

Doc. 11007

7 July 2006

Situation in Kazakhstan and its relations with the Council of Europe

Report

Political Affairs Committee

Rapporteur : Mr Tadeusz Iwiński, Poland, Socialist Group

Summary

The report notes that since its independence in 1991, Kazakhstan has achieved progress in building institutions of democracy, and welcomes its commitment to continue democratic reforms. At the same time, it notes a number of shortcomings hindering democratic process in the country, and calls on the authorities to take practical steps in some specific areas.

The report welcomes the consensus among political forces and the civil society of Kazakhstan in support of further transformations towards European standards, and that both the Government and the opposition are in favour of strengthening relations between Kazakhstan and the Council of Europe. It suggests stepping up the existing co-operation between the Council of Europe and Kazakhstan, with the emphasis on democracy, the rule of law and respect for human rights.

As far as the Assembly is concerned, the report suggests considering the Parliament of Kazakhstan as eligible to apply for a special guest status.

A. Draft Resolution

1. The Parliamentary Assembly refers to its [Resolution 1506](#) (2006) on External relations of the Council of Europe and reiterates its commitment to promoting democracy, the rule of law and respect for human rights beyond its current borders, in particular in neighbouring countries.
2. In this context, it attaches great importance to furthering democracy in Kazakhstan, which it considers to be one of the pillars of stability in the Euro-Asian region.
3. The Assembly notes that, since its independence in 1991, Kazakhstan has achieved progress in building institutions of modern and functional genuine democracy. It welcomes the commitment to further developing and strengthening democracy repeatedly stated by the political leadership of Kazakhstan.
4. The Assembly particularly welcomes the moratorium on the execution of the death penalty enacted by presidential decree in December 2003, and the ratification by Kazakhstan of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR) and the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (ICESCR).

5. On the other hand, the Assembly is aware of a number of considerable shortcomings still hindering the democratic process in Kazakhstan, including, inter alia, the difficulties of registering political parties, cases of criminal prosecution of opposition activists in relation to their political activity, and political and administrative pressure on the media supportive of the opposition. It is particularly worried by the murder, in February 2006, of Altynbek Sarsenbayev, and by the death under suspicious circumstances in November 2005, of Zamanbek Nurkadilov, two prominent leaders of the opposition.

6. Furthermore, the Assembly is concerned that the government and the opposition have so far failed to engage in a genuine political dialogue, which is an essential condition for building a sound and sustainable political system and for safeguarding and strengthening the unique inter-ethnic and inter-confessional accord that Kazakhstan enjoys. The Assembly calls on the political leaders from the government to show good will in making such a dialogue a reality, and is ready to contribute to it.

7. However, the Assembly is pleased to note that there is a broad consensus among political forces and the civil society of Kazakhstan in support of further transformations towards European standards, and that both the Government and the opposition are in favour of strengthening relations between Kazakhstan and the Council of Europe.

8. Kazakhstan already enjoys observer status with the European Commission for Democracy through Law (Venice Commission), and has expressed interest in participating in several Council of Europe conventions. Moreover, the Parliament of Kazakhstan has co-operated with the Assembly on the basis of an agreement concluded in April 2004. Members of the Parliament of Kazakhstan regularly attend the Assembly sessions. The First Euro-Asian Forum on Migration co-organised by the Assembly and the Parliament in September 2005 in Almaty was a concrete example of co-operation in facing common challenges.

9. The Assembly believes that this co-operation should be stepped up in order to provide Kazakhstan with better opportunities to rely on Council of Europe experience and expertise in the process of democratic transition, in particular, in the process of future constitutional reform. Such co-operation must be based on the firm commitment to, and be focused on achieving progress towards democracy, the rule of law and respect for human rights, which are Council of Europe fundamental values.

10. Therefore, the Assembly calls on the authorities of Kazakhstan to:

10.1. consider the possibility of becoming party to relevant Council of Europe legal instruments which are open to non-member states;

10.2. use more actively the experience of, and seek full membership of the Venice Commission;

10.3. engage in contacts, and consider opportunities for co-operation with other Council of Europe bodies and institutions.

11. The Assembly encourages the Senate and the Majilis of the Parliament of Kazakhstan to:

11.1. fully explore the possibilities offered by the agreement on co-operation between the Assembly and the Parliament of Kazakhstan, and participate more actively in various activities organised by the Assembly and its Committees;

11.2. play the leading role in promoting co-operation of various authorities and institutions of Kazakhstan with Council of Europe organs, bodies and institutions;

11.3. take the lead in promoting political reforms in Kazakhstan aimed at strengthening democracy, enhancing the rule of law and guaranteeing respect for human rights and political and civil freedoms, and review, in co-operation with the Venice Commission and in line with Council of Europe standards, the legislation concerning:

11.3.1. the administration of elections;

- 11.3.2. the establishment and the activities of political parties;
- 11.3.3. the freedom and independence of the media;
- 11.3.4. the freedom of demonstration and association;
- 11.3.5. the independence of the judiciary;
- 11.3.6. the local self-government;
- 11.4. take legislative action to achieve the complete abolition of the death penalty in Kazakhstan;
- 11.5. initiate a political dialogue with opposition political forces.
12. The Assembly encourages the Ombudsman of the Republic of Kazakhstan to develop contacts and co-operation with the Council of Europe Commissioner for Human Rights.
13. For its part, the Assembly is determined to develop co-operation with the Parliament of Kazakhstan in accordance with the 2004 agreement, and to contribute to political reforms and dialogue between various political forces in Kazakhstan.
14. Moreover, the Assembly considers that Rule 59 of its Rules of Procedure on Special Guests could be interpreted in a way that allows including Euro-Asian non-member states. It therefore believes that, as Euro-Asian state participating in the OSCE and signatory to ICCPR and ICESCR, Kazakhstan complies with the criteria for its Parliament to be eligible for applying for the Special Guest status as set forth by Rule 59 of the Rules of Procedure of the Assembly.
15. Finally, it stands ready to consider proposals for further developing co-operation between the Council of Europe and Kazakhstan on a new basis, in the form that the authorities of Kazakhstan believe to be the most appropriate.

B. Explanatory memorandum by Mr Iwinski, Rapporteur

I. Introduction

1. Kazakhstan became an independent State in December 1991 following the break-up of the USSR. Upon declaring independence, the Kazakhstan authorities stated their intention to build a democratic State whose key values would be the human being, human life and human rights and freedoms.
2. In fifteen years Kazakhstan has made substantial progress along that path. It now has the institutions needed to develop democracy, the basic components of civil society and machinery for harmonising the interests of different social groups.
3. Kazakhstan is a multi-ethnic and multi-faith country free of inter-ethnic and inter-religious conflict and rightly enjoys the reputation of being a pillar of stability in a vast region with a number of unstable flashpoints.
4. However, the transition to democracy has not been without difficulties, and has been hampered by a number of shortcomings, particularly in the areas of electoral legislation and practice, respect of the rights of the political opposition, freedom of expression and media freedom.
5. Back in 1995 Kazakhstan took successive steps to bring itself closer to the Council of Europe in order to draw on our Organisation's experience in democratic transitions.
6. In 1997, the Kazakhstan Parliament requested special guest status with the Parliamentary Assembly. In 1999, a request for observer status was lodged by the Speakers of the two parliamentary chambers.

7. As those two requests were not granted following the discussion at the Political Affairs Committee meeting in Istanbul in May 2001, the Kazakhstan Parliament concluded an agreement in 2004 on cooperation with the Parliamentary Assembly. Members from both chambers regularly attend Assembly sessions in Strasbourg. In September 2005, the Assembly and the Kazakhstan Parliament organised the first Euro-Asian forum on migration in Almaty. In March 2006, the Political Affairs Committee organised a hearing on Kazakhstan in Paris, in which representatives of the Parliament and the opposition participated.

8. In addition, Kazakhstan cooperates with the European Commission for Democracy through Law (Venice Commission), where it holds observer status, and has shown interest in acceding to certain Council of Europe conventions.

9. The purpose of the present report is to consider where Kazakhstan now stands in relation to its stated aim of establishing a society based on the values of democracy and the rule of law and characterised by respect for human rights, as well as what role might be played by the Council of Europe in contributing to that process.

10. In my capacity of rapporteur, I wish to thank the authorities of Kazakhstan, particularly the Senate and the Majilis, for the excellent organisation of my fact-finding visit to the country, which took place from 25 to 29 May 2006, and all the individuals I had the honour of meeting during my visit.

II. General information

11. Kazakhstan is in western Asia, between the central Asian countries (Turkmenistan, Uzbekistan, Kyrgyzstan), China and Russia. It has a surface area of 2.7 million km² (making it the world's 9th largest country), 4% of which lies to the west of the Ural river, forming part of the European continent. Its new capital is Astana (since 1997).

12. Kazakhstan has a population of 15 million people, belonging to over 130 different ethnic groups (53% Kazakhs, 30% Russians, as well as Ukrainians, Uzbeks, Koreans, Germans, Tatars, Uigurs, Chechens, Poles etc). There is no inter-ethnic conflict, and relations between the different ethnic groups can serve as an example not only for the countries in the region but also for a great many European States.

13. The state language is Kazakh, spoken by 65% of the population. Russian is used in all institutions and has the status of official language under the constitution (spoken by 95% of the population).

14. Kazakhstan is a secular State. The most widespread religion is Sunni Islam (47% of the population), followed by the Russian Orthodox Church (44%), Protestantism (2%) and other religions (the remaining 7%). There is no animosity between the followers of different faiths.

15. Kazakhstan has considerable natural assets (oil, gas, metals, other raw materials) whose exportation has ensured strong economic growth (GDP growth has been over 9% in the last five years) and softened the impact of the crisis suffered by the country following the break-up of the USSR. The standard of living is improving but there is still great disparity between incomes and disguised unemployment is sizeable. Corruption is one of the main socio-economic scourges.

III. Institutions

16. The first constitution of Kazakhstan as an independent State was adopted in January 1993. The second was approved by referendum in August 1995 and is still in force.

17. Under the constitution, which is very much inspired by the French model, Kazakhstan is a presidential republic. The President is elected by universal suffrage for a seven-year, once-renewable term. The current President, Nursultan Nazarbayev, was elected in December 2005 with 91% of the vote.

18. The constitution places the President in a strong position. He alone has the power to propose amendments to the constitution, appoint and dismiss members of the government,

dissolve the Parliament, propose referendums and appoint and dismiss the governors of the regions and of the cities of Astana and Almaty.

19. The bi-cameral Parliament, comprising the Senate and the Majilis, is the supreme representative and legislative organ of Kazakhstan.

20. The Senate has 39 members, 32 of whom are indirectly elected in the 14 regions and 2 cities with constitutional status by elected representatives of all the lower levels. The remaining 7 are appointed by the President. A senator's term is 6 years. Half of the Senate is renewed every 3 years. There are 5 senatorial committees.

21. The Majilis comprises 77 deputies and is elected by direct suffrage on a mixed majority/proportional representation basis for 5 years. The present Majilis, elected in September 2004¹, has two political groups representing the "OTAN" and "AIST" parties. The activities of the Majilis are organised into 7 committees.

22. The government of Kazakhstan is appointed by the President and accountable to him. The Prime Minister is appointed following consultation with and approval by the Parliament.

23. Kazakhstan is a unitary State sub-divided into 14 regions (*oblasti*) and 2 cities with special status, Astana and Almaty. State authority is exercised in the regions by *akims* (governors) representing the President and appointed by him. Local self-government is exercised through *maslikhats* (assemblies), made up of local deputies elected by direct suffrage for a term of 4 years.

24. The Constitutional Council, made up of representatives of the President of the Republic and the Speakers of the two Chambers of Parliament, ensures that laws and international treaties comply with the constitution of Kazakhstan before they are promulgated or ratified, and gives official interpretations of constitutional norms. It also arbitrates in the event of disputes over the regularity of presidential and legislative elections.

25. The constitution proclaims the principle of the independence of justice, the rule of law and the presumption of innocence. Judges are appointed for life but may be dismissed in the cases provided for by law. The uniform implementation of laws is ensured by the *Prokuratura*. It is planned to institute assize courts from 2007 onwards.

26. There is provision for capital punishment in the constitution but a moratorium on executions was introduced by presidential decree in December 2003 and life imprisonment was brought in.

27. There are two institutions upholding respect for human rights: the Ombudsman, instituted by presidential decree in 2002 and a presidential human rights committee with consultative status.

28. At present there are 12 officially constituted political parties in Kazakhstan's political arena, and there are others awaiting completion of registration formalities.

29. The voluntary sector numbers over 4,000 NGOs, some of which, within the Confederation of non-governmental organisations of Kazakhstan, are engaged in dialogue with the political authorities and, since 2003, have organised a Forum of citizens of Kazakhstan, in which the President takes part. There are a great many NGOs working actively in the human rights protection field, which are highly critical of the government.

30. The Assembly of peoples of Kazakhstan is a unique consultative institution intended to ensure that harmonious relations are maintained between the 130 ethnic groups, as well as peace between religions and stability in society. Under the auspices of the President of the Republic, who chairs it, it makes proposals for state policy on inter-ethnic relations on the basis of the principle of equality and, in particular, takes initiatives to promote the cultures and languages of the different ethnic groups.

IV. Recent political developments

31. The presidential election in December 2005 was the major political event of recent months. Four candidates ran against the incumbent, including Mr Tuyakbay, former Speaker of the Majilis, representing the "For a just Kazakhstan" movement, who described himself as the sole candidate of the democratic opposition. According to the official data, President Nazarbayev received 91% of votes and was declared elected after the first round of voting.

32. Throughout the election campaign and after the publication of the results opposition representatives accused the government of seeking to favour the outgoing President and prevent the opposition movements campaigning for their candidate, through intimidation and harassment and blocking opposition candidates' access to print and television media.

33. The Parliamentary Assembly was involved in the observing of the presidential election as part of an international team comprising *inter alia* representatives of the OSCE and the European Parliament. The Assembly representatives' conclusions bear out, at least partly, the criticism made by the opposition. In particular, the Assembly observer mission report² concluded that "despite improvements in the election administration, the presidential elections in Kazakhstan on 4 December 2005 did not meet a number of internationally accepted standards for democratic elections".

34. The observers stated that electoral legislation and practices required a substantial overhaul. The OSCE mission in Kazakhstan has already organised a series of round tables with Kazakhstan's electoral authorities, involving parliamentarians. It is to be recommended that Council of Europe bodies, such as the Venice Commission, are also involved in these projects.

35. On 24 March 2006 President Nazarbayev inaugurated the first meeting of the "State commission for the development and concretization of the programme of political reforms". Thirty political figures, including the leaders of all the officially registered political parties and representatives of civil society have been invited to take part in the work of the commission, which is to submit concrete proposals for reform by the end of 2006.

36. The leaders of the opposition parties making up the "For a just Kazakhstan" movement believe that the setting up of the commission is an attempt to simulate political dialogue. They have laid down prior conditions for their participation, requiring *inter alia* broader representation of the opposition movements within the commission, and are currently boycotting meetings. However, they do not rule out taking part.

37. The commission's activities are organised in five working groups on the following themes: broadening the prerogatives of the legislature; introducing local self-government; reforms in the area of justice and the law enforcement agencies; developing civil society; developing the constitution. Several draft laws are already being discussed, including a draft law on self-government. It is quite possible that the works of the State Commission will result in proposals for a new constitution. In this context, co-operation with the Venice Commission could prove to be helpful.

38. The political situation has been profoundly marked by two tragic deaths in recent times. In November 2005 one of the opposition figures, Zamanbek Nurkadilov, a former minister and governor of Almaty, was found dead from three gunshot wounds. The official inquiry concluded that it had been suicide, which was called into question by the opposition given the nature of the wounds.

39. In February 2006, Altynbek Sarsenbayev, co-chairman of the Nagyz Ak Zhol party, was assassinated together with his chauffeur and bodyguard. The authorities invited experts from the American FBI to take part in the investigation. Several suspects were arrested, including members of special services (national security committee), and the person alleged to have ordered the killing. The trial is currently under way.

40. The murder of Mr Sarsenbayev, a highly respected politician, caused a shock wave in society and badly tarnished Kazakhstan's image as a stable State. The opposition claimed that the crime was politically motivated and put the blame on the President's inner circle. A series of peaceful and unauthorised rallies were organised by the opposition; the organisers were arrested by the police and some were given prison sentences of up to 15 days. These cases highlight the need to revise legislation and practices where the guarantee of public freedoms is concerned.

41. One of the opposition criticisms levelled at the government is linked to the tightening up of the legal procedure for the establishment of political parties. Under current legislation 50,000 signatures must be collected in order to apply for the registration of a new party. Moreover, the founding congress of the new party must be attended by at least 1,000 participants. These requirements appear excessively stringent and restrict the right of association. They should be relaxed.

42. The other major area of concern is the situation of the media. While it is true that there is a great diversity of public and private information sources in Kazakhstan, the media which are critical of the authorities and sympathise with the opposition are frequently subjected to pressure from the authorities using various means, such as inspections of all kinds, seizures of print-runs, court action for libel and closures decreed by court decision.

43. There have been several cases of independent journalists being attacked and beaten up without the culprits ever being found. Kazakhstan's journalist community is still deeply marked by the tragic death, in July 2004, of Askhat Sharipzhanov, an independent journalist who had worked for media close to the opposition. Although the investigation concluded that he had died in a road traffic accident, the official version is disputed by his family and colleagues, who believe that his death was connected with his work.

44. Parliament is examining a reform of media legislation. The proposals laid before it by the Ministry of Information are aimed at imposing new restrictions on the media and have been criticised by both the international community (OSCE called for these amendments to be withdrawn) and representatives of Kazakhstan journalist organisations and civil society. An alternative bill, prepared by the Congress of journalists in conjunction with NGOs and aimed at making existing legislation more liberal, has also been laid before Parliament.

V. International situation

45. Since becoming independent, Kazakhstan has pursued a multi-dimensional foreign policy seeking stable and balanced relations with its neighbours, Russia and China, as well as with the United States and Europe.

46. Kazakhstan was admitted to the United Nations in March 1992. It has signed the main UN instruments in the human rights protection field, including the International covenant on civil and political rights and the International covenant on economic, social and cultural rights.

47. Kazakhstan is a member of the Commonwealth of Independent States (CIS), which it has been chairing since May 2006.

48. Kazakhstan participates in the Organisation for Security and Cooperation in Europe (OSCE) and its Parliamentary Assembly. The authorities of Kazakhstan have put forward their country's candidature to chair the OSCE in 2009.

49. The European Union cooperates with Kazakhstan on the basis of a partnership and cooperation agreement, in force since 1999.

50. In May 1994, Kazakhstan joined NATO's "Partnership for peace" programme. The Kazakhstan Parliament enjoys observer status with the Parliamentary Assembly of NATO.

51. Kazakhstan is developing regional cooperation and maintains stable relations with neighbouring States. It is part of the Shanghai Cooperation Organisation and the Organisation of the Islamic Conference, and chairs the Conference on Interaction and Confidence-Building Measures in Asia.

52. Kazakhstan has lodged a request for accession to the World Trade Organisation (WTO).

VI. Conclusions and proposals

53. Since independence, Kazakhstan has made considerable progress in setting up a viable modern State. The authorities' intention to see Kazakhstan progress along the road to

democracy, with clear reference to European experience in building democratic institutions and organising society, is manifestly backed by the country's people.

54. The transition to democracy is not without its difficulties, and certain recent trends are a cause for concern and call for vigilance on the part of those who wish to see Kazakhstan number among the nations attached to democratic values.

55. Stepping up the cooperation which already exists between the Council of Europe and Kazakhstan would allow this Eurasian country to benefit from the experience accumulated within our Organisation during the democratic transitions of central and east European countries.

56. This cooperation should also help to remedy shortcomings and counter negative trends in the democratic process.

57. As a closer relationship with the Council of Europe is strongly desired both by representatives of the political forces in power and by the opposition, it could also foster political dialogue between the country's different political movements.

58. In turn, Kazakhstan could serve as an example and share its experience where inter-ethnic and inter-faith relations are concerned.

59. For these reasons, stronger cooperation between the Council of Europe and Kazakhstan would be advantageous for both sides.

60. It goes without saying that this cooperation should be based on a firm commitment to democracy, the rule of law and respect for human rights, which are the Council of Europe's key values, and be geared to progressing towards those objectives.

61. It is for the authorities of Kazakhstan to confirm their country's interest in closer links with the Council of Europe, in the form they consider most appropriate. The Assembly should support them in this process.

62. For its part, the Assembly might decide, already at this stage, to interpret Rule 59 of its Rules of procedure, concerning special guests, in such a way as to include Eurasian States. Two Council of Europe member States, Turkey and Russia, belong geographically to both Europe and Asia and are therefore Eurasian. Strictly speaking, the three South Caucasus States, Armenia, Azerbaijan and Georgia are located in Asia, yet their membership of political Europe is no longer in doubt.

63. This being the case, Kazakhstan, as a Eurasian State participating in the OSCE and a signatory to the International covenant on civil and political rights and the International covenant on economic, social and cultural rights, would meet the criteria laid down in Rule 59, making it eligible to apply for special guest status with the Assembly.

APPENDIX

Programme of the visit to Kazakhstan by Mr Tadeusz Iwiński, Rapporteur of the Political Affairs Committee

24-30 May 2006

Wednesday 24 May

13.20 Departure from Frankfurt to Almaty (Lufthansa LH 648)

23.45 Arrival in Almaty (local time: CET + 4 h)

Thursday 25 May

06.30 Departure from Almaty to Astana (Air Astana 4L 991)

- 08.10 Arrival to Astana
- 10.00-10.45 Meeting with **Mrs Balieva, Minister of Justice**
- 11.00-11.45 Meeting with **Mr Zhumabekov, Chairman of the Central Electoral Commission**
- 12.00-12.45 Meeting with **members of the Constitutional Council**
- 15.0-15.45 Meeting with **Mr Baykadamov, Ombudsman of the Republic of Kazakhstan**
- 16.0-16.45 Meeting with **Mr Mukhamedzhanov, Speaker of the Majilis of the Parliament**
- 16.45-17.30 Meeting with **Heads of parliamentary groups of political parties**

Friday 26 May

- 10.00-10.45 Meeting with **Mr Kopeyev, Vice-President of the Senate of the Parliament**
- 11.00-12.30 Meeting with **Mrs Sivrukova, Chair of the Confederation of Non-governmental organisations**, and representatives of the Kazakh and International NGOs
- 12.30-14.00 Lunch offered by **Mr Kopeyev, Vice-President of the Senate of the Parliament**
- 14.15-15.15 Meeting with **Mr Aliev, Head of Secretariat of the Assembly of the Peoples of Kazakhstan**, and representatives of national minorities
- 15.30-16.30 Meeting with **representatives of religious communities**
- 16.30-17.30 Meeting with **Mr Babichev, Ambassador of Russia**
- 17.30 Departure to the airport
- 19.00 Departure from Astana to Shymkent (Air Company SCAT DV 804)
- 20.40 Arrival in Shymkent

Saturday 27 May

- 09.00-10.00 Meeting with **Mr Abishev, Acting Akim (Governor) of South-Kazakhstan Region**
- 10.00-11.00 Meeting with **Mr Kosmambetov and Mr Sarsenov, members of the Majilis representing the South-Kazakhstan Region, and Mr Mirzakhmetov, Head of the Maslikhat (Regional Assembly) of the South-Kazakhstan Region**
- 11.00-11.30 Participation in the opening of an exhibition dedicated to Adam Mickiewicz
- Meeting with representatives of the Polish diaspora
- 12.30-13.30 Visit to Otyrar municipality, **meetings with Mr Kurtaev, Akim, and elected representatives of the Otyrar district**
- 15.00-18.00 Visit to Turkestan municipality, **meetings with Mr Bektaev, Akim of Turkestan municipality, and elected representatives**
- 20.00 Return to Shymkent

Sunday 28 May

09.45 Departure from Shymkent to Almaty (Air Astana 4L 972)

11.25 Arrival to Almaty

14.00-16.00 Meeting with **Mr Matayev, President of the Union of journalists of Kazakhstan**, and representatives of the media

16.00-17.45 **Press Conference** and interviews at National Press Club

18.00-19.30 Meeting with **Mr Baimenov, Chairman, "Ak Zhol" Democratic party**

Monday 29 May

10.00-11.00 Meeting with **Mr Tuyakbai, Chairman, "For Just Kazakhstan" movement**
(58, Kabanbay Batyr st., Almaty)

11.00-11.30 Participation at the co-ordination meeting of NGOs "Kazakhstan from the Moratorium on Death Penalty toward the Adoption of the Second Optional Protocol to the ICCPR"

11.30-13.00 Meeting with representatives of political parties
(Hotel Kazakhstan, Conference room)

Mr Zhakiyanov,

Mr Zhandosov, Co-Chair, "True Ak Zhol" Democratic party

Mr Kozhakhmetov, Chair of Political Council, "Alga" party

Mr Kosanov, Secretary General, "For Just Kazakhstan" movement, Chair of Executive Committee, People's Republican party

13.00-14.30 Lunch with relatives of the late MM. Nurkadilov, Sarsenbayev and Sharipzhanov

14.30-16.30 Meeting with editors of independent media

Mr Bapi, "Aina Plus" newspaper

Mrs Dyrkina, "Respublika" newspaper

Mr Mizinov, Zonakz.net internet site

16.30-18.00 Meeting with representatives of NGOs

Mrs Kaleeva, President, "Adil Soz" Foundation

Mrs Taukina, President, "Journalists in Danger" Foundation

Mrs Toregozhina, "Kahar" youth movement

18.30-20.30 Briefing with representatives of Diplomatic Missions accredited in Almaty organised by **Mr Sokołowski, Ambassador of Poland**

Tuesday 30 May

03.00 Departure for Frankfurt

Reporting Committee: Political Affairs Committee.

Reference to Committee: 2826, 27.05.03

Draft resolution unanimously adopted by the Committee on 27 June 2006

Members of the Committee : Mr Abdülkadir **Ateş** (Chairman), Mr Konstantion Kosachev (Vice-Chairman), Mr Zsolt Németh (Vice-Chairman), Mr Giorgi Bokeria (Vice-Chairman), Mr Miloš **Aligrudić**, Ms Birgir Ármannsson, Mr Giuseppe Arzilli, Mr Claudio **Azzolini**, Mr Miroslav Beneš, Mr Radu-Mircea Berceanu, Mr Gerardo Bianco, Mr Alexandër **Biberaj**, Mr Luc **Van den Brande**, Ms Beáta Brestenká, Ms Anna Čurdová, Mr Noel Davern, Mr Dumitru **Diacov**, Mr Michel Dreyfus-Schmidt, Mr Adri Duivesteijn, Ms Josette **Durrieu**, Mr Mikko **Elo**, Mr Joan Albert Farré Santuré, Mr Per-Kristian **Foss**, Mr Jean-Charles **Gardetto**, Mr Charles Goerens, Mr Daniel Goulet, Mr Andreas **Gross**, Mr Jean-Pol Henry, Mr Joachim **Hörster**, Mr Renzo Innocenti (alternate: Ms Tana **de Zulueta**), Mr Ivan Ivanovski, Mr Tadeusz **Iwiński**, Mr Elmira Jahić, Mr Miloš **Jeftić**, Mr Oleksandr Karpov, Mr Oskars Kastēns, Mr Yuriy Kostenko, Ms Darja Lavtižar-Bebler, Mr Göran **Lindblad**, Mr Younal **Loutfi**, Mr Mikhail Margelov, Mr Tomasz **Markowski**, Mr Dick Marty, Mr Frano Matušić, Mr Murat **Mercan**, Mr Jean-Claude Mignon (alternate: Mr Denis **Badré**), Mr Marko **Mihkelson**, Ms Nadezhda Mikhailova (alternate: Mr Ivan **Ivanov**), Mr **Mirzazada**, Mr João Bosco Mota Amaral, Ms Natalia Narochitskaya (alternate: M. Ilyas **Umakhanov**), Ms Carina **Ohlsson**, Mr Boris Oliynyk, Mr Theodoros Pangalos, Ms Elsa Papadimitriou, Ms Porteiro Garcia, Mr Christos Pourgourides (alternate: Mr Andros **Kyprianou**), Mr Gordon Prentice (alternate: Mr John **Austin**), Mr Gabino Puche, Mr Lluís Maria de Puig, Mr Jeffrey Pullicino Orlando, Lord **Russell-Johnston**, Mr Peter Schieder, Mr Ingo **Schmitt**, Mr Adrian **Severin**, Ms Hanne **Severinsen**, Mr Samad **Seyidov**, Mr Leonid Slutsky, Mr Michael Spindelegger, Mr Rainer **Steenblock**, Mr Zoltán **Szabó**, Baroness Taylor of Bolton (alternate: Lord **Tomlinson**), Mr Mehmet **Tekelioğlu**, Mr Tigran **Torosyan**, Mr José Vera Jardim, Ms Biruté Vesaitė, Mr Varujan Vosganian, Mr David **Wilshire**, Mr Bart van Winsen, Mr Wolfgang Wodarg, Ms Renate Wohlwend, Mr Marco Zacchera, Mr Krzysztof **Zaremba**.

Ex-officio: MM. Mátyás **Eörsi**, Mats Einarsson,

N.B. : The names of the members who took part in the meeting are printed in **bold**

Head of the Secretariat : Mr Perin

Secretaries to the Committee: Mrs Nachilo, Mr Chevtchenko, Mrs Sirtori-Milner, Ms Pieter

¹ The Assembly took part in the observation of parliamentary elections in September 2004 (See AS/Bur/Kaz (2004) 3).

² See [Doc 10789](#), 20 January 2006.