

UNHCR Evaluation Management Response	
Evaluation title:	Évaluation des interventions sur les moyens de subsistance du HCR au Bénin 2015-2017 (mi-parcours)
UNHCR evaluation reference:	Decentralised Evaluation /2018/02
Entity that commissioned the evaluation:	The Regional Office for Western Africa (RRWA)
Date of Management Response:	19 August 2018
General comments on the evaluation:	<i>We agree with the 4 out of the 5 recommendations. In fact, the recommendation 5 is focused on pure assistance while our efforts is to bring parents to be self-sufficient through livelihood activities in taking care of the school fees and other needs of the people with specific needs. We should focus on this particular aspect, otherwise the assistance syndrome will everlasting.</i>
<p>RECOMMENDATION 1: Adhérer à tous les critères minimums de programmes de moyens de subsistance établit par le HCR.</p> <p><i>Mesures recommandées à la CNAR en collaboration avec le bureau régional du HCR</i></p>	<p>Sub-recommendation 1.1 Finaliser le document de stratégie de moyen de subsistance (en suivant le modèle du HCR) assortit d'un plan de programmation pluriannuel (3 à 5 ans).</p> <p>Sub-recommendation 1.2 Mettre à jour l'ébauche de cartographie institutionnelle réalisée en 2015 et faire le plaidoyer pour intégrer les réfugiés dans les programmes de développement d'autres partenaires potentiels, en particulier les agences des nations unies, du gouvernement et le secteur privé ainsi que de créer un cadre de concertation pour la coordination entre tous ces acteurs pour plus d'efficacité.</p> <p>Sub-recommendation 1.3 Initier des partenariats stratégiques entre la CNAR et les organisations ayant une expertise pertinente pour soutenir la CNAR dans les domaines où elle n'a ni expertise ni capacité (par exemple, fourniture de services financiers, planification / budgétisation pluriannuelle, insécurité alimentaire).</p> <p>Sub-recommendation 1.4 Mettre en œuvre les activités de microfinance pour renforcer les activités des réfugiés:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Renforcer le plaidoyer auprès d'ALIDE (ou d'autres IMF) pour inclure les PoC dans leur programme de microfinance - Inclure une composante épargne dans les programmes de formations des PoC.
Management response:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Agree <input type="checkbox"/> Partially agree <input type="checkbox"/> Disagree
Reasons (if partially agree or disagree):	
Unit or function responsible:	CNAR Benin (livelihoods) with support from RRWA livelihoods unit.

Top line planned actions		By whom	Comments	Expected completion date	Progress				
					Status	Comments			
1.1	<p>Sub-recommendation 1.1 The livelihoods unit in the regional office in collaboration with livelihoods focal persons in CNAR Benin will use recommendations in the report to populate the livelihoods template provided by DPSM. This will replace the existing “work-in-progress” livelihoods strategy being finalized by CNAR Benin. The strategy will be a 3-year plan in tandem with the multi-year planning initiative for project partnership agreements.</p>	<p>CNAR Benin – Livelihoods Focal point with supervision from RRWA</p>	<p>The existing “WIP” livelihood strategy used by the operation before closure is found to be weak in targeting and risk analysis as pointed out by OIOS in 2016. Findings from this evaluation will be a rich source of relevant technical information to develop the livelihoods strategy.</p>	31st March 2019					
	<p>Sub-recommendation 1.2 CNAR Benin would promote economic inclusion of refugees by advocating for their integration in the national development structures and systems of Benin. Being the government (CNAR), RRWA would only play a capacity-building role in supporting the technical training of staff involved in the process of economic inclusion where necessary. E.g, Training of government staff on minimum economic recovery standards to ensure effective M&E of government interventions.</p>						<p>CNAR with support from RRWA senior management and technical teams</p>	<p>This would be a joint supportive process by both programs and protection with CNAR taking the lead role as government.</p>	31 st December 2022
	<p>Sub-recommendation 1.3 RRWA would build capacity of CNAR livelihoods staff to enable them identify the key requirements in terms of expertise in engaging strategic livelihood partners. Where capacity is non-existent, the livelihoods unit in RRWA would provide back-stop technical support. As integration and economic inclusion would be an on-going process, government staff would</p>							<p>Capacity building by RRWA staff where necessary.</p>	31 st March 2019 (For CNAR Staff)

	<p>eventually take up the key roles of providing support in the same manner as with the nationals. Capacity building will include financial and budgetary management training as well as training on food security early warning systems, agricultural best practices and crop preservation techniques to ensure adequacy & availability of food year-round.</p> <p>Sub-recommendation 1.4</p> <p>CNAR would advocate and facilitate the linkage of refugees to micro-finance and banking institutions to promote savings and potential access to loan facilities. RRWA livelihoods unit would provide technical guidance to the linkage process to ensure refugee's interests are taken into consideration.</p>	<p>CNAR Benin and Government line ministries staff.</p> <p>CNAR Benin with technical guidance from RRWA livelihoods unit.</p>	<p>Advocacy will include recognition and acceptance of refugee identity cards in lieu of national identity cards pending naturalization and eligibility to wield national identity cards.</p> <p>Interests rates and conditions would be same as nationals</p>	<p>31st Dec 2022 (For Government line ministries staff.)</p> <p>31st Dec 2019</p>		
--	---	---	--	---	--	--

<p>RECOMMENDATION 2: Renforcer les capacités institutionnelles de la CNAR.</p> <p><i>Mesures recommandées spécifiquement au bureau régional du HCR</i></p>		<p>Sub-recommandation 2.1 Augmenter le personnel de la CNAR surtout celui du service communautaire et de suivi évaluation et renforcer la capacité du personnel existant pour faciliter le suivi individualisé et adapté des réfugiées.</p> <p>Sub-recommandation 2.2 Augmenter les ressources financières de la CNAR pour la prise en compte de tous ceux qui sont éligible aux programmes de moyen de subsistance.</p> <p>Sub-recommandation 2.3 Améliorer le mécanisme de programmation et de suivi évaluation des activités :</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Collecter plus de données sur les groupes cibles, en détaillant leurs ressources, leurs activités de subsistance, les priorités, contraintes et opportunités pour rendre les critères de ciblage vérifiables applicable de manière objective. - Définir des indicateurs SMART (Spécifiques, Mesurables, Réalisables, Pertinents et Limités dans le temps) de mesure des performances pour tous les programmes. La fréquence de collecte des données, les responsabilités de collecte de données et le flux d'informations doivent y être clairement définis. <p>Sub-recommandation 2.4 Faire le plaidoyer pour le financement progressif des activités de la CNAR par l'état béninois.</p> <p>Sub-recommandation 2.5 Continuer le plaidoyer pour le vote et la promulgation de la loi sur l'asile ainsi du décret portant création et attributions de la CNAR afin de garantir une protection juridique aux PoC et une existence légale de la CNAR.</p>				
		<p>Management response: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Agree <input type="checkbox"/> Partially agree <input type="checkbox"/> Disagree</p>				
Reasons (if partially agree or disagree):						
Unit or function responsible:		RRWA/ CNAR Benin (Management)				
Top line planned actions		By whom	Comments	Expected completion date	Progress	
					Status	Comments
2.1	<p>Sub-recommandation 2.1 Increasing the number of staff in CNAR Benin would be a great thing to do; and we do agree to that. However, we strongly believe in the course of promoting economic inclusion and social integration, refugees would eventually end up in the mainstream government structures for inclusive</p>	RRWA	A close follow-up on the staffing situation of CNAR Benin to be done by RRWA, to ascertain the need to engage more staff.	31 st . December 2019 (upon need justification)		

<p>services. RRWA would albeit have a more closer look at the staffing situation and adjust administrative budgets if possible to engage community services and a monitoring and evaluation assistants</p> <p><u>Sub-recommendation 2.2</u></p> <p>The financial budget of CNAR Benin may be increased in 2019. The Midyear review saw relocation of OPS funds to CNAR Benin of some CFA 7.1 million. If this is fully utilized by end of program year, and there is need for increased funding, RRWA would not hesitate to do so.</p> <p><u>Sub-recommendation 2.3</u></p> <p>Improving program delivery mechanisms and evaluation procedures. SWOTs would be conducted to obtain relevant information to ensure program effectiveness. Prioritization in targeting would also be done. Objectives set would conform to standard procedures – SMART compliant.</p> <p><u>Sub-recommendations 2.4</u></p> <p>Advocacy for funding from Benin Government by CNAR Benin would be great. The converse of advocating for inclusion of refugees in the national</p>	<p>RRWA Management</p> <p>CNAR Benin with support from RRWA livelihoods unit</p> <p>CNAR Benin</p>	<p>Increase if funding would be commensurate with identified program needs. With the new strategy of economic and financial inclusion, RRWA rather sees a reduction in direct assistance, as Micro-finance institutions would be engaged for direct access to loans.</p> <p>No Comments</p> <p>CNAR Benin should rather advocate for economic inclusion of refugees and</p>	<p>31st December 2019</p> <p>31st March 2019</p> <p>31st December 2021.</p>		
---	--	---	--	--	--

	<p>development plans so government can directly support refugees within such service structures would be more appropriate and effective in tandem with the economic inclusion strategy which is currently being rolled out.</p> <p><u>Sub-recommendation 2.5</u></p> <p>Advocacy for legal representation of CNAR Benin and ratification of the asylum law in Benin to ensure refugees continue to have legal protection under the international refugee asylum law.</p>	CNAR Benin	<p>direct support to them alongside nationals through existing service structures. Funding of CNAR activities by Government would however be welcomed.</p> <p>CNAR Benin should continue advocating for the asylum rights of refugees in Benin. They should also continue with deliberations that would eventually ensure their legal representation and recognition in Benin.</p>	31 st December 2020.		
--	---	------------	--	---------------------------------	--	--

<p>RECOMMENDATION 3: favoriser l'accès des réfugiés à l'emploi salarié.</p> <p><i>Mesures recommandées spécifiquement à la CNAR</i></p>		<p>Sub-recommendation 3.1 Mener des actions de plaidoyer envers les entreprises pour la valorisation des compétences des réfugiés pour favoriser leur employabilité.</p>				
<p>Management response:</p>		<p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Agree <input type="checkbox"/> Partially agree <input type="checkbox"/> Disagree</p>				
<p>Reasons (if partially agree or disagree):</p>						
<p>Unit or function responsible:</p>		CNAR Benin				
<p>Top line planned actions</p>		<p>By whom</p>	<p>Comments</p>	<p>Expected completion date</p>	<p>Progress</p>	
3.1	<p><u>Sub-recommendation 3.1</u> Advocacy with potential employers to create awareness on the relevant skills sets of refugees to promote employability would be conducted by CNAR Benin. The new economic inclusion strategy if well implemented by CNAR Benin would ensure refugees</p>	CNAR Benin	<p>Awareness creation of relevant skills sets of refugees by CNAR Benin would ensure refugees with employable skills get jobs. CNAR should engage employment agencies and enterprises to sell the skills of refugees. Where there is a</p>	31 st December 2020	<p>Status</p>	<p>Comments</p>

	with employable skills find jobs in the labour market.		skill need by employers, CNAR Benin should train refugees to fill the personnel needs created by that skills-gap.			
--	--	--	---	--	--	--

<p>RECOMMENDATION 4: Améliorer la mise en œuvre du programme emploi indépendant.</p> <p><i>Mesures recommandées spécifiquement à la CNAR</i></p>	<p>Sub-recommendation 4.1 Améliorer les critères de ciblage de chaque intervention de moyens de subsistance de façon à ce qu'ils ne soient pas seulement clairement définis en fonction de l'évaluation socio-économique, de l'analyse du marché, des besoins / intérêts / compétences des réfugiés, mais également être clairement communiqués aux PoC.</p> <p>Sub-recommendation 4.2 Identifier une liste restreinte de secteurs porteurs à partir des « 100 idées de projets porteurs » en tenant compte des besoins du marché, des contraintes spécifiques et compétence des PoC et l'utiliser pour guider les PoC dans le choix de leur activités génératrices de revenu.</p> <p>Sub-recommendation 4.3 Améliorer les curricula de formation des PoC en intégrant des modules spécifiques sur l'environnement des affaires au Bénin afin de permettre aux PoC d'acquérir des compétences sur comment faire les affaires au Bénin et développer des activités viables localement plutôt que le commerce transfrontalier. Les réfugiés qui ont réussi en affaire au Bénin peuvent être invités aux formations pour raconter leur histoire de succès pour édifier les nouveaux PoC participants.</p> <p>Sub-recommendation 4.4 Créer un cadre de dialogue entre réfugiés (ceux qui réussissent et ceux qui ne réussissent pas) pour faciliter l'apprentissage par les pairs.</p> <p>Sub-recommendation 4.5 Développer des mécanismes pour encourager les réfugiés à épargner, même si ce n'est que pour de petites sommes à travers par exemple le renforcement du partenariat avec ALIDE et autres institutions de microfinance ou développer les groupes de tontine (épargne et crédit).</p>					
	<p>Management response:</p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Agree <input type="checkbox"/> Partially agree <input type="checkbox"/> Disagree</p>					
	<p>Reasons (if partially agree or disagree):</p>					
	<p>Unit or function responsible: CNAR Benin (livelihoods) with guidance from RRWA livelihoods unit.</p>					
Top line planned actions		By whom	Comments	Expected completion date	Progress	
					Status	Comments
4.1	<u>Sub-recommendation 4.1</u>					

<p>Improving the targeting criteria would be done by CNAR Benin with technical guidance from the livelihoods unit in RRWA. A framework for targeting of refugees for livelihoods intervention would be shared with CNAR Benin to ensure livelihoods interventions are effectively targeted towards those that need it most to maximize impact. The targeting criteria would include amongst others: the wealth levels of PoCs, the market needs of the community, personal interests and skills capacity of PoCs; these conditions would be clearly shared with PoCs to better understand the targeting process. This would however be done in a more professional manner in order to avoid PoCs tailoring their responses in targeting surveys to correspond to these criteria by “word of mouth”</p> <p><u>Sub-recommendation 4.2</u></p> <p>CNAR Benin with support from RRWA livelihoods unit, would engage the services of a local consultant to undertake a market assessment to identify amongst several other key market variables, sectors that have potential in engaging refugees with income generating activities with realistic financial revenues (≥CFA 40,000/ month -minimum wage in Benin). ToRs of the market assessment would include identifying market needs and refugee existing skills competence and gaps (skills mapping) to effectively address the identified market requirements to ensure a skills- driven economic inclusion process.</p>	<p>CNAR with technical guidance from RRWA livelihoods unit.</p> <p>Local Consultant with guidance from CNAR Benin and RRWA Livelihoods Unit.</p>	<p>The major criteria for targeting would be shared and used in upcoming livelihoods interventions. The criteria would be adjusted to ensure context specificity for maximum impact. Household Economy Analysis would be undertaken to ensure responses are actually the reality at household levels.</p> <p>The choice of a local consultant vis-à-vis an international would be duly considered before actual engagement for the study.</p>	<p>31st March 2019</p> <p>31st December 2019.</p>		
---	--	---	---	--	--

	<p><u>Sub-recommendations 4.3 & 4.4</u></p> <p>Vocational training curricula would be developed by CNAR Benin working in tandem with the educational and labour ministry to ensure vocational skills training are market-driven</p> <p>A platform for mentorship briefings and sharing of success stories by self-reliant refugees would be encouraged by CNAR Benin to motivate yet-to-be self-reliant PoCs in their income generation endeavours. The platform would be guided and supported by RRWA livelihoods unit.</p> <p><u>Sub-recommendation 4.5</u></p> <p>CNAR Benin would facilitate linkages of PoCs to micro-finance institutions (MFIs) and banks to promote the culture of savings as well as increase their potential to access loans. This would be a gradual graduation process from a community-driven savings and loans association in the form of a Rotary savings and credit association (ROSCA) until members can be effectively linked to private micro-finance institutions using their savings record as reference and guarantee for credit worthiness for linkage. ALIDE would be strongly recommended for continuous assistance to PoCs in the area of accessing credit.</p>	<p>CNAR Benin, Education and Labour Ministry, RRWA Livelihoods unit.</p> <p>CNAR Benin with technical guidance from RRWA Livelihoods unit. ALIDE (Micro-finance institution)</p>	<p>The opportunity would also be seized to invite enterprise operators to share with PoCs skills requirements and policies underpinning legal employment in Benin.</p> <p>PoCs who are already engaged in businesses and require financial support for scale-up would also be facilitated by linkage to micro-finance institutions.</p>	<p>31st December 2019</p> <p>31st December 2019</p>		
--	---	---	--	--	--	--

RECOMMENDATION 5: Renforcer les mesures de protection sociale. <i>Mesures recommandées spécifiquement à la CNAR</i>		Sub-recommendation 5.1 Maintenir la prise en charge de la scolarisation des enfants.				
		Sub-recommendation 5.2 Prendre en compte toutes les personnes ayant des besoins spécifiques (les handicapés, les enfants à risques, les femmes victime de SGBV, les malades etc).				
Management response:		<input type="checkbox"/> Agree <input type="checkbox"/> Partially agree <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Disagree				
Reasons (if partially agree or disagree):		In as much as social protection is not a substitute for livelihoods provisioning and vice-versa, the livelihoods unit strongly believes in rather providing effective livelihoods intervention for parents taking care of infants with focus on educational and health needs. Enrolling households in health insurance is a good starter. Persons with special needs and their family should also be given the opportunity to benefit from livelihoods provisioning instead of falling on social safety nets for subsistence. The foster household concept should be promoted in case of persons with no immediate family support. Sub-recommendation 5.1 is however in agreement.				
Unit or function responsible:		CNAR Benin (livelihoods) with technical guidance from RRWA livelihoods Unit.				
Top line planned actions		By whom	Comments	Expected completion date	Progress	
					Status	Comments
5.1	Sub-recommendation 51 Supporting children's education is one of the prime reasons for promoting self-reliance among PoCs. Targeted PoCs would be assisted with livelihoods interventions to support education of their wards through payment of school fees. For this to be a reality, Evaluation of livelihoods interventions would ensure assistance in income generating activities yield realistic revenues to support payment of fees.	CNAR Benin	In Benin, a revenue in income generation of ≥CFA 40,000 per month can be termed realistic. Income generating activities should be tailored to attain at least the minimum wages earned by the nationals in Benin.	31 st December 2019		