

COUNCIL OF EUROPE



CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE

ACFC/SR/IV(2016)006

**Fourth Report submitted by the Russian Federation pursuant to Article
25, paragraph 2 of the Framework Convention for the Protection of
National Minorities**

(Received on 20 December 2016)

**FOURTH PERIODIC REPORT SUBMITTED BY THE RUSSIAN FEDERATION ON
IMPLEMENTATION OF THE COUNCIL OF EUROPE**

FRAMEWORK CONVENTION FOR THE PROTECTION OF NATIONAL MINORITIES

FOURTH REPORT SUBMITTED BY THE RUSSIAN FEDERATION PURSUANT TO ARTICLE
25, PARAGRAPH 1 OF THE FRAMEWORK CONVENTION FOR THE PROTECTION OF
NATIONAL MINORITIES

Moscow, 2016

CONTENTS

SUMMARY OF THE REPORT	4
PREAMBLE	7
PART I. THE MAIN DIRECTIONS OF IMPLEMENTATION OF THE FRAMEWORK CONVENTION FOR THE PROTECTION OF NATIONAL MINORITIES IN THE RUSSIAN FEDERATION	10
1. Development of civil society and interaction between non-governmental (non-profit) organizations with state authorities.....	10
2. The indigenous small-numbered peoples of the Russian Federation	13
3. Ombudsmen for rights of indigenous small-numbered peoples.....	19
4. The socio-economic and ethnocultural development of the Roma	23
5. The Crimean Tatars and other national minorities living in the Republic of Crimea.....	25
PART II. ARTICLE-FOR-ARTICLE COMMENTARY TO THE FRAMEWORK CONVENTION FOR THE PROTECTION OF NATIONAL MINORITIES TAKING INTO ACCOUNT THE RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE THIRD MONITORING CYCLE	29
Articles 1, 2 of the Framework Convention.....	29
Article 3 of the Framework Convention	30
Article 4 of the Framework Convention	31
Article 5 of the Framework Convention	35
Article 6 of the Framework Convention	40
Article 7 of the Framework Convention	48
Article 8 of the Framework Convention	51
Article 9 of the Framework Convention	52
Article 10 of the Framework Convention	54
Article 11 of the Framework Convention	58
Article 12 of the Framework Convention	58
Article 14 of the Framework Convention	62
Article 15 of the Framework Convention	64
Article 16, 17 of the Framework Convention	66
Article 18 of the Framework Convention	66
CONCLUSION	67
APPENDIXES.....	68

SUMMARY OF THE REPORT

1. This report is the national report submitted by the Russian Federation on implementation of provisions of the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities (“the Framework Convention”) within the fourth monitoring cycle and covers the period from 2011 to 2015 after the third national report was submitted. This report was drawn up by the Federal Agency for Ethnic Affairs in cooperation with other state authorities of the Russian Federation and civil society institutions.
2. The Russian Federation is a multinational and multireligious state. The representatives from 193 ethnic groups, speaking 277 languages and dialects, live in the Russian Federation¹.
3. Many religions are practiced in the Russian Federation, with Christianity, Islam, Judaism, Buddhism being the most common. The State guarantees freedom of worship.
4. The Russian Federation focuses on inter-ethnic and inter-religious relations, takes measures to harmonize them, as well as to prevent extremism, xenophobia, to ensure the constitutional rights and freedoms of the Russian citizens regardless of their nationality, religion, political and other opinions and beliefs.
5. Russia ensures protection of rights of the Russian citizens, including representatives of national minorities, facilitates their ethnocultural development and maintains the national and linguistic identity, unimpeded access to education, participation in public associations, use of mass media and exercise of voting rights. The Russian Federation enforces the policy towards national minorities within implementation of the provisions of Framework Convention ETS No. 157 for the Protection of National Minorities (“the Framework Convention”).
6. The key approaches to the state national policy of the Russian Federation towards national minorities, achievements in this area, as well as in the area of improvement of the Russian legislation on prevention of, responding to and suppression of inter-ethnic intolerance or hatred are specified in the thematic sections of the report. A special emphasis is given in the report to preservation and development of the culture of the peoples of the Russian Federation as well as maintenance of linguistic diversity.
7. The activity of the state authorities of the Russian Federation on protection of national minorities is based on the coherent legal

¹ According to the All-Russian Population Census conducted in 2010
http://www.gks.ru/free_doc/new_site/perepis2010/croc/perepis_itogi1612.htm

and regulatory framework, including the Constitution of the Russian Federation, federal laws, other legal acts as well as regional legislation of the constituent entities of the Russian Federation. The report contains information on the areas of the state authorities' activity on improvement of the legislation and the public administration system in order to improve the situation of national minorities and their comfortable existence in the Russian Federation.

8. The Federal Agency for Ethnic Affairs was established under the Government of the Russian Federation by Decree of the President of the Russian Federation No. 168 of 31 March 2015 to perform the following functions:

- to develop and implement the state national policy, to ensure statutory regulations and to provide public services in the state national policy;
- to implement measures aimed at enhancing the unity of the multinational people of the Russian Federation (Russian nation), to ensure inter-ethnic harmony, ethnocultural development of the peoples of the Russian Federation, to protect the rights of national minorities and indigenous small-numbered peoples of the Russian Federation;
- to interact with national and cultural autonomies, Cossack societies and other civil society institutions;
- to develop and implement the state and federal target programs in the area of inter-ethnic relations;
- to control the enforcement of the state national policy;
- to implement the state monitoring in the area of inter-ethnic and inter-religious relations;
- to prevent any forms of discrimination on racial, ethnic, religious or linguistic grounds;
- to prevent attempts to incite racial, ethnic and religious dissension, hatred or hostility;

A special emphasis is given in this report to cooperation of the state authorities of the Russian Federation with non-governmental organizations, including non-profit organizations (NPOs).

9. The Russian Federation recognizes and respects the leading role of civil society in development and enforcement of the national and ethnocultural state policy.

10. Separate sections of the report are devoted to practical steps for the development of ethnic culture, ethnically-oriented education, mass media broadcasting in minority languages.
11. It is also important that the financing of the ethnocultural activities, support of indigenous small-numbered peoples, including those living under extreme conditions in the North, Siberia and the Far East of the Russian Federation, to maintain and develop native languages, increase access to quality education and health care is stipulated in the budget of the Russian Federation, as well as the budgets of the constituent entities and municipalities.
12. It is emphasized herein that the Russian Federation considers the Framework Convention as a real instrument to ensure protection of rights of national minorities, and takes into account its provisions during enforcement of the state policy towards national minorities. The Russian Federation also takes into account the relevant international commitments undertaken, and recommendations of the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe received following the third stage of monitoring of implementation of the provisions of the Framework Convention. The Framework Convention is implemented, *inter alia*, by adoption and implementation of all strategic planning documents in the Russian Federation. Not only tools for implementation of the national policy were represented, but the vector of further development was specified in the documents listed above.
13. The third opinion on the Russian Federation adopted by the Advisory Committee of the Framework Convention on 24 November 2011 was published on official sites of the relevant federal state authorities and sent to the authorities of the constituent entities of the Russian Federation for its elaboration, consideration and implementation at practice.

PREAMBLE

1. According to the Constitution of the Russian Federation, the regulation of rights of national minorities is under the jurisdiction of the Russian Federation, and the protection of rights of national minorities is under the joint jurisdiction of the Russian Federation and the constituent entities of the Russian Federation (Article 71 (c), Article 72 (b) of the Constitution of the Russian Federation). The responsibility of the Russian Federation and the constituent entities of the Russian Federation is based on the generally accepted principles of democracy as well as principles of equal rights and self-determination of the peoples of the Russian Federation (Article 1 § 1, Article 5 § 3 of the Constitution of the Russian Federation), obligation of the Russian Federation to protect human and civil rights and freedoms in its territory regardless of nationality (Article 19 § 2 of the Constitution of the Russian Federation), obligation of the Russian Federation to preserve native languages of the peoples of the Russian Federation (Article 68 § 3 of the Constitution of the Russian Federation, Article 8 of Federal Law No. 74-FZ of 17 June 1996 *On National and Cultural Autonomy*, Article 14 of Federal Law No. 273-FZ of 29 December 2012 *On Education in the Russian Federation*).
2. Ban on propaganda and agitation causing social, racial, national or religious hatred and hostility as well as propaganda of social, racial, national, religious or linguistic supremacy, is directed toward the protection of rights of national minorities (Article 29 § 2 of the Constitution of the Russian Federation, Article 1 § 1 of Federal Law No. 114-FZ of 25 July 2002 *On Combating Extremist Activity*, Article 282 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation No. 63-FZ of 13 June 1996).
3. An expansive interpretation of the term “national minority” is used in this report, and “rights of national minorities” mean the rights of ethnic communities in general and the rights of an individual citizen of the Russian Federation claiming to belong to a national minority in the territory of the Russian Federation under the principle of self-determination. “The protection of rights of national minorities” in the Russian Federation means not only prevention, detection and suppression of unlawful extremist acts, but ensuring of exercise of rights of national minorities on preservation of their traditions, culture, language and identity.
4. The Russian Federation ratified the Framework Convention more than 15 years ago, and now the Framework Convention is an integral part of the Russian legal system. Improvement of the legal and regulatory framework in protection of rights of national minorities is one of the priorities of the state national policy of the Russian Federation.
5. The period, since the previous report was submitted within the third monitoring cycle, has been characterized by a stepping-up of efforts of the state and civil society to improve the legal coverage and preserve the resource provision of activities in the area of inter-ethnic relations, to establish the inter-agency cooperation and coordination.

6. The organizational and legal fundamentals for activities of the law enforcement agencies to enforce the legislation related to inter-ethnic relations, to prevent and investigate the extremist crimes have been strengthened.
7. The state authorities of the Russian Federation focus on meeting the socioeconomic and ethnocultural needs of national minorities in culture, science and education.
8. Cultural wealth of the Russian Federation consists in diversity of the peoples inhabiting its territory, and, according to President of the Russian Federation V.V. Putin, the national question is fundamental for Russia (Article of V.V. Putin. Russia: The National Question, - 23 January 2012, *Nezavisimaya Gazeta*). The understanding of importance of these processes determines the state policy in preservation and development of languages of peoples of the Russian Federation, their identity, study of the culture of the various ethnic communities, harmonization of inter-ethnic relations.
9. Russia is a unique state, occupying a significant part of the Eurasian continent. The total area of its territory is 17,125,407 sq. km, where 146,267,288 people live.
10. Particularities of the geographical position of the Russian State, the specific character of historical, political and legal processes of its formation led to the ethnic and cultural diversity of the population. Russia was historically formed as a multinational state where the Russians were a systemically important core². However “most peoples of Russia have been formed in the territory of the Russian state for centuries”³ what determines their belonging to indigenous small-numbered peoples of the Russian Federation. At the same time, the Russian legislation provides for the special status of indigenous small-numbered peoples, whose number does not exceed 50,000 persons (Article 69 of the Constitution of the Russian Federation).
11. Every people has contributed and seamlessly participated in the formation of the Russian national identity, and the Russian culture has absorbed the traditions and ethnic culture of the peoples of Russia. Thus, maintenance of the unity in diversity is a long-term vector of development of the national policy in Russia.
12. The relevant sections of the report contain information on the basic area of enforcement of the state national policy of the Russian Federation and implementation of the provisions of the Framework Convention.
13. During the reporting period, considerable work has been performed in the Russian Federation to improve the activity of public institutions in the field of preventing and combating racial discrimination, ethnic dissension by various forms of extremism. The federal and regional legislation has been considerably

² Paragraph 11 of the Strategy of the State National Policy of the Russian Federation for the Period until 2025 — approved by Decree of the RF President No. 1666 of 19 December 2012

³ Paragraph 9 of Strategy of the State National Policy of the Russian Federation for the Period until 2025 — approved by Decree of the RF President No. 1666 of 19 December 2012

developed. Initiatives in the adoption of new regulatory acts were accompanied by public social discussion, which made it possible to take into account the views of representatives of civil society, including those representing the interests of national minorities, as much as possible.

14. Formulation of the state national policy priorities, consolidated in the federal strategic planning documents, including the above-mentioned Strategy, was completed.

15. After the Strategy of the State National Policy of the Russian Federation for the Period until 2025 had been approved by Decree of the RF President No. 1666 of 19 December 2012, the regional strategies and implementation plans, taking into account regional peculiarities and differences, were adopted in the constituent entities of the Russian Federation.

16. The basic principles of the Strategy include in particular:

- ensuring of the rights of indigenous small-numbered peoples (small ethnic communities), including support of their economic, social and cultural development, protection of original habitat and traditional way of life;
- ensuring of the rights of national minorities (subparagraphs h), i) of paragraph 19 of the Strategy).

17. According to Federal Law No. 284-FZ of 22 October 2013 *On Amendments to Certain Legislative Acts of the Russian Federation with regard to Determination of the Powers and Responsibilities of State Authorities of the Constituent Entities of the Russian Federation, Local Authorities and their Officials in the Area of Inter-Ethnic Relations*, the powers of the authorities of the constituent entities of the Russian Federation include a set of measures to ensure the state guarantees of the equality of human and civil rights, freedoms and legitimate interests, regardless of race, nationality, language, religion and other circumstances. The regional authorities are empowered to preserve and develop the ethnic and cultural diversity of peoples, their languages and culture, protect the rights of national minorities, ensure social and cultural adaptation of migrants, prevent inter-ethnic conflicts. The law also stipulates that the chief executive of a municipality or the local administration may be dismissed in case mass violation of human rights and freedoms on racial, ethnic, religious grounds, or restriction of the rights on racial, national, linguistic or religious grounds occurred.

PART I. THE MAIN DIRECTIONS OF IMPLEMENTATION OF THE FRAMEWORK CONVENTION FOR THE PROTECTION OF NATIONAL MINORITIES IN THE RUSSIAN FEDERATION

1. Development of civil society and interaction between non-governmental (non-profit) organizations with state authorities

1.1. As of 31 December 2015, 223,551 non-profit organizations were registered in the Russian Federation, including:

public associations — 100,405;

religious organizations — 28,465;

other non-profit organizations — 90,464;

branches of international organizations, foreign non-profit non-governmental organizations — 11.

1.2. 77 political parties and their 4,129 structural subdivisions were also registered. The establishment of political parties on ethnic grounds is not allowed in the Russian Federation. At the same time, the interests of indigenous small-numbered peoples will be represented by elected representatives from different parties of indigenous small-numbered peoples on the elections to the State Duma of the Federal Assembly of the Russian Federation of VII convocation held on 18 September 2016:

- Grigoriy Ledkov (Nenets, the Yamal-Nenets Autonomous Area, a single-mandate constituency);

- Tatiana Gogoleva (Mansi, Yugra, by the party list).

Ruslan Provodnikov (Mansi, Yugra, by the party list) became leader No. 1 of the Beloyarskaya group in the list of members of the Duma of the Khanty-Mansi Autonomous Area — Yugra.

Yeremey Aypin (Khanty, Yugra), the head of the Assembly of representatives of indigenous small-numbered peoples of the North in the Duma of the Khanty-Mansi Autonomous Area, entered into the Tyumen Regional Duma by the party list.

Valeriy Vengo (Nenets, the Krasnoyarsk Territory, the single-mandate constituency), leader of constituency No. 23, entered the Legislative Assembly of the Krasnoyarsk Territory of the third convocation (Taimyr Dolgan-Nenets Municipal District) according to the results of elections.

Tatiana Romanova (Itelmes, Kamchatka Territory, a single-mandate constituency) and Galina Kravchenko (Itelmes, Kamchatka Territory) became the deputies of the Legislative Assembly of the Kamchatka Territory of the third convocation.

Elena Kolesova (Evenk, Amur Region) was elected in the Zeysky District Council of People's Deputies of the Sixth Convocation in the Amur Region, in a single-mandate constituency, she gained 23.72% of votes.

Anatoly Tyneru (Chukchi, Chukotka Autonomous Area) and Valentina Keulkut (Chukchi, Chukotka Autonomous Area) became deputies in the Eastern three-mandate constituency No. 1 and the Western three-mandate constituency No. 2 in the Chukotka Autonomous Area, correspondingly.

1.3. Socially oriented non-profit organizations play significant role in the system of civil society and the activities of state authorities of the Russian Federation.

1.4. According to Article 2 of Federal Law No. 7-FZ of 12 January 1996 *On Non-Profit Organizations*, non-profit organizations carrying out activities aimed at solving social problems, development of civil society in the Russian Federation, as well as the activities stipulated by this law, including such as the development of international cooperation, preservation and protection of identity, culture, languages and traditions of the peoples of the Russian Federation; social and cultural adaptation and integration of migrants are recognized as socially oriented non-profit organizations.

1.5. The current legislation stipulates that the state authorities and local authorities provide, as a matter of priority, targeted support for socially oriented non-profit organizations, including those protecting the legitimate interests of national minorities in the Russian Federation.

1.6. Socially oriented non-profit organizations are provided with the state and municipal preferences and benefits.

1.7. Socially oriented non-profit organizations are supported in the following forms:

financial, property, information, advisory support, as well as support in the field of training, additional vocational education of employees, volunteers of socially oriented non-profit organizations;

socially oriented non-profit organizations are provided with tax and duty exemptions.

1.8. The state authorities in a number of the constituent entities of the Russian Federation adopted the regulatory acts determining the guiding principles and forms of interaction between the state authorities of the constituent entities of the Russian Federation, the local authorities and non-profit organizations, including those related to the implementation of regional target programs, social and civic initiatives, volunteering activities, financial and other support.

1.9. The development and improvement of the activities of civil society institutions operating in the environment of the indigenous small-numbered peoples is a special direction in implementation of the state policy towards national minorities.

1.10. Communities are one of the most effective form of self-government of indigenous small-numbered peoples.

1.11. Communities are the voluntary associations of citizens, belonging to the indigenous small-numbered peoples of the Russian Federation, and united on the basis of kinship and (or) an area basis for the purpose of defending their original habitat, preserving and developing traditional ways of life, economy, trades and culture.

1.12. As of September 2015, 1,296 communities of indigenous small-numbered peoples are registered in the territory of the Russian Federation.

1.13. The institution of commissioners for rights of indigenous small-numbered peoples (ombudsmen) has been developed in the Russian Federation in recent years.

1.14. Positions on the rights of indigenous small-numbered peoples have been established in the Sakha Republic (Yakutia), Kamchatka and Krasnoyarsk Areas. More information about the ombudsmen's activity is presented in section 5 hereof. The institution of authorized representatives of indigenous small-numbered peoples before the state authorities effectively operates in the Republic of Buryatia, Khabarovsk, Sakhalin and Sverdlovsk Areas.

1.15. Representatives of the Russian organizations of indigenous small-numbered peoples are the members of international organizations, have the status of permanent members and observers in a number of intergovernmental bodies. Representatives of indigenous small-numbered peoples are included in the Council under the President of the Russian Federation on International Relations, Expert Advisory Board under the Interdepartmental Working Group on Inter-Ethnic Relations under the Government of the Russian Federation. Moreover, they are included into the expert advisory boards and the interdepartmental commissions at the level of the supreme state authorities of the constituent entities of the Russian Federation and participate in matters that affect them.

1.16. The State Commission on Arctic Development (“the State Commission”) created by Decree of the President of the Russian Federation No. 50 of 3 February 2015 also pays considerable attention to the measures related to preservation and extension of the opportunities for traditional way of life of indigenous small-numbered peoples of the Arctic zone, improvement of the quality of life and lifetime of the indigenous small-numbered peoples of the region. The President of the All-Russian Public Organization “Russian Association of Indigenous Peoples of the North, Siberia and Far East of the Russian Federation” was included into the presidium of the State Commission and has been actively involved in its work.

1.17. An interdepartmental working group on the implementation of the state policy towards the indigenous small-numbered peoples living in the Arctic zone of the Russian Federation led by the head of Federal Agency for Ethnic Affairs of the Russian Federation (FAEA of Russia) has been established and operates under the State Commission upon an initiative of FAEA of Russia. A special interdepartmental working group was also established under FAEA of Russia in order to implement the Concept of Sustainable Development of indigenous small-numbered peoples of the North, Siberia and Far East of the Russian Federation. The representatives of

indigenous small-numbered peoples are actively involved in the work of both groups.

1.18 Similar events take place in the Civic Chamber of the Russian Federation, for instance, a round table meeting on the topic: “The development of legislation to ensure the rights of indigenous small-numbered peoples of the North, Siberia and the Far East: Problems and Prospects”. The meeting was organized by the Association of Indigenous Peoples of the North, Siberia and Far East of the Russian Federation, Union of Communities of Indigenous Peoples of the North, Siberia and Far East of the Russian Federation with the support of the Civic Chamber of the Russian Federation, the International Working Group for Indigenous Affairs. Discussion of the legislation on the rights of indigenous small-numbered peoples of the North, Siberia and the Far East: implementation and development prospects, as well as the practice of law enforcement and the main gaps were included into the agenda. The representatives of the federal state executive and legislative authorities, indigenous small-numbered peoples of the North, Siberia and Far East of the Russian Federation were invited to participate therein.

1.19. The joint fruitful work of all levels of state authority and civil society institutions enables to ensure favorable environment for the sustainable development of the indigenous small-numbered peoples of the North, Siberia and Far East of the Russian Federation, preservation and increase of their cultural heritage, which is an integral part of the national heritage of Russia.

1.20. The Russian Federation respects and supports non-governmental (non-profit) organizations which carry out their statutory activities under the Russian law.

1.21. The Advisory Council on Affairs of National and Cultural Autonomies, comprising the heads of all federal national and cultural autonomies, including representatives of indigenous small-numbered peoples of the Russian Federation, was created under FAEA of Russia in order to develop effective and evidence-based measures aimed at strengthening the unity of the Russian nation, promoting culture of inter-ethnic dialog and the Russian multinational culture, as well as preparation of proposals on improvement of legislation in the state national policy.

2. The indigenous small-numbered peoples of the Russian Federation

2.1. The indigenous small-numbered peoples of the Russian Federation, whose number does not exceed 50,000 persons and who preserve their traditional way of life, economy and trades are under the special state protection. They mainly live in the Far North, Siberia and Far East of the Russian Federation.

2.2. The Russian State policy towards indigenous small-numbered peoples is focused on the preservation and ensuring of sustainable development through the strengthening of social and economic potential of indigenous small-numbered peoples, the preservation of original habitat, traditional way of life and cultural values as a result of targeted state support and by mobilizing the internal resources of indigenous small-numbered peoples.

2.3. For the period from 2002 to 2010, their total number increased by 3% and reached 316,000 people⁴.

2.4. The Russian Federation has the Unified List of indigenous small-numbered peoples of the Russian Federation approved by Resolution of the Government of the Russian Federation No. 255 of 24 March 2000, which recognizes 47 peoples as indigenous small-numbered peoples. The list of indigenous small-numbered peoples of the Republic of Dagestan approved by Resolution of the State Council of the Republic of Dagestan No. 191 of 18 October 2000 *On the indigenous small-numbered peoples of the Republic of Dagestan*, containing another 14 nations, was recognized as a part of this list.

2.5. 40 peoples among the mentioned ones are a special group living under extreme climatic conditions in the North, Siberia and the Far East, and having a separate legal status of indigenous small-numbered peoples. They are mainly settled or lead a nomadic lifestyle in the territory of 28 regions of Russia: the Republics of Altai, Buryatia, Karelia, Komi and Sakha (Yakutia), Tyva, Khakassia; Altai Territory, Zabaykalsky Territory, Kamchatka Territory, Krasnoyarsk Territory, Primorsky Territory, Khabarovsk Territory; Amur, Vologda, Irkutsk, Kemerovo, Leningrad, Magadan, Murmansk, Sakhalin, Sverdlovsk, Tomsk, Tyumen Regions; Nenets, Khanty-Mansi, Chukotka and Yamal-Nenets Autonomous Areas.

2.6. The state authorities of the Russian Federation adopted more than 1,500 regulatory acts concerning the issues of establishing and exercising the rights of indigenous small-numbered peoples. Access to them is provided on the basis of modern information and telecommunication systems.

2.7. The main legislative acts aimed at regulating the legal status of indigenous small-numbered peoples are the Federal Laws *On Guarantees of Rights of indigenous small-numbered peoples of the Russian Federation* (No. 82-FZ of 30 April 1999)⁵, *On General Principles for Organization of Communities of indigenous small-numbered peoples of the North, Siberia and the Russian Far East* (No. 104FZ of 20 July 2000), *On Territories of Traditional Natural Resource Use by indigenous small-numbered peoples of the North, Siberia and the Russian Far East* (No. 49FZ of 7 May 2001)⁶.

⁴ According to the nAll-Russian Population Census conducted in 2002 (<http://www.perepis2002.ru/index.html?id=44>) и 2010 (http://www.gks.ru/free_doc/new_site/perepis2010/croc/perepis_itogi1612.htm).

⁵ The amendments stipulating the establishment of councils of the representatives of indigenous small-numbered peoples led by the heads of municipalities were made by Federal Law No. 256-FZ of 13 July 2015 *On Amendments to Article 7 of the Federal Law On Guarantees of Rights of indigenous small-numbered peoples of the Russian Federation*.

⁶ More than 500 territories of traditional natural resource use by the indigenous small-numbered peoples of the North were formed in Russia at the regional and local levels. Federal Law No. 406-FZ of 28 December 2013 *On Amendments to the Federal Law On Specially Protected Nature Territories and Certain Legislative Acts of the Russian Federation*, territories of traditional natural resource use by the indigenous small-numbered peoples of the North are not especially protected territories what eliminated the obstacles to the economic activity of indigenous small-numbered peoples. <http://base.garant.ru/70552582/#friends#ixzz4KKDkY1Ku>

2.8. In addition to the mentioned three federal laws, other normative legal acts are included into the regulations serving the interests of indigenous small-numbered peoples. Thus, a simplified procedure for access of indigenous small-numbered peoples of the North to the use of aquatic resources is stipulated by Federal Law No. 166-FZ of 20 December 2004 *On Fisheries and Conservation of Aquatic Biological Resources*.

2.9. The rights of indigenous small-numbered peoples to use the forest plots in the traditional territories of indigenous small-numbered peoples are also provided for in the Forestry Code of the Russian Federation (Federal Law No. 22-FZ of 29 January 1997) (Article 124).

2.10. State support for indigenous communities, created in order to protect their original habitat, preservation and development of the traditional way of life, economy, trades and culture, as socially oriented non-profit organizations is stipulated by Federal Law No. 7-FZ of 12 January 1996 *On Non-Profit Organizations*.

2.11. The application-based procedure of lease of land owned by the state or municipality applies, *inter alia*, to indigenous communities according to Federal Law No. 101-FZ of 24 July 2002 *On Turnover of Agricultural Lands* (paragraph 5 of Article 10).

2.12. The right to a social pension under State pension provision, which is granted 5 years earlier the generally established retirement age, i.e. at 55 and 50 years (men and women, respectively), while the normal retirement age is 60 and 55 years (men and women) respectively was provided to citizens belonging to indigenous small-numbered peoples by Federal Law No. 166-FZ of 15 December 2001 *On State Provision of Pensions in the Russian Federation* (Article 11).

2.13. Thus, federal law provides for special privileges as well as preferences and exemptions for indigenous small-numbered peoples of the North:

- a simplified procedure for access of indigenous small-numbered peoples to the use of aquatic bioresources;
- special regime of forest management and forestry in the traditional territories of indigenous small-numbered peoples and ethnic communities of the North;
- State support for indigenous communities of the North, created in order to protect their original habitat, preservation and development of the traditional way of life, economy, trades and culture, as socially oriented non-profit organizations;
- the application-based procedure of lease of land owned by the state or municipality;
- the right to a social pension under State pension provision, which is granted 5 years earlier the generally established retirement age, i.e. at

55 and 50 years (men and women, respectively), while the normal retirement age is 60 and 55 years (men and women) respectively;

- the right to free use of the lands of different categories in the traditional habitats and traditional economic activities and other exemptions of land use and environmental management in order to protect the original habitat, traditional way of life, economy and trades of indigenous small-numbered peoples of the North;
- the right to free wood procurement for their own needs when using forests in their traditional habitats;
- the right to use water bodies in traditional habitats of indigenous small-numbered peoples to ensure their traditional natural resource use;
- tax exemption on the wildlife and aquatic resources use to meet personal needs;
- the right to preserve and develop their native language, traditions and culture;
- freedom of choice and use of working language, as well as other rights and preferences.

2.14. In addition, the constituent entities of the Russian Federation, taking into account regional particularities and circumstances, adopt regional regulatory acts establishing additional measures of social support of indigenous small-numbered peoples of the Russian Federation. The regional legislation provides for the support of the traditional economies of indigenous small-numbered peoples (especially reindeer herding, fishing, wild plants gathering), culture and languages. Targeted assistance on the issues of medicine, housing and education, including for the people who lead a nomadic lifestyle is provided.

2.15. Due to multi-year state policy, indigenous small-numbered peoples of Russia have one of the highest level of education among the indigenous small-numbered peoples of the world.

2.16. Free general secondary education is guaranteed to everyone. In many regions, access to free higher education is subsidized, the students from the indigenous families are supported in the form of a monthly scholarship, the costs of the first and second higher extramural education are reimbursed, graduate students are provided with material assistance. The education is a crucial factor of social integration of the indigenous small-numbered peoples, as well as the preservation of the native language and ethnic identity. On the one hand, the conditions for raising the level of education of indigenous small-numbered peoples are created, on the other hand, their right to study and use their native language is provided.

2.17. 97 languages of peoples of Russia are studied, including 22 languages of indigenous small-numbered peoples, as individual subjects in Russian schools (for

comparison, in 2005, 17 languages of the indigenous small-numbered peoples were studied in school).

2.18. A system of modern education has been created in Russia, being adapted to the traditional way of life of indigenous small-numbered peoples. More than 1,500 teaching material titles on languages and literature, history and culture, traditions, decorative and applied arts of indigenous small-numbered peoples have been published during the Second International Decade of the World's Indigenous People in Russia.

2.19. According to the All-Russian Population Census conducted in 2010, 98% of indigenous small-numbered peoples of the Russian Federation above 15 years of age are covered by the general education system, 40% — by the professional education system, including 12% of those who have higher education, 0.3% — by post-graduate education system, and only 2% of indigenous people do not have basic education.

2.20. Such high indexes were achieved by efforts to modernize the regional general education systems, development of new forms of education for nomadic peoples, socio-economic support of students and professional advancement of teachers working with indigenous small-numbered peoples.

2.21. Even in the most remote northern territories, educational institutions are re-equipped, vehicles for travel of students are purchased, funds of school libraries are replenished.

2.22. The boarding schools for children in which they spend most of the year, while their parents migrate were created in the Soviet period for people living in the harsh climatic conditions and those who lead a nomadic lifestyle. This approach has proved its effectiveness as a tool to improve the general level of education of citizens.

2.23. The boarding schools were gradually transformed into institutions of family type, in which not only general subjects are studied but also the classes on traditional creativity, decorative and applied arts, natural resource management are given in order to strengthen the ties of indigenous children with the traditional culture. This approach, to a greater extent, allows preserving indigenous culture, gives children the opportunity to return to parents after training and engage in traditional activities, but with basic school knowledge. Therefore, such project as a mobile-nomadic school is implemented in Russia. These schools play a key role in introducing children to their native language and culture, in preserving of the environment of language functioning. Such schools are opened on Yamal, on Taimyr, in Evenkia, in the Nenets Autonomous Area, on Chukotka, in Yakutia.

2.24. The Russian Federation also promotes the popularization of knowledge about indigenous small-numbered peoples at the domestic and international levels, conducting such activities as contests, festivals, exhibitions, master-classes, training sessions on the national folk arts.

2.25. A variety of major international, all-Russian, inter-regional activities are annually supported within the framework of the existing targeted programs. Among the most outstanding events that promote the culture of indigenous small-

numbered peoples, the following should be mentioned: All-Russian Exhibition-Fair “Treasure of the North”, the Nomadic All-Russian Festival “Alluring Worlds. Ethnic Russia”, the traditional holiday “Beringia” (dog sled race), which received the status of an official holiday of the Kamchatka Territory and many others.

2.26. According to the All-Russian Population Census conducted in 2010, the national average of 54.3% of the representatives of indigenous small-numbered peoples of working age are employed, including part-time employment. About 23% of peoples able to work have a private household plot, being mostly traditional.

2.27. The issues of medical care of the indigenous small-numbered peoples are among the top priorities in the framework of implementation of the Concept of Sustainable Development of indigenous small-numbered peoples of the North. The main directions of enhancement of the organization of medical care of indigenous peoples are bringing of primary health and social care closer to the places of production and economic activity, as well as providing the possibility of timely medical evacuation of nomads in specialized hospitals.

2.28. The material and technical resources of the state and municipal in-patient medical and wellness institutions are strengthened within the framework of the regional health care modernization programs in the constituent entities of the Russian Federation with the compact residence of indigenous small-numbered peoples of the North. New standards of medical care adopted to the representatives of these peoples are introduced on the basis of such common diseases among them as cardiovascular, digestive, respiratory diseases and malignant neoplasms are introduced. Particular attention is paid to the development of maternity and childhood protection system, introduction of remote telecommunication health care technologies (telemedicine). Measures to create the telemedicine infrastructure are being taken at the federal level, at the level of the constituent entities of the Russian Federation and at the level of inter-regional centers for specialized emergency medical care. The optimal solution for the development of primary care infrastructure in the territory of indigenous small-numbered peoples' habitats taking into account the small size and remote distance migration is the use of equipped mobile medical clinics, medical facilities (complexes), assistant and obstetrician stations.

2.29. Field works using all types of transport (road, rail, water and air) continue to be actively implemented in order to bring medical assistance closer to the population, especially in rural areas, in places of traditional residence and traditional economic activities of indigenous small-numbered peoples of the North.

2.30. Field medical teams, equipped with portable diagnostic equipment, formed in places of residence of indigenous small-numbered peoples, paid more than 550,000 visits in 2014.

2.31. Specialized mobile medical complexes of various purposes are used to improve quality of medical assistance, provide conditions for the work of medical staff and convenience of the population during the field work, especially in localities where there are no medical organizations and their subdivisions.

2.32. More than 328 mobile medical complexes, including 26 health centers, 8 outpatient clinics, 10 assistant and obstetrician stations, 63 complexes for the medical examination of children and adults, 208 photofluorographic units and 13 mammography units were operated in medical institutions of the constituent entities of the Russian Federation, in the territories inhabited by indigenous people of the North in 2014.

2.33. The medical and diagnostic centers have been created and operate on the basis of rail transport; services of laboratory, ultrasound, endoscopy, X-ray diagnostics, the operating unit are available within the framework of public private partnership.

2.34. Patients are received at the medical and diagnostic department on the basis of water transport of autonomous institution of the Khanty-Mansi Autonomous Area - Yugra "Professional Pathology Center" - m/s "Nikolay Pirogov" by doctors of 12 specialties. Doctors' workplaces are fully computerized, a satellite telemedicine complex is available. Each year, a mobile clinic provides consultative and diagnostic assistance to residents of 40-45 remote villages of the area, doctors examine more than 10,000 people. A third part of them are representatives of indigenous small-numbered peoples of the North.

3. Ombudsmen for rights of indigenous small-numbered peoples

3.1. In order to protect rights of indigenous small-numbered peoples, to improve the legislation and to ensure its compliance by state authorities, local authorities and officials in Russia, a unique institution of commissioners for rights of indigenous small-numbered peoples (ombudsmen) was established. Individual positions of ombudsmen for rights of indigenous small-numbered peoples were established in three regions of Russia: the Sakha Republic (Yakutia), Kamchatka and Krasnoyarsk Territories.

3.2. Ombudsmen for rights of indigenous small-numbered peoples were granted a special status when exercising their powers. They are independent and unaccountable to any state authorities. Their main tasks concerning indigenous small-numbered peoples are:

- 1) to ensure state protection of rights of indigenous small-numbered peoples;
- 2) to assist in unimpeded exercise of rights;
- 3) to improve the mechanism for enforcement and protection of rights;
- 4) to assist in improvement of legislation;
- 5) to assist in the activities of state authorities, local authorities, public associations and non-profit organizations in the field of enforcement and protection of rights of indigenous small-numbered peoples;
- 6) to inform the public about the status of observance and protection of rights of indigenous small-numbered peoples;

7) to participate in international cooperation of state authorities in the field of enforcement of rights of small-numbered peoples.

3.3. As a rule, ombudsmen's annual public reports include individual and joint appeals of citizens and public organizations of indigenous small-numbered peoples addressed to ombudsmen, and outcomes of their review; correspondence between ombudsmen and state or local authorities; materials obtained in the course of their interaction with public organizations of indigenous small-numbered peoples; publications in the media; official statistics; ombudsmen's conversations with citizens during personal meetings and appointments.

3.4. As practice shows, ombudsmen's reports cause wide interest. Statesmen and public officials, law enforcement officers, representatives of the scientific community and industrial companies use them in their work. They are distributed among libraries and public organizations; they are recommended for use in educational institutions in traditional habitats of indigenous small-numbered peoples. The reports contain not only information on violations of rights of indigenous small-numbered peoples, but also historical facts and scientific opinions; attention is paid to peculiarities of mentality, household, lifestyle and traditional economy of indigenous small-numbered peoples.

3.5. Semen Yakovlevich Palchin was appointed as the first ombudsman for rights of indigenous small-numbered peoples in the Krasnoyarsk Territory. He is a Nenets by nationality; he originates from the family of reindeer breeders. His candidacy was approved on 4 December 2008 by deputies of the Legislative Assembly of the Krasnoyarsk Territory.

3.6. In April and June 2010, taking into account recommendations of the Ombudsman, the Government of the Krasnoyarsk Territory developed and approved the Concept of Sustainable Development of Indigenous Peoples for the period from 2010 to 2015. The ombudsman facilitates improving the indigenous peoples' living conditions, expanding the practice of visiting the settlements where indigenous peoples live by professional medical specialists within medical teams (those settlements are situated in the Arctic zone, at a distance of 1,200-1,800 km from Krasnoyarsk and more than 100 km from each other). In 2012, with the support of the ombudsman in the structure of the Siberian Federal University, a scientific and educational center "Modern Problems of Indigenous Small-Numbered Peoples of the North and Siberia" was established. The center conducts research and develops practical recommendations for state and municipal authorities. Since 2013, the ombudsman has been actively promoting reforms in education system for children of nomadic reindeer breeders, development of educational technologies adapted to peculiarities of nomadic lifestyle, to culture and traditions of indigenous peoples and, at the same time, complying with federal state educational standards.

3.7. The ombudsman takes an active part in various events at regional, federal and international levels, including sessions of the United Nations Expert Mechanism on Human Rights.

3.8. The ombudsman received 122 and 67 appeals in 2013 and 2014 correspondingly. In 2015, the ombudsman received 70 complaints and appeals, 60% of which concerned issues of exercising the right to protection of indigenous habitat, traditional lifestyle and natural management. Another 40% concerned issues of providing high-quality state and municipal services, including housing and utility services, provision of residential accommodations, rehousing from ramshackle and substandard houses, labor rights etc⁷.

3.9. Considering positive experience of the Krasnoyarsk Territory, the President of the Russian Federation adopted Decree No. 1381 of 4 December 2009 *On Standard Public Positions in the Constituent Entities of the Russian Federation*, which recommends establishment of the position of the ombudsmen for rights of indigenous small-numbered peoples in regions where indigenous small-numbered peoples live. On 19 December 2013, the law of the Kamchatka Territory *On the Chamber of Ombudsmen in the Kamchatka Territory* was adopted, according to which individual ombudsmen, including the ombudsman for rights of indigenous small-numbered peoples of the Kamchatka Territory, shall work in every area.

3.10. At the 21st session of the Legislative Assembly of the Kamchatka Territory, which took place on 25 March 2014, Oleg Nikitovich Zaporotsky was appointed as an ombudsman for rights of indigenous small-numbered peoples in the Kamchatka Territory for a period of 5 years.

3.11. The primary objective of the ombudsman for rights of indigenous small-numbered peoples in the Kamchatka Territory is protection of rights, freedoms and legitimate interests of indigenous small-numbered peoples living in the territory of the Kamchatka Territory. In 2014, the ombudsman received 52 appeals from citizens, including 27 written appeals (including 5 appeals sent by e-mail). In 2015, the ombudsman for rights of indigenous small-numbered peoples in the Kamchatka Territory received 71 appeals from citizens, including 34 written appeals. Most of appeals addressed the issues of protection of indigenous habitat, traditional way of life, economy and trades, health and medical care, social and pension benefits, employment relationship.

3.12. The ombudsman actively cooperates with state authorities of the Kamchatka Territory and is included in various collegiate bodies⁸.

3.13. On 24 June 2013 the State Assembly (Il Tumen) of the Sakha Republic (Yakutia) adopted the Republic Law *On the Ombudsman for Rights of Indigenous Small-Numbered Peoples of the North in the Sakha Republic (Yakutia)*. According to the above-mentioned law, on 5 February 2014 President of the Sakha Republic (Yakutia) Ye. A. Borisov appointed an Even, Konstantin Vasilyevich Robbek, as an ombudsman for rights of indigenous small-numbered peoples of the North in the Sakha Republic (Yakutia) by his Decree, with the consent of the State Assembly of the Sakha Republic (Yakutia).

⁷ <http://www.ombudsmankk.ru/about/report/>

⁸ Reports of the ombudsman are published on the official website of the Chamber of Ombudsmen in the Kamchatka Territory: <http://www.prava41.ru/>.

3.14. The ombudsman in the Sakha Republic (Yakutia) has the right:

- 1) to be immediately admitted by public officials of the state authorities of the Sakha Republic (Yakutia), local authorities, organizations and enterprises on the issues related to his activities;
- 2) in accordance with the established procedure, to request and obtain all necessary information, documents, materials and explanations from the state authorities of the Sakha Republic (Yakutia), local authorities, organizations, enterprises and their officials concerning issues related to observance and protection of rights of small-numbered peoples;
- 3) upon showing his authorization document, to visit the state authorities of the Sakha Republic (Yakutia), local authorities, organizations and enterprises on the issues related to his activities, except for cases established by the legislation of the Russian Federation;
- 4) to obtain explanations from the state authorities of the Sakha Republic (Yakutia), local authorities, organizations, enterprises and their officials on the circumstances that are to be clarified in the course of reviewing complaints;
- 5) independently or in cooperation with relevant bodies responsible for solving issues related to protection and restoration of rights of small-numbered peoples, to perform audit of the activities of the executive authorities of the Sakha Republic (Yakutia), local authorities, organizations, enterprises and their officials that violate rights of indigenous small-numbered peoples;
- 6) to participate in plenary sessions of the State Assembly (Il Tumen) of the Sakha Republic (Yakutia), meetings of the executive authorities of the Sakha Republic (Yakutia) on the issues related to protection of rights of indigenous small-numbered peoples.

3.15. During 2014, the ombudsman received 65 appeals from representatives and associations of indigenous small-numbered peoples of the Republic; in 2015, he examined 74 written appeals.

3.16. The most important area of work of the ombudsman is direct communication with the population of naslegs (villages) in the Northern and Arctic regions. The ombudsman established the practice of joint visits of specialists from the State Committee of Justice of the Sakha Republic (Yakutia) and the office of the ombudsman for providing free legal assistance.

3.17. In March 2014, an agreement on cooperation and interaction was concluded between the Constitutional Court of the Sakha Republic (Yakutia), the ombudsman for human rights in the Sakha Republic (Yakutia), the ombudsman for rights of indigenous small-numbered peoples of the North in the Sakha Republic (Yakutia) and the ombudsman for protection of businessmen rights in the Sakha Republic (Yakutia) in the sphere of protection of constitutional human and civil rights and freedoms, of entrepreneurs and indigenous small-numbered peoples of the North.

4. The socio-economic and ethnocultural development of the Roma

4.1. According to Article 19 § 2 of the Constitution of the Russian Federation, all citizens of the Russian Federation, including those who are Roma by nationality, are guaranteed equal rights and freedoms regardless of sex, race, nationality, language, origin, property and official status, place of residence, religion, convictions, membership in public associations and other circumstances.

4.2. In 2013, in the context of recommendations from the Advisory Committee, the Government of the Russian Federation adopted the Comprehensive Action Plan for Socio-Economic and Ethnocultural Development of the Roma for 2013-2014 ("the Comprehensive Plan"), which had been developed with the participation of the All-Russian Public Organization "Federal National and Cultural Autonomy of the Russian Roma" ("FNCA of Roma").

4.3. 15 federal ministries and departments, 32 constituent entities of the Russian Federation with a large number of Roma living therein participated in implementation of the Comprehensive Plan. The plan included organizational and legal measures, activities in ethnocultural development and education, social security, information and mass communications aimed at promoting integration of the Russian Roma into public life of the country, including improvement of educational level, promoting legal awareness, self-employment of the Russian Roma, prevention of underage homelessness among Roma and work with core groups of the Roma national associations. It also provided for measures aimed at overcoming negative social stereotypes against Roma.

4.4. An important positive outcome of the Comprehensive Plan implementation was the institutional development of the Roma community by means of facilitating registration of public organizations (consulting, assistance in preparation of documents). Various preventive, ethnocultural, social and organizational measures were taken, which allowed analyzing the current situation in the areas of compact settlement of Roma and level of social, educational and other services provided to Roma, and establishing cooperation with the formal and informal leaders of the Roma community. It is particularly worth noting the significant improvement of situation related to the issue of personal identity documents and registration at the place of residence or at the place of stay in the territory of the Russian Federation.

4.5. The Comprehensive Plan provided for implementation of the Council of Europe's Training Programme for Roma Mediators (ROMED), within the framework of which the seminar (Moscow) and trainings on cross-cultural communication for the representatives of the Roma communities and activists of the Roma NGOs (Moscow, 2012, Strasbourg, 2014) were held.

4.6. The Roma public organizations participate in the work of various advisory and coordinating central authorities, including at the highest level. The representatives of FNCA of Roma are included into the Presidential Council of the Russian Federation, the Advisory Board for National and Cultural Autonomies under FAEA of Russia. The

Roma associations are locally represented in the boards under regional and local authorities.

4.7. The International Romani Day dedicated, *inter alia*, to the memory of the World War II victims among Roma is annually celebrated in the Russian Federation (on 8 April). The ethnocultural events aimed at introducing traditional culture of peoples of Russia, such as All-Russian Festival “Roma Under the Sky of Russia”, are regularly held.

4.8. During the reporting period, the organized measures for the legalization of the Roma population, the most of which had no identity documents, citizenship etc. were taken.

4.9. The quarterly monitoring was organized to control the Roma situation in the constituent entities of the Russian Federation and implementation of the Methodological Recommendations for the executive authorities of the constituent entities of the Russian Federation and local authorities dealing with the Roma population, approved by Decree of the Ministry of Regional Development of Russia No. 318 of 30 July 2013, and sent to all regions with high concentration of Roma.

4.10. In order to identify the main issues and to assess the socialization level of the Roma population, the Comprehensive Plan involved conducting of a complex research of socio-economic and ethnocultural legal aspects of Roma integration in Russia. In 2015, such research was conducted by FAEA of Russia in cooperation with the Russian Public Opinion Research Center. The research covered the Roma population aged 16 and older in the territory of 30 constituent entities of the Russian Federation. Total sampled population: 1,000 respondents. The socio-economic and socio-political situation of the Russian Roma, their lifestyle, ethnocultural and legal awareness, public opinion on the key issues of development of the Russian society and their degree of integration into the Russian society were studied within the research.

4.11. The project of FNCA of the Russian Roma “Education as a Way of Adapting Roma into the Russian Society” has become one of the most relevant and significant social projects in the sphere of education for Roma children, recently implemented with the governmental support. The project implementation was funded by the grant of the President of the Russian Federation in two pilot regions of Russia — Moscow (Belyaninovo, Mytishchinsky District) and Smolensk (Safonovo) Regions. The project is focused on solving the relevant issues in the sphere of basic elementary and preschool education for children from Roma families. Main tasks of the project were to promote full education for Roma children in general education schools; to identify main issues and involve the State into solving them, to integrate the Roma community into the modern society by means of education and to overcome ethnic prejudices against Roma among students.

4.12. Children gained all necessary knowledge and skills for successful studying and adaptation to the system of primary and general education (including the Russian language). The Federal Education Development Institute (FEDI) developed and introduced new methods of work with Roma children at schools within the project.

The project materials were published, including best practices based on its implementation for the introduction of approved methods in the regions not covered by the project.

4.13. The method of involving an assistant from the community — a native speaker — into the educational process was tested within the project; he attended classes to help establishing communication between teachers, students and parents.

4.14. During the project implementation, the regular classes for preschool children were held at the local schools in the Smolensk and Moscow Regions (Safonovo and Belyaninovo). Extra classes for Roma schoolchildren getting behind the school curricula were held as well.

4.15. Teacher-parent meetings were held in each region, at which the progress of the project implementation and difficulties arising were discussed. Parents began treating education of their children more seriously and keeping track of their studying; some of them even expressed gratitude to teachers and organizers of the project. The project implementation resulted in organizing the productive cooperation between all participants of the educational process, overcoming the existing stereotypes, raising the level of teaching and learning.

5. The Crimean Tatars and other national minorities living in the Republic of Crimea

5.1. The Republic of Crimea and the federal-status city of Sevastopol are multinational entities of the Russian Federation. According to the results of the peninsula population census, the representatives of 175 nationalities live in its territory.

5.2. According to the sociological research conducted in Crimea by the Russian Public Opinion Research Center in February 2015, almost 90% of surveyed Crimeans consider inter-ethnic relations to be benevolent, and 89% of them believe that there are no ethnic problems on the peninsula.

5.3. For more than two decades of contemporary history, the Crimean Tatar people had been expecting from the Government of Ukraine to adopt the law on the status of the Crimean Tatar people and the law on rehabilitation, which would have been the most important background for the preservation and development of the national identity, culture and language.

5.4. The integration of the Crimean Tatars into the Russian society has become one of the priorities of the Russian Federation since the citizens of the Crimea expressed their will for the peninsula to become a part the Russian Federation.

5.5. Under the jurisdiction of the Russian Federation, the Crimean Tatar language was recognized as one of the official languages of the Republic of Crimea, which provided the basis for the adoption of appropriate regulatory and legal acts for its preservation and development, for ensuring fully equal rights.

5.6. For the purpose of restoring historical justice, elimination of consequences of illegal deportation of Armenian, Bulgarian, Greek, Italian, Crimean Tatar and other

peoples from the territory of the Crimean Autonomous Soviet Socialist Republic and violations of their human rights, on 21 April 2014 the President of the Russian Federation, Vladimir Putin, signed a Decree *On Measures of Rehabilitation of Armenian, Bulgarian, Greek, Italian, Crimean Tatar and German Peoples and State Support for Their Revival and Development*.

5.7. In order to implement this Decree, the Council of Ministers of the Republic of Crimea approved the Action Plan by its Order of 27 May 2014, which provided for a set of measures aimed at the development of regulatory acts governing the issues in the spheres of inter-ethnic relations, settlement, socio-cultural adaptation of returnees, education in official languages of the Republic of Crimea and learning of Armenian, Bulgarian, Modern Greek, Crimean Tatar and German languages, as well as implementation of measures aimed at meeting social and ethnocultural needs of repressed peoples.

5.8. On 6 October 2014, a set of measures aimed at restoration of historical justice, political, social and spiritual renovation of Armenian, Bulgarian, Greek, Italian, Crimean Tatar and German peoples that had suffered illegal deportation and political repression on ethnic or other grounds was adopted for 2014-2016.

5.9. A set of measures involves the activities aimed at meeting linguistic, ethnocultural, educational needs of repressed peoples of Crimea, improving areas of their compact settlement, as well as the development and adoption of regulatory acts aimed at meeting social needs of the peoples of Crimea that have returned to the Republic of Crimea from places of deportation etc.

5.10. The federal target program "Social and Economic Development of the Republic of Crimea and Sevastopol until 2020" was adopted by Resolution of the Government of the Russian Federation No. 790 of 11 August 2014. It provides for the measures aimed at national, cultural and spiritual renewal of Armenian, Bulgarian, Greek, Italian, Crimean Tatar and German peoples, as well as at social development of the territory of the Republic of Crimea and Sevastopol.

5.11. The state authorities of the Republic of Crimea take measures to solve problematic issues of settlement of returnees; in particular, of providing them with land for construction and maintenance of private houses.

5.12. On 10 December 2014 the State Council of the Republic of Crimea adopted the Law *On Measures of Social Support for Certain Categories of Citizens and Persons Residing in the Territory of the Republic of Crimea*, according to which a right for benefits provided for by the Law of the Russian Federation *On the Rehabilitation of Victims of Political Repressions* was granted to the Crimean Tatar people.

5.13. As for 24 September 2015, the Main Department of the Ministry of Justice of the Russian Federation for the Republic of Crimea and Sevastopol registered 66 local and 10 regional national and cultural autonomies carrying on their activity in the territory of the Republic of Crimea, including: Public Association "Regional National and Cultural Autonomy of Greeks in the Republic of Crimea 'Tavrida'", Public Association "Regional German National and Cultural Autonomy of the Republic of

Crimea”, Public Association “Regional National and Cultural Autonomy of Jews of the Republic of Crimea”, Public Association “Regional Armenian National and Cultural Autonomy of the Republic of Crimea”, Public Association “Regional National and Cultural Autonomy of Estonians in the Republic of Crimea”, Public Association “Regional National and Cultural Autonomy Moldavians in the Republic of Crimea 'Plai'”, Public Association “Regional National and Cultural Autonomy of Crimean Karaites in the Republic of Crimea”, “Regional Azerbaijani National and Cultural Autonomy in the Republic of Crimea”, Public Association “Regional Bulgarian National and Cultural Autonomy of the Republic of Crimea 'Pàisiy Hilendàrski'”, Public Association “Regional Belarus National and Cultural Autonomy”.

5.14. New public associations representing interests of the Crimean Tatar people were established.

5.15. As for 24 September 2015, 168 religious organizations were registered in the region.

5.16. A register of houses of worship for various confessions was established:

- Orthodoxy — 538 houses of worship;
- Islam — 452 houses of worship;
- Protestantism — 36 houses of worship;
- Catholicism — 8 houses of worship;
- Karaism — 6 houses of worship;
- Judaism — 3 houses of worship.

5.17. According to Order of Head of the Republic of Crimea S. Aksyonov No. 667-p of 15 July 2014, a former religious building of Karaite kenesa located at: 6 Karaimskaya St., Simferopol was transferred to the religious organization “Simferopol Karaite Religious Community 'Cholpan'” for uncompensated use.

5.18. According to Order of the Head of the Republic of Crimea No. 01-62/2968 of 07 November 2014, following the results of the meeting with representatives of the Jewish organizations of the Republic of Crimea, an action plan (“Road Map”) was developed. It aimed at transfer of the building of the former Religious School “Talmud-Torah” located at: 13 Studencheskaya St., 29 Kurchatova St., Simferopol to the centralized religious organization of Orthodox Judaism “The Federation of Jewish Communities of Russia”.

5.19. According to Order of the Council of Ministers of the Republic of Crimea No. 418-p of 12 May 2015 *On Issues of Property Management*, the building of Muslim Spiritual School located at: 57 Basenko St. (building L), Bakhchysarai, as well as building of mosque located at: 15-a Russkaya St., Amurskoye village, Krasnogvardeysky District, the Republic of Crimea were transferred to the Centralized Organization “Spiritual Board of the Muslims of Crimea and Sevastopol” for uncompensated use.

5.20. On 25 September 2015, the solemn commencement of construction of the Cathedral Mosque took place under the patronage of the President of the Russian Federation, Vladimir Putin in Simferopol.

5.21. On 18 May 2015 the Prayer for Remembrance and Unity occasioned with the Day of Remembrance for Victims of Crimean Peoples Deportation was held according to the resolution adopted at the session of Crimean Inter-Confessional Council "Peace is a Gift of God". The event was aimed at holding a collective prayer attended by representatives of all religious confessions of Crimea.

5.22. The activities of the media in the territory of the Russian Federation and the constituent entities of the Russian Federation are carried out under the licenses issued by the authorities of the Federal Service for Supervision in the Sphere of Telecom, Information Technologies and Mass Communications.

5.24. Within the implementation of the universal comprehensive information campaign aimed at securing civil unity of peoples of the Russian Federation, harmonization of inter-ethnic and inter-religious relations, consolidation of civic identity and ethnic tolerance, the State Committee for Inter-Ethnic Relations and Deported Citizens of the Republic of Crimea facilitates the work of the media published in the Armenian, Bulgarian, German, New Greek and Crimean Tatar languages.

5.25. Furthermore, the Department of National Programs has been established within Autonomous Non-Profit Organization "Television and Radio Company 'Crimea'" in order to meet the informational and educational needs of the Crimean peoples; it includes national editorial bodies broadcasting in the Armenian, Bulgarian, Greek, Crimean Tatar, German, Ukrainian languages. Broadcast of the following national TV programs is organized:

- Greek educational TV-program "Elpida";
- German educational TV-program "Hoffnung";
- Bulgarian educational TV-program "Bulgarian Meetings";
- Armenian educational TV-program "Barev";
- Crimean Tatar talk-show "Dilde, fikirde, işte birlik"; Crimean Tatar news TV-programs "Haberler", "Netije", "Ekindi Subet"; Crimean Tatar educational TV-program "Eglenip-Ogrenem"; Crimean Tatar cultural and religious TV-program "Selyam Aleykum"; Crimean Tatar informational and cultural TV-program "Tanysh-Belish".

PART II. ARTICLE-FOR-ARTICLE COMMENTARY TO THE FRAMEWORK CONVENTION FOR THE PROTECTION OF NATIONAL MINORITIES TAKING INTO ACCOUNT THE RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE THIRD MONITORING CYCLE

Articles 1, 2 of the Framework Convention

Ratification of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages

Recommendation

29. *The Advisory Committee calls on the authorities to ratify the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages without further delay.*

In accordance with Decree of the President of the Russian Federation No. 90-рп of 22 February 2001, the Russian Federation signed the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages on 10 May 2001 and has considered the possibility to ratify it until now.

In order to assess the possibility of implementation of the Charter in the Russian conditions, the joint project “National Minorities in Russia: Development of Languages, Culture, Media and Civil Society” was implemented during 2009-2011 in cooperation with the Council of Europe and the European Commission.

The pilot regions for the implementation of the joint project became the Republic of Dagestan, the Republic of Mordovia and the Altai Territory.

The European experts, the Russian scientists and non-governmental organizations participated in the project implementation. About 60 seminars with the participation of experts in the field of education, linguistics, history, human rights, and representatives of the authorities of all levels, the activities of which affect the scope of protection of minority languages were held within the framework of the program.

The majority of the project participants recognized that there is a developed and multi-level (taking into account the federal character of the state) language policy, and an efficient system of protection and development of national languages was established in Russia, while the ratification of the Charter in the current geopolitical conditions is connected with the aggravate external risks and requires considerable additional financial and organizational costs in terms of economic sanctions.

In this respect, the issue requires further study and discussion of the expert community in cooperation with the federal executive bodies, executive bodies of the constituent entities of the Russian Federation and local authorities, holding of extensive discussions.

Article 3 of the Framework Convention

Scope of application

Recommendation

33. *The Advisory Committee recommends the Russian authorities to adhere the flexible approach in general when recognizing national minorities and the determination of the scope of application of the Framework Convention. It calls on the federal and regional authorities to enter into a constructive dialogue with indigenous small-numbered groups, including groups of minority communities, who ask to recognize them as indigenous small-numbered people in accordance with the principle of freedom of self-determination.*

The Federal Agency for Ethnic Affairs, together with other interested state authorities, considers the mentioned initiatives in the context of the Unified List of Indigenous Small-Numbered Peoples of the North, as well as compliance with the Russian legislation and the actual socio-economic conditions for exercising the rights. The direction is clear. For instance, in 2015, the amendments related to the Chukotka Autonomous Area as an area traditionally inhabited by the Yukaghir people were made in the Unified List of Indigenous Small-Numbered Peoples.

See also chapter about indigenous small-numbered peoples.

Collecting data on ethnic affiliation

Recommendation

38. *The Advisory Committee again calls on the Russian authorities to ensure the discussion on the return of the column “nationality” to identity documents, with full awareness by participants of the discussion that all of these columns should be filled at will and should not cause the negative consequences for the individuals concerned.*

In the Russian Federation, all Russian citizens, as the multinational people of the Russian Federation, shall constitute a single Russian nation. All Russian citizens have equal rights and freedoms guaranteed by the state. Every citizen of the Russian Federation shall have the right to determine his/her own nationality, which does not diminish his/her rights and freedoms in this case. In this regard, the Russian Federation proceeds from the absence of the necessity to return the column “nationality” to the passport of Russian citizen.

Establishment of a citizen's nationality is actual only for certain categories of citizens, in particular, for the indigenous small-numbered peoples of the North, Siberia and the Russian Far East, for obtaining of additional guarantees, preferences, social benefits, pensions, etc. In order to improve the mentioned practice of confirmation of nationality for indigenous small-numbered peoples the draft law is currently being developed that will take into account the opinions of the representatives of these peoples at the level of municipalities.

Article 4 of the Framework Convention

The legislative and institutional framework to combat discrimination

Recommendations

44. *The Advisory Committee again calls on the Russian authorities to adopt comprehensive legislation to combat discrimination, which would cover all spheres of law and public life and would provide effective protection against discrimination in all its forms.*

The significant measures to improve the work of state institutions in combating racial and other forms of discrimination, ethnic and religious hatred, various forms of extremism were taken in recent years.

In 2011, the Code of Administrative Offences of the Russian Federation was supplemented with new article 5.62. "Discrimination": "Discrimination, that is, violation of human and civil rights, freedoms and legitimate interests depending on gender, race, colour, nationality, language, origin, property, family, social and professional status, age, place of residence, attitude to religion, beliefs, affiliation with public associations or any social groups". Sanctions for discrimination are established by the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation and the Code of Administrative Offences of the Russian Federation.

Anti-discrimination rules are included in the regulatory acts of different legal force. So, they are reflected in:

- the Federal Constitutional Laws *On Courts of General Jurisdiction in the Russian Federation* (Article 5), *On Referendum in the Russian Federation* (Article 2), *On the Government of the Russian Federation* (Article 3); *On the Judicial System of the Russian Federation* (Article 7), etc.;
- Codified regulatory acts: Article 3 of the Tax Code (Article 3), the Code of Administrative Court Proceedings (Article 8), the Housing Code (Article 1), Article 6 of the Code of Civil Procedure (Article 6), Code of Arbitration Procedure (Article 7), the Labour Code (Article 2), the Code of Criminal Procedure (Article 11), the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation (Article 4), the Civil Code of the Russian Federation (Article 1), etc.
- Federal laws *On Education in the Russian Federation* (Article 3), *On Free Legal Aid in the Russian Federation* (Article 5), *On the Fundamentals of Health Protection of Citizens in the Russian Federation* (Article 5), *On Physical Culture and Sports in the Russian Federation* (Article 11); *On Basic Guarantees of Rights of the Child in the Russian Federation* (Article 4); *On Freedom of Conscience and Religious Associations* (Article 3), *On National and Cultural Autonomy* (Article 4), *On Trade Unions, Their Rights and Guarantees* (Article 9); *On Public Private Partnership, Municipal Private Partnership in the Russian Federation and*

Amendments to Certain Legislative Acts of the Russian Federation (Article 4), and others.

The Russian legal system belongs to the Romano-Germanic legal family, and therefore its national legislation is built on a sectoral basis, i.e. the whole body of regulatory acts is divided into separate sectors, which include a set of rules governing a particular area of homogeneous public relations by specific methods. In addition, anti-discrimination principles are enshrined in the Constitution of the Russian Federation, the activities of the Constitutional Court of the Russian Federation and the entire judicial system of the country.

Thus, the provisions of Article 4 of the Framework Convention are implemented in the Russian legislation to the full, and this interconnected body of regulatory acts, in conjunction with the Constitution of the Russian Federation and Criminal Code of the Russian Federation. is anti-discrimination legislation, which is constantly improved, adapting to the realities of today's time.

45. *The Advisory Committee repeatedly calls on the authorities to establish specialized and independent body to combat racism and racial discrimination of all its forms by, inter alia, monitoring the implementation of legislation to combat discrimination. In addition, this body should be involved in conducting educational and awareness-raising activities in the relevant public services and in society in general, especially among the groups being most vulnerable to discrimination.*

Monitoring in observation of human rights is conducted on a regular basis by the Ombudsman for Human Rights in the Russian Federation, as well as the ombudsmen in the regions of Russia. The Ombudsman contributes to the restoration of violated human rights and freedoms; the improvement of legislation on human rights and freedoms and bringing it into conformity with the generally recognized principles and rules of international law; the development of international cooperation in the field of human rights; raising of legal awareness on human rights and freedoms, forms and methods of their protection by provided legal means. In December 2014, the Bureau of the International Coordinating Committee of National Human Rights Institutions of the UN Human Rights Council confirmed the highest accreditation status "A" for the period from 2014 to 2019 in respect of the Ombudsman for Human Rights in the Russian Federation ("the Ombudsman"). This confirms the correspondence of the Ombudsman's activities to the Principles relating to the Status of National Institutions for the Promotion and Protection of Human Rights (the Paris Principles) adopted by UN General Assembly Resolution No. 48/134 of 20 December 1993.

The Ombudsman carries out constant work for the protection of human rights and freedoms against possible violations and discrimination. Media, public opinion and positions of non-governmental human rights defenders are monitored under normal conditions. These activities allow detecting and preventing violations, forming the objective picture in public opinion and competent position regarding the situation related to human rights and freedoms in Russia.

The program of measures on the fight against racism and various forms of discrimination within preparation for the World Cup 2018 in Russia may be one example of the work on the protection of the Russian citizens' rights against racial discrimination within the framework of raising legal awareness.

In the summer of 2015, a strategy of the FIFA World Cup 2018 in Russia in the field of sustainable development and the special guidance to prevent similar incidents were announced at a seminar of UN OHCHR on the fight against racism and various forms of discrimination in modern football with the participation of the Football Union of Russia and the Ministry of Sports of Russia.

This topic was also discussed by the Ombudsman for Human Rights at the meetings with the UN High Commissioner for Human Rights and the Head of Anti-Discrimination Unit of the Office of the UN High Commissioner for Human Rights held in June 2015 in Geneva. At present, the seminar on these issues is being prepared with the Ombudsmen for Human Rights in 11 regions of Russia, hosting the World Cup games in 2018.

It is important to note that the Federal Agency for Ethnic Affairs created and launched the system for monitoring the status of inter-ethnic and inter-confessional relations and early prevention of conflict situations.

The main tasks of the monitoring system are:

- 1) to identify the key issues in the sphere of inter-ethnic relations in order to promptly respond thereto;
- 2) to identify information threats in the information and telecommunication network of the Internet;
- 3) to ensure interdepartmental and inter-level interaction between federal, regional and municipal authorities in order to respond to emerging conflict situations;
- 4) to provide the possibility of meaningful analysis of the complaints of citizens received by the state authorities of the constituent entities of the Russian Federation, in order to identify systemic problems in the sphere of international relations.

According to Igor Barinov, the head of the Federal Agency for Ethnic Affairs: "The monitoring system is an important tool for the implementation of the state national policy strategy. It allows not only to identify the flash points of potential conflicts, but also to predict them at the earliest stages, enabling the authorities of all levels to take steps to prevent their further escalation in due time."

Collecting data on ethnic affiliation

Recommendation

49. *The Advisory Committee reiterates its recommendation given to the Russian authorities on the establishment of a comprehensive system for collection of data on the situation related to the persons belonging to national minorities in various areas,*

such as education, employment and housing, in order to assess the extent of their exposure to discrimination in everyday life and determine the optimal policy to combat such discrimination. In this regard, it invites the authorities to pay attention to independent research on these issues.

The main source of information on the ethnic composition of the population of the Russian Federation are the All-Russian Population Censuses conducted once every 8-10 years.

Data on the national (ethnic) composition, according to the 2010 All-Russian Population Census (including the main socio-demographic characteristics) and the Population Census in the Crimean Federal District are publicly available on the website of the Federal State Statistics Service (www.gks.ru) and contain information on the main socio-demographic characteristics (marital status, level of education, sources of livelihood, economic activity, language skills) of individual nationalities. In particular, the information about the level of education, sources of income, employment, including separately in the territories traditionally inhabited by indigenous small-numbered peoples of the Russian Federation, is provided.

In the inter-census period, the microcensuses, as well as individual sociological studies, including a census in Crimean Federal District, are conducted. In particular, a comprehensive study on the socio-economic, ethno-cultural and legal aspects of the integration of Roma in Russia: “Socio-economic, ethno-cultural and legal problems of the Roma in Russia” (November, 2015) was conducted in the IV quarter of 2015 by order of FAEA of Russia, with the participation of the Federal National and Cultural Autonomy of Roma. The socio-economic and socio-political situation of the Russian Roma, their lifestyle, ethnocultural and legal awareness, public opinion on key issues in the development of the Russian society, the degree of integration into the Russian society were examined within the study. The various sociological studies aimed at assessing the status of inter-ethnic relations and the situation of individual national minorities are conducted. For instance, the study: “Public opinion of the Crimean Tatars about the situation in the republic, the policy of the state and problems of the people” was conducted in 2015 (October – November 2015).

In order to monitor the observance of the rights of national minorities, the reports of public and human rights organizations are also analysed.

Full and effective equality of persons belonging to national minorities

Recommendations

63. *The Advisory Committee calls on the Russian authorities to pay the utmost attention to the existing problem of inequality faced by persons belonging to national minorities, particularly descendants from Caucasus and Roma. It is required to carry out educational and awareness-raising activities among the relevant public services, in particular among law enforcement and judicial bodies, and in society in general, in order to ensure a better understanding of the existing international and national guarantees of human rights observance.*

See chapter 4. Socio-cultural and economic development of the Roma people.

64. *The Advisory Committee also calls on the Russian authorities to put an end to the violent elimination of the Roma settlements without the provision of alternative housing or adequate compensation, and urges them, upon consultation with representatives of the Roma, to develop and implement a comprehensive strategy to ensure the effective equality for Roma, including access to housing and education.*

1,548 Roma live in Plekhanovo of the municipality of Tula.

As of 30 August 2016, the citizens live in 181 buildings located at Sverdlova Street, Mayakovskogo Street, Microdistrict-1; the number of residential buildings was 289 before 1 May 2016. Since most of residential houses were built without permission, the Leninskiy District Court delivered 120 judgments, on the basis of which the Department of the Federal Bailiff Service of Russia for the Tula Region initiated 122 enforcement proceedings. On 30 May 2016 compulsory enforcement proceedings were commenced. 8 stages of the demolition of unauthorized buildings were held in the course of which 77 buildings were forcibly dismantled, 33 unauthorized buildings were demolished on a voluntary basis. Execution of the remaining nine enforcement proceedings was temporarily suspended in connection with the filing of applications by debtors with the Tula Regional Court on quashing the judgments in view of newly discovered circumstances.

Along with the demolition of unauthorized buildings, the Ministry of Economic Development of the Tula Region began to implement the procedure of providing land plots to residents and execution of documentation related to land for already authorized buildings.

At present, 39 applications out of 99 are being published; orders for preliminary approval of 20 applications were prepared; and contracts for 6 applications were issued. The land plots have been provided to residents of habitat before. From 2011 to 2013, 107 large families received land plots on a free-of-charge basis; most of them are located in the villages Aleshnya and Teploye. 45 Roma having many children and living in Plekhanovo are on the waiting list for land plots. The Tula City Administration regularly holds meetings with the elders of the Roma settlement in order to prevent inter-ethnic conflicts, as well as to raise awareness in terms of livelihood and improvement, the need to conclude contracts for provision of public services, to explain how to provide the residents with heating in 2016-2017.

Article 5 of the Framework Convention

State support of the preservation and development of minority culture

Recommendations

69 *The Advisory Committee again calls on the authorities to ensure that the funds provided for to support the cultural activities of minority communities are allocated in accordance with clear criteria and are available to all interested minority communities. In addition, the procedure for the allocation of funds should be transparent and representatives of minorities should be*

provided with real possibilities for independent management of allocated funds.

70 The Advisory Committee also recommends to establish clear legal guarantees of supporting cultural activities of minority communities at the federal level, and to develop an effective mechanism for monitoring the implementation of these guarantees in the constituent entities of the Federation upon consultation with minority representatives.

The projects of the national public organizations aimed at strengthening of international cooperation and prevention of the spread of ideas of racial intolerance in any form are supported in Russia. In accordance with the legislation of the Russian Federation, the projects of public organizations aimed at preserving and developing the culture of the peoples of Russia are supported through the following instruments: the state programs of the Russian Federation, the state programs of the constituent entities of the Russian Federation, grants and subsidies.

In accordance with Federal Law No. 44 of 5 April 2013 *On The Contract System of Procurement of Goods, Works and Services for State and Municipal Needs* ("Federal Law No. 44"), the public organizations may participate in meeting state and municipal needs in terms of openness and transparency of the procurement, the prevention of corruption and other abuses in the field of procurement on a competitive basis.

According to Article 27 § 4 (4), socially oriented non-profit organizations have advantages in procurement in accordance with Article 30 of Federal Law No. 44.

In accordance with Federal Law No. 7-FZ of 12 January 1996 *On Non-Profit Organizations*, non-profit organizations (NPOs) may be recognized as socially oriented in the implementation of activities aimed at solving of social problems, development of civil society, including the development of international cooperation, preservation and protection of identity, culture, languages and traditions of the peoples of Russia, promotion of social and cultural adaptation and integration of migrants.

According to Article 31.1 § 3 of the mentioned Federal Law, socially oriented NPOs are also supported in the following forms:

- 1) financial, property, information, advisory support, and support in training, additional vocational training of employees and volunteers of socially oriented NPOs;
- 2) granting of privileges on payment of taxes and fees in accordance with the [legislation](#) on taxes and fees;
- 3) procurement of goods, works and services for state and municipal needs of socially oriented non-profit organizations in accordance with the procedure established by the RF legislation on the contract system in procurement of goods, works and services for state and municipal needs;

4) provision of benefits to pay taxes and fees to legal entities that provide socially oriented NPOs with material support in accordance with the legislation on taxes and fees.

The activities for social and cultural adaptation and integration of migrants were attributed to socially oriented activities according to Federal Law No. 440-FZ of 22 December 2014, which enabled NPOs engaged in these activities to receive support from the state authorities for the implementation of their projects.

The Ministry of Economic Development of the Russian Federation supported socially oriented NPOs through providing grants to the all-Russian organizations and budgetary subsidies of NPOs' activities at the regional level from 2013 to 2015. In 2013, the Ministry of Economic Development of the Russian Federation granted subsidies from the federal budget to 49 constituent entities of the Russian Federation for the implementation of support programs for socially oriented NPOs in the amount of RUB 630 million, RUB 43.8 million of which were directed to support socially oriented NPOs engaged in development of activities of international cooperation, what amounted to 7% of the total amount of allocated subsidy. In 2014, RUB 62.6 million were allocated for their support, what amounted to 9.5% of the total amount of allocated subsidy.

In 2015, the Ministry of Economic Development of the Russian Federation granted subsidies from the federal budget to 55 constituent entities of the Russian Federation in the amount of RUB 621 million for support of socially oriented NPOs, including for development of international cooperation.

In particular, support was provided to the public organization “Federal Jewish National and Cultural Autonomy”, the all-Russian public organization “Assembly of Peoples of Russia”, the charitable foundation for support and development of educational and social projects “PSP-fund” (St. Petersburg), Belgorod Regional Women’s Public Organization of Migrants “Vera” (*Faith*) and others.

Grant support is also provided through the Administration of the President of the Russian Federation. In 2015, RUB 4.228 billion were allocated for grants to NPOs implementing social projects and projects in the sphere of protection of human and civil rights and freedoms. At the same time, all NPOs, including those entered in the register as “foreign agents”, may apply for grants.

The state authorities ensure and guarantee precise observance of legislation and monitoring of its implementation at all levels of minority communities' activities.

National and cultural autonomies

Recommendations

75. *The Advisory Committee urges the authorities to ensure more clarity regarding the legal status and powers of the national and cultural autonomies and to establish clear and transparent criteria and procedures for allocation of funds to enable them to exercise their powers effectively.*

76. *The Advisory Committee also recommends that the federal, regional and municipal authorities to enable persons belonging to national minorities to preserve and develop their culture and identity in a wider sense in accordance with Article 5 of the Framework Convention by adjusting the regulatory framework and practice related to national and cultural autonomies.*

The Russian Federation guarantees the right of national minorities to unite in national and cultural autonomies (Federal Law No. 74-FZ of 17 June 1996 *On National and Cultural Autonomy*) and other types of NPOs. According to Article 1 of the mentioned Federal Law, national and cultural autonomy is a form of national and cultural self-determination representing a union of the Russian citizens considering themselves as a certain ethnic community being in the situation of national minority in the respective territory on the basis of their voluntary self-organization for the purpose of independent solution of questions related to preservation of the identity, development of language, education, national culture.

According to the Ministry of Justice of the Russian Federation, 1,183 national and cultural autonomies are registered in Russia as of September 2015.

In 2015, the Advisory Council on National and Cultural Autonomies was created under the Federal Agency for Ethnic Affairs. It is involved into the relevant activities to prevent inter-ethnic and inter-confessional conflicts, to develop the joint actions and work plans, to clarify the procedures for state support etc.

National and cultural autonomies may receive state support along with other non-profit organizations.

The situation of indigenous peoples

Recommendations

83. *The Advisory Committee urges the Russian authorities to intensify efforts to implement the goals of the Concept and allocate additional funds for this purpose. Decisions on the allocation of funds should be taken upon a detailed consultation with representatives of indigenous peoples. When determining the appropriate performers, the preference should be given to associations of indigenous peoples.*

84. *The Advisory Committee also calls on the authorities to ensure that the achievement of the goal of sustainable development of indigenous peoples is not prevented by parallel amendments in the legislation restricting the rights of indigenous peoples and their free access to ancestral territories. It is necessary to consult with representatives of indigenous peoples in all matters affecting them, especially if we are talking about amendments in the legislation on the use of land, forests and water bodies.*

Software and other financial mechanisms for the implementation of policy for sustainable development of the indigenous peoples are established in Russia.

The main financial instruments are target programs (from 2014 — state programs) and optional activities aimed at solving specific tasks and meeting the needs of the indigenous small-numbered peoples in various regions of Russia.

The funds are provided from the federal budget for the co-financing of measures aimed at economic and social development of indigenous small-numbered peoples of the North. These measures are taken in places of traditional residence and traditional economic activities of indigenous small-numbered peoples of the North, and they are targeted.

The effectiveness of the use of funds is assessed according to 5 indicators determined in places of traditional residence and traditional economic activities of indigenous small-numbered peoples, namely:

- the proportion of the population participating in cultural and leisure events held by state (municipal) cultural organizations and in the work of amateur associations;
- the infant mortality rate;
- the level of registered unemployment;
- the number of registered patients with active tuberculosis;
- the population's income level.

The constituent entities of the Russian Federation were provided with the appropriate support from the federal budget in the total amount of RUB 1.78 billion during the period from 2009 to 2014. The funds of the consolidated budgets of the constituent entities of the Russian Federation were raised in the amount of RUB 3.16 billion.

Due to subsidies and inter-budgetary transfers to the budgets of the constituent entities of the Russian Federation, new schools and facilities of social and engineering infrastructure were built in places of traditional residence and traditional economic activities; ethnic and cultural activities aimed at preserving traditional culture and development of the traditional economic activities of indigenous small-numbered peoples of the North were carried out.

Another mechanism for implementing the policy for sustainable development of the indigenous small-numbered peoples is the federal target program “Strengthening of the Unity of the Russian Nation and Ethnocultural Development of the Peoples of Russia in 2014-2020” approved in 2013⁹.

The regional programs for strengthening civil unity and harmonization of inter-ethnic relations are supported, all-Russian activities aimed at the development of civil society institutions, support of languages and cultures of the peoples of Russia, including indigenous small-numbered peoples, youth initiatives etc., are implemented within the framework of this federal target program.

⁹ Resolution of the Government of the Russian Federation No. 718 of 20 April 2013.

The regional target programs (state programs) for support of the indigenous small-numbered peoples are implemented at the regional level.

Such programs are implemented in 23 regions of Russia densely inhabited by indigenous small-numbered peoples. The socio-economic and ethno-cultural development in other constituent entities of the Russian Federation inhabited by indigenous small-numbered peoples is supported within the framework of sectoral target programs and optional activities.

In addition, socially oriented projects of public associations of indigenous small-numbered peoples are supported at the federal and regional levels in the form of grants.

During the period of the Second International Decade of the World's Indigenous People in Russia, declared by the UN (2005-2014), within the framework of various state and target programs, more than RUB 83 billion were allocated from the federal, regional and local budgets (according to incomplete estimates) to support the sustainable development of the indigenous small-numbered peoples (the preservation of the traditional way of life, the development of traditional economic activities, including the reindeer herding, fishing, crafts, healthcare, welfare, education, raising of quality of life and housing improvement).

See also chapter about indigenous small-numbered peoples.

Article 6 of the Framework Convention

Combating racism and hate crimes

Recommendations

94. *It is necessary to intensify efforts to counter the spread of racist ideas among the population, especially among young people. If racist groups commit acts of violence, law enforcement authorities should respond quickly and should ensure effective implementation of the law.*

The problem of youth involvement in extremist activities on ethnic and religious grounds recently becomes more urgent among young people. Young people being most vulnerable to all the social and political changes notice and overrespond to everything that seems unfair that does not coincide with the general opinion often imposed by pseudo heroes from TV programs, newspapers and magazines, the Internet. Countering extremism and racism among young people becomes a nationwide task, including various aspects of its implementation.

Measures aimed at countering extremist activities include: awareness-raising activities, educational work with population, including activities aimed at preventing extremism among young people.

In order to improve the activities on countering extremism and terrorism, mutual exchange, accumulation and analysis of information, the interdepartmental working groups on issues related to the activities of non-profit organizations as well as the

improvement of interaction in the implementation of measures to combat extremism were established in the constituent entities of the Russian Federation.

The following measures were taken for this purpose:

- II International Interreligious Youth Forum (2015, Republic of Dagestan);
- Scientific and Practical Conference “The Holy Great Prince Vladimir, Equal of the Apostles. The Spiritual Origins of the Russian Civilization” (2015, Perm Region);
- A series of three workshops for children, students and young people “Crimea is Our Common Home” (2015, Republic of Crimea);
- A seminar for representatives of the media “Peculiarities of the Media Impact on a Person's Consciousness: Ethnopsychological Aspect” (2015, Republic of Crimea);
- Scientific and Practical Conference “Psychology of Socialization in the Information Space: Ethnopsychological Aspect” (2015, Republic of Crimea);
- Youth Inter-Ethnic Forum “Prosperity is in Unity” (2015, Republic of Crimea);
- International Scientific Conference “Prince Vladimir and His Time” (2015, Moscow);
- Cultural Forum of the Regions of Russia “Civil Solidarity in the Implementation of the State Cultural Policy: Interaction of Government, Business and Society” (2015, Yakutsk – Moscow).

Thus, we may state with certainty that the Russian Federation currently takes the consistent steps aimed at preventing racism, extremism on ethnic and religious grounds, preventing the involvement of children and adolescents in extremist organizations at the early stages, as well as constantly improves the relevant legislation.

The fight against the use of hate speech in the media and in political life

Recommendations

106. *The Advisory Committee urges the authorities to systematically, definitely and unconditionally condemn all manifestations of intolerance, racism and xenophobia in political life. The adequate sanctions should be applied to the politicians that support intolerance or incite hatred.*

107. *Much more drastic measures should be taken to combat the spread of prejudice, and sometimes hatred through the media, including through more effective use of the existing mechanism for the media self-regulation. It is necessary to expand the program for raising awareness among media professionals on the legal standards to combat discrimination and their responsibilities in the fight against racism and the promotion of respect for diversity.*

The activities of public associations whose objectives and actions are aimed at inciting social, racial, national and religious hatred are prohibited in the Russian Federation. The same equally applies to the individual politicians who are subject to

criminal prosecution if they commit acts that contain elements of the crime under Article 282 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation “Inciting hatred or hostility, and humiliation of human dignity” on the common basis.

The activities of mass media in the territory of the Russian Federation and the constituent entities of the Russian Federation are carried out under licenses issued by the authorities of the Federal Service for Supervision of Communications, Information Technology and Mass Communications (Roskomnadzor).

The law enforcement agencies and other interested state authorities of the Russian Federation interact with the media on a regular basis. The Ministry of Internal Affairs of the Russian Federation initiated the preparation of monthly publications of materials explaining the criminal nature of extremist organizations in the media and posting thereof on various Internet resources.

The mechanism of pre-trial blocking of sites containing radical content in the Internet was created by Federal Law No. 398-FZ of 28 December 2013 *On Amendments to the Federal Law On Information, Information Technologies and Information Protection*. The most popular bloggers (whose resources are visited by more than three million users per day) allowing extremist statements on their websites shall hold administrative responsibility.

The All-Russian competition of the media is annually held in cooperation with the Guild of Inter-Ethnic Journalism, “Radio of Russia” and *The Rossiyskaya Gazeta* to award the best coverage of the issues related to inter-ethnic interaction of the peoples of Russia and their ethnocultural development “SMIrotvorets”. The competition is held for participation of journalists of the federal, regional and national and cultural media.

Such competition already bears fruit. The results of “SMIrotvorets-2011” showed that the number of positive articles on ethnic themes in the Russian federal, regional and ethnic media increased more than twofold for three years (2009-2011).

The purpose of the competition is to promote the professional activity of journalists covering the issues related to life, culture and traditions of the peoples of multinational Russia, the issues of ethnocultural development and interaction of the peoples, the activities of the Russian state and civil society institutions to strengthen the unity of the Russian nation in the media; to promote covering (through the media, including the media of national and cultural societies) the positive examples of inter-cultural and inter-religious dialogue and cooperation, joint efforts of the state authorities of the Russian Federation and civil society institutions for harmonization of inter-ethnic relations, forecasting ethnic and religious extremism, strengthening the general civil solidarity.

The Guild of Inter-Ethnic Journalism has regularly held round tables, lectures and training seminars for journalists on competent coverage of ethnic issues in the media, with the support of state authorities, since 2010. In 2015, training seminars were held in 14 regions; 603 people from among journalists and national activists took part therein.

The Guild has held a three-month inter-ethnic journalism school on the basis of specially developed program as a system of advanced training for journalists working with ethnic themes since 2015. In 2015, 123 journalists were trained. The “Road Map” for the journalist who works in a multinational country was also released.

FAEA of Russia supported the periodic publication to the nationwide newspaper dedicated to the peoples of Russia and inter-ethnic harmony.

The situation in the North Caucasus

Recommendations

123. The Advisory Committee calls on the authorities to intensify efforts to prevent, investigate, prosecute and punish for human rights violations in the North Caucasus and put an end to impunity of those who violate these rights in order to restore an atmosphere of security, trust and mutual respect in the region.

124. Stigmatization of any specific population groups should be eliminated to prevent further human rights violations and growing tensions between different groups. The authorities should also take more drastic measures to counteract religious intolerance and promote respect for diversity.

In order to prevent human rights violations in the North Caucasus Federal District (“the NCFD”), the interdepartmental cooperation with non-governmental organizations, creative unions, national and cultural autonomies, public and religious associations of citizens was organized.

The constituent entities of the District have adopted and update the regional concepts of state national policy; the seminars and training courses for employees of the authorities in the field of ethno-religious and inter-ethnic relations are regularly held.

The national and local channels broadcast the programs on religious topics, which, *inter alia*, raise the issues of combating the spread of religious extremism in the region, restoring of an atmosphere of security and trust.

The representatives of religious organizations, national and cultural societies and local associations, state and local authorities systematically interact.

The entities of the NCFD, with the support of the federal centre, actively participate in the activities within the Federal Target Program “of the Unity of the Russian Nation and Ethnocultural Development of the Peoples of Russia (2014-2020)” (“the FTP”), such as:

- International Political Science Forum “Russian Caucasus”;
- All-Russian Competition of Journalists “SMIrotvoret” for the best coverage of issues of inter-ethnic and ethno-confessional relations;
- production of video projects relating to the promotion of tolerance, fight against ethnic extremism and prevention of international conflicts;

- meetings of young journalists and bloggers of the NCFD;
- project “Multinational Russia”;
- All-Russian master class of teachers of native languages, including Russian;
- development of exemplary work programs of instruction of subjects of national and regional directions in the entities of the NCFD in the context of the implementation of the federal state educational standards for general education.

In November 2012, the Council of Rectors of the North Caucasus Federal District approved the Recommendations for improving the forms and methods of work on the harmonization of inter-ethnic relations in the higher education institutions of the NCFD. The document calls for:

- to focus on the civic and patriotic ideological orientations, primarily aimed at strengthening of the Russian national identity combined with respect for the cultures, customs and traditions of all peoples in the educational process, scientific research, educational work, the students' creative work;
- to definitely oppose attempts of extremist forces to

to recruit the students being representatives of different ethnic groups, to expose the separatist ideas of separation of the North Caucasus from Russia, any change of the territory of the North Caucasus, the establishment of some alternative system of political and legal relations and management in the region during the training and educational process;

- to promote and ensure the popularization of ethno-cultural and ethno-confessional brand of the North Caucasus region as unique, attractive and safe territory of the Russian Federation;
- to ensure the strengthening of principles, forms and projections of secular ethics, secular spiritual and material culture in the university environment;
- to form the academic student groups and groups of students living in dormitories on a multinational basis.

In addition, the relevant regional programs of harmonization of inter-ethnic relations based on the model regional target program for the harmonization of inter-ethnic relations and strengthening of the unity of the Russian nation are implemented in the entities of the NCFD.

Some of them are supported at the federal level. For instance, in February 2014, Karachay-Cherkessia won a competitive selection among the constituent entities of the Russian Federation for subsidies within the framework of the FTP by presenting the regional sub-program “Harmonization of inter-ethnic relations and ethno-cultural development of the peoples of the Karachay-Cherkess Republic for 2014-2016” of the state program “Implementation of the state national, religious, information policy in the Karachay-Cherkess Republic until 2016”.

The following measures are being taken in the NCFD, with the support of the Ministry of North Caucasus Affairs of Russia, as part of the action plan for implementation of State National Policy Strategy of the Russian Federation until 2025:

- the annual district meetings of representatives of the executive authorities of the constituent entities of the Russian Federation on the prevention of inter-ethnic conflicts, ensuring of the effective operation of the system for monitoring and prevention of extremism on national and religious grounds;
- annual workshops of employees of cultural institutions (clubs, libraries, museums, national cultural centres) for the prevention of inter-ethnic conflicts;
- in accordance with the approved uniform programs, regular training, retraining and advanced training of the federal state civil and municipal employees involved in the implementation of the state national policy, as well as cooperating with national associations and religious organizations are undertaken.

The situation of migrant workers

Recommendations

129. *The Advisory Committee calls on the authorities to step up measures to ensure the effective integration of migrants in all aspects of life. Such policies should include the campaigns for more decisive struggle with anti-migrant and racist stereotypes and racist violence.*

The state guarantees for the enjoyment of the constitutional rights of ethnic minorities and migrant workers to labour and social protection from unemployment are stipulated by the Law of the Russian Federation *On employment in the Russian Federation* ("the Law"). According to Article 6 of the Law, the legislation on employment also applies to stateless persons, unless otherwise provided by federal laws or international treaties of the Russian Federation.

In this regard, employment of national minorities, including Roma, and foreign nationals legally residing in the territory of the Russian Federation, is ensured through the provision of a set of public services in the field of employment promotion, as well as their participation in additional measures to reduce tensions in the labour market of the constituent entities of the Russian Federation.

Migration statistics in the Russian Federation indicate that the majority of migrant workers are citizens of countries of the Commonwealth of Independent States (CIS).

On 29 May 2014 the Agreement on Foundation of Eurasian Economic Community (EAEC) was signed. In accordance therewith, the conditions for ensuring equal rights and opportunities for the employment of citizens of the EAEC member states in the territories of the EAEC member states were created.

Migrant workers and members of their families have the right to be fully informed by the state about employment, on a case-by-case basis, before their departure, or not

later than at the time of their entry into the state of employment, about all the conditions of their admission and, in particular, the conditions of their stay and remunerated activity in which they may be engaged, as well as about the requirements which they should meet in the state of employment, and about the body to which they should apply for the purpose of any changes in these conditions.

For this purpose, there is an information portal of the Federal Service for Labour and Employment “Work in Russia” on the Internet at the following address: www.trudvsem.ru.

The citizens, including foreign ones, may independently search for a job with the help of this information portal.

The users of the information portal have access to information about job vacancies information (vacancies), including the provision of housing, addresses and telephone numbers of the employment service bodies of the constituent entities of the Russian Federation where the relevant vacancy is offered.

Within the framework of the CIS, there is a system of exchange of information on the needs for the labour force in the national labour markets of CIS member states.

This system allows the user to get information about the labour legislation of CIS member states and the presence of vacancies in the labour markets of the CIS member states.

This social support, which includes unemployment benefits, is guaranteed to the unemployed persons.

The decision on recognition of a citizen registered in order to find suitable job as unemployed is taken by the employment service bodies at the place of residence of such citizen.

Thus, a foreign citizen may obtain the status of “unemployed” only in case of having a temporary residence permit or a residence permit in the Russian Federation and being registered at the place of residence.

In accordance with Federal Law No. 357-FZ of 24 November 2014 *On Amendments to the Federal Law On the Legal Status of Foreign Citizens in the Russian Federation and Certain Legislative Acts of the Russian Federation*, employers or customers of works (services), which are legal entities or individual entrepreneurs or private notaries, lawyers, who founded a lawyer’s office, or other persons whose professional activities shall be subject to state registration and (or) the licensing in accordance with federal laws may involve the foreign citizens who arrived to the Russian Federation in accordance with the procedure not requiring a visa, and under the age of eighteen years, lawfully staying in the territory of the Russian Federation, provided that each foreign citizen has patent, from the 1 January 2015.

A patent is a document confirming the right of a foreign citizen who has arrived to the Russian Federation in accordance with the procedure not requiring a visa, except

for certain categories of foreign citizens, to temporary labour activities in the territory of the Russian Federation.

The validity term of a patent may be repeatedly extended for a period of not less than one month. The total validity term of the patent, taking into account extensions, may not exceed twelve months from the date of issue of the patent.

The validity term of the patent shall be deemed extended for the period for which an income tax was paid in the form of a fixed advance payment.

Federal Law No. 115-FZ of 25 July 2002 *On the Legal Status of Foreign Citizens in the Russian Federation* provides for the right of the Government of the Russian Federation, taking into account the political, economic, social and demographic situation, to determine the need to involve foreign workers arriving in the Russian Federation on the basis of visas, including under priority professional and qualification groups, and in order to ensure national security, maintain an optimal balance of labour resources, the promotion of priority employment of citizens of the Russian Federation, as well as to resolve other problems of internal and foreign policy of the state, the Government of the Russian Federation has the right to set quotas for the issue work permits to foreign citizens arriving in the Russian Federation on the basis of visas.

The quota for the issue of work permits is determined on the basis of the proposals of the constituent entities of the Russian Federation on the need to involve foreign workers and approved in full, or partially reduced by the Interdepartmental Commission on determination of the need for involvement of foreign workers to the Russian Federation.

Within the implementation of immigration legislation, the Russian Federation insists on the legitimacy of stay of citizens of CIS countries in the Russian Federation. Any unlawful actions are the basis for expulsion and prohibition of entry into the Russian Federation for a certain period. This is all-European practice, which is being actively implemented in the Russian Federation.

130. *Additional steps should be taken to simplify the system of registration and access to the labour market in the Russian Federation, to avoid violating the law by migrant workers. It is important to ensure that the ill-treatment, exploitation of migrant workers and violations of labour and other legislation by the employer or other private persons are properly investigated, prosecuted and punished by the authorities, regardless of the legal status of migrant workers. It is also necessary to provide additional opportunities for migrant workers to obtain legal and other advice and support.*

The foreign citizens are advised on the Russian migration legislation within the framework of multi-service centres for the provision of state (municipal) services created in the constituent entities of the Russian Federation. More than 105,000 consultations were provided to foreign citizens and stateless persons over the three-month period of this year. Printed materials (memos for migrants), as well as visual

information and the Internet are used in consultations. The rooms are equipped with information boards and samples.

Article 7 of the Framework Convention

Freedom of association and assembly

Recommendations

138. *The Advisory Committee calls on the authorities to take all necessary steps to ensure full respect for the rights protected by Article 7 of the Framework Convention, as well as for the prevention, investigation and punishment for all violations or undue restriction of these rights.*

The right of citizens to assembly (association) is enshrined in Article 30 of the Constitution of RF. This right is regulated by the Civil Code of the Russian Federation, Federal Law No. 82-FZ of 19 May 1995 *On Public Associations*, Federal Law No. 7-FZ of 12 January 1996 *On Non-Profit Organizations*, Federal Law No. 10-FZ of 12 January 1996 *On Trade Unions, Their Rights and Guarantees*, Federal Law No. 3085-1 of 19 June 1992 *On Consumer Cooperation (Consumer Societies and Unions) in the Russian Federation*, Federal Law No. 95-FZ of 11 July 2001 *On Political Parties*, Federal Law No. 74-FZ of 17 June 1996 *On National and Cultural Autonomy*.

Article 31 of the Constitution provides the citizens of the Russian Federation with the right “to hold rallies, meetings, demonstrations, marches and pickets”. As part of building a system of counteracting extremism, including racial and ethnic intolerance, a restrictive condition for the enjoyment of this right is introduced. It means that citizens should “gather peacefully, without weapons”. Federal Law No. 54-FZ of 19 June 2004 *On Rallies, Meetings, Demonstrations, Marches and Picketing* enshrined the basic principles for holding the public event, including the principle of legality and the voluntary participation of citizens aged at least sixteen in a public event, in Article 3. Article 19 provides for the right to appeal against “decisions and actions (omission) violating the citizens’ right to hold a public event”. Article 149 of the Criminal Code provides for responsibility for “illegal obstruction of meetings, rallies, demonstrations, marches, picketing or participation in them or forcing to participate in them, if these acts were committed by an official using his official position or with the use, or threat of use, of violence”.

139. *The Advisory Committee also calls on the authorities to ensure that the law on countering extremist activities was not applied in a discriminatory manner and was not used to obstruct the activities of individuals and groups to protect the legitimate interests of national minorities and human rights in general. The inspections and audits the activities of NPOs, including those dealing with minority issues, conducted by the authorities, should not lead to any restrictions on freedom of association and assembly, in addition to necessary ones in a democratic society.*

The legitimate interests of national minorities, including in terms of freedom of association and assembly of indigenous small-numbered peoples of the Russian Federation, are protected by the legislation of the Russian Federation.

The notion of “extremist activity” (“extremism”) is disclosed in Article 1 of Federal Law No. 114-FZ of 25 July 2002 *On Combating Extremist Activity* (as amended on 8 March 2015). Extremist activities are deemed incitement to social, racial, national or religious hatred; propaganda of exceptional nature, superiority or deficiency of a person on the grounds of his/her social, racial, ethnic, religious or linguistic affiliation or attitude to religion; violation of human and civil rights, freedoms and legitimate interests depending on his/her social, racial, ethnic, religious or linguistic affiliation or attitude to religion; propaganda and public demonstration of Nazi emblems or symbols, or emblems or symbols similar or confusingly similar to Nazi emblems and symbols, or any public display of emblems or symbols of extremist organizations; public calls for the implementation of these actions or mass distribution of knowingly extremist materials, as well as their production or storage for the purpose of mass distribution; organization and preparation of these acts, as well as incitement to commit them, as well as their financing. **In order to** specify the provisions of Federal Law No. 114-FZ of 25 July 2002 *On Combating Extremist Activity* adopted in 2014. The Strategy for Countering Extremism in the Russian Federation until 2025 contains definitions of “ideology of extremism”, “extremism” and “combating extremism” and establishes the conceptual approaches for the implementation of the state policy in counteracting extremism.

To implement the Strategy for Countering Extremism, on 30 June 2015 an Action Plan for implementation of the Strategy for Countering Extremism in the Russian Federation until 2025 was approved under the number of 4721п-П44.

Pursuant to Article 13 of the Federal Law *On Combating Extremist Activity* and paragraph 7 of the Regulation on the Ministry of Justice of the Russian Federation, approved by Decree of the President of the Russian Federation No. 1313 of 13 October 2004, the Federal List of Extremist Materials has been created and is regularly updated in the Russian Federation. The materials recognized as extremist by the decision of the court are included into this list. At present, the list contains more than 3,000 names of extremist materials. The Ministry of Justice of Russia is responsible for keeping the federal list of extremist materials. For these purposes, the work of the Scientific Advisory Council at the Ministry was organized to study the informational materials of religious content in order to identify the signs of extremism.

In addition, the Ministry of Justice of Russia was entrusted to maintain a list of public associations and religious organizations, other NPOs, in respect of which the court delivered a final decision on liquidation or prohibition of activities, or activities of which were suspended due to their extremist nature.

140. *Furthermore, the Advisory Committee invites the authorities to consider the possibility to amend the federal legislation on political parties, to enable persons belonging to national minorities to set up political parties representing their legitimate interests. It also proposes to review the provisions of the Law On National and Cultural Autonomy, limiting the freedom of assembly.*

The activities of public associations whose objectives and actions are aimed at inciting to social, racial, national and religious hatred (Article 13) are prohibited by

the Constitution of the Russian Federation, and Article 9 of Federal Law No. 95-FZ of 11 July 2001 *On Political Parties* prohibits the establishment of political parties on the grounds of national (ethnic) and religious affiliation.

The legislation, including in the sphere of international relations, is being regularly improved depending on enjoyment of the right of legislative initiative.

Freedom of conscience and religion

Recommendations

144. *The Advisory Committee urges the authorities to continue their efforts to develop and implement a training program including the elements of religious education being versatile and not affiliated to any particular confession. In addition, it invites the authorities to ensure that religious education does not become an imposition of another religion or belief on students, and that students and their parents may make a free choice regarding religious education in all regions of the Russian Federation.*

On 7 December 2010 the Russian Ministry of Education has approved the subject “Fundamentals of Spiritual and Moral Culture of the Peoples of Russia” as part of the federal state educational standard of general education. Later, the course was renamed into “Fundamentals of Religious Cultures and Secular Ethics” (FRCSE). On 1 September 2012 this subject has been introduced in all constituent entities of the Russian Federation.

Teaching of FRCSE is based on the following regulatory acts of the legislation of the Russian Federation: The Constitution of the Russian Federation, the Laws of the Russian Federation *On Education, On Basic Guarantees of the Rights of the Child in the Russian Federation; On Freedom of Conscience and Religious Associations*. In accordance with the constitutional rules (Articles 13 and 14 of the Constitution of the Russian Federation), as well as Law *On Freedom of Conscience and Religious Associations*, the choice of one of 6 modules is the exclusive right of parents (legal representatives) of juvenile students.

The course of FRCSE is a single complex training and educational system. All its modules are consistent with each other in terms of pedagogical goals, objectives, requirements to the results of the mastering of educational content, which should be achieved by the students through the educational process within the course, as well as in the system of content, conceptual, value and semantic relations of the subject with other humanitarian subjects of elementary and primary school.

The course of FRCSE is culturological and aims at developing ideas of moral ideals and values that form the basis for religious and secular traditions of the multinational culture of Russia in the students of 10-11 years, understanding of their significance in the life of modern society and their affiliation thereto.

145. *The Advisory Committee urges the authorities to take decisive measures to ensure strict compliance with and the effective protection of constitutional guarantees of freedom of conscience and religion in the whole territory of the*

Russian Federation, as well as non-coercion of persons belonging to minorities and religious minorities to compliance with the traditions of a particular faith (see also comments on Article 6 above).

As of 31 December 2015, 28,465 religious organizations are registered in the Russian Federation.

In accordance with Federal Law No. 125-FZ of 26 September 1997 *On Freedom of Conscience and Religious Associations*, “the right of everyone to freedom of conscience and freedom of religion and equality before the law, regardless of attitude to religion and belief” is enshrined. According to Article 3 of the Law, the right to practice any religion or not to practice any religion is enshrined not only for Russian citizens, but also for foreign citizens and stateless persons.

Impeding exercise of the right to freedom of conscience and freedom of religion should be prohibited and prosecuted in accordance with federal law. The violation of this right entails an administrative (Article 5.26 of the Code of Administrative Offences of the Russian Federation “Violation of legislation on freedom of conscience and religious associations”) and criminal (Article 148 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation “Violation of the right to freedom of conscience and religion”) responsibilities.

Article 8 of the Framework Convention

Religious associations

Recommendations

152. *The Advisory Committee urges the authorities to ensure that “non-traditional” religious organizations will be provided with the possibility of unimpeded registration as religious organizations, and full compliance with federal rules governing freedom of religion, belief and association.*

153. *The Advisory Committee invites the authorities to take further steps to ensure that persons belonging to minorities and being Muslims, have sufficient access to places of worship, especially in the places substantially inhabited by them. Decisions on the construction or allocation of new places of worship should be taken during the close and timely consultation with representatives of interested groups.*

154. *The Advisory Committee urges the authorities to ensure the return of religious property to religious communities without discrimination, and to ensure that persons belonging to national minorities and followers of other religions, rather than Russian Orthodoxy, are not at a disadvantage.*

155. *The authorities should take more decisive steps to ensure the effective protection of all persons, including those belonging to minorities, from violations of the right to manifest their religion or belief, which is protected by Article 8 of the Framework Convention.*

Religious organizations registered by the Ministry of Justice of the Russian Federation operate in the territory of the Russian Federation, in addition to the traditional religions, according to the established procedure.

In 2014–2015, amendments to the Federal Law *On Freedom of Conscience and Religion* were adopted, according to which some provisions of the Civil Code of the Russian Federation were no longer applied to religious organizations. For example, religious organizations currently determine their hierarchical structure on an independent basis. They are not covered by Article 50 of the Civil Code of the Russian Federation in terms of the requirement for availability of an authorized capital in case of performing income-generating activities.

Control over the activities of religious organizations in terms of financing changed from November 2015: reports should be provided only by religious organizations financed from abroad.

The religious buildings are being transferred to religious organizations at their requests in accordance with Federal Law No. 327-FZ of 30 November 2010 *On the Transfer of Religious Property Owned by the State or Municipality to Religious Organizations*.

Article 9 of the Framework Convention

The Russian Federation provides financial and organizational support to the Russian media, including electronic and print, which issue, distribute and replicate the social projects aimed at harmonization of inter-ethnic relations, the development of inter-ethnic understanding, promotion of ideas of inter-ethnic tolerance and prevention of extremism on national and religious grounds and strengthening of inter-ethnic communication and unity of the Russian nation.

State media regularly carry out informational work aimed at harmonization of inter-ethnic and inter-confessional relations, promotion of culture of inter-ethnic communication and prevention of inter-ethnic and racial conflicts.

Cyclic cultural, educational, religious, socio-political and musical entertainment programs on this topic are regularly broadcasted on TV. In addition, the All-Russian State Television and Radio Broadcasting Company (VGTRK) weekly allocates time slot in the TV program “Russian TV” for a national thematic broadcasting by 25 regional branches and 3 territorial offices. In total, the regional branches of VGTRK produce and broadcast the information and thematic TV and radio programs in more than 50 national languages. Thus, the regional branch State Television and Radio Broadcasting Company “Dagestan” broadcasts programs in 13 local languages.

As a result of the increase in the volume of regional broadcasting from 2010, new cyclic programs and projects on the history of relations between the peoples inhabiting the North Caucasus, on the development of inter-ethnic relations, preserving the national, cultural and religious traditions appeared.

State print publication “Rossiyskaya Gazeta” and the magazine “Rodina” carry out constant informational work aimed at harmonization of inter-ethnic and inter-confessional relations, promotion of culture of inter-ethnic communication and prevention of ethnic and racial conflicts. A large number of materials on the problems of inter-ethnic and inter-confessional relations, activities of the authorities in this area, national cultures and traditions of the peoples of Russia, protection of rights of national minorities are published on the pages of the central and regional issues and on the official website of the publication www.rg.ru in rubrics and packages “Society”, “In the region”, “Culture”, “Religion”, “Migration”, “Foreigners in Russia” and others.

The media of national minorities

Recommendation

160. The Advisory Committee invites the authorities to facilitate access of minorities' organizations and media to government funding. It is also necessary to allocate additional resources to support the training of journalists and professionals from the media being in minority languages or covering the issues involving minorities.

The state authorities of the federal and regional levels support the publication, replication and distribution of media, covering the issues of ethnocultural development of the peoples of Russia, their history, current situation etc. During the period from January 2012 to June 2015, with the support of the Federal Agency for Press and Mass Media, 69 projects were implemented in the electronic media (the total amount of subsidies totalled RUB 132.1 million), and 85 projects were implemented in the print media (the total amount of subsidies totalled RUB 29.715 million).

The following programs are among the projects supported by the state:

- TV shows: “Diasporas”, “Welcome”, “Culture News”, “Earth and Sky” (Television and Radio Broadcasting Company “Mir”), “The Big Country” (Russian Public Television), “Finding Story” (Television and Radio Broadcasting Company “NNTV”, N. Novgorod), “Living Together!” (Branch VGTRK GTRK “Volgograd-TRV”), “Chime of Buryatia”, “Nairamdal” (GTRK “Buryatia”) and others;
- TV documentaries: “Let be the brothers”, the second film (branch of VGTRK GTRK “Stavropolye”), a series of TV documentaries “Cultural Capital Commonwealth” (TRC “Mir”), “Holidays” (TV channel “Culture”), “Hearth” (branch of VGTRK GTRK “Adygea”) and others;
- radio programs: “Peoples of Russia” (“Radio of Russia”), “The National Question” (radio “Komsomolskaya Pravda”), “Kyzyl in faces” (branch of VGTRK GTRK “Tyva”) and others;

- projects in the federal and regional magazines: “Elementary School” (Moscow), the project “Training and education in multiethnic and multicultural environment (classes with multinational structure of pupils, including classes with a significant proportion of children of migrants and internally displaced persons)”; “Young Guard” (Moscow), the project “Towards each other”; “The Roma of Russia” (Moscow), the project “Addressing the social problems of the Roma people, strengthening and development of its cultural traditions according to the comprehensive plan for socio-economic and ethnocultural development of the Roma in the Russian Federation for 2014-2015”; “Ushkan” (Republic of Buryatia), the project “Tree of cultures”; “Maramyz (Constellation)” (Republic of Karachaevo-Cherkessia), the project “Keep your customs, respect the customs of other peoples” and others;
- projects in the federal and regional newspapers: “Moskovskiy Komsomolets” (Moscow), the project “Beyond the Law”; “Weekdays of district” (Republic of Dagestan), the project “Information confrontation to crime, terrorism, extremism, ethnic and religious intolerance in the municipal area”; “Center of Asia” (Republic of Tyva), the project “Traditions of the peoples' interaction of a century unity of Russia and Tuva: combining history and Russian language”; “Rural Newspaper” (Krasnodar Territory), the project “Peculiarities of National Friendship”; “Orenburg sudarynya” (Orenburg Region), the project “Community”; “Zmeinogorsky Bulletin” (Altai Territory), the project “We are different, but we are together”; “Inform Polis” (Republic of Buryatia), the project “Lessons of the Buryat language”; “Revival” (Republic of Mordovia), the project “We are a single particle of Russia” and others.

Article 10 of the Framework Convention

The use of minority languages in private and public places

Recommendation

166. The Advisory Committee reiterates its urgent recommendation to the Russian authorities to ensure that guarantees and the effective enjoyment of the rights provided for in Article 10 of the Framework Convention, in all regions. The use of minority languages, particularly small-numbered groups, should be actively encouraged and supported by the authorities, so that persons belonging to national minorities may effectively enjoy their rights protected by Article 10 of the Framework Convention.

In accordance with Article 14 of Federal Law No. 273-FZ of 29 December 2012 *On Education in the Russian Federation*, education in the state language of the Russian Federation, as well as the choice of language for training and education within the possibilities offered by the education system shall be guaranteed in the Russian Federation.

Citizens of the Russian Federation have the right to acquire pre-school, primary general and basic general education in their native language among the languages of the peoples of the Russian Federation, as well as the right to study their native language among the languages of the peoples of the Russian Federation.

The enjoyment of these rights is ensured by the creation of the necessary number of corresponding educational institutions, classes, groups, as well as the conditions for their functioning. Teaching and learning of the native language from among the languages of the peoples of the Russian Federation in the framework of state-accredited educational programs are carried out in accordance with the federal state educational standards, educational standards.

The language, the languages of education are determined by the educational organization with the participation of parents (legal representatives) and enshrined by local regulatory acts (documents) of these educational institutions.

In addition, the education system of the Russian Federation is governed by articles of Law of the Russian Federation No. 1807-1 of 25 October 1991 *On Languages of Peoples of the Russian Federation*:

Article 9 “The right to choose the language of education”;

Article 10 “Teaching and learning of languages of the peoples of the Russian Federation”.

It should be noted that Law of the Russian Federation *On Languages of Peoples of the Russian Federation* governs the general issues related to language policy in the field of education, and issues of the study of the state languages of the republics within the Russian Federation are regulated by regional legislation (Article 6 of the Law of the Russian Federation *On Languages of the Peoples of the Russian Federation*).

In the Russian Federation, except for the Russian language as the state language of the Russian Federation, the training is conducted in 24 languages of the republics belonging to the Russian Federation, and 40 languages of the peoples of Russia are taught as an academic subject. In addition, the literature, and in some regions of Russia geography or local history, are learned as subjects in the language of the indigenous peoples.

For example, about RUB 22 million were transferred for 37 educational institutions, which educate children of indigenous small-numbered peoples, in the Khabarovsk Territory, more than RUB 23 million — for 20 educational institutions in the Zabaikalsky Territory, about RUB 2.5 million — for 3 educational institutions in the Nenets Autonomous Area. 34 schools of the Sakha Republic (Yakutia) were provided with 101 sets of educational and laboratory equipment.

In accordance with Article 5 § 3 of Federal Law No. 273-FZ, free higher education shall be guaranteed in the Russian Federation on a competitive basis, if a citizen acquires this type of education level for the first time.

Training of representatives of indigenous small-numbered peoples of the Russian Federation by orders of the constituent entities of the Russian Federation is provided by the Russian State Pedagogical University named after A.I. Herzen, the North-Eastern Federal University named after M.K. Ammosov, Yugra, Gorno-Altai, Buryat State Universities.

The Tomsk Region, under a contract with the Russian State Pedagogical University named after A.I. Herzen, annually sends 3 persons from among indigenous small-numbered peoples of the North for training in teaching of the native language.

The Khanty-Mansiysk Technological and Pedagogical College implements the project "Preparation of national teaching staff with additional training in the native language and literature", in which 85 students participate.

The additional training of the Ulch, Nivkh, Evenk languages is provided for students of the Nikolayevsk-on-Amur pedagogical college of small-numbered peoples of the North.

The Yamal versatile college prepares specialists for work in the nomadic kindergarten and nomadic school.

The Naryan-Marskiy socio-humanitarian college named after I.P. Vyucheysky provides additional training for students in the teaching of the native (Nenets) language.

Educational programs of the Northern National Lyceum (Murmansk Region) are aimed at preserving of the unique culture of the Sami.

The process of improving the quality of teacher training, the methodological culture is intentionally completed by understanding of the tasks that arise during the organization of the educational process for the children of indigenous small-numbered peoples both in the advanced training system at the state (federal and regional) level.

The constituent entities of the Russian Federation, with educational institutions in places of residence and traditional activities of indigenous small-numbered peoples of the North, scientific and practical conferences and training seminars on the organization of the study of native languages and national cultures of small-numbered peoples are regularly held (in the republics of Buryatia, Sakha (Yakutia), Krasnoyarsk Territory, Arkhangelsk Region, etc.), at institutes of advanced training and retraining of workers of education and higher schools are training courses (in the republics of Buryatia, Khakassia, Khabarovsk, Krasnoyarsk, Kemerovo, Murmansk, Tomsk, Sakhalin Regions, the Yamal-Nenets Autonomous Area and others).

In order to facilitate the study of the native languages the Research Institute of Ethnic Schools of the Sakha Republic (Yakutia), with the participation of the Russian Ministry carries out scientific-methodical work and analytical research on the formation of ethnocultural, regional and civil identity of children of indigenous small-numbered peoples, the issues of ethnic and cultural quality of education in the conditions multicultural environment, and develops a model of the organization of

educational activities in pre-school and educational institutions (including ungraded) located in places of traditional residence and economic activities of indigenous small-numbered peoples of the North.

The annual event for teachers of native languages - "All-Russian master class of teachers of native, including Russian languages", aimed at the preservation of a common educational and cultural space of the Russian Federation (Moscow), which aims at the development of creative activity of the teacher educators to update the content of education, support new technologies in the organization of educational process, raising the status of teachers of native languages, including Russian language teachers, working in conditions of bilingualism.

In order to develop and preserve the native languages of indigenous small-numbered peoples of the North of high level of their ownership of the scientific organizations of the Russian Federation educational, scientific and fiction, including on electronic media in the languages of indigenous peoples for use in the educational process is developed and published .

Within the framework of the federal target program "Strengthening of the unity of the Russian nation and ethnocultural development of the peoples of Russia (2014-2020)" from 23 to 26 June 2015, Moscow FAEA of Russia together with the Ministry of Culture of the Russian Federation held a seminar "Language Policy in education: a tool of formation of Russian national identity". The seminar was due to the need to work out proposals for the creation of optimal conditions for the preservation and development of languages of the peoples living in the Russian Federation, the organization of educational process aimed at the formation of the all-Russian civic identity based on the language situation in the Russian Federation.

The event was attended by 53 constituent entities of the Russian Federation, including representatives of public authorities (17 people) and the authorities of the constituent entities of the Russian Federation (44 people), native languages teachers, including Russian (30 teachers), representatives of scientific and expert community (100 people) including 5 academicians, 78 doctors, 91 PhD, 127 reports were heard. During the seminar-meeting of two plenary meetings and four thematic sections, the problems and mechanisms for the implementation of language policies, problems and prospects of teaching native languages of peoples of Russia, including the languages of indigenous small-numbered peoples were considered, topical issues of contemporary language policy in education was discussed, successful experience in implementing projects aimed at the preservation and development of ethnic and cultural and linguistic diversity in the Russian Federation was presented.

From 16 to 23 November 2015 as part of the celebration of the International Day of Tolerance on the initiative of FAEA of Russia the lessons of tolerance have been conducted in schools across the country. During cooperation of FAEA of Russia and the Jewish Museum and Tolerance Centre have developed guidelines for teaching in elementary, middle and high school. Students got acquainted with the cultural heritage of the peoples of the world, learned to write the word "peace" in 86 languages as well as their name in Farsi, rehearsed proverbs of different peoples in Russian: Tatar, Jewish, Dagestan, Udmurt, Bashkir and others.

It is also important to note that the Criminal Procedure Code of the Russian Federation establishes the right of a citizen to give evidence in his/her native language, to use the free services of an interpreter, to receive copies of documents subject to compulsory service which are translated into the native language (Article 18, Code of Criminal Procedure), all of the accused and suspects of crimes have the right to legal counsel regardless of their financial status and other circumstances (Articles 16, 51 of the Code of Criminal Procedure). Evidence obtained in violation of these rights is inadmissible (Article 75 of the Code of Criminal Procedure).

Membership in any national minority is not an obstacle to access to justice.

The choice of the alphabet

Recommendation

169. The Advisory Committee once again urges the Russian authorities to retake the federal legislation providing for exceptions for the use of the Cyrillic alphabet in all official languages, in accordance with Article 10 of the Framework Convention.

Cyrillic alphabet is traditionally and justifiably for many decades has been used in writing systems of the Russian languages. Many writings were originally created on the basis of Cyrillic alphabet. Cyrillic alphabet consists of 33 letters and allows using different letter combinations indicate in writing all the sounds used in the languages of the peoples of Russia. At the same time the feasibility of changes, providing for an exception for the use of the Cyrillic alphabet, with language development position requires additional scientific studies.

Article 11 of the Framework Convention

Topographical signs

Recommendation

173. The Advisory Committee calls on the Russian authorities to ensure consistent implementation on the regional level of federal guarantees regarding the use of topographical signs in minority languages.

In the Russian Federation, where in addition to the Russian language the status of state language and languages of the peoples of Russia (in the Republic of North Ossetia - Alania - Ossetian, in the Republic of Crimea - Ukrainian, etc.) topographical signs are duplicated in Russian and in the language of a national minority.

Article 12 of the Framework Convention

Equal access to education

Recommendations

180. The Advisory Committee invites the authorities to continue the monitoring of the compliance by all schools of children' right to attend school, regardless of the

legal status of their parents or of whether have registration. In case of violation of the law in this regard immediate and effective actions should be taken.

According to Article 3 § 1 (2) of Federal Law No. 273-FZ of 29 December 2012 *On Education in the Russian Federation* ("Law No. 273-FZ"), the public policy and legal regulation of relations in the field of education are based, *inter alia*, on the principle of ensuring the right of everyone to education, non-discrimination in education on a national basis. Thus on the basis of paragraph 2 article 5 § of the Law No. 273-FZ of the right of education in the Russian Federation shall be guaranteed irrespective of gender, race, nationality, language, origin, property and social status, residence, attitude to religion, convictions or other circumstances.

In accordance with Article 78 of the Law No. 273-FZ, foreign citizens and stateless persons have equal rights with citizens of the Russian Federation to receive pre-school, primary general, basic general and secondary education as well as vocational training program of vocational training for occupations of workers, positions of employees within the mastery of the secondary education curriculum on the general and free of charge basis.

In this regard, in order to implement the right to education of children, including, for example, Roma and other national minorities under Article 5 § 4, Article 9 of the Law No. 273-FZ, Articles 15, 16 of Federal Law No. 131-FZ of 06 October 2003 *On General Principles of Organization of Local Self-Government in the Russian Federation*, local governments created the appropriate social and economic conditions for its receipt, organized records of all children to be educated from 6 to 15 years, taking into account the foreign citizens (stateless persons), as well as the consolidation of municipal educational institutions for specific territories.

As part of these activities and in accordance with Article 14 § 1 (4), § 2 (2) of Federal Law No. 120-FZ of 24 June 1999 *On Basics of the System of Minors' Neglect and Offences Prevention*, bodies that manage education sphere and organizations engaged in educational activities provide the identification and registration of minors who do not attend or systematically fail to attend educational institutions without valid reason, take measures for their education and providing general education to them. As a mechanism for the protection and restoration of the rights and legitimate interests of minors to get education the powers of commissions on juvenile affairs and protection of their rights are used (Article 11 of the mentioned law).

181. The Advisory Committee urges the authorities to put an end to improper placement of Roma pupils in special schools. Particular attention should be paid to ensure that the students testing was passed without discrimination.

182. The authorities should take resolute measures to transfer and integrate Roma students enrolled in separate classes or schools, in educational institutions. However, while maintaining the temporary separation of education should focus on improving of academic achievement and quality of education. You should also carry out regular monitoring of the learning process in these schools/classes and provide teachers and

school administrators with additional support and guidance. The authorities should consider the introduction of school system mediators between Roma.

183. *The Advisory Committee urges the authorities to redouble their efforts to create and implement alternatives to boarding schools, which would adequately match the educational needs of persons belonging to indigenous peoples.*

As part of the federal state educational standard of general education, approved by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation of 17 December 2010 No. 1897, in order to ensure the individual needs of students, including the Roma nation, at the expense of extracurricular activities in the constituent entities of the Russian Federation programs are implemented aimed at the development and socialization of studying in the areas of personality development (sports and recreation, spiritual, moral, social, intellectual, general cultural).

In 2013 - 2014, prosecutors of a number of the constituent entities of the Russian Federation carried out checks to verify compliance with the rights and legitimate interests of Roma children in educational institutions. Violation of their right to education has not been established.

Roma children have equal rights and opportunities for learning in educational institutions, they are provided with educational literature and stationery and food. For delivery of enrolled in educational institutions located in rural areas the buses are used.

If necessary, children from Roma families experiencing difficulties in the development of basic educational programs, development and social adaptation, psychological and pedagogical, medical and social assistance is provided, in accordance with the requirements of Article 42 of Federal Law No. 273-FZ.

The facts of segregation of Roma children were also not established. Education in some rural schools, so-called "Roma classes" is based on the decision of parents, taking into account national traditions, nomadic lifestyle of citizens of called nationality. For the same reasons, in some educational institutions for these children correspondence course are organized remotely and internally.

See also chapter about Roma.

Intercultural learning

Recommendations

187. *The Advisory Committee invites the authorities to intensify efforts to promote respect for cultural diversity and education against racism in school. It is necessary to make further efforts to train teachers to work in multicultural environment.*

188. *It is necessary to take further steps to disseminate comprehensive and adequate knowledge on national minorities in school textbooks and schools in general. Particular emphasis should be placed on the study of the history of national minorities, and the work in this direction should be conducted in close cooperation with representatives of the respective groups.*

As one of the instruments of unity of peoples of Russia, preservation and development of culture, traditions and customs of different nationalities living in the same land, and in one country is considered cultural events, thematic ethno-exhibitions, ethno-festivals.

During 2011 - 2015, the following cultural events have been held considering the way of life of national minorities in the Russian Federation:

The gala concert of the International Festival of Arts and Popular Traditions "Finno-Ugric transit: childhood holiday" (the Republic of Karelia, city of Petrozavodsk);

Popular science lecture "Culture of peoples of Western Siberia: tradition and modernity" (Omsk Region);

Republican folklore ethnographic festival "'Tusholi" festivities'" (Republic of Ingushetia);

Preservation and development of the traditional culture of the peoples of the Altai (Altai Republic);

International festival competition of ethnic pop "Song of Fire" (Republic of Khakassia);

Republican holiday "Tun Payram" (Republic of Khakassia);

International festival of ethnic music and crafts "World of Siberia" (Krasnoyarsk Territory);

Festivals and competitions aimed at the preservation and development of folk art of the Republic of Bashkortostan;

Festival of traditions and customs of peoples of Russia "The People's Station" (Chuvash Republic);

Inter-regional competition of national costume "Holiday of Mariy costume invites" (Mariy-El Republic);

Russian folk festival "Karavon" (Republic of Tatarstan);

III International Festival of the Arctic "Taimyr Attraction" (Krasnoyarsk Territory);

Festivals of folk art of Kostroma Region;

Festivals and competitions of traditional culture "The Kursk mosaic";

National Festival of Arts and LLS "Crimean Mosaic" (Republic of Crimea);

International Festival of National Cultures "Don Peoples friendly family" (Rostov Region);

International Festival of Folk Art of the Russian regions and the Caspian states "The Caspian Sea-shore of friendship" (Republic of Dagestan);

II Regional competition game on national harmonica named after People's Artist of the RSFSR K.Kashirgova (Kabardino-Balkarian Republic);

International Festival of storytellers "Epics of peace on earth of Dzhargara descendants" (Republic of Kalmykia);

International festival of folk art and crafts "Sadko" (Novgorod Region);

Russian folklore competition "Cossack Circle";

All-Russia competition of folk artists "Russia Workshop";

Round table "Mechanisms of public-private partnerships in the provision of cultural communications, ethnocultural and inter-religious dialogue in the regions of Russia" (2015, Moscow);

International scientific-practical conference "Islamic education in multicultural space of Russia: Yesterday, Today and Tomorrow" (2015, Pyatigorsk), in the framework of which a seminar-meeting for representatives of the Spiritual Administration of Muslims of the North Caucasus and the Mufti of the Krasnoyarsk Territory, Yamal-Nenets Autonomous Area, Orenburg and Sverdlovsk Regions, as well as the Republic of Kalmykia was held;

Refresher courses for Islamic religious leaders and Islamic teachers of educational institutions on the basis of Federal State Budgetary Educational Institution of Higher Professional Education "Pyatigorsk State Linguistic University" (2015, Stavropol Territory).

See also comments on recommendations Nos. 63, 144, 166.

Article 14 of the Framework Convention

Impact of the reform of the educational system in the teaching of minority languages

Recommendations

193. As part of the process of "optimization" of schools, the Advisory Committee urges the authorities to identify and implement learning opportunities for conservation of measures in the languages of minorities and the use of minority languages in areas where persons belonging to national minorities live in substantial quantities. In general, it invites the authorities to take measures for the development of an atmosphere that encourages persons belonging to national minorities for greater study and use of their minority languages (see also comments on Article 10 above).

194. The authorities should ensure that the implementation of the new standard of the educational program, introduced in 2011, duly took into account the needs of persons belonging to national minorities, and has provided an opportunity to a

quality education in their own languages and qualitative study of their languages and cultures.

In Article 43 of the Constitution the right to education is established. According to this article in the Russian Federation “access to free pre-school, basic and secondary vocational education in state or municipal educational institutions and enterprises is guaranteed.” In addition, each shall have the right “get free higher education in a state or municipal educational institution or enterprise on a competitive basis.” Article 5 of Federal Law No. 273-FZ of 29 December 2012 *On Education in the Russian Federation* stipulates that education should be provided “regardless of gender, race, nationality, language, origin, property, social and official status, place of residence, attitude to religion, beliefs, membership of voluntary associations.” Article 14 guarantees education in the state language of the Russian Federation, as well as the choice of language training and education within the possibilities offered by the education system. At the state and municipal educational institutions located in the territory of the Russian Federation republics, teaching and learning the official languages of the republics may be administered. In addition, it provided teaching of the native language of the peoples of Russia upon request of a group of parents. Currently 34 languages of peoples of Russia are the state languages of the republics in the Russian Federation and can be used in these constituent entities on a par with the Russian language. According to the statistical surveillance in the 2014/2015 academic year, in addition to the Russian language as the state language of the Russian Federation, the training was conducted in the 24 official languages of the republics belonging to the Russian Federation, and 73 languages of the peoples of Russia are studied as a subject.

Education in minority languages and the study of minority languages

Recommendations

201. The Advisory Committee urges the authorities to ensure effective implementation of the federal legislative guarantees at the local level, to ensure real access to education on minority languages, including persons belonging to small-numbered or dispersed minorities. Particular attention should be paid to the account of educational needs of the scattered minority groups and minorities without territorial unit to ensure adequate opportunities for access to education on minority languages.

202. Parents should be aware of their right to request education on minority languages. Particular attention should be paid to the continuity of minority language education at all levels of the education system.

203. More efforts should be made for the effective involvement of representatives of minorities, especially indigenous peoples, in the development of school programs on a number of subjects, in particular, and on their language and culture.

The state assists in the organization of various forms of education on the languages of the peoples of Russia, including remote ones, for people living outside their

national-state and national-territorial subdivisions, as well as citizens who do not have any, representatives of indigenous small-numbered peoples and ethnic groups.

See chapter of indigenous small-numbered peoples.

Article 15 of the Framework Convention

Representation in elected bodies

Recommendation

209. The Advisory Committee urges the authorities to re-consider all measures, including reservation of seats, to increase the opportunities for persons belonging to national minorities to be represented in election assemblies at different levels, to enable them to protect their legitimate interests.

Participation in election bodies (representative) bodies in accordance with the legislation on elections is carried out regardless of the ethnic or religious affiliation. Personnel policy of public authorities is based on the level of competence of employees, where when applying for public service the level of education is taken into account, skills and experience in the relevant work.

Consultation mechanisms

Recommendations

216. The Advisory Committee invites the authorities to ensure that the existing bodies of national minorities effectively promoted the regular and stable participation of persons belonging to national minorities in the decision of all matters affecting them.

217. It also invites the authorities to create the structure on federal level that would ensure regular consultation with persons belonging to indigenous peoples in close cooperation with representatives of these groups. The authorities also need to take additional steps in order to ensure effective consultation with persons belonging to these groups, in making decisions on issues affecting them at the regional and federal level.

218. Further steps should be taken to improve the coordination of policies on minorities between the constituent entities of the Federation, as well as between the federal and regional level. Particular attention should be paid to the need to ensure consistent implementation of the rights provided by the Framework Convention on the whole territory of the Russian Federation.

Representatives of non-profit organizations dealing with issues of national minorities participate in various advisory and coordinating bodies in the field of harmonization of inter-ethnic and inter-confessional relations.

Thus, in the Republic of Tatarstan the Council under the President of the Republic of Tatarstan on inter-ethnic and inter-confessional relations and inter-agency working group on inter-ethnic and inter-confessional relations is acting.

In the Republic of Mordovia the Council at the Head of the Republic of Mordovia is acting on Ethnic Relations and the Public Council for the development of Orthodox culture at the Head of the Republic of Mordovia.

Advisory bodies are cooperative in nature and include in its membership the representatives of the government of the Russian Federation, the most authoritative representatives of national and religious organizations operating in the territory of the Russian Federation, public officials, representatives of the scientific community.

Meetings of advisory bodies at the level of the Russian Federation are held not less than twice a year. An extraordinary meeting of the relevant body is also envisaged. However, in many constituent entities of the Russian Federation, activities on the harmonization of interethnic and interreligious relations are provided by number of bodies, so the actual quantity of meetings is higher. Thus, in the Republic of Tatarstan over a period of 2011 - 2015, 17 meetings of the Presidential Council and of the interdepartmental working group on the harmonization of interethnic relations have been held. In addition, it is necessary to take into account existing consultative bodies at the municipal level. So, in the Stavropol Territory at the municipal level operate 34 Ethnic Councils and 283 Councils of peace and friendship.

Thus, it should be noted that the public authorities of the constituent entities of the Russian Federation made considerable work on the improvement of public administration in the sphere of interethnic and interreligious relations through the establishment of constructive engagement with civil society institutions and involving them in the decision of the state national policy tasks.

Participation in economic life

Recommendations

225. The Advisory Committee urges the authorities to accelerate the implementation of measures aimed at improving the socio-economic conditions of indigenous peoples, especially in regard to access to the labour market and to health care. Development, implementation and regular monitoring of all such measures should be carried out in close consultation with representatives of minorities to ensure their maximum efficiency.

See chapter of indigenous small-numbered peoples.

226. The Advisory Committee also urges the authorities to immediately take complex positive measures aimed at improving access of Roma to all sectors of the labour market, including through technical and vocational education and training.

227. The authorities should also ensure the involvement of a sufficient number of employees with the knowledge of minority languages to work in the public service, that persons belonging to national minorities may use their language in contacts with local administrations, in accordance with Article 10 of the Framework Convention.

See chapter of indigenous small-numbered peoples.

Article 16, 17 of the Framework Convention

Cross-border work of NPOs

Recommendation

240. *The Advisory Committee urges the authorities to refrain from any undue interference with the right of persons belonging to national minorities to establish and maintain free and peaceful cross-border contacts.*

Article 17 of the Framework Convention of the Council of Europe for the Protection of National Minorities refers to the fact that persons belonging to national minorities have the right to establish and maintain free and peaceful cross-border contacts with persons residing in the territory of other States, in particular those with whom they share common ethnic, cultural, linguistic or religious heritage. Constitution of the Russian Federation and the international instruments on human rights contain the provision that every citizen of the Russian Federation has the right to freedom of movement, choice of place of residence within the Russian Federation, the restriction of this right of citizens is allowed only on the basis of the law (Article 1 of Law of the Russian Federation of 25 June 1993 No. 5242-1 *On the Right of Citizens of the Russian Federation to Freedom of Movement, Choice of Place of Stay and Residence within the Russian Federation*).

Article 18 of the Framework Convention

Bilateral relations

Recommendations

243. *The Advisory Committee urges the authorities to ensure that the tension in the relations with the neighbouring countries did not lead to a violation of rights protected by the Framework Convention.*

244. *It also reiterates its strong recommendation on the conclusion of bilateral agreements in order to improve the protection of persons belonging to the national minorities.*

The Russian side creates the working groups on cross-border cooperation with various countries, within the frameworks of which issues of ethnocultural development of the people living in border areas are considered.

Refugees and internally displaced persons from Ukraine are assisted and supported in the territory of the Russian Federation. Socially oriented organizations working with this category of people are also supported.

The Russian Federation on extradition of foreign nationals who have committed wrongful acts in the territory of a foreign state is based on the provisions of Article 13 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation and on concluded international agreements on extradition.

CONCLUSION

The Russian Federation is a multinational state in the territory of which representatives of more than 190 nationalities live. National policy has been historically considered by the country's leadership as one of the priorities, as the multinational nation of the Russian Federation is the basis of existence of the state, its foundation. The national policy of Russia is based on a coherent system of regulatory acts, consisting primarily of the Constitution of the Russian Federation, federal laws of the Russian Federation and the respective subordinate acts providing for the implementation of measures to combat extremism, incitement to racial and religious hatred and enmity, preservation and development of the culture of national minorities, support of multilingualism, the further development of civil society institutions and the media. The international treaties of the Russian Federation, primarily the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities, the provisions of which are directly applicable in the territory of our country in accordance with Article 15 of the Constitution of the Russian Federation, are an important element of this system. It should be emphasized that the basis for compliance with the provisions of the Convention by the Russian Federation is the effective state policy to strengthen civil unity, preservation of ethnic and cultural diversity and multilingualism.

The Russian Federation respects the active position of different civil society institutions involved in the implementation of the state national policy, seeks to comprehensively promote cooperation with non-governmental organizations, including public unions and associations.

In accordance with current legislation, the state authorities of the Russian Federation and state authorities of the constituent entities of the Russian Federation, with the support of non-governmental organizations, widely support the ethnocultural development of the peoples of Russia, in particular take measures to support ethnic media, ensure ethnically oriented education, hold different ethnic and cultural events.

The Russian Federation, strictly complying with its international commitments for the protection of national minorities, observance of human and civil rights and freedoms will continue to pursue a coordinated policy for the protection of its national interests, to protect the Russian citizens regardless of their racial, ethnic, linguistic, religious, and other affiliation, advocating their interests in case of any unlawful infringement, and wherever they are.

APPENDIXES

The list of main regulatory acts in the sphere of protection of rights of national minorities

- The Constitution of the Russian Federation (as amended by laws of the Russian Federation on amendments to the Constitution of the Russian Federation No. 6-FKZ of 30.12.2008 and No. 7-FKZ of 30.12.2008), <http://www.constitution.ru/>
- Federal Law No. 114-FZ of 25.07.2002 *On Combating Extremist Activity* (as amended on 08.03.2015),
<http://docs.cntd.ru/document/901823502>
- Federal Law No. 82-FZ of 30.04.1999 *On Guarantees of the Rights of Indigenous Small-Numbered Peoples of the Russian Federation*,
<http://constitution.garant.ru/act/right/180406/>
- Federal Law No. 99-FZ of 24.05.1999 *On State Policy of the Russian Federation in Respect of Compatriots Living Abroad*,
http://www.consultant.ru/document/cons_doc_LAW_23178/
- Federal Law No. 104-FZ of 20.07.2000 *On General Principles of Organization of Indigenous Small-Numbered Peoples' Communities of The North, Siberia and the Russian Far East*,
<http://docs.cntd.ru/document/901765288>
- Federal Law No. 49-FZ of 20.05.2001 *On Territories of Traditional Natural Resource Use by indigenous small-numbered peoples of the North, Siberia and the Russian Far East*,
<http://docs.cntd.ru/document/901786770>
- Federal Law No. 62-FZ of 31.05.2002 *On Citizenship of the Russian Federation*,
<http://docs.cntd.ru/document/901819226>
- Federal Law No. 115-FZ of 25.07.2002 *On the Legal Status of Foreign Citizens in the Russian Federation*,
<http://docs.cntd.ru/document/901823501>
- Federal Law No. 284-FZ of 22 October 2013 *On Amendments to Certain Legislative Acts of the Russian Federation with regard to Determination of the Powers and Responsibilities of State Authorities of the Constituent Entities of the Russian Federation, Local Authorities and their Officials in the Area of Inter-Ethnic Relations*,
http://www.consultant.ru/document/cons_doc_LAW_153536/

- Federal Law No. 33-FZ of 4 November 2014 *On Amendments to Articles 1 and 4 of the Federal Law On National and Cultural Autonomy,*

<https://rg.ru/2014/11/07/avtonomiya-dok.html>

- Federal Law No. 440-FZ of 22 December 2014 *On Amendments to Article 31 of the Federal Law On Non-Profit Organizations,*

http://www.consultant.ru/document/cons_doc_LAW_172515/

- The Criminal Code of the Russian Federation of 13.06.1996 No. 63-FZ (as amended on 25.07.2015),

http://www.consultant.ru/document/cons_doc_LAW_10699/

- The Code of Administrative Offences of the Russian Federation (as amended on 05.10.2015),

http://www.consultant.ru/document/cons_doc_LAW_34661/

- Decree of the President of the Russian Federation No. 803 of 03.06.1996 *On Basic Provisions of Regional Policy in the Russian Federation,*

<https://www.referent.ru/1/18877>

- Decree of the President of the Russian Federation No. 537 of 12.05.2009 *On the National Security Strategy of the Russian Federation until 2020,*

<https://rg.ru/2009/05/19/strategia-dok.html>

- Action Plan for implementation of the Strategy for Countering Extremism in the Russian Federation until 2025 approved on 30.07.2015 under number 4721n-П44,

<http://www.garant.ru/products/ipo/prime/doc/71195422/>

- Decree of the President of the Russian Federation No. 602 7 May 2012 *On Ensuring Inter-Ethnic Harmony,*

<http://base.garant.ru/70170940/>

- Decree of the President of the Russian Federation No. 776 of 5 June 2012 *On the Presidential Council of the Russian Federation on Inter-Ethnic Relations,*

<http://base.garant.ru/70185068/>

- Decree of the President of the Russian Federation No. 1666 of 19 December 2012 *On the State National Policy Strategy of the Russian Federation until 2025,*

<http://base.garant.ru/70284810/>

- Decree of the President of the Russian Federation No. 249 of 18 May 2015 *On Amendments to the Composition of the Presidential Council of the Russian Federation*

on Inter-Ethnic Relations approved by Decree of the President of the Russian Federation No. 776 of 5 June 2012,

<http://docs.cntd.ru/document/420274528>

- Decree of the President of the Russian Federation No. 268 of 26 May 2015 *On Amendments to the Composition of the Presidential Council of the Russian Federation on Development of Civil Society and Human Rights, Approved by Decree of the President of the Russian Federation No. 120 of 1 February 2011,*

<http://base.garant.ru/6747418/>

- Decree of the President of the Russian Federation No. 458 of 12 September 2015 *On Amendments to Decree of the President of the Russian Federation No. 268 of 21 April 2014 On Measures of Rehabilitation of Armenian, Bulgarian, Greek, Italian, Crimean Tatar and German Peoples and State Support for Their Revival and Development,*

<http://base.garant.ru/70641266/>

- Order of the President of the Russian Federation No. 372-pn of 28 November 2014 *On Approval of the Composition of the Presidential Council of the Russian Federation on the Russian Language,*

http://pravo.gov.ru/proxy/ips/?doc_itself=&nd=102362465&page=1&rdk=0#I0

- Order of the President of the Russian Federation No. 154-pn of 26 May 2015 *On Amendments to the Composition of the Council on Cooperation with Religious Associations under the President of the Russian Federation Approved by Order of the President of the Russian Federation No. 47-pn of 7 February 2004,*

<http://docs.cntd.ru/document/420276077>

- Resolution of the Government of the Russian Federation No. 27 of 15 January 2014 *On Amendments to the Federal Target Program Strengthening of the Unity of the Russian Nation and Ethnocultural Development of the Peoples of Russia (2014-2020),*

<http://docs.cntd.ru/document/420264261>

- Resolution of the Government of the Russian Federation No. 1269 of 27 November 2014 *On Amendments to the Federal Target Program Strengthening of the Unity of the Russian Nation and Ethnocultural Development of the Peoples of Russia (2014-2020),*

<http://www.garant.ru/products/ipo/prime/doc/70711036/>

- Resolution of the Government of the Russian Federation No. 1270 of 27 November 2014 *On Amendments to the Rules of Distribution of Subsidies from the Federal Budget to Non-Profit Organizations within the Framework of the Federal*

Target Program Strengthening of the Unity of the Russian Nation and Ethnocultural Development of the Peoples of Russia (2014-2020),

<http://base.garant.ru/70612066/>

- Resolution of the Government of the Russian Federation No. 368 of 18 April 2015 *On the Federal Agency for Ethnic Affairs,*

<http://base.garant.ru/70980460/>

- Resolution of the Government of the Russian Federation No. 369 of 18 April 2015 *On Amendments to Resolution of the Government of the Russian Federation No. 590 of 20 July 2011,*

<http://base.garant.ru/70369466/>

- Resolution of the Government of the Russian Federation No. 481 of 20 May 2015 *On the Federal Targeted Program Russian Language for 2016-2020,*

<http://docs.cntd.ru/document/420275135>

- Resolution of the Government of the Russian Federation No. 718 *On the Federal Target Program Strengthening of the Unity of the Russian Nation and Ethnocultural Development of the Peoples of Russia (2014-2020),*

<http://government.ru/media/files/41d4862001ad2a4e5359.pdf>

- Resolution of the Government of the Russian Federation No. 881 of 25 August 2015 *On Amendments to the Federal Target Program Strengthening of the Unity of the Russian Nation and Ethnocultural Development of the Peoples of Russia (2014-2020),*

<http://www.garant.ru/products/ipo/prime/doc/71074030/>

- Order of the Government of the Russian Federation No. 536-p of 28 March 2015 *On Approval of the Distribution of Subsidies Granted in 2015 from the Federal Budget to the Budgets of the Constituent Entities of the Russian Federation for Implementation of Actions of the Federal Target Program Strengthening of the Unity of the Russian Nation and Ethnocultural Development of the Peoples of Russia (2014-2020),*

<http://docs.cntd.ru/document/499040473>

- Order of the Government of the Russian Federation No. 615-p of 10 April 2015 *On Amendments to the Action Plan for Implementation of the State National Policy Strategy of the Russian Federation in 2013-2015 for the Period until 2025,*

<http://docs.cntd.ru/document/499033904>

- Order of the Government of the Russian Federation No. 1226-p *On Approval of the Action Plan for Implementation of the State National Policy Strategy of the Russian Federation in 2013-2015 for the Period until 2025,*

<http://base.garant.ru/70417548/>