

Australian Government

Refugee Review Tribunal

Country Advice Pakistan

Pakistan – PAK36448 – Quetta – Hazaras – Security situation 30 March 2010

1. Have hundreds of Hazaras been killed in Quetta in recent years?

Well over one hundred Hazaras, and perhaps more than two hundred, have been killed in Quetta in recent years in so called "targeted killings". The attacks have been attributed to two separate insurgent movements: the Taliban styled Sunni militant Lashkar-e-Jhangavi (LJ)¹ and, to a lesser extent, the Baloch nationalist Balochistan Liberation Army (BLA).² In the recent weeks of March 2010 three attacks by gunmen on Hazara men have resulted in seven deaths in as many days. Such attacks upon the Hazara community have been one aspect of a wave of insurgent violence in Quetta which has also seen attacks upon other non-Sunni and/or non-Balochi communities (including ethnic Punjabis, Sindhis and Pashtuns) as well as politicians, security forces, gas pipe-line workers, and NGO workers.

In reporting on the targeted killing of Quetta Hazaras news sources will often put the estimated number of Hazaras killed in the city in recent years in the hundreds. In November 2009 a *HT Columnist* article reported that: "the Hazara community in Quetta [has suffered] 260 casualties over the past six years"; and in February 2010 *The Daily News* referred to the killing of "hundreds of Hazaras" in Quetta's "sectarian violence". Regular reports of the killing of Hazaras in Quetta by gunmen, and in bomb attacks, indicates that well over one hundred Hazaras have been killed.

Recent years have seen frequent attacks by motorbike borne gunmen against individual, or a small number of, Hazara men, typically labourers, market traders or pedestrians. On occasion Hazara policemen and prominent Hazara leaders have also been killed and January 2009 was

http://www.irinnews.org/report.aspx?reportid=33701 – Accessed 29 March 2010 – Attachment 19; for historical background, see: International Crisis Group 2007, 'Pakistan: The Forgotten Conflict in Balochistan', Crisis Group Asia Briefing no.69, 22 October – Attachment 20.

¹ Akbar, M.S. 2009, 'Hazara tribesmen under attack in Quetta', *Daily Times*, 6 February http://www.dailytimes.com.pk/default.asp?page=2009\02\06\story_6-2-2009_pg7_15 – Accessed 29 March 2010 – Attachment 13.

² Raja, A.H. 2009, 'Festering cauldron of Balochistan', *Pak Tribune*, 14 September http://www.paktribune.com/news/index.shtml?219254 – Accessed 30 March 2010 – Attachment 34.

³ 'Pakistan: Outsiders flee violence-stricken Balochistan after nationalist murders' 2009, *IRIN News*, 12 April http://www.irinnews.org/Report.aspx?ReportId=83898 – Accessed 29 March 2010 – Attachment 14.

⁴ In February 2010 a "report sent by Law Enforcement Agencies to the Federal Government has disclosed that 83 Punjabi and Sindhi settlers were brutality murdered by terrorists and extremists in Balochistan during last year target killings", see: 'Pakistan: 83 Punjabi and Sindhis killed in Balochistan during last year' 2010, *Plus News Pakistan*, 17 February – Attachment 15.

⁵ Zaman, Q. 2009, 'Inside Balochistan's Ravaged Heartland', *Tehelka*, 31 October, vol.6: no.43 http://www.tehelka.com/story_main43.asp?filename=Ne311009inside_balochistan.asp – Accessed 29 March 2010 – Attachment 16; Ahmad, A. 2009, 'For Balochistan, from bad to worse', *The Nation*, 26 March http://www.nation.com.pk/pakistan-news-newspaper-daily-english-online/Opinions/Columns/26-Mar-2009/For-Balochistan-from-bad-to-worse – Accessed 29 March 2010 – Attachment 17.

⁶ 'Pakistan: A dangerous mixture in Balochistan' 2010, *IRIN News*, 1 March http://www.irinnews.org/Report.aspx?ReportId=88267 – Accessed 29 March 2010 – Attachment 18; 'Pakistan: Focus on the conflict in Balochistan' 2006, *IRIN News*, 2 February

⁷ 'Confidence-building in Balochistan' 2009, HT Columnists, 13 November – Attachment 1.

⁸ 'Pakistan: Sectarian menace again' 2010, *Daily Times*, 1 February – Attachment 2.

notable for the assassination of Hazara Democratic Party (HDP) chairman Hussain Ali Yousufi⁹ by Lashkar-e-Jhangavi and for the killing of three Hazara policemen, also by LJ. ¹⁰ According to the South Asian Terrorism Portal "at least 50" Hazaras were murdered in targeted killings in first three months of 2009. ¹¹ By October 2009 a Hazara source, the Hazara News Pakistan website, claimed that over one hundred Hazaras had been killed and by November 2009 the same source claimed that: "The consecutive target killing of Hazaras have claimed lives of over 300 innocent people since the beginning of 2009". ¹³ Estimates of the latter kind may be inflated but, as is noted above, the assessment that several hundred Hazaras have been killed in Quetta over the last six years has been widely reported.

The following timeline illustrates the extent to which the Quetta Hazara community have been subject to attack over the recent year:

- 4 March 2009: "Four Hazara laborers and their Punjabi colleague were killed by unknown gunmen on Eastern Bypass today". 14
- 11 March 2009: "Unknown gunmen shot dead two Hazara tribesmen in an apparent sectarian attack at Arbab Karam Khan Road here on Monday". 15
- 11 March 2009: "In row (sic) of merciless target killings of Hazara minority tribesmen, three more Hazaras came under fire and all of them escaped unhurt, but a passerby got bullet wounds, here on Spini Road on Wednesday, police officials said". 16
- 12 April 2009: "Ghulam Hussein Hazara was killed while another person sustained critical wounds when unknown armed men opened fire at them on Kirani Road". ¹⁷
- 12 October 2009: "Unidentified armed men killed the Balochistan Chief Mines Inspector on Sariab Road in Quetta. Ashraf Ali was a member of the Shia Hazara community".
- 15 October 2009: "Another Hazara, Muhammad Asif, brother AIG Musa Jaffari has been shot dead on Jinnah Road, Quetta this evening at 7:30pm. A friend of him is critically injured". ¹⁹

⁹ 'Riots erupt in Quetta after the killing of Hazara Democratic Party leader' 2009, *The Nation*, 26 January http://www.nation.com.pk/pakistan-news-newspaper-daily-english-online/Politics/26-Jan-2009/Riots-erupt-in-Quetta-after-the-killing-of-Hazara-Democratic-Party-leader – Accessed 30 March 2010 – Attachment 26.

¹⁰ 'DSP gunned down in Quetta' 2009, *Dawn*, 15 January http://www.dawn.com/2009/01/15/top9.htm – Accessed 30 March 2010 – Attachment 28.

¹¹ Lakshman, K. 2009, 'Sectarian Implosion', *South Asia Intelligence Review*, vol.7: no.38, 30 March http://www.satp.org/satporgtp/sair/Archives/7 38.htm – Accessed 30 March 2010 – Attachment 29.

¹² 'Target-Killing Campaign; Advocate Wulayet Murdered' 2009, Hazara News Pakistan website, 3 October http://hazaranewspakistan.wordpress.com/2009/10/03/target-killing-campaign-advocate-wulayet-murdered/ – Accessed 29 March 2010 – Attachment 4.

¹³ 'Assassin of Hazaras Arrested: Police' 2009, Hazara News Pakistan website, 13 November http://hazaranewspakistan.wordpress.com/2009/11/13/assassin-of-hazaras-arrested-police/ – Accessed 30 March 2010 – Attachment 30.

¹⁴ "Unknown Gunmen" Strike Again, Kill 5 On Eastern Bypass' 2009, Hazara News Pakistan, 4 March http://hazaranewspakistan.wordpress.com/2009/03/04/unknown-gunmen-strike-again-kill-5-on-eastern-bypass/ – Accessed 30 March 2010 – Attachment 31.

¹⁵ '2 tribesmen gunned down' 2009, *The Nation*, 9 March – Attachment 5.

¹⁶ 'Three escape unhurt in row of target killings in Quetta' 2009, *Baluchistan Times*, 11 March – Attachment 6.

¹⁷ 'Pakistan police say 11 killed in Baluchistan violence' 2009, *BBC Monitoring Newsfile*, source: *Associated Press of Pakistan* (11 April 2009), 12 April – Attachment 7.

¹⁸ 'Pakistan: 2009: Year of Terrorism' 2009, *Daily The Pak Banker*, 25 December – Attachment 8.

¹⁹ 'Another Victom of Target GenociDE' 2009, Hazara News Pakistan website, 15 October http://hazaranewspakistan.wordpress.com/2009/10/15/another-victom-of-target-genocide/ – Accessed 29 March 2010 – Attachment 10.

- 18 March 2010: "gunmen attacked three construction workers, killing two of them and injuring the third. All of them belonged to the Hazara tribe".²⁰
- 19 March 2010: "gunmen killed a trader belonging to Hazara tribe in the Hazargangi area. Sources said Asad Ali Hazara was sitting in his shop when the gunmen opened fire. He died on the spot". ²¹
- 21 March 2010: "gunmen riding a motorcycle killed three people and injured three others who were travelling in a pick-up in the Killi Sardo Karez area near western bypass. ... All the six men belonged to the Hazara tribe." 22

Less recently, in 2003 and 2004, Quetta was the scene of large scale attacks against the Hazara community. On 4 June 2003 an attack by gunmen "killed 12 Shi'a Hazara police cadets in Quetta"; and: "On 5 July 2003, an attack on a Shia mosque in Baluchistan's capital, Quetta, left 54 Shia Hazaras dead and dozens wounded". ²³ In 2004, on 2 March, suicide gunmen/bombers attacked a procession celebrating the Shia festival of Ashura. Thirty-eight Hazaras died and responsibility for the attack was subsequently attributed to Lashkar-e-Jhangavi. ²⁴

The spate of killings has led to a number of protests being staged by Quetta's Hazara residents who have called for action against the targeting of their community. ²⁵ The issue has also caught the attention of the Pakistan national press ²⁶ and international commentators. On 13 March 2009 the International Crisis Group commented as follows:

Balochistan's provincial capital, Quetta, widely accepted as the Afghan Taliban's headquarters, is also a hub of sectarian violence, with Shia Hazaras, like Kurram's Turis, targeted by the Pakistani Taliban and other Sunni radical groups including Lashkar-e-Jhangvi and SSP.

...The LJ was responsible for an attack on a Shia procession on Ashura day in March 2004 that killed 38 people, most of them Hazaras; the two senior LJ militants convicted for their role in this incident escaped custody in mid-January 2008. ...On 26 January 2009, the Shia leader of the Hazara Democratic Party was assassinated in Quetta, with the Lashkar-e-Jhangvi claiming responsibility, sparking violent sectarian clashes.

Shahid, S. 2010, 'Retired SP among three shot dead in Quetta', *Dawn*, 18 March
 http://www.dawn.com/wps/wcm/connect/dawn-content-library/dawn/the-newspaper/front-page/retired-sp-among-3-shot-dead-in-quetta-830 – Accessed 29 March 2010 – Attachment 9.
 Shahid, S. 2010, 'Violence in Balochistan leaves five dead', *Dawn*, 19 March

²¹ Shahid, S. 2010, 'Violence in Balochistan leaves five dead', *Dawn*, 19 March http://www.dawn.com/wps/wcm/connect/dawn-content-library/dawn/news/pakistan/provinces/22-three-killed-and-twelve-injured-in-balochistan-aj-02 – Accessed 29 March 2010 – Attachment 11.

²² Shahid, S. 2010, 'More violence in Balochistan leaves six dead', *Dawn*, 21 March http://www.dawn.com/wps/wcm/connect/dawn-content-library/dawn/the-newspaper/front-page/19-six-killed-in-balochistan-130-hh-09 – Accessed 29 March 2010 – Attachment 12.

²³ International Crisis Group 2004, *Unfulfilled Promises: Pakistan's Failure to Tackle Extremism*, Asia Report 73, 16 January, p.10, n.58 – Attachment 32; Amnesty International 2004, *AI Report 2004*, 26 May – Attachment 33.

<sup>33.
&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> Idris, I. 2004, 'Carnage in Quetta', *Al-Ahram*, no.681, 11-17 March
http://weekly.ahram.org.eg/2004/681/in2.htm – Accessed 30 March 2010 – Attachment 8; Akbar, M.S. 2009,
'Hazara tribesmen under attack in Quetta', *Daily Times*, 6 February
http://www.dailytimes.com.pk/default.asp?page=2009\02\06\story_6-2-2009_pg7_15 – Accessed 29 March
2010 – Attachment 13; International Crisis Group 2009, *Pakistan: The Militant Jihadi Challenge*, Asia Report no.164, 13 March, pp.16-17 – Attachment 23;

²⁵ 'HDP Protests Hazara Target Killing' 2010, Hazara News Pakistan, 21 March http://hazaranewspakistan.wordpress.com/2010/03/21/hdp-protests-hazara-target-killing/ – Accessed 29 March 2010 – Attachment 22; 'Quetta shuts down after target killings' 2009, *Dawn*, 23 June http://www.dawn.com/wps/wcm/connect/dawn-content-library/dawn/news/pakistan/metropolitan/07-quetta-shut-down-after-target-killings-claim-three-lives-ha-05 – Accessed 29 March 2010 – Attachment 21.

²⁶ Akbar, M.S. 2009, 'Hazara tribesmen under attack in Quetta', *Daily Times*, 6 February http://www.dailytimes.com.pk/default.asp?page=2009\02\06\story 6-2-2009 pg7 15 – Accessed 29 March 2010 – Attachment 13.

Hazaras have become even more vulnerable as Sunni radical groups have penetrated the province's police force. For example, police who belonged to the SSP were implicated in two sectarian attacks in quick succession, in March and May 2004. On 19 July 2008, nine Hazara protesters were killed in a clash with police. More than two dozen were killed between December 2008 and February 2009, with police from the Hazara community a particular target. In the absence of a robust campaign to bring the perpetrators of such violence to justice, sectarian violence in Balochistan will continue to claim lives.²⁷

In November 2009 a HT Columnist article reported as follows:

Not a single perpetrator has been convicted so far. The Hazaras say that the administration, instead of protecting their lives and property, protects the perpetrators of crimes against them. They allege that some members of the police force have an ethnic bias against them and are involved in their killings. They are also of view that some sectarian militant organisations have patrons in the intelligence agencies. The Hazara community is quite concerned over the activities of the Lashkar-e-Jhangvi and Jindullah, both comprising Baloch Sunni militants.²⁸

As will be apparent from the above there have been allegations that Quetta police have failed to provide effective protection to the local Hazara population and that some police officers have had an involvement in perpetrating such violence. Relations have not been helped by the clashes which have occurred between Hazaras and police when Hazara demonstrators have rioted following security incidents like the 2004 Ashura attack²⁹ or the demonstrations of 19 July 2008 when "nine Hazaras were killed in Quetta in a clash between the police and Hazara protesters". Clashes also broke out between Hazara protesters and police in January 2009 following the killing of HDP leader Hussain Ali Yousufi. (Though no protesters were killed on this occasion, some 13 persons were injured when police opened fire to end the rioting). ³¹

There have, however, also been claims of police progress in apprehending persons suspected of perpetrating attacks upon the Quetta Hazara community. On 13 November 2009 police in Quetta "claimed the arrest of a top Lashkar-e-Jhangvi (LeJ) terrorist wanted in 16 cases and for the murder of 28 members of the Shia-Hazara community in target killings in the provincial capital". Even so, and as is evident from the recent sample of attacks noted in the timeline above, attacks on Hazara in Quetta continue to be reported.

Attachments

1. 'Confidence-building in Balochistan' 2009, *HT Columnists*, 13 November. (FACTIVA)

- 2. 'Pakistan: Sectarian menace again' 2010, Daily Times, 1 February. (FACTIVA)
- 3. '210 persons killed in target killing in Quetta alone' 2009, Free Library website, *Balochistan Times*, 18 March http://www.thefreelibrary.com/210+persons+killed+in+target+killing+in+Quetta+alone.-a0195937731 Accessed 29 March 2010.

http://weekly.ahram.org.eg/2004/681/in2.htm – Accessed 30 March 2010 – Attachment 8.

²⁷ International Crisis Group 2009, *Pakistan: The Militant Jihadi Challenge*, Asia Report no.164, 13 March, pp.16-17 – Attachment 23.

²⁸ 'Confidence-building in Balochistan' 2009, HT Columnists, 13 November – Attachment 1.

²⁹ Idris, I. 2004, 'Carnage in Quetta', *Al-Ahram*, no.681, 11-17 March

³⁰ Akbar, M.S. 2009, 'Hazara tribesmen under attack in Quetta', *Daily Times*, 6 February http://www.dailytimes.com.pk/default.asp?page=2009\02\06\story 6-2-2009 pg7 15 – Accessed 29 March 2010 – Attachment 13.

³¹ Shahid, S. 2009, 'Violence in Quetta after Hazara leader's murder', *Dawn*, 27 January http://www.dawn.com/2009/01/27/top4.htm – Accessed 30 March 2010 – Attachment 27.

³² Akbar, M.S. 2009, "'Mastermind" of sectarian killings held in Quetta', *Daily Times*, 13 November http://www.dailytimes.com.pk/default.asp?page=2009%5C11%5C13%5Cstory 13-11-2009 pg7 3 – Accessed 29 March 2010 – Attachment 24.

- 4. 'Target-Killing Campaign; Advocate Wulayet Murdered' 2009, Hazara News Pakistan website, 3 October http://hazaranewspakistan.wordpress.com/2009/10/03/target-killing-campaign-advocate-wulayet-murdered/ Accessed 29 March 2010.
- 5. '2 tribesmen gunned down' 2009, *The Nation*, 9 March. (FACTIVA)
- 6. 'Three escape unhurt in row of target killings in Quetta' 2009, *Baluchistan Times*, 11 March. (FACTIVA)
- 7. 'Pakistan police say 11 killed in Baluchistan violence' 2009, *BBC Monitoring Newsfile*, source: *Associated Press of Pakistan* (11 April 2009), 12 April. (FACTIVA)
- 8. 'Pakistan: 2009: Year of Terrorism' 2009, *Daily The Pak Banker*, 25 December. (FACTIVA)
- 9. Shahid, S. 2010, 'Retired SP among three shot dead in Quetta', *Dawn*, 18 March http://www.dawn.com/wps/wcm/connect/dawn-content-library/dawn/the-newspaper/front-page/retired-sp-among-3-shot-dead-in-quetta-830 Accessed 29 March 2010.
- 10. 'Another Victom of Target GenociDE' 2009, Hazara News Pakistan website, 15 October http://hazaranewspakistan.wordpress.com/2009/10/15/another-victom-of-target-genocide/ Accessed 29 March 2010.
- 11. Shahid, S. 2010, 'Violence in Balochistan leaves five dead', *Dawn*, 19 March http://www.dawn.com/wps/wcm/connect/dawn-content-library/dawn/news/pakistan/provinces/22-three-killed-and-twelve-injured-in-balochistan-aj-02 Accessed 29 March 2010.
- 12. Shahid, S. 2010, 'More violence in Balochistan leaves six dead', *Dawn*, 21 March http://www.dawn.com/wps/wcm/connect/dawn-content-library/dawn/the-newspaper/front-page/19-six-killed-in-balochistan-130-hh-09 Accessed 29 March 2010.
- 13. Akbar, M.S. 2009, 'Hazara tribesmen under attack in Quetta', *Daily Times*, 6 February http://www.dailytimes.com.pk/default.asp?page=2009\02\06\story 6-2-2009_pg7_15 Accessed 29 March 2010.
- 14. 'Pakistan: Outsiders flee violence-stricken Balochistan after nationalist murders' 2009, *IRIN News*, 12 April http://www.irinnews.org/Report.aspx?ReportId=83898 Accessed 29 March 2010.
- 15. 'Pakistan: 83 Punjabi and Sindhis killed in Balochistan during last year' 2010, *Plus News Pakistan*, 17 February. (FACTIVA)
- 16. Zaman, Q. 2009, 'Inside Balochistan's Ravaged Heartland', *Tehelka*, 31 October, vol.6: no.43 http://www.tehelka.com/story_main43.asp?filename=Ne311009inside_balochistan.asp – Accessed 29 March 2010.
- 17. Ahmad, A. 2009, 'For Balochistan, from bad to worse', *The Nation*, 26 March http://www.nation.com.pk/pakistan-news-newspaper-daily-english-online/Opinions/Columns/26-Mar-2009/For-Balochistan-from-bad-to-worse-Accessed 29 March 2010.
- 18. 'Pakistan: A dangerous mixture in Balochistan' 2010, *IRIN News*, 1 March http://www.irinnews.org/Report.aspx?ReportId=88267 Accessed 29 March 2010.
- 19. 'Pakistan: Focus on the conflict in Balochistan' 2006, *IRIN News*, 2 February http://www.irinnews.org/report.aspx?reportid=33701 Accessed 29 March 2010.

- 20. International Crisis Group 2007, 'Pakistan: The Forgotten Conflict in Balochistan', Crisis Group Asia Briefing no.69, 22 October.
- 21. 'Quetta shuts down after target killings' 2009, *Dawn*, 23 June http://www.dawn.com/wps/wcm/connect/dawn-content-library/dawn/news/pakistan/metropolitan/07-quetta-shut-down-after-target-killings-claim-three-lives-ha-05 Accessed 29 March 2010.
- 22. 'HDP Protests Hazara Target Killing' 2010, Hazara News Pakistan, 21 March http://hazaranewspakistan.wordpress.com/2010/03/21/hdp-protests-hazara-target-killing/ Accessed 29 March 2010.
- 23. International Crisis Group 2009, *Pakistan: The Militant Jihadi Challenge*, Asia Report no.164, 13 March.
- 24. Akbar, M.S. 2009, "'Mastermind" of sectarian killings held in Quetta', *Daily Times*, 13 November http://www.dailytimes.com.pk/default.asp?page=2009%5C11%5C13%5Cstory_13-11-2009_pg7_3 Accessed 29 March 2010.
- 25. Idris, I. 2004, 'Carnage in Quetta', *Al-Ahram*, no.681, 11-17 March http://weekly.ahram.org.eg/2004/681/in2.htm Accessed 30 March 2010.
- 26. 'Riots erupt in Quetta after the killing of Hazara Democratic Party leader' 2009, *The Nation*, 26 January http://www.nation.com.pk/pakistan-news-newspaper-daily-english-online/Politics/26-Jan-2009/Riots-erupt-in-Quetta-after-the-killing-of-Hazara-Democratic-Party-leader Accessed 30 March 2010.
- 27. Shahid, S. 2009, 'Violence in Quetta after Hazara leader's murder', *Dawn*, 27 January http://www.dawn.com/2009/01/27/top4.htm Accessed 30 March 2010.
- 28. 'DSP gunned down in Quetta' 2009, *Dawn*, 15 January http://www.dawn.com/2009/01/15/top9.htm Accessed 30 March 2010.
- 29. Lakshman, K. 2009, 'Sectarian Implosion', *South Asia Intelligence Review*, vol.7: no.38, 30 March http://www.satp.org/satporgtp/sair/Archives/7_38.htm Accessed 30 March 2010.
- 30. 'Assassin of Hazaras Arrested: Police' 2009, Hazara News Pakistan website, 13 November http://hazaranewspakistan.wordpress.com/2009/11/13/assassin-of-hazaras-arrested-police/ Accessed 30 March 2010.
- 31. "'Unknown Gunmen" Strike Again, Kill 5 On Eastern Bypass' 2009, Hazara News Pakistan, 4 March http://hazaranewspakistan.wordpress.com/2009/03/04/unknown-gunmen-strike-again-kill-5-on-eastern-bypass/ Accessed 30 March 2010.
- 32. International Crisis Group 2004, *Unfulfilled Promises: Pakistan's Failure to Tackle Extremism*, Asia Report 73, 16 January, p.10, n.58.
- 33. Amnesty International 2004, AI Report 2004, 26 May.
- 34. Raja, A.H. 2009, 'Festering cauldron of Balochistan', *Pak Tribune*, 14 September http://www.paktribune.com/news/index.shtml?219254 Accessed 30 March 2010.