



General Assembly

Distr.: General
11 February 2013

Original: English

Human Rights Council

Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review

Sixteenth session

22 April–3 May 2013

Compilation prepared by the Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights in accordance with paragraph 5 of the annex to Human Rights Council resolution 16/21

Russian Federation

The present report is a compilation of the information contained in the reports of treaty bodies and special procedures, including observations and comments by the State concerned, and of the Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights (OHCHR), and in other relevant official United Nations documents. It is presented in a summarized manner due to word-limit constraints. For the full text, please refer to the document referenced. This report does not contain any opinions, views or suggestions on the part of OHCHR other than those contained in public reports and statements issued by the Office. It follows the general guidelines adopted by the Human Rights Council in its decision 17/119. Information included herein has been systematically referenced in endnotes. The report has been prepared taking into consideration the periodicity of the review and developments during that period.

I. Background and framework

A. Scope of international obligations¹

International human rights treaties²

	<i>Status during previous cycle</i>	<i>Action after review</i>	<i>Not ratified/not accepted</i>
<i>Ratification, accession or succession</i>	ICERD (1969)	CRPD (2012)	ICCPR-OP2
	ICESCR (1973)	OP-CRC-SC	OP-CAT
	ICCPR (1973)	(signature only, 2012)	ICRMW
	CEDAW (1981)		CPED
	CAT (1987)		
	CRC (1990)		
	OP-CRC-AC (2008)		
<i>Reservations, declarations and/or understandings</i>	ICERD (declaration, art. 17, para. 1, 1969)		
	ICESCR (declaration, art. 26, para. 1, 1973)		
	ICCPR (declaration, art. 48, para. 1, 1973)		
	ICCPR-OP1 (declaration, art. 1, 1991)		
<i>Complaint procedures, inquiry and urgent action³</i>	ICERD, art. 14 (1991)		OP-ICESCR
	ICCPR, art. 41 (1991)		OP-CRC-IC
	ICCPR-OP 1 (1991)		ICRMW
	OP-CEDAW, art. 8 (2004)		OP-CRPD
	CAT, arts. 20 (1987), 21 and 22 (1991)		CPED

Other main relevant international instruments

	<i>Status during previous cycle</i>	<i>Action after review</i>	<i>Not ratified</i>
<i>Ratification, accession or succession</i>	Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide		Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court
	Conventions on refugees ⁴		Conventions on stateless persons ⁸
	Palermo Protocol ⁵		
	Geneva Conventions of 12 August 1949 and Additional Protocols thereto ⁶		ILO Conventions Nos. 169 and 189 ⁹
	ILO fundamental conventions ⁷		
	UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education		

1. The Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (CESCR), the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW) and the Committee against Torture (CAT) encouraged the authorities to consider ratifying ICRMW.¹⁰ CEDAW and CAT encouraged the ratification of CPED.¹¹ CESCR¹² and CAT¹³ encouraged the authorities to consider ratifying OP-ICESCR. CAT recommended that the authorities consider ratifying OP-CAT and it invited them to ratify ICCPR-OP2.¹⁴

2. CAT invited the authorities to ratify the Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court.¹⁵

3. The Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR) and the Human Rights Committee (HR Committee) recommended the ratification of the Conventions regarding statelessness.¹⁶ CESCR recommended that the authorities consider ratifying ILO Convention No. 169.¹⁷

B. Institutional and human rights infrastructure and policy measures**Status of national human rights institutions¹⁸**

<i>National human rights institution</i>	<i>Status during previous cycle</i>	<i>Status during present cycle¹⁹</i>
Commissioner for Human Rights in the Russian Federation	B (2001)	A (November 2008)

II. Cooperation with human rights mechanisms**A. Cooperation with treaty bodies²⁰**

1. Reporting status

<i>Treaty body</i>	<i>Concluding observations included in previous review</i>	<i>Latest report submitted since previous review</i>	<i>Latest concluding observations</i>	<i>Reporting status</i>
CERD	August 2008	2012	–	Twentieth to twenty-second reports pending consideration in 2013
CESCR	November 2003	2008	May 2011	Sixth report due in 2016
HR Committee	November 2003	2012	Oct 2009	Seventh report pending consideration in 2014
CEDAW	January 2002	2009	July 2010	Eighth report due in 2014
CAT	November 2006	2010	November 2012	Sixth report due in 2016
CRC	September 2005	2010 and 2011	–	Fourth and fifth reports and initial OP-CRC-AC report pending consideration.
CRPD	–	–	–	Initial report due in 2014

2. Responses to specific follow-up requests by treaty bodies**Concluding observations**

<i>Treaty body</i>	<i>Due in</i>	<i>Subject matter</i>	<i>Submitted in</i>
CERD	2009	Racism and xenophobia in media; extremist racist activity; citizenship; situation of Roma ²¹	2009 ²² Dialogue ongoing ²³
HR Committee	2010	Human rights violations by armed forces; violence against journalists and human rights defenders; and extradition of foreign nationals ²⁴	2010 ²⁵ Dialogue ongoing ²⁶
CEDAW	2011	Violence against women in the North Caucasus; and participation in political and public life ²⁷	2012 ²⁸
CAT	2013	Detention places; human rights defenders; hazing and ill-treatment within the armed forces ²⁹	

Views

<i>Treaty body</i>	<i>Number of views</i>	<i>Status</i>
CCPR	9 ³⁰	Dialogue ongoing

B. Cooperation with special procedures³¹

	<i>Status during previous cycle</i>	<i>Current status</i>
<i>Standing invitation</i>	No	No
<i>Visits undertaken</i>	Women (2004) Racism (2006) Independence of judges and lawyers (2008)	Indigenous peoples (October 2009) Cultural rights (April 2012)
<i>Visits agreed to in principle</i>	Enforced or involuntary disappearances Internally displaced persons Torture	Independence of judges and lawyers (April 2013) Working Group on the issue of human rights and transnational corporations and other business enterprises
<i>Visits requested</i>	Substances and waste (2005) Extrajudicial, summary or arbitrary executions, (2000, follow-up letters sent in 2003, 2004 and 2005) Indigenous peoples (2006) Arbitrary detention (2008)	Substances and waste (renewed in 2010) Extrajudicial, summary or arbitrary executions (renewed in 2008) Enforced or involuntary disappearances (reminders in 2008, 2009, 2010, 2011 and 2012) Freedom of religion or belief (2009) Human rights defenders (2011, the Government is considering its reply) Trafficking in persons (2009) Torture (2010) Terrorism (2008, reminder in 2010) Food (2011) Freedom of association and assembly (2011)
<i>Responses to letters of allegations and urgent appeals</i>	During the period under review 55 communications were sent. The Government replied to 48.	

4. In 2012, the Working Group on Enforced or Involuntary Disappearances stated that since its establishment, it had transmitted 479 cases to the Government; of those, 12 cases were clarified and 467 remained outstanding.³²

C. Cooperation with the Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights

5. The United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights (High Commissioner) conducted an official visit to Moscow and St. Petersburg in February 2011 with a view to enhancing cooperation with the Russian Federation.³³ A Human Rights Adviser has been working within the United Nations country team since 2008.³⁴

6. In 2009, 2010, 2011 and 2012, the Russian Federation contributed financially to OHCHR, including to the Voluntary Funds for Technical Cooperation and for Financial and Technical Assistance for Implementation of the Universal Periodic Review.³⁵

III. Implementation of international human rights obligations, taking into account applicable international humanitarian law

A. Equality and non-discrimination

7. CESCR called upon the authorities to adopt a general law prohibiting all forms of discrimination in addition to the laws prohibiting discrimination in specific areas.³⁶ CEDAW urged the authorities to incorporate in the Constitution or legislation a definition of direct and indirect discrimination.³⁷

8. CEDAW reiterated concern about patriarchal attitudes and deep-rooted stereotypes regarding the roles and responsibilities of women and men. It stated that such customs and practices perpetuated discrimination against women and girls.³⁸ CEDAW noted that existing discrimination against women became more acute in the Chechen Republic.³⁹ CESCR recommended promoting gender equality and a positive, non-stereotypical and non-discriminatory portrayal of women, as well as adopting the draft federal law on equal rights and equal opportunities for women and men.⁴⁰

9. CESCR was concerned that the situation of women in employment remained precarious and that women were the majority of workers in lower level and low-paid jobs in the public and private sectors. It was also concerned about the wide gender pay gap, the high incidence of sexual harassment in the workplace and the narrow definition of sexual harassment.⁴¹ The ILO Committee of Experts on the Application of Conventions and Recommendations asked the Government to address occupational segregation and the inequalities in remuneration existing in practice between men and women, including specific measures to address stereotypical attitudes with a view to reducing inequalities in remuneration.⁴²

10. In 2009, the HR Committee expressed concern at increasing hate crimes and racially motivated attacks against ethnic and religious minorities and about manifestations of racism and xenophobia, including racial profiling and harassment by law enforcement personnel targeting foreigners and members of minority groups.⁴³ In 2012, CAT was concerned at reports of discrimination and abuse, including violent attacks against Roma and other ethnic minorities, and migrant workers.⁴⁴

11. The HR Committee noted with concern the discrimination against individuals on the basis of their sexual orientation, including hate speech and manifestations of intolerance and prejudice by public officials, religious leaders and in the media. It was concerned about acts of violence against lesbian, gay, bisexual and transgender (LGBT) persons, including reports of harassment by the police and incidents of people being assaulted or killed on account of their sexual orientation.⁴⁵ CAT was concerned at reports that police had failed to

promptly react to, or to carry out effective investigations and bring charges against those responsible for violent attacks against LGBT persons.⁴⁶

B. Right to life, liberty and security of the person

12. While noting the de facto moratorium on the death penalty, CAT invited the authorities to abolish the death penalty de jure.⁴⁷

13. CAT was concerned over reports of the widespread practice of torture and ill-treatment of detainees, including as a means to extract confessions, and that the definition intended to cover the term “torture” in the Criminal Code did not fully reflect all elements of the definition of the Convention. CAT was concerned that officials suspected of torture were mostly prosecuted under articles on abuse of power and on extorting confessions and that torture was not criminalized as an independent crime. CAT recommended that the Government: prevent all acts of torture and ill-treatment; unequivocally reaffirm the absolute prohibition of torture; bring the definition of torture into full conformity with the Convention and have torture criminalized as an independent crime.⁴⁸

14. The HR Committee was concerned about reports of torture and ill-treatment, enforced disappearance, arbitrary arrest and extrajudicial and secret detention in Chechnya and other parts of the North Caucasus committed by the military, security services and other State agents.⁴⁹ CAT was concerned at the Government’s failure to investigate and punish the perpetrators of such abuses.⁵⁰

15. CAT remained concerned about allegations of abuses and deaths occurring within the army as a result of reported practices of hazing of conscripts by officers and fellow soldiers. It remained concerned at allegations that investigations carried out into hazing incidents were inadequate or absent.⁵¹

16. While welcoming measures by the Government to reduce the prison population, CAT remained concerned about reports of overcrowding and the high number of suicides in detention places, and the lack of independent medical officials available to examine prisoners claiming to be victims of abuse.⁵²

17. CAT was concerned about reports of frequent placement of persons in psychiatric institutions on an involuntary basis and the absence of investigations into the reported ill-treatment and deaths of persons held in such facilities.⁵³

18. The HR Committee was concerned about the prevalence of domestic violence.⁵⁴ CEDAW was concerned at the absence of a holistic approach to the prevention and elimination of violence against women and at the fact that domestic violence cases were often treated as private charges to be filed by the victim, not the prosecutor.⁵⁵ CAT was concerned that, despite numerous allegations of violence against women, there were only a small number of complaints, investigations and prosecutions of such acts.⁵⁶

19. CAT was concerned about reports regarding acts of violence against women in the North Caucasus, including killings and so-called “honour killings” and bride-kidnapping.⁵⁷ CEDAW was concerned that such cases of violence and killings were rarely documented, prosecuted and punished.⁵⁸

20. CEDAW urged the authorities to adopt a comprehensive law on violence against women and develop an action plan to combat violence against women.⁵⁹ CESCR recommended adopting a specific legislative act criminalizing domestic violence.⁶⁰ CAT urged the Government to ensure that: all allegations of violence against women are promptly, impartially, and effectively investigated; perpetrators are prosecuted; and police officers refusing to register such complaints are appropriately disciplined.⁶¹ CESCR

recommended ensuring access of victims of domestic violence to adequate services for recovery and rehabilitation.⁶²

21. CESCR remained concerned about the large number of children who lived and worked on the streets, in particular in the informal sector. It urged the Government to address the root causes of the phenomenon of street children, ensure that street children have access to education, shelter and health care and address the sexual abuse and other exploitation of street children through the prosecution of perpetrators of abuse and the reintegration of victims into society.⁶³

22. CEDAW expressed concern at the high prevalence of human trafficking and that the country was a source, transit and destination country for human trafficking. It was concerned at the Government's failure to address the root causes of trafficking.⁶⁴ The ILO Committee of Experts noted with regret that no progress had been achieved regarding the adoption of the draft Law on Combating Human Trafficking.⁶⁵ CESCR encouraged the Government to develop programmes to address the root causes of trafficking and sexual exploitation of women and children and to adopt its draft Law on Combating Trafficking in Human Beings.⁶⁶

C. Administration of justice, including impunity

23. The HR Committee was concerned about the lack of independence of judges.⁶⁷ The Special Rapporteur on the independence of judges and lawyers stated that political and other interference had damaged the image of the justice system in the eyes of the population.⁶⁸ The HR Committee recommended ensuring the full independence of the judiciary from the executive branch and establishing an independent body responsible for matters relating to the appointment and promotion of judges.⁶⁹ The Special Rapporteur on the independence of judges and lawyers recommended that the selection of judges be made on merit only, based on a qualification examination.⁷⁰

24. While welcoming the establishment of Public Oversight Committees (POCs), CAT was concerned by: their inability to carry out unannounced visits; the reports that POC members were denied access to detention facilities even in some cases in which their visits were previously authorized and that independence of membership of POCs was inadequately safeguarded and some POCs did not have sufficient funding; and reports of reprisals against POC members.⁷¹

25. CAT expressed concern at the failure to ensure that the right of persons deprived of their liberty to access a lawyer promptly upon detention is respected in practice. It was concerned at reports of instances in which individuals were not assigned legal aid prior to their initial interrogations and that legislation did not ensure that all persons deprived of their liberty have the right to contact family members promptly upon deprivation of liberty, instead permitting officials to contact relatives on detainees' behalf, and failing to ensure that in all cases relatives should be informed of detainees' whereabouts. CAT recommended ensuring that all detainees are afforded, by law and in practice, the right to access a lawyer, contact family members, be informed of the charges against them and request and receive a medical examination by an independent physician promptly upon actual deprivation of liberty as well as maintain video recording of interrogations.⁷²

26. The Special Rapporteur on the independence of judges and lawyers recommended that the practical implementation of the principles of equality of arms and the presumption of innocence be strengthened.⁷³

27. CAT urged combating the practice of torture to extract confessions, and ensuring that, in practice, forced confessions are not used as evidence in any proceedings.⁷⁴

28. CAT was concerned at the failure of the authorities to carry out effective and independent investigations into allegations of torture and ill-treatment by public officials. It urged the Government to carry out prompt, impartial, effective investigations into all allegations of torture and ill-treatment; prosecute those responsible and impose appropriate sentences on those convicted.⁷⁵

29. CAT stated that the Government should step up its efforts to provide redress to victims of torture and ill-treatment, including fair and adequate compensation, and as full rehabilitation as possible.⁷⁶

30. The Special Rapporteur on the independence of judges and lawyers recommended that the draft law for the establishment of a juvenile justice system be adopted without delay.⁷⁷

D. Right to marriage and family life

31. CEDAW was concerned about the persistency of early marriages of girls and polygamy, especially in the North Caucasus.⁷⁸

32. CESCR encouraged the Government to reduce the number of children living in institutions and intensify its efforts to develop family-based alternative care.⁷⁹

E. Freedom of religion or belief, expression, association and peaceful assembly, and right to participate in public and political life

33. The Special Rapporteur in the field of cultural rights recommended that serious attention be given to alternative education proposals promoting inter-faith understanding favoured by some religious leaders.⁸⁰

34. The HR Committee was concerned that the length of civilian services for conscientious objectors was longer than military service. It noted with regret that the conditions for alternative service were punitive in nature.⁸¹

35. The HR Committee was concerned that media professionals continued to be subjected to politically motivated trials and convictions, and that the arbitrary use of defamation laws had served to discourage critical media reporting on matters of public interest.⁸² The High Commissioner reported that the State Duma had voted, in 2012, to restore defamation provisions to the Criminal Code – thereby reversing legislation passed only seven months previously that had reduced defamation to an administrative offence.⁸³

36. The HR Committee regretted that the definition of “extremist activity” in the Federal Law on Combating Extremist Activity remained vague, allowing for arbitrariness in its application, and that the amendments to the law made certain forms of defamation of public officials an act of extremism.⁸⁴

37. The United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) stated that the 2012 amendments to the Information Act, which was intended to block websites containing images of child abuse and other illegal material, could potentially lead to limitations on freedom of expression on the Internet.⁸⁵

38. CAT was concerned about a 2012 requirement that organizations receiving financial support from outside sources register and identify themselves publicly as “foreign agents”.⁸⁶ Several Special Rapporteurs stated that strict control measures could be applied on foreign-funded non-commercial organizations to closely monitor their activities. The Special Rapporteur on the situation of human rights defenders was concerned that putting

human rights defenders under such scrutiny would deter them from performing their work.⁸⁷

39. CAT was concerned by recent amendments to the Criminal Code, which expanded the definition of the crime of State treason to include providing financial, technical, advisory or other assistance to a foreign State or international organization directed at harming the country's security. It was concerned that such provisions could be interpreted as prohibiting the sharing of information on the human rights situation with the United Nations human rights organs. CAT recommended amending legislation requiring human rights organizations that receive foreign funding to register as "foreign agents" and repealing the amended definition of the crime of treason.⁸⁸

40. The Special Rapporteur on the situation of human rights defenders expressed concern about increasing harassment, threats, violence and judicial harassment against human rights defenders, in particular against journalists and lawyers.⁸⁹ The High Commissioner noted that several human rights defenders, lawyers and journalists, including Anna Politovskaya, Natalia Estemirova and Sergey Magnitsky, had been murdered or died in custody.⁹⁰ CAT,⁹¹ HR Committee,⁹² CEDAW⁹³ and UNESCO⁹⁴ made similar observations. CAT was concerned by the authorities' failure to effectively investigate such acts and hold accountable the perpetrators.⁹⁵

41. In 2012, the Special Rapporteur in the field of cultural rights was concerned that social art activists had reportedly been harassed by the police, and people prosecuted and convicted with criminal offences for provocative artistic expressions.⁹⁶

42. The High Commissioner referred to the 2012 restrictive amendments to the Law on Public Rallies and the Administrative Code that imposed hefty fines on participants and organizers of "unauthorized" gatherings. She stated that administrative authorities had more powers to refuse permits for mass gatherings and that it had become more difficult and costly for those holding alternative views to engage in public protests.⁹⁷

43. In 2012, the Special Rapporteur on the situation of human rights defenders expressed concern about reported arrests, detentions and instances of police abuse and excessive use of force during demonstrations.⁹⁸ In 2011, a joint communication was sent by several special procedure mandate holders regarding allegations of harassment, arbitrary detention and excessive use of force against activists and peaceful protesters in the context of the 2011 parliamentary elections. The Government replied to this communication.⁹⁹

44. The Special Rapporteur on the rights to freedom of peaceful assembly and of association recommended that the Government conduct a thorough, impartial and independent investigation over any allegation of excessive use of force, and of torture and ill-treatment, during peaceful demonstrations; and hold accountable those responsible and provide full redress to victims.¹⁰⁰ Referring to the recommendation 85.42 of the 2009 review accepted by the Government, he urged the authorities to refrain from adopting legislation that can hamper the legitimate work of civil society.¹⁰¹

45. The Special Rapporteur in the field of cultural rights noted information that it remained difficult for LGBT people to use cultural spaces to express their identity. She was concerned that the 2012 law adopted by the city of St. Petersburg, prohibiting propaganda of homosexuality to minors, might be used to prevent participation of persons in such events.¹⁰² The Special Rapporteur on the situation of human rights defenders was concerned about reports of increased obstacles for defenders of LGBT and intersexual persons' rights as a result of legislative initiatives in some cities representing considerable restrictions on their rights to freedom of expression and freedom of assembly.¹⁰³

46. CEDAW was concerned about the continuing women underrepresentation in public and political life and in decision-making positions.¹⁰⁴

F. Right to work and to just and favourable conditions of work

47. CESCR encouraged the Government to prevent wage arrears and ensure the implementation of the Labour Code stipulating that the minimum wage must not be lower than the worker's minimum subsistence level.¹⁰⁵ CESCR requested the Government to ensure that the safety and health standards in the workplace are strictly observed.¹⁰⁶

48. CESCR urged the authorities to amend its legislation to ensure that all public servants who do not exercise authority in the name of the Russian Federation can exercise freely their right to strike and that collective bargaining is always entrusted to trade unions, where they are established in the workplace.¹⁰⁷

G. Right to social security and to an adequate standard of living

49. CESCR encouraged the Government to continue to allocate resources to combat poverty; promote an adequate standard of living for all and to continue to reduce the number of persons below the subsistence level. It recommended adopting a national strategy integrating economic, social and cultural rights to combat poverty.¹⁰⁸

50. CESCR encouraged the Government to address homelessness, by ensuring the provision of social housing, with priority given to the most disadvantaged and marginalized groups, including the forcibly displaced persons and the Roma.¹⁰⁹

51. CESCR urged the Government to ensure in practice that the lack of residence registration and other personal identity documents does not hinder the enjoyment of economic, social and cultural rights. It recommended adopting a single registration number for each of its citizens that may give access everywhere on its territory to the enjoyment of all social benefits irrespective of the place of registered residence or lack thereof, in particular with regard to the homeless, Roma and other disadvantaged or marginalized groups.¹¹⁰

H. Right to health

52. While commending the Government's efforts in the area of health care, CEDAW noted with concern that the reduction of expenditure on public health had had a negative impact on access to health services, especially in rural areas.¹¹¹

53. CESCR remained concerned about the spread of drug addiction, including by way of injection, which was the main factor for the growing epidemic of HIV/AIDS, hepatitis C and tuberculosis; the continued ban on the medical use of methadone and buprenorphine for treatment of drug dependence; and the fact that the Government did not support opioid substitution therapy and needle and syringe programmes which were recommended by a number of United Nations bodies as effective measures for prevention of HIV/AIDS among injecting drug users.¹¹²

54. CESCR remained concerned that a large number of women, especially in rural areas, had limited access to reproductive and sexual health services, and at the lack of reproductive and sexual health education.¹¹³

I. Right to education

55. CESCR remained concerned about the sizeable numbers of children who did not attend school. It urged the Government to ensure that no child is deprived of the right to education, particularly in the rural areas and among disadvantaged and marginalized groups.¹¹⁴ CESCR also urged the Government to ensure that all children living in the North Caucasus and those internally displaced pursue their schooling in conformity with the relevant Federal Law.¹¹⁵

J. Cultural rights

56. The Special Rapporteur in the field of cultural rights noted an assessment indicating that, while many new opportunities have opened up, State support for cultural activities and infrastructure, especially in the most remote areas, has decreased. She highlighted a need to respond to the desire of all persons to access, participate in and to contribute to cultural life without discrimination and to promote everyone's right to access and enjoy cultural heritage. Furthermore, she stated that mechanisms are needed to ensure people's participation in decision-making regarding the identification, interpretation and stewardship of cultural heritage.¹¹⁶

K. Persons with disabilities

57. The HR Committee expressed concern at the significant number of persons with mental disabilities who were deprived of their legal capacity and the lack of adequate procedural and substantive safeguards against disproportionate restrictions in their enjoyment of the rights guaranteed under ICCPR.¹¹⁷

58. CESCR was concerned that persons with disabilities reportedly continued to face marginalization in the enjoyment of their economic, social and cultural rights, including in employment, education and health-care assistance.¹¹⁸

59. The Special Rapporteur in the field of cultural rights encouraged the authorities to respond to the requests to further implement the cultural rights of persons with disabilities, in particular requests regarding the training of sign language interpreters, subtitles on television, specialized school teachers and programmes to eliminate stereotypes and stigmatization of persons with disabilities.¹¹⁹

L. Minorities and indigenous peoples

60. CESCR encouraged the authorities to adopt a national programme of action for the promotion of economic, social and cultural rights of Roma, and to allocate sufficient resources for its effective implementation.¹²⁰

61. CESCR was concerned at the lack of concrete outcomes of the policy, action plan and target programme regarding the development of the indigenous peoples. It was also concerned that changes to federal legislation regulating the use of land, forests and water bodies deprived indigenous peoples of the right to their ancestral lands, fauna and biological and aquatic resources, on which they rely for their traditional economic activities.¹²¹

62. The Special Rapporteur on the situation of human rights and fundamental freedoms of indigenous people noted that the Federal Law on Territories provided that the land an indigenous community utilizes for traditional economic activities might be granted a

special legal designation of “territory of traditional nature use”. However, no such territories were established under the Law. In many places, indigenous peoples were subject to licensing and auctioning regimes that force them to auction for hunting and fishing licences in competition with non-indigenous, usually commercial interests, without any priority given to traditional hunting or fishing practices.¹²² He stated that oil development often occurred on, and transportation pipelines were built through, the areas indigenous peoples used as reindeer pastures, or as fishing and hunting grounds.¹²³

63. The Special Rapporteur stated that it was essential that the authorities urgently bring coherence and consistency to the various laws concerning the rights of indigenous peoples and particularly their access to land and resources. In accordance with international standards, guarantees for indigenous land and resource rights should be legally certain; implemented fully and fairly for all indigenous communities; consistent between federal and regional frameworks; and consistent throughout various legislation dealing with property rights, land leases and auctions, fisheries and forestry administration, national parks and environmental conservation, oil development and regulation of commercial enterprises.¹²⁴

64. The Special Rapporteur indicated that additional federal legislation is needed to regulate the interaction between industrial and extractive enterprises and indigenous communities, with a special emphasis on the right of indigenous peoples to be effectively consulted about industrial activities affecting them, and the right to compensation and mitigation measures.¹²⁵ He stated that steps should be taken to ensure that indigenous people receive adequate opportunity for political participation, and legislation should be enacted to ensure that indigenous people are consulted when decisions affecting them are undertaken.¹²⁶

65. The Special Rapporteur indicated that further efforts should be made to strengthen educational opportunities for indigenous people, who have higher levels of illiteracy than other members of the population. He stated that the authorities should support indigenous peoples’ efforts to establish educational institutions that best suit their communities.¹²⁷

66. The Special Rapporteur stated that the rights of ethnically distinct indigenous groups that do not meet the legislative criteria for designation as “small-numbered indigenous peoples”, but that nonetheless have characteristics similar to those within this category, should be protected.¹²⁸

M. Migrants, refugees and asylum seekers

67. CESCR remained concerned that illegal labour migration was widespread, which meant that a large number of people work without legal and social protection.¹²⁹

68. UNHCR stated that the refugee law was not fully compliant with international standards, in particular, because it contained additional grounds for rejection of asylum applications beyond the criteria set out in the 1951 Convention. UNCHR recommended adopting the new draft Law on Refugees and amending other relevant legislative acts to ensure consistency.¹³⁰

69. CAT was concerned about reports of extraditions/expulsions of foreign nationals to Central Asia, when those extraditions/expulsions expose the individuals to a risk of torture in their countries of origin and by the reliance of the authorities on diplomatic assurances in such cases. It recommended that the Government discontinue the practice of relying upon diplomatic assurances concerning the extradition/expulsion of persons to States where they would face a risk of torture.¹³¹ UNHCR recommended providing for the full respect of the non-refoulement principle and preventing refoulement in the context of deportation/expulsion procedures of persons in need of international protection, including

for those who did not exhaust the national asylum procedure, or are appealing against a negative decision.¹³²

70. UNHCR recommended ensuring that the detention of asylum seekers is only used as a last resort, and where necessary, for as short period as possible and that judicial safeguards are in place to prevent arbitrary and indefinite detention.¹³³

71. CESCR urged the Government to consider extending the social security benefits to which refugees were entitled to persons granted temporary asylum status.¹³⁴ UNHCR recommended enhancing cooperation between Federal Migration Service and NGOs in order to better address the socioeconomic needs of refugees and asylum seekers in the temporary accommodation centres and facilitate their local integration process.¹³⁵

72. In 2009, HR Committee was concerned about the large number of stateless and undocumented persons.¹³⁶ While noting efforts of the Government to reduce statelessness, UNHCR reported, in 2012, that a sizeable number of individuals remained stateless or with undetermined nationality.¹³⁷ UNHCR stated that stateless persons were often subject to administrative expulsion and prolonged detention in pre-removal centres and that there was no formal procedure in place for statelessness determination which would ensure that stateless persons are comprehensively identified and afforded protection.¹³⁸ It recommended introducing simplified procedures for acquiring citizenship or residency permits for certain categories of stateless persons, such as those who became stateless as a result of State succession and by enhancing the documentation of stateless persons. It recommended establishing a formal statelessness determination procedure to ensure that stateless persons are afforded protection.¹³⁹

73. UNHCR stated that the collective accommodations for former refugees and former internally displaced persons in the North Caucasus were of substandard quality and under threat of closure by the authorities, often without other alternative solutions. Former refugees and returnees from abroad were not provided with special assistance on return to the Chechen Republic.¹⁴⁰

N. Human rights and counter-terrorism

74. CAT urged the Government to ensure that any counter-terrorism measures taken in the North Caucasus conform to the Convention's prohibitions against torture and ill-treatment.¹⁴¹ The HR committee stated that the authorities should review the relevant provisions of the Federal Law on Counteracting Terrorism to bring it into line with the requirements of ICCPR and adopt a narrower definition of crimes of terrorism limited to offences that can justifiably be equated with terrorism and its serious consequences.¹⁴² Similarly, the High Commissioner stated that it was essential to ensure that counter-terrorism measures were carried out in line with human rights principles.¹⁴³

Notes

¹ Unless indicated otherwise, the status of ratifications of instruments listed in the table may be found on the official website of the United Nations Treaty Collection database, Office of Legal Affairs of the United Nations Secretariat, <http://treaties.un.org/>. Please also refer to the United Nations compilation on the Russian Federation from the previous cycle (A/HRC/WG.6/4/RUS/2).

² The following abbreviations have been used for this document:

ICERD	International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination
ICESCR	International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights

OP-ICESCR	Optional Protocol to ICESCR
ICCPR	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
ICCPR-OP 1	Optional Protocol to ICCPR
ICCPR-OP 2	Second Optional Protocol to ICCPR, aiming at the abolition of the death penalty
CEDAW	Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women
OP-CEDAW	Optional Protocol to CEDAW
CAT	Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment
OP-CAT	Optional Protocol to CAT
CRC	Convention on the Rights of the Child
OP-CRC-AC	Optional Protocol to CRC on the involvement of children in armed conflict
OP-CRC-SC	Optional Protocol to CRC on the sale of children, child prostitution and child pornography
OP-CRC-IC	Optional Protocol to CRC on a communications procedure
ICRMW	International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families
CRPD	Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities
OP-CRPD	Optional Protocol to CRPD
CPED	International Convention for the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearance

³ Individual complaints: ICCPR-OP 1, art. 1; OP-CEDAW, art. 1; OP-CRPD, art. 1; OP-ICESCR, art. 1; OP-CRC-IC, art. 5; ICERD, art. 14; CAT, art. 22; ICRMW, art. 77; and CPED, art. 31. Inquiry procedure: OP-CEDAW, art. 8; CAT, art. 20; CPED, art. 33; OP-CRPD, art. 6; OP-ICESCR, art. 11; and OP-CRC-IC, art. 13. Inter-State complaints: ICCPR, art. 41; ICRMW, art. 76; CPED, art. 32; CAT, art. 21; OP-ICESCR, art. 10; and OP-CRC-IC, art. 12. Urgent action: CPED, art. 30.

⁴ 1951 Convention relating to the Status of Refugees and its 1967 Protocol.

⁵ Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children, supplementing the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime.

⁶ Geneva Convention for the Amelioration of the Condition of the Wounded and Sick in Armed Forces in the Field (First Convention); Geneva Convention for the Amelioration of the Condition of Wounded, Sick and Shipwrecked Members of Armed Forces at Sea (Second Convention); Geneva Convention relative to the Treatment of Prisoners of War (Third Convention); Geneva Convention relative to the Protection of Civilian Persons in Time of War (Fourth Convention); Protocol Additional to the Geneva Conventions of 12 August 1949, and relating to the Protection of Victims of International Armed Conflicts (Protocol I); Protocol Additional to the Geneva Conventions of 12 August 1949, and relating to the Protection of Victims of Non-International Armed Conflicts (Protocol II); Protocol Additional to the Geneva Conventions of 12 August 1949, and relating to the Adoption of an Additional Distinctive Emblem (Protocol III). For the official status of ratifications, see Federal Department of Foreign Affairs of Switzerland, at www.eda.admin.ch/eda/fr/home/topics/intla/intrea/chdep/warvic.html.

⁷ International Labour Organization Convention No. 29 concerning Forced or Compulsory Labour; Convention No. 105 concerning the Abolition of Forced Labour; Convention No. 87 concerning Freedom of Association and Protection of the Right to Organise; Convention No. 98 concerning the Application of the Principles of the Right to Organise and to Bargain Collectively; Convention No. 100 concerning Equal Remuneration for Men and Women Workers for Work of Equal Value; Convention No. 111 concerning Discrimination in Respect of Employment and Occupation; Convention No. 138 concerning Minimum Age for Admission to Employment; Convention No. 182 concerning the Prohibition and Immediate Action for the Elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labour.

⁸ 1954 Convention relating to the Status of Stateless Persons and 1961 Convention on the Reduction of Statelessness.

⁹ International Labour Organization Convention No. 169 concerning Indigenous and Tribal Peoples in Independent Countries and Convention No. 189 concerning Decent Work for Domestic Workers.

- ¹⁰ Concluding observations of CESCR on the fifth periodic report of the Russian Federation, E/C.12/RUS/CO/5, para. 17, concluding observations of CEDAW on the seventh periodic report of the Russian Federation, CEDAW/C/USR/CO/7, para. 54, and concluding observations of CAT on the fifth periodic report of the Russian Federation, CAT/C/RUS/CO/5, para. 25.
- ¹¹ CEDAW/C/USR/CO/7, para. 54, and CAT/C/RUS/CO/5, para. 25.
- ¹² E/C.12/RUS/CO/5, para. 35.
- ¹³ CAT/C/RUS/CO/5, para. 25.
- ¹⁴ Ibid., paras. 24 and 26.
- ¹⁵ Ibid., para. 25.
- ¹⁶ UNHCR submission, p. 8, and concluding observations of CCPR on the sixth periodic report of the Russian Federation, CCPR/C/RUS/CO/6 and Corr.1, para. 9.
- ¹⁷ E/C.12/RUS/CO/5, para. 7 (f).
- ¹⁸ According to article 5 of the rules of procedure for the International Coordination Committee (ICC) Sub-Committee on Accreditation, the different classifications for accreditation used by the Sub-Committee are: A: Voting Member (fully in compliance with each of the Paris Principles), B: Non-Voting Member (not fully in compliance with each of the Paris Principles or insufficient information provided to make a determination), C: No Status (not in compliance with the Paris Principles).
- ¹⁹ For the list of national human rights institutions with accreditation status granted by the International Coordination Committee of National Institutions for the Promotion and Protection of Human Rights (ICC), see A/HRC/20/10, annex, and [http://nhri.ohchr.org/EN/Documents/Chart%20of%20the%20Status%20of%20NIs%20\(30%20May%202012\).pdf](http://nhri.ohchr.org/EN/Documents/Chart%20of%20the%20Status%20of%20NIs%20(30%20May%202012).pdf).
- ²⁰ The following abbreviations have been used for this document:
- | | |
|--------------|--|
| CERD | Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination |
| CESCR | Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights |
| HR Committee | Human Rights Committee |
| CEDAW | Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women |
| CAT | Committee against Torture |
| CRC | Committee on the Rights of the Child |
| CRPD | Committee on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities |
- ²¹ CERD/C/RUS/CO/19, para. 36.
- ²² Information received from the Government of the Russian Federation on the implementation of the concluding observations of CERD, CERD/C/RUS/CO/19/Add.1.
- ²³ Letter dated 27 August 2010 from CERD to the Permanent Mission of Russian Federation in Geneva, available from http://www2.ohchr.org/english/bodies/cerd/docs/followup/RussianFederation_27082010.pdf.
- ²⁴ CCPR/C/RUS/CO/6 and Corr.1, para. 31.
- ²⁵ Information received from the Russian Federation on the implementation of the concluding observations of HR Committee, CCPR/C/RUS/CO/6/Add.2.
- ²⁶ Letter dated 30 April 2012 from HR Committee to the Permanent Mission of Russian Federation in Geneva, available from <http://www2.ohchr.org/english/bodies/hrc/docs/followup/RussianFederationFUApril2012.pdf>, and letter dated 16 November 2012 from HR Committee to the Permanent Mission of Russian Federation in Geneva, available from <http://www2.ohchr.org/english/bodies/hrc/docs/RussianFederationFUNovember2012.pdf>.
- ²⁷ CEDAW/C/USR/CO/7, para. 55.
- ²⁸ Information provided by the Government of the Russian Federation on the follow-up to the concluding observations of CEDAW, CEDAW/C/RUS/CO/7/Add.1.
- ²⁹ CAT/C/RUS/CO/5, para. 28.
- ³⁰ CCPR/C/95/D/1278/2004, CCPR/C/95/D/1447/2006, , CCPR/C/98/D/1232/2003, CCPR/C/99/D/1577/2007, CCPR/C/101/D/1410/2005, CCPR/C/101/D/1304/2004, CCPR/C/102/D/1605/2007, CCPR/C/104/D/1866/2009 and CCPR/C/105/D/1628/2007. See also A/64/40 (Vol. II), A/65/40 (Vol. I), and A/66/40 (Vol. I and Vol. II, Part II).
- ³¹ For the titles of special procedures, see www.ohchr.org/EN/HRBodies/SP/Pages/Themes.aspx and www.ohchr.org/EN/HRBodies/SP/Pages/Countries.aspx.

- ³² Report of the Working Group on Enforced or Involuntary Disappearances, A/HRC/19/58/Rev.1, para. 476.
- ³³ Press release, United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights to visit Russia, 7 February, 2011. Available from www.ohchr.org/EN/NewsEvents/Pages/DisplayNews.aspx?NewsID=10711&LangID=E.
- ³⁴ OHCHR, *Report on Activities and Results 2008*, pp. 8, 68 and 126. See also OHCHR, *Report on Activities and Results 2011*, p. 143.
- ³⁵ OHCHR, *Report on Activities and Results 2009*, pp. 160, 195, 197 and 198; OHCHR, *Report on Activities and Results 2010*, pp. 79, 96 and 99; and OHCHR report 2011, pp. 125, 129, 154 and 157 and forthcoming OHCHR report 2012.
- ³⁶ E/C.12/RUS/CO/5, para. 10.
- ³⁷ CEDAW/C/USR/CO/7, paras. 13 and 21.
- ³⁸ *Ibid.*, para. 20.
- ³⁹ *Ibid.*, para. 24.
- ⁴⁰ E/C.12/RUS/CO/5, para. 12.
- ⁴¹ *Ibid.*, paras. 14–15.
- ⁴² ILO Committee of Experts on the Application of Conventions and Recommendations, Observation concerning ILO Equal Remuneration Convention, 1951 (No. 100) - Russian Federation, adopted 2011, published 101st ILC session (2012). Available from www.ilo.org/dyn/normlex/en/f?p=1000:13100:0::NO:13100:P13100_COMMENT_ID:2699089.
- ⁴³ CCPR/C/RUS/CO/6 and Corr.1, para. 11.
- ⁴⁴ CAT/C/RUS/CO/5, para. 15. See also UNHCR submission, pp. 9–10.
- ⁴⁵ CCPR/C/RUS/CO/6 and Corr.1, para. 28.
- ⁴⁶ CAT/C/RUS/CO/5, para. 15. See also CEDAW/C/USR/CO/7, para. 41.
- ⁴⁷ *Ibid.*, para. 26. See also CCPR/C/RUS/CO/6 and Corr.1, para. 12.
- ⁴⁸ *Ibid.*, paras. 6–7.
- ⁴⁹ CCPR/C/RUS/CO/6 and Corr.1, para. 14.
- ⁵⁰ CAT/C/RUS/CO/5, para. 13. See also opening remarks by the High Commissioner for Human Rights Navi Pillay at a press conference during her mission to the Russian Federation, 17 February, 2011. Available from www.ohchr.org/EN/NewsEvents/Pages/DisplayNews.aspx?NewsID=10734&LangID=E.
- ⁵¹ *Ibid.*, para. 16.
- ⁵² *Ibid.*, para. 18.
- ⁵³ *Ibid.*, para. 22.
- ⁵⁴ CCPR/C/RUS/CO/6 and Corr.1, para. 10.
- ⁵⁵ CEDAW/C/USR/CO/7, para. 22.
- ⁵⁶ CAT/C/RUS/CO/5, para. 14.
- ⁵⁷ *Ibid.*, para. 13.
- ⁵⁸ CEDAW/C/USR/CO/7, para. 24.
- ⁵⁹ *Ibid.*, para. 23.
- ⁶⁰ E/C.12/RUS/CO/5, para. 22.
- ⁶¹ CAT/C/RUS/CO/5, para. 14. See also CEDAW/C/USR/CO/7, para. 25.
- ⁶² E/C.12/RUS/CO/5, para. 22.
- ⁶³ *Ibid.*, para. 24.
- ⁶⁴ CEDAW/C/USR/CO/7, para. 26.
- ⁶⁵ ILO Committee of Experts on the Application of Conventions and Recommendations, Observation concerning ILO Forced Labour Convention, 1930 (No. 29) - Russian Federation, adopted 2010, published 100st ILC session (2011). Available from www.ilo.org/dyn/normlex/en/f?p=1000:13100:0::NO:13100:P13100_COMMENT_ID:2329253:NO.
- ⁶⁶ E/C.12/RUS/CO/5, para. 23. See also CEDAW/C/USR/CO/7, para. 27.
- ⁶⁷ CCPR/C/RUS/CO/6 and Corr.1, para. 21.
- ⁶⁸ Report of the Special Rapporteur on the independence of judges and lawyers on his mission to the Russian Federation, A/HRC/11/41/Add.2, para. 94.
- ⁶⁹ CCPR/C/RUS/CO/6 and Corr.1, para. 21.
- ⁷⁰ A/HRC/11/41/Add.2, para. 99.
- ⁷¹ CAT/C/RUS/CO/5, para. 11.

- ⁷² Ibid., para. 9.
- ⁷³ A/HRC/11/41/Add.2, para. 98.
- ⁷⁴ CAT/C/RUS/CO/5, para. 10.
- ⁷⁵ Ibid., para. 8.
- ⁷⁶ Ibid., para. 20.
- ⁷⁷ A/HRC/11/41/Add.2, para. 97.
- ⁷⁸ CEDAW/C/USR/CO/7, para. 48.
- ⁷⁹ E/C.12/RUS/CO/5, para. 25.
- ⁸⁰ Preliminary conclusions and observations by the Special Rapporteur in the field of cultural rights at the end of the visit to the Russian Federation, 16–26 April 2012. Available from www.ohchr.org/EN/NewsEvents/Pages/DisplayNews.aspx?NewsID=12084&LangID=E.
- ⁸¹ CCPR/C/RUS/CO/6 and Corr.1, para. 23.
- ⁸² Ibid., para. 24.
- ⁸³ Press release, Pillay concerned about series of new laws restricting human rights in Russian Federation, 18 July 2012. Available from www.ohchr.org/EN/NewsEvents/Pages/DisplayNews.aspx?NewsID=12366&LangID=E. See also UNESCO submission, para. 53.
- ⁸⁴ CCPR/C/RUS/CO/6 and Corr.1, para. 24.
- ⁸⁵ UNESCO submission, para. 54. See also press release, Pillay concerned about series of new laws restricting human rights in Russian Federation, 18 July 2012.
- ⁸⁶ CAT/C/RUS/CO/5, para. 12.
- ⁸⁷ Press release, “Russia’s draft law on non-commercial organizations detrimental to civil society” – UN experts, 12 July 2012. Available from www.ohchr.org/en/NewsEvents/Pages/DisplayNews.aspx?NewsID=12344&LangID=E.
- ⁸⁸ CAT/C/RUS/CO/5, para. 12.
- ⁸⁹ Report of the Special Rapporteur on the situation of human rights defenders, A/HRC/19/55/Add.2, para. 307.
- ⁹⁰ Opening remarks by the High Commissioner for Human Rights Navi Pillay at a press conference during her mission to the Russian Federation, 17 February 2011.
- ⁹¹ CAT/C/RUS/CO/5, para. 12.
- ⁹² CCPR/C/RUS/CO/6 and Corr.1, para. 16 (b).
- ⁹³ CEDAW/C/USR/CO/7, para. 32.
- ⁹⁴ UNESCO submission, para. 56.
- ⁹⁵ CAT/C/RUS/CO/5, para. 12. See also A/HRC/19/44, p. 67, and A/HRC/13/22/Add.1 and Corr.1, para. 1870.
- ⁹⁶ Preliminary conclusions and observations by the Special Rapporteur in the field of cultural rights at the end of the visit to the Russian Federation, 16–26 April 2012.
- ⁹⁷ Press release, Pillay concerned about series of new laws restricting human rights in Russian Federation, 18 July 2012.
- ⁹⁸ A/HRC/19/55/Add.2, para. 307. See also CCPR/C/RUS/CO/6 and Corr.1, para. 25.
- ⁹⁹ Special procedure communication report, A/HRC/20/30, p. 27.
- ¹⁰⁰ Report of the Special Rapporteur on the rights to freedom of peaceful assembly and of association, A/HRC/20/27/Add.3, para. 250.
- ¹⁰¹ Ibid., paras. 253.
- ¹⁰² Preliminary conclusions and observations by the Special Rapporteur in the field of cultural rights at the end of the visit to the Russian Federation, 16–26 April 2012.
- ¹⁰³ A/HRC/19/55/Add.2, para. 308.
- ¹⁰⁴ CEDAW/C/USR/CO/7, para. 30. See also E/C.12/RUS/CO/5, para. 12.
- ¹⁰⁵ E/C.12/RUS/CO/5, para. 18.
- ¹⁰⁶ Ibid., para. 16.
- ¹⁰⁷ Ibid., paras. 19–20.
- ¹⁰⁸ Ibid., para. 26.
- ¹⁰⁹ Ibid., para. 27.
- ¹¹⁰ Ibid., para. 8.
- ¹¹¹ CEDAW/C/USR/CO/7, para. 38.
- ¹¹² E/C.12/RUS/CO/5, para. 29.

- ¹¹³ Ibid., para. 30.
- ¹¹⁴ Ibid., para. 32.
- ¹¹⁵ Ibid., para. 33.
- ¹¹⁶ Preliminary conclusions and observations by the Special Rapporteur in the field of cultural rights at the end of the visit to the Russian Federation, 16–26 April 2012.
- ¹¹⁷ CCPR/C/RUS/CO/6 and Corr.1, para. 19.
- ¹¹⁸ E/C.12/RUS/CO/5, para. 11.
- ¹¹⁹ Preliminary conclusions and observations by the Special Rapporteur in the field of cultural rights at the end of the Visit to the Russian Federation, 16–26 April 2012.
- ¹²⁰ E/C.12/RUS/CO/5, para. 9.
- ¹²¹ Ibid., para. 7. See also letter dated 2 September 2011 from CERD to the Permanent Mission of Russian Federation in Geneva, available from http://www2.ohchr.org/english/bodies/cerd/docs/early_warning/RussianFederation02092011.pdf, and letter dated 11 March 2011 from CERD to the Permanent Mission of Russian Federation in Geneva, available from http://www2.ohchr.org/english/bodies/cerd/docs/RussianFederation_11March2011.pdf.
- ¹²² Report of the Special Rapporteur on the situation of human rights and fundamental freedoms of indigenous people, A/HRC/15/37/Add.5, paras. 32, 33, 35 and 36.
- ¹²³ Ibid., para. 41.
- ¹²⁴ Ibid., para. 83. See also CCPR/C/RUS/CO/6 and Corr.1, para. 29.
- ¹²⁵ Ibid., para. 85.
- ¹²⁶ Ibid., para. 88.
- ¹²⁷ Ibid., para. 92.
- ¹²⁸ Ibid., para. 81.
- ¹²⁹ E/C.12/RUS/CO/5, para. 17.
- ¹³⁰ UNHCR submission, pp. 4–5.
- ¹³¹ CAT/C/RUS/CO/5, para. 17. See also CCPR/C/RUS/CO/6 and Corr.1, para.17.
- ¹³² UNHCR submission, p. 6.
- ¹³³ Ibid., p. 6.
- ¹³⁴ E/C.12/RUS/CO/5, para. 21.
- ¹³⁵ UNHCR submission, p. 7.
- ¹³⁶ CCPR/C/RUS/CO/6 and Corr.1, para. 9.
- ¹³⁷ UNHCR submission, p. 7.
- ¹³⁸ Ibid., pp. 7–8.
- ¹³⁹ Ibid., pp. 8–9.
- ¹⁴⁰ Ibid., p. 9.
- ¹⁴¹ CAT/C/RUS/CO/5, para. 13.
- ¹⁴² CCPR/C/RUS/CO/6 and Corr.1, para. 7.
- ¹⁴³ Opening remarks by the High Commissioner for Human Rights Navi Pillay at a press conference during her mission to the Russian Federation, 17 February 2011.