan Times* article, dated 15 January 2008, reports on the threats of raids against party venues by the ANF in Islamabad. The force commander accused the owners of such establishments of “secretly promoting the drug addiction habits” of the young and also engaging “in immoral activities including dance parties”. The article states:

Force Commander Anti Narcotics Force (ANF) Rawalpindi Region, Brig. Asif Alvi took strict notice of the **dance parties** and open use of drugs in the guests houses, clubs and hotels situated in the Federal Capital.

He issued warning to the owners of all these hotels, clubs and guest house to close their immoral activities within a week otherwise strict action would be taken in case of violation.

While speaking in a press conference here on Tuesday he said that these hotels, clubs and guests houses are massively affecting the youth careers by secretly promoting the drugs addiction habits. He further said that these clubs, hotels and guests houses are also engaged in immoral activities including **dance parties**.

He said that police would conduct raid against the owners of these hotels and clubs and smuggler if they did not shut their business within deadline. Similarly, he said that ANF has recovered drugs worth of Rs. 200 million in four separate operation since last few days. These drugs include 3.710 kg heroin while 18 kg Chars. ANF have also arrested five smugglers including a woman along with a vehicle used for smuggling purposes, he added. He further said that ANF has also terminated of its employees for having links with smugglers and investigation is being underway against them (‘ANF warns hotels, clubs, guest houses owners to clamp down on immoral activities’ 2008, *The Baluchistan Times*, 15 January – Attachment 21).

Another 2008 article reports on allegations that the owner of a farmhouse where private dance parties and drug taking occur is actually an official in the Federal Investigation Agency (Mir, A. 2008, 'Shoab is no diabetic: PCB', *DNA*, 18 May – Attachment 22).

A 2007 article reports that a social festival at Pakistan's Punjab University had been attacked by a "group of [more than 70] Islamists", the leader of whom claimed that the attack was "because a 'dance party' had been scheduled for the night". The vice-chancellor said that "the police had failed to provide adequate protection to the students" ('Islamists attack festival in Pakistan University' 2007, *Indo-Asian News Service*, 15 April – Attachment 26).

A 2003 *Reuters* article reports on the dancing girls of Lahore, stating: "It is legal to dance in Heera Mandi from the hours of 11 p.m. to 1 a.m., but prostitution is officially against the law. Police surround the district in the evening – their main role seems to be to demand bribes from visitors and dancers alike" ('Lahore's dancing girls fall on hard times' 2003, *Daily Times*, 22 August http://www.dailytimes.com.pk/default.asp?page=story_22-8-2003_pg7_15 – Accessed 22 July 2008 – Attachment 34).

A 2002 article states that "[i]f you get caught drunk in public, you can face severe penalties including jail and extreme humiliation; the only way out is to bribe the police officer who catches you". Although the article is reporting on the situation for homosexuals in Pakistan, the information on drinking and private parties is relevant here:

There are no nightclubs or bars in Pakistan because drinking alcohol and dancing are prohibited by religious and state law. This doesn't mean that all dancing is banned but ordinary people don't dance. Rather, they go to the movies and the theatre to watch professionals. Most of society still believes that good people don't dance or go into professions like music or acting. The only occasion when an ordinary Pakistani dances is at a wedding or at the cricket when Pakistan wins against India.

People arrange private parties in their homes. Naturally, gay people do this too. The invitation is passed by word of mouth. Anyone who has any interest in men is welcome. I have never heard of gay bashing at such parties because they are arranged very discreetly. The alcohol is usually arranged on the official permit of a non-Muslim friend. If you get caught drunk in public, you can face severe penalties including jail and extreme humiliation; the only way out is to bribe the police officer who catches you (Haider, Saqlain 2002, 'The Invisible Men', *DNA Magazine*, June, Global Gayz website <http://www.globalgayz.com/g-pakistan.html> – Accessed 5 July 2004 – Attachment 42).

As noted in the previous question, a 2002 article reports that the Pakistani police arrested two men for holding a dance party instead of a religious ceremony in Lahore ('Pakistani police arrest two men for holding dance party instead religious ceremony' 2002, *Associated Press*, 9 August – Attachment 35).

ICG report

According to ICG, "police officers concede that elements within their ranks have links with jihadi and sectarian groups". ICG quotes a police official who states:

"When the state itself has consciously promoted extremism and sectarianism for almost three decades, it's not surprising that these tendencies have managed to establish roots inside the police force, just like they have in the military"
(International Crisis Group 2008, 'Reforming Pakistan's Police', *Asia Report N° 157*, 14 July, p. 15 – Attachment 15).

According to ICG, the police themselves are also bearing the brunt of the massive increase in terror attacks in Pakistan. The report states:

If anything, 2008 promises to be an even bloodier year for the police. In January, a suicide bomber outside the Lahore high Court killed 21 police officers. In February, more than 40 people dies in a suicide attack on the funeral procession of a police officer in Swat, killed in a roadside bombing a day earlier. In March, fifteen FIA personnel and eight civilians were killed in a suicide car bomb attack on FIA's Lahore headquarters. Initial reports indicated that it was aimed at preventing the FIA's Special Investigations Unit (the wing that deals with counter-terrorism operations) from interrogating suspects involved in recent terror activities in the city. On 6 July, a suicide bomber killed fifteen police deployed on security duties at an Islamist rally in Islamabad (International Crisis Group 2008, 'Reforming Pakistan's Police', *Asia Report N° 157*, 14 July, p. 15 – Attachment 15).

UK Home Office information

The latest UK Home Office country report on Pakistan includes relevant collated information. Quoting *Jane's Sentinel* risk assessment of Pakistan, the report states that "Police and security forces remain hard-pressed to control religio-political extremists". The report also cites the SATP Pakistan assessment, which states:

Year 2007 unambiguously demonstrated that the flag of extremist Islam continues to flail vigorously and violently across Pakistan...In a welter of violence, at least 3,599 persons, including 1,523 civilians, 597 security force (SF) personnel and 1,479 militants, were killed in 2007. While militant and terrorist violence has been reported from all the provinces, the worst affected were FATA followed by the NWFP. Fatalities in 2007, at 3599, were substantially more than double the fatalities in the preceding year (1471). The number of civilians killed remained marginally higher than the number of militants and terrorists killed – a continuing trend since 2003 (UK Home Office 2008, *Country of Origin Information Report: Pakistan*, 29 April, Section 8.03 – Attachment 1).

In relation to the police force, the UK Home Office report cites *Jane's Sentinel*, which states that "the police are politicised, in addition to being subject to manipulation by powerful landlords in the rural areas and 'influentials' in the cities. Corruption is rife [sic]. The UK Home Office report also cites the US Department of State, and other sources, which state:

"Corruption within the police was rampant. Police charged fees to register genuine complaints and accepted money for registering false complaints. Bribes to avoid charges were commonplace. Individuals paid police to humiliate their opponents and avenge personal grievances. Corruption was most prominent among police SHOs [Station House Officers], some of whom reportedly operated arrest-for-ransom operations and established unsanctioned stations to increase illicit revenue collection." [2h] (Section 1d)

(See also Section 18: Corruption)

9.06 On the efficacy of the police, the USSD Report 2007 stated that:

"Police force effectiveness varied greatly by district, ranging from reasonably good to completely ineffective. Some members of the police force committed numerous, serious human rights abuses. Failure to punish abuses created a climate of impunity. Police and prison officials frequently used the threat of abuse to extort money from prisoners and their families. The inspector general, district police officers, district

nazims, provincial interior or chief ministers, the federal interior or prime minister, or the courts can order internal investigations into abuses and order administrative sanctions. Executive branch and police officials can recommend and the courts can order criminal prosecution, and these mechanisms were sometimes used... Police often failed to protect members of religious minorities – particularly Christians, Ahmadis, and Shi’as – from societal attacks.” [2h] (Section 1d)

(See also Section 12: Arbitrary arrest)

9.07 The publication ‘Freedom House – Freedom in the World 2007’ reported that:

“Anecdotal evidence suggested that police continue to routinely engage in crime; use excessive force in ordinary situations; arbitrarily arrest and detain citizens; extort money from prisoners and their families; accept money to register cases on false charges; rape female detainees and prisoners; commit extrajudicial killings; and torture detainees (often to extract confessions). Political opponents, former government officials, and other critics of the regime are particularly at risk of arbitrary arrest or abduction, torture, and denial of basic due process rights at the hands of military authorities, according to Human Rights Watch and local NGOs. Progress on creating a National Human Rights Commission that is empowered to monitor and investigate cases of abuse and to redress grievances remained slow during the year” (UK Home Office 2008, *Country of Origin Information Report: Pakistan*, 29 April, Section 9 – Attachment 1).

In regards to Islamic Law,

The US State Department Report 2007 (USSD 2007), published on 11 March 2008, noted that:

“The Federal Shariat Court, according to Article 203 of the Constitution, can be used to examine and decide whether any law is repugnant to the injunctions of Islam. Therefore, the passage of the Women’s Protection Bill does not negate the possibility of Federal Shariat Court oversight in certain cases. Federal Shariat Court could be used for any issue that involves those parts of the Hudood Ordinance not moved to the secular law provisions, including gambling, liquor possession and drinking, and fornication in the false promise of marriage.

... Hudood Ordinances

11.43 A Human Rights Commission of Pakistan publication (accessed 12 September 2006) stated that:

“In 1979 the following four Hudood Ordinances were enforced:

1. Offence of Zina [ie rape, abduction, adultery and fornication] (Enforcement of Hudood) Ordinance, 1979
2. Offence of Qazf [ie false accusation of zina] (Enforcement of Hadd) Ordinance, 1979
3. Offence Against Property [ie theft] (Enforcement of Hudood) Ordinance, 1979

4. Prohibition [ie of alcohol and narcotics] (Enforcement of Hadd) Order, 1979”
[27b] (p1)

11.44 The Freedom House report Freedom in the World 2006, Pakistan, reported that “The Sharia court enforces the 1979 Hudood Ordinances, which criminalize nonmarital rape, extramarital sex, and several alcohol, gambling, and property offences, and provide for Koranic punishments, including death by stoning for adultery, as well as jail terms and fines...In part because of strict evidentiary standards, authorities have never carried out the Koranic punishments.” [19a]

11.45 The USSD Report 2007 noted that:

“Before the 2006 Women’s Protection Bill, the Hudood Ordinances provided Koranic punishments for violations of Shari’a (Islamic law), including amputation and death by stoning. Authorities did not use such punishments. [2h] (Section 1c) ... The bill reversed the most negative aspects of the Hudood Ordinances, which contained provisions for the punishment for rape and adultery and was generally used by family members to control their children’s marriage choices, by abusive husbands to control their wives, or by neighbors to settle personal scores. The new law brought the crime of rape under the jurisdiction of criminal rather than Islamic courts. While sex outside a marriage remained a crime, police lost the authority to investigate such claims under the new law, implementation of which was a problem because of the lack of training of police and lack of awareness of the bill’s technicalities. After the passage of the law, police were not allowed to arrest or hold a woman overnight at a police station without the permission of a civil court judge... After the passage of the Women’s Protection Bill, all cases against women were cited under it and not the Hudood Ordinances.” [2h] (Section 1e)

11.46 The USSD Report 2006 noted:

“...Sections of the Hudood Ordinances that remain in effect, such as those prohibiting gambling, alcohol, and some property offenses, are tried by ordinary criminal courts. The ordinances set strict standards of evidence, which discriminate between men and women and Muslims and non Muslims, for cases in which Koranic punishments are to be applied...For Hudood cases involving the lesser secular [Tazir] penalties, different weight is given to male and female testimony in matters involving financial and contractual obligations. The Hudood ordinances do not apply to non-Muslims, although non-Muslims can be implicated in cases that involve wrong-doing by Muslims”

...19.20 The USSD IRF Report 2006 observed that “The Hudood Ordinances criminalize rape, extramarital sex, property crimes, alcohol, and gambling. They apply equally to Muslims and non-Muslims. Hudood violations can be tried on either Qur’anic or secular standards of evidence. If Qur’anic standards are used, Muslim and non-Muslim and male and female testimony carries different weight, and harsh Qur’anic punishments can be applied.” [2a] (Section II: Status of Religious Freedom) (UK Home Office 2008, *Country of Origin Information Report: Pakistan*, 29 April, Section 11 – Attachment 1).

Information on police corruption in relation to homosexuality may also be relevant to other illegal activities. The report quotes information on the ‘Sodomylaws’ website which states that:

‘Arrests and trials do not occur ... As elsewhere with unenforced sodomy prescriptions, the existence of the law is a threat – a threat conducive to blackmail.

While the law is largely irrelevant to life in Pakistan, those acting in its name are not...Police recurrently take money and/or sex from those they know to be involved in same-sex sex (commercial or not). (Chapter on Pakistan by Stephen O Murray and Badruddin Khan in 'Sociolegal Control of Homosexuality' (UK Home Office 2008, *Country of Origin Information Report: Pakistan*, 29 April, Section 21.01 – Attachment 1).

Information in the report also notes that “heterosexual consensual sex outside of marriage continues to be criminalized” (section 23.08); however, amendments in the form of the Women’s Protection Act (WPA) included “dropping the death penalty and flogging for persons convicted of having consensual non-marital sex” (UK Home Office 2008, *Country of Origin Information Report: Pakistan*, 29 April, Section 23 – Attachment 1).

Previous research

The following research responses provide further relevant sourced information:

Questions 1 & 2 of *Research Response PAK32942*, dated 19 February 2008, provides recent information on Pakistani police (RRT Research & Information 2008, *Research Response PAK32942*, 19 February – Attachment 20);

Question 4 of *Research Response PAK31335*, dated 26 February 2007, provides information on police protection and police corruption, especially in Punjab (RRT Country Research 2007, *Research Response PAK31335*, 26 February – Attachment 43);

Research Response PAK17215, dated 28 February 2005, looks at obscenity laws in Pakistan (RRT Country Research 2005, *Research Response PAK17215*, 28 February – Attachment 44).

4. Is Time social magazine widely read and distributed in Pakistan?

No “Time” social magazine was found in a search of the available English-language sources. The well-known and worldwide *Time Magazine* does not have a social section dedicated to local areas. The publication *Sunday* is described in a February 2008 article as the “hot-selling weekly social magazine of Daily Times”. *The Daily Times* is a Lahore based national daily (Farooq, H. 2008, ‘Mehreen Syed crowned Sunday Face of 2007’, *Daily Times*, 3 February http://www.dailytimes.com.pk/default.asp?page=2008%5C02%5C03%5Cstory_3-2-2008_pg13_5 – Accessed 22 July 2008 – Attachment 45).

List of Sources Consulted

Internet Sources:

Government Information & Reports

UK Home Office <http://www.homeoffice.gov.uk/>

US Department of State <http://www.state.gov/>

United Nations

UNHCR Refworld <http://www.unhcr.org/cgi-bin/texis/vtx/refworld/rwmain>

Non-Government Organisations

Human Rights Watch <http://www.hrw.org/>
Amnesty International <http://www.amnesty.org>
International Crisis Group <http://www.crisisgroup.org>

International News & Politics

BBC News <http://news.bbc.co.uk>

Region Specific Links

Asian Centre for Human Rights website <http://www.achrweb.org/>

Pakistan Times <http://www.pakistantimes.net>

The Daily Times website <http://www.dailytimes.com.pk>

The Nation <http://www.nation.com.pk>

Topic Specific Links

Pakistan People's Party website <http://www.ppp.org.pk>

Search Engines

Google <http://www.google.com>

Databases:

FACTIVA (news database)

BACIS (DIAC Country Information database)

REFINFO (IRBDC (Canada) Country Information database)

ISYS (RRT Research & Information database, including Amnesty International, Human Rights Watch, US Department of State Reports)

RRT Library Catalogue

List of Attachments

1. UK Home Office 2008, *Country of Origin Information Report: Pakistan*, 29 April.
2. Khan, M. 2008, 'Three shot dead in separate incidents', *The Nation*, 18 July <http://www.nation.com.pk/pakistan-news-newspaper-daily-english-online/Regional/Karachi/18-Jul-2008/Three-shot-dead-in-separate-incidents> – Accessed 22 July 2008.
3. 'PPP worker among two killed' 2008, *The International News*, 17 July http://www.thenews.com.pk/daily_detail.asp?id=124608 – Accessed 22 July 2008.
4. Usher, G. 2008, 'Pakistan Amidst the Storms', *Middle East Report Online*, 27 June <http://www.merip.org/mero/mero062708.html> – Accessed 22 July 2008.
5. 'Pakistan People's Party and Pakistan Muslim League Nawaz leaders pessimistic over coalition' 2008, *Pakistan Daily*, 22 July <http://www.daily.pk/national/nationalnews/88-nationalnews/5893-pakistan-peoples-party-and-pakistan-muslim-league-nawaz-leaders-pessimistic-over-coalition.html> – Accessed 22 July 2008.
6. International Crisis Group 2008, 'CrisisWatch – Pakistan', updated 1 July http://www.crisisgroup.org/home/index.cfm?action=cw_search&l=1&t=1&cw_country=86&cw_date – Accessed 22 July 2008.
7. 'Shahbaz orders withdrawal of all cases against PPP workers' 2008, *Daily Times*, 20

July

http://www.dailytimes.com.pk/default.asp?page=2008%5C07%5C20%5Cstory_20-7-2008_pg7_8 – Accessed 22 July 2008.

8. 'MQM-PPP activists' tussle claims a life' 2008, *The International News*, 18 July http://www.thenews.com.pk/daily_detail.asp?id=124732 – Accessed 22 July 2008.
9. 'PM says workers like Javed Hafeez keeps PPP alive' 2008, *Associated Press of Pakistan*, 15 July http://www.app.com.pk/en_/index.php?option=com_content&task=view&id=45380 – Accessed 22 July 2008.
10. Zaidi, E. & Malik, I. 2008, 'PPP-backed union workers paralyse MCB operations', *The Nation*, 14 July. (FACTIVA)
11. 'Police arrests several in Karachi bomb blasts' 2008, *Khabrein.Info*, 8 July http://www.khabrein.info/index.php?option=com_content&task=view&id=15161&Itemid=57 – Accessed 22 July 2008.
12. 'Former MPA granted interim protection by SHC' 2008, *The International News*, 4 July http://www.thenews.com.pk/daily_detail.asp?id=122062 – Accessed 22 July 2008.
13. 'By-poll message' 2008, *The International News*, 28 June http://www.thenews.com.pk/daily_detail.asp?id=120955 – Accessed 22 July 2008.
14. 'Suicide Attacks in Punjab' 2008, South Asia Terrorism Portal, last updated 11 March <http://satp.org/satporgtp/countries/pakistan/Punjab/datasheet/suicideattack.htm> – Accessed 22 July 2008.
15. International Crisis Group 2008, 'Reforming Pakistan's Police', *Asia Report N° 157*, 14 July.
16. International Crisis Group 2008, 'After Bhutto's Murder: A Way Forward for Pakistan', *Asia Briefing N° 74*, 2 January.
17. US Department of State 2008, *Country Reports on Human Rights Practices for 2007 – Pakistan*, March.
18. 'PPP Warns Against Continued Spate of Violence Against The Party' 2008, Pakistan People's Party website, 14 February http://www.ppp.org.pk/news_event/feb/15-2-2008.html – Accessed 26 February 2008.
19. RRT Research & Information 2008, *Research Response PAK32938*, 26 February.
20. RRT Research & Information 2008, *Research Response PAK32942*, 19 February.
21. 'ANF warns hotels, clubs, guest houses owners to clamp down on immoral activities' 2008, *The Baluchistan Times*, 15 January. (FACTIVA)
22. Mir, A. 2008, 'Shoaib is no diabetic: PCB', *DNA*, 18 May. (FACTIVA)

23. 'Eye Spy' 2007, *Sunday* magazine website, 16 February, accessed through Internet Archive
http://web.archive.org/web/20070216215747/www.dailytimes.com.pk/sunday/default.aspx?c=eye_spy_a.html – Accessed 23 July 2008.
24. 'Review of Mohsin Hamid's *Moth Smoke*' 2001, BrothersJudd.com, 1 October
http://www.brothersjudd.com/index.cfm/fuseaction/reviews.detail/book_id/412/Moth%20Smoke.htm – Accessed 23 July 2008.
25. 'Pakistan's beloved kite festival lost to violence' 2008, *MSNBC*, source: *Associated Press*, 11 April <http://www.msnbc.msn.com/id/24072396/> – Accessed 22 July 2008.
26. 'Islamists attack festival in Pakistan University' 2007, *Indo-Asian News Service*, 15 April. (FACTIVA)
27. Subramanian, N. 2007, 'Kite-flying in the time of high spirits', *The Hindu*, 18 February <http://www.hindu.com/mag/2007/02/18/stories/2007021800150400.htm> – Accessed 22 July 2008.
28. Siddiqui, Z. 2006, 'Basant frenzy grips Lahore', *Dawn*, 13 March <http://www.dawn.com/2006/03/13/nat7.htm> – Accessed 22 July 2008.
29. Walsh, Declan 2006, 'Pakistani society looks other way as gay men party', *The Guardian*, 14 March <http://www.guardian.co.uk/pakistan/Story/0,,1730227,00.html> – Accessed 28 March 2006.
30. 'Sardari System, Mily Rule Ruined Country: MMA' 2005, *The Nation*, 11 February. (FACTIVA)
31. 'Too sad to celebrate New Year Night' 2008, *Dawn*, 1 January <http://www.dawn.com/2008/01/01/nat29.htm> – Accessed 22 July 2008.
32. Farooq, H. 2007, 'DHA to be stern on New Year', *Daily Times*, 29 December http://www.dailytimes.com.pk/print.asp?page=2007%5C12%5C29%5Cstory_29-12-2007_pg7_43 – Accessed 22 July 2008.
33. 'DHA Lahore' (undated), Mapsofworld.com
<http://www.mapsofworld.com/cities/pakistan/lahore/dha.html> – Accessed 22 July 2008.
34. 'Lahore's dancing girls fall on hard times' 2003, *Daily Times*, 22 August http://www.dailytimes.com.pk/default.asp?page=story_22-8-2003_pg7_15 – Accessed 22 July 2008.
35. 'Pakistani police arrest two men for holding dance party instead religious ceremony' 2002, *Associated Press*, 9 August. (FACTIVA)
36. Qaiser, A. 2007, 'Why have we come to this?', *Dawn*, 21 May <http://www.dawn.com/2007/05/21/fea.htm#4> – Accessed 22 July 2008.
37. 'Pakistan official in dilemma over dancing girls' 2006, *The Peninsula*, source: Internews, 20 November

- http://www.thepeninsulaqatar.com/Display_news.asp?section=World_News&subject=Pakistan+%26+Sub-Continent&month=November2006&file=World_News2006112084935.xml – Accessed 22 July 2008.
38. Bhutta, S. 2004, 'The good times keep on rolling', *Daily Times*, 24 January http://www.dailytimes.com.pk/default.asp?page=story_24-1-2004_pg7_10 – Accessed 22 July 2008.
 39. Hussain, Z. 2003, 'Pakistan forbids fashion shows', *The Times*, 14 November <http://www.timesonline.co.uk/tol/news/world/article1016825.ece> – Accessed 22 July 2008.
 40. 'Wateen Powers the Entertainment Scene' 2008, *Pakistan Times*, 5 April <http://pakistanimes.net/2008/04/08/national5.htm> – Accessed 23 July 2008.
 41. 'Party time!' 2008, Deep Thoughts web log, 8 March http://deephoughtsbyinsha.blogspot.com/2008_03_01_archive.html – Accessed 23 July 2008.
 42. Haider, Saqlain 2002, 'The Invisible Men', *DNA Magazine*, June, Global Gayz website <http://www.globalgayz.com/g-pakistan.html> – Accessed 5 July 2004.
 43. RRT Country Research 2007, *Research Response PAK31335*, 26 February.
 44. RRT Country Research 2005, *Research Response PAK17215*, 28 February.
 45. Farooq, H. 2008, 'Mehreen Syed crowned Sunday Face of 2007', *Daily Times*, 3 February http://www.dailytimes.com.pk/default.asp?page=2008%5C02%5C03%5Cstory_3-2-2008_pg13_5 – Accessed 22 July 2008.
 46. Khan, M. 2008, 'Former Bhutto bodyguard shot dead', *BBC News*, 23 July http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/south_asia/7520749.stm – Accessed 24 July 2008.
 47. 'Homosexuality apparently thriving in Pakistan despite severe punishments' 2004, *National Public Radio*, GlobalGayz website, 3 August <http://www.globalgayz.com/pak-news01-04.html#article19> – Accessed 22 July 2008.