

## UNHCR Evaluation Management Response

<b>Evaluation title:</b>	Evaluation of Refugee Response White Nile State, Sudan
<b>UNHCR evaluation reference:</b>	<b>Decentralised Evaluation/2018/02</b>
<b>Entity that commissioned the evaluation:</b>	UNHCR Sudan
<b>Date of Management Response:</b>	08/09/2018

<b>General comments on the evaluation:</b>	<p>UNHCR Sudan commissioned an independent evaluation of the Refugee Response in White Nile State (WNS) between December 2013 and April 2018. The evaluation was conducted by Jock Baker (Team Leader) and Dr. Iman M. Elawad, and as a decentralised evaluation was managed by UNHCR Sudan with technical support and quality assurance provided by the Evaluation Service in Headquarters. This evaluation was commissioned to generate lessons learnt, and identify examples of good practice, to support improvements to the ongoing refugee response in WNS as well as the wider refugee response in other parts of Sudan. UNHCR Sudan anticipates that the conclusions and recommendations resulting from this independent evaluation will contribute to developing its strategic engagement in the ongoing response in Sudan, and is preparing a Management Response Matrix (MRM) to address the recommendations in the response. Both the final evaluation report and MRM will be published externally on the UNHCR website.</p> <p>The evaluation aimed to assess the extent to which protection objectives have been met, including in meeting the assistance needs of refugees, particularly in light of the evolving context and emerging needs in this ongoing response. Despite significant challenges, including lack of access, funding constraints and sensitivities of the political context, the evaluation found that UNHCR had improved its coordination of the response, following the launch of the Refugee Coordination Forum in 2016, though the need to effectively engage development actors remains. UNHCR had ensured the delivery of critical life-saving assistance – particularly in the water and nutrition sectors – though more could be done to improve emergency standards in sanitation, shelter and education. The evaluation also found that UNHCR has kept protection at the centre of its Sudan operation. However, the evaluation also recommends UNHCR do more to promote protection mainstreaming through awareness-raising, capacity building, integrated approaches and improvements in community-level feedback and complaints systems, as well as working towards developing more longer-term and multi-year strategies.</p>
--	---

<b>RECOMMENDATION 1:</b>	Move to targeted assistance to address critical unmet needs combined with longer-term livelihood support. This transition should include piloting cash-based initiatives by, for example, carrying out assessments and accountability to affected populations (AAP) initiatives together with selected strategic partners to improve cost-effectiveness.
<b>Management response:</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Agree <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Partially agree <input type="checkbox"/> Disagree
<b>Reasons (if partially agree or disagree):</b>	We accept the overall recommendation to look at longer term planning including the use of CBI, livelihoods and community participation. Targeting of assistance will take some time to implement so we will need an incremental approach. Also CBI is not yet fully accepted by GoS as a modus operandi for SSR, including in WNS. Thus, UNHCR, NGOs and the donor community need to invest a lot of efforts in advocating for CBI. In addition, funding for livelihoods has been limited but UNHCR is working closely with livelihood partners to advocate for refugees' full engagement in livelihoods and to ensure maximum impact of projects.

<b>Unit or function responsible:</b>		<b>Senior Management, Livelihood/Programme Unit in Kosti with the support of CBI Unit Khartoum</b>				
<b>Top line planned actions</b>		<b>By whom</b>	<b>Comments</b>	<b>Expected completion date</b>	<b>Progress</b>	
					<b>Status</b>	<b>Comments</b>
1.1	Update the existing vulnerability data of the population in progress	Protection Kosti and Registration Khartoum	The information already exists in proGres, only updates are needed	31/12/2018		
1.2	Conduct prioritisation based on resources availability	Senior management	None	30/11/2018 for 2019 planning		
1.3	Develop/implement a plan to address needs/gaps through CBI and livelihoods support	Program and livelihoods units in Kosti Protection/Livelihood/CBI units Khartoum office	Government resistance to CBI which requires awareness raising to accept the approach. The implementation will be incremental due to limited skills by the community and funding constraints	31/12/2019		
<b>RECOMMENDATION 2:</b>		Strengthen accountability to affected populations, refugees and host communities, to promote dignity, ownership, cost effectiveness and sustainability of interventions.				
<b>Management response:</b>		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Agree <input type="checkbox"/> Partially agree <input type="checkbox"/> Disagree				
<b>Reasons (if partially agree or disagree):</b>						
<b>Unit or function responsible:</b>		<b>Program/Protection/Field units in Kosti</b>				
<b>Top line planned actions</b>		<b>By whom</b>	<b>Comments</b>	<b>Expected completion date</b>	<b>Progress</b>	
					<b>Status</b>	<b>Comments</b>
2.1	Full application of AGDM approach in programming	Program in Kosti	Participatory assessments by MFTs should be conducted as required by AGDM approach. Staff and partners training on AGDM and ensuring integration of AGDM in programming	31/12/2019		
2.2	Strengthening community participation in protection and assistance delivery	Protection and Field units in Kosti	Strengthening camp management and coordination is paramount in improving	31/12/2018		

			protection and assistance delivery. There is need to ensure community structures participation in protection and assistance delivery including solutions to challenges and problems.			
2.3	Implement community based complaint mechanisms and feedback mechanisms in all camps	Protection and Field units in Kosti		31/12/2018		
<b>RECOMMENDATION 3:</b>		Promote protection mainstreaming throughout UNHCR, Government of Sudan partners and implementing partners through awareness-raising, capacity building, integrated approaches and improvements in community-level feedback and complaints systems.				
<b>Management response:</b>		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Agree <input type="checkbox"/> Partially agree <input type="checkbox"/> Disagree				
<b>Reasons (if partially agree or disagree):</b>						
<b>Unit or function responsible:</b>		<b>Program/Protection/Field units in Kosti with Support from Protection/Program in Khartoum</b>				
<b>Top line planned actions</b>		<b>By whom</b>	<b>Comments</b>	<b>Expected completion date</b>	<b>Progress</b>	
					<b>Status</b>	<b>Comments</b>
3.1	Create awareness on UNHCR protection polices and tools to all partners and staff	Protection in Kosti		31/12/2018		
3.1	Conduct operation Protection Audit to identify protection mainstreaming gaps per sector	Protection in Kosti		31/12/2018		
3.2	Develop an implementation plan to address Identified gaps	Protection/Program in Kosti		31/12/2018		
3.3	Monitoring/evaluation of the implementation of protection mainstreaming	Protection/Technical/Field Teams in Kosti		31/12/2019		
3.4	Implement community based complaint mechanisms and feedback mechanisms in all camps	Protection and Field units in Kosti		31/12/2018		

<b>RECOMMENDATION 4:</b>		Adopt a transitional or modular approach to shelters and community infrastructure such as schools to increase coverage and community ownership while ensuring durability of completed structures.				
<b>Management response:</b>		<input type="checkbox"/> Agree <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Partially agree <input type="checkbox"/> Disagree				
<b>Reasons (if partially agree or disagree):</b>		UNHCR Kosti has already commenced this activity with upgrading of CFS and plans of converting communal shelters for educational purposes in order to mitigate the gap in classrooms for both, elementary and secondary education. The strategy and plan to gradually implement permanent community infrastructure has been activated				
<b>Unit or function responsible:</b>		<b>Program/Technical/Field/Protection units in Kosti with Support of program/Management in Khartoum</b>				
Top line planned actions		By whom	Comments	Expected completion date	Progress	
					Status	Comments
4.1	Participatory development and implementation of new designs for durable shelter/community infrastructure to transition from emergency to sustainable and durable infrastructure in the camp	Senior Management Technical/program in Kosti	The implementation of this recommendation will be gradual and will take some time due to limited funding. The Government push for permanent community infrastructures despite the lack of resources is hampering provision of education services to all children. The use of emergency shelters and infrastructure will continue for at least 3 years as we construct durable ones gradually with community participation.	31/12/2021		
4.2	Use the existing CFC and communal shelters to create more classrooms so as to meet the standard class room to student ratio.	Protection/Field/Program in Kosti	The existing structures will be identified in all camps to be re-purposed and upgraded.	31/12/2018		
4.3	Continued advocacy with GoS for the use of temporary and transitional classrooms to accommodate all school age	Senior Management		Ongoing		

	children as a first priority, without abandoning the Government demand for permanent infrastructure.					
<b>RECOMMENDATION 5:</b>		Improve partnership selection, supported through capacity building, to fill critical gaps and help ensure improved quality and accountability of UNHCR-supported interventions at a community level.				
<b>Management response:</b>		<input type="checkbox"/> Agree <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Partially agree <input type="checkbox"/> Disagree				
<b>Reasons (if partially agree or disagree):</b>		UNHCR believes partnership selection is done in a fair manner through Implementing Partner Management Committee (IPMC) at Khartoum level, which is in line with global UNHCR standards. However significant capacity building for partners is indeed required as the capacity of certain partners is weak, particularly when it comes to emergency and protection interventions. Important to note that there are restrictions on NGOs and the pool of potential partners is often quite small. In addition to this, each UNHCR international partner is obliged to work with a national downstream partner which often affect implementation on the ground.				
<b>Unit or function responsible:</b>		<b>Program/Management at Kosti and Khartoum</b>				
<b>Top line planned actions</b>		<b>By whom</b>	<b>Comments</b>	<b>Expected completion date</b>	<b>Progress</b>	
					<b>Status</b>	<b>Comments</b>
5.1	Review the capacities of partners in program and supply management to identify gaps, develop and implement a capacity development plan	Program/Supply in Kosti and Khartoum Senior Management	The selection of partners is done effectively through the IPMC. However there are restrictions by the Government on NGOS and the pool of partners is small	31/12/2019		
5.2						
5.3						
<b>RECOMMENDATION 6:</b>		Strengthen collection and management of monitoring data in a way that captures learning, improves outcome level monitoring so as to better inform interventions and more clearly demonstrate contributions to strategic objectives. Consider using a write-shop approach to measure outcomes in a participatory format.				
<b>Management response:</b>		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Agree <input type="checkbox"/> Partially agree <input type="checkbox"/> Disagree				
<b>Reasons (if partially agree or disagree):</b>						
<b>Unit or function responsible:</b>		<b>Program/technical units in Kosti with support from Program/Information Management in Khartoum</b>				
<b>Top line planned actions</b>		<b>By whom</b>	<b>Comments</b>	<b>Expected completion date</b>	<b>Progress</b>	
					<b>Status</b>	<b>Comments</b>

6.1	Train MFT monitoring teams on performance, impact monitoring and reporting	Program in Kosti		30/11/2018		
6.2	Ensure field presence and collection of indicator information as per reporting timeframes	Senior Management Program/Field in Kosti		30/11/2018		
6.3	Develop a data base to inform reporting and planning	Program in Kosti and Program/Information Management in Khartoum Senior Management		30/06/2019		
<b>RECOMMENDATION 7:</b>		Develop a 3-year multi-year strategy in consultations with partners which is divided into one-year annual plans and linked to the OCHA-led multi-year strategy.				
<b>Management response:</b>		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Agree <input type="checkbox"/> Partially agree <input type="checkbox"/> Disagree				
<b>Reasons (if partially agree or disagree):</b>						
<b>Unit or function responsible:</b>		<b>Senior Management</b>				
<b>Top line planned actions</b>		<b>By whom</b>	<b>Comments</b>	<b>Expected completion date</b>	<b>Progress</b>	
					<b>Status</b>	<b>Comments</b>
7.1	Conduct a participatory stakeholder analysis	Senior Management Program in Kosti and Khartoum		01/01/2019		
7.2	Hold a stakeholders workshop to solicit inputs into strategy development	Senior Management Program/Protection in Kosti		01/01/2019		
7.3	Oversee the implementation of the strategy	Senior Management		31/12/2021		
<b>RECOMMENDATION 8:</b>		Further improve team work with strategic partners, including joint fundraising, improving alignment between RRRPs and HRP and improving the efficiency of coordination meetings where UNHCR has a lead role.				
<b>Management response:</b>		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Agree <input type="checkbox"/> Partially agree <input type="checkbox"/> Disagree				
<b>Reasons (if partially agree or disagree):</b>		<p>UNHCR is already engaged in strategic partnerships, including joint fundraising. The LOU and joint fundraising with UNICEF is the strongest example. In addition, UNHCR is working with key donors on coordinating and prioritising needs assessments and resource allocation to ensure efficient and technically appropriate interventions.</p> <p>The RRP for Sudan is already strategically aligned with the HRP, within the limitation of a one year RRP. With the move to a multi-year RRP this recommendation will be easier to implement.</p>				

<b>Unit or function responsible:</b>		<b>Senior Management, External Relations, Program in Kosti</b>				
<b>Top line planned actions</b>		<b>By whom</b>	<b>Comments</b>	<b>Expected completion date</b>	<b>Progress</b>	
					<b>Status</b>	<b>Comments</b>
8.1	Continue engaging with Un and NGO partners in strategic partnership discussions, with particular focus on complementarity, respective strengths and weaknesses, and joint fundraising.	Senior Management Program and External Relations in Kosti and Khartoum		31/12/2019		
8.2	Include resilience component in the RRP 2019-2020 and ensure alignment with HRP and Sudan Collective Outcomes	Senior Management External Relations in Khartoum		31/12/2018		
8.3						
<b>RECOMMENDATION 9:</b>		As a component of the multi-year strategy, include a description of a process for eventual handover of sector lead responsibilities to strategic partners and relevant line ministries where appropriate to allow UNHCR and their main partners to prioritise its resources on core areas where they add most value.				
<b>Management response:</b>		<input type="checkbox"/> Agree <input type="checkbox"/> Partially agree <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Disagree				
<b>Reasons (if partially agree or disagree):</b>		<p>It is premature to impellent this recommendation. More time is needed to consolidate and strengthen ongoing coordination efforts. For the coming 2 years UNHCR plans to strengthen UNHCR sectoral leadership in a collaborative manner with other agencies, COR and line ministries. The reason for not pursuing hand-over now is that the operation is still far from reaching minimum standards so a period of consolidation is required after which UNHCR will start discussions about phase out and possible hand over.</p> <p>UNHCR is concentrating on coordinating with IASC sector leads and ensuring they are in the lead in out-of-camp locations as this is where the importance of ensuring inclusion of refugees into national services is crucial from the outset. The number of out-of-camp locations is much bigger that the number of camps in Sudan.</p>				
<b>Unit or function responsible:</b>						
<b>Top line planned actions</b>		<b>By whom</b>	<b>Comments</b>	<b>Expected completion date</b>	<b>Progress</b>	
					<b>Status</b>	<b>Comments</b>
9.1	<i>[This section is N/A if management disagrees with the recommendation.]</i>					
9.2						
9.3						

<b>RECOMMENDATION 10:</b>		Integrate capacity building approach into UNHCR's way of working by developing a specific capacity building strategy in consultation with partners to building national capacities and proactively engaging partners to fill specific gaps.				
<b>Management response:</b>		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Agree <input type="checkbox"/> Partially agree <input type="checkbox"/> Disagree				
<b>Reasons (if partially agree or disagree):</b>						
<b>Unit or function responsible:</b>		Program/Protection/Technical units in Kosti with support from Khartoum				
Top line planned actions		By whom	Comments	Expected completion date	Progress	
					Status	Comments
10.1	Conduct a capacity needs assessment	Program in Kosti		31/12/2018		
10.2	Develop a prioritised training plan	Program in Kosti and Khartoum		31/12/2018		
10.3	Monitor/evaluate the implementation of the plan	Senior Management		31/12/2019		