



Report on the implementation of the EU framework for National Roma Integration Strategies



Neither the European Commission nor any person acting on behalf of the European Commission may be held responsible for the use that may be made of the information contained in this publication.

The communication Report on the implementation of the EU Framework for National Roma Integration Strategies COM(2014) 209 final is also available in French and German, along with the Commission staff working document SWD(2014) 121 final, from the European Commission Roma portal: <http://ec.europa.eu/roma>

Europe Direct is a service to help you find answers
to your questions about the European Union.

Freephone number (*):
00 800 6 7 8 9 10 11

(*) Certain mobile telephone operators do not allow access to 00 800 numbers or these calls may be billed.

European Commission - Directorate-General for Justice

More information on the European Union is available on the Internet (<http://europa.eu>)

© European Union, 2014

Picture copyright: European Union/Reporters.

Reproduction is authorised provided the source is acknowledged.

Printed in Belgium

Table of contents

Report on the implementation
of the EU Framework for National Roma Integration Strategies
COM(2014) 209 final - 2.4.2014..... 5

Commission staff working document
accompanying the document Report on the implementation
of the EU Framework for National Roma Integration Strategies :
SWD(2014) 121 final..... 17

Brussels 2.4.2014
COM(2014) 209 final

Communication from the Commission to the European Parliament,
the Council, the European Economic and Social Committee
and the Committee of the Regions

Report on the implementation of the EU Framework for National Roma Integration Strategies

{SWD(2014) 121 final}

1. Introduction

The EU Framework for National Roma Integration strategies up to 2020¹ adopted in April 2011 brought about a change in the approach to Roma inclusion: for the first time a comprehensive and evidence-based framework clearly linked to the Europe 2020 strategy was developed. The EU Framework is for all Member States but needs to be tailored to each national situation.

EU Heads of State and Government endorsed the EU Framework², and consequently, for the first time ever, Member States began to coordinate their efforts to close the gap between Roma and non-Roma in access to education, employment, healthcare and housing. The Commission put in place an annual reporting mechanism to the European Parliament and the Council to assess progress made until 2020. In parallel, it established structures to accompany Member States in their efforts, in particular the National Roma Contact Points' network where Na-

tional Roma Contact Points from all 28 Member States meet regularly as well as the Commission-internal Roma Task Force chaired by Directorate General Justice (with Directorate General Employment, Social Affairs and Inclusion as deputy chair) bringing together senior representatives from the Commission's Secretariat General as well as from various Directorates General, including those in charge of regional and urban policy, education and culture, agriculture and rural development, health and consumers, enlargement, home affairs, statistics, budget, communication and the European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights (FRA) to ensure coherence and consistency.

This report measures for the first time progress made in the four key areas of education, employment, healthcare and housing, as well as in the fight against discrimination and the use of funding. It also assesses the progress made at EU level.

¹ COM(2011) 173 final O.J. L 76/68, 22.3.2011

² *European Council Conclusions EUCO 23/11 of 23 and 24 June 2011, following the Employment, Social Policy, Health and Consumer Affairs (EPSCO) Council Conclusions on an EU Framework for National Roma Integration Strategies up to 2020, 106665/11 of 19 May 2011.*

³ Malta did not adopt a National Roma Integration Strategy as it declared there is no significant Roma population on its territory, though will address Roma integration should this case arise.

⁴ In this communication the term 'strategies' covers integrated sets of policy measures and strategies.

⁵ In 2013 the European Council issued country specific recommendations relevant for Roma inclusion for Bulgaria, the Czech Republic, Hungary, Slovakia and Romania. These recommendations address the implementation of National Roma Integration Strategies in the framework of the horizontal policies as well as specific policy developments in the field of education and employment for Roma.

⁶ Council recommendation of 9 December 2013 on effective Roma integration measures in the Member States, OJ C 378, 14.12.2013, 01.

⁷ Council regulation laying down the multiannual financial framework 2014-2020. Council regulation No 1311/2013 of 2 December 2013. O.J. L 347/884 20.12.2013

⁸ *Regulation (EU) No 1303/2013 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 17 December 2013 laying down common provisions on the European Regional Development Fund, the European Social Fund, the Cohesion Fund, the European Agricultural Fund for Rural Development and the European Maritime and Fisheries Fund and laying down general provisions on the European Regional Development Fund, the European Social Fund, the Cohesion Fund and the European Maritime and Fisheries Fund and repealing Council Regulation (EC) No 1083/2006. O.J. L 347, 20.12.2013*

⁹ Including Regulation (EU) No 1304/2013 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 17 December 2013 on the European Social Fund and repealing Council Regulation (EC) No 1081/2006. O.J. L 347, 20.12.2013

2. Progress at EU level

2.1. Mainstreaming of Roma integration in policy and financing

The size and situation of the Roma population vary from one Member State to another. In addition, in some Member States, integration of recently arrived Roma communities poses new challenges that need to be addressed. Under the EU framework, all Member States³ have developed their own Roma integration strategies⁴ tailored to the needs of the Roma population in their country. As many Roma face poverty and social exclusion, the Commission linked Roma integration to its wider growth agenda, the Europe 2020 strategy. In the European Semester, the European Council has issued country-specific recommendations⁵ on Roma integration to Member States with a sizeable Roma population. In addition, the Commission proposed, and the Council adopted, the first ever legal instrument on Roma, a Council Recommendation on effective Roma integration measures in the Member States⁶. This Recommendation identi-

fies specific measures, including positive action to improve the situation of Roma.

The Commission's Roma Task Force ensures that all aspects of Roma integration are addressed, notably through the use of various EU funds. The new multi-annual Financial Framework for 2014-2020⁷ facilitates the use of EU funds for Roma integration. The Common Provisions Regulation for all European Structural and Investment (ESI) Funds⁸ gives the possibility to combine different EU funds to work in the four key policy areas of the EU Framework. The main relevant funds for Roma integration are the European Social Fund (ESF), the European Regional Development Fund (ERDF) and the European Agricultural Fund for Rural Development (EAFRD). The financial Regulations⁹ set out that at least 23.1% of the Cohesion policy budget would be earmarked to investment in people - through the European Social

¹⁰ Commission Delegated Regulation (EU) of 7 January 2014 on the European code of conduct on partnership in the framework of the European Structural and Investment Funds; C(2013) 9651.

¹¹ Regulation (EU) No 1304/2013 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 17 December 2013 on the European Social Fund and repealing Council Regulation (EC) No 1081/2006. O.J. L 347, 20.12.2013

¹² Council Recommendation of 26 April 2013 on Establishing a Youth Guarantee O.J. C 120, 26.4.2013, 1

¹³ Such as the Council of Europe, the Council of Europe Development Bank, the World Bank, the United Nations, UNICEF, the EU Agency for Fundamental Rights (FRA) and the Open Society Foundations.

¹⁴ The ROMACT project, launched in October 2013 in about 40 municipalities in 5 Member States, aims at building up political will and sustained policy engagement at the local level, at enhancing democratic participation and empowerment of local Roma communities, with a view to assist the design and implementation of projects with the support of EU and national funds.

¹⁵ The ROMED programme, funded through Lifelong Learning Programme, launched in 2011 has trained close to 1,300 mediators to date in the field of school, culture and health. For 2013-2014, mediation is focussing on establishing contacts with local authorities (municipalities, schools, etc.).

Fund, allocating at least 20% of this amount in each Member State to combating poverty and social exclusion. Furthermore, the new Regulations governing the spending of EU Funds now incorporate improved monitoring and evaluation mechanisms to obtain more accurate information on whether Structural Funds are meeting the defined Roma inclusion goals

The Commission also issued a European Code of Conduct on Partnership¹⁰, which covers all the ESI Funds, and provides detailed criteria for organising partnerships, for planning, implementing, and follow-

ing up the programmes. In addition, the European Social Fund (ESF) Regulation¹¹ requires that an appropriate amount of ESF funding be used in less developed and transition regions to strengthen the capacity of social partners and NGOs in implementing the programmes.

Lastly, based on a Commission proposal, the Council adopted a Recommendation on Establishing a Youth Guarantee¹² and Member States were specifically called upon to regard Roma as a key target group in proportion to the size and situation of their Roma population.

2.2. Working closely with all stakeholders

The Commission has set up a permanent dialogue with Member States through the network of the 28 National Roma Contact Points. This network represents an important step forward to support coordination and implementation of the strategies, and actions on the ground. It also allows Member States to share their experience and expertise with the Commission, and fosters transnational cooperation and the exchange of good practices.

In addition, the meetings of the European Platform for Roma Inclusion have developed into a forum for discussion and exchange of experience between the Commission, Member States, international organisations, enlargement countries and

civil society. The Commission, in cooperation with all stakeholders, will further reflect on how to make this forum even more efficient and contribute best to the shaping of European Roma integration policies.

To support effective implementation of National Roma Integration Strategies at local and regional levels, the Commission participates in a Coalition of international organisations¹³. In this Coalition, the Commission and the Council of Europe join forces to strengthen the capacity of local authorities to design, fund and implement local Roma inclusion strategies starting with improving local governance¹⁴ and community participation through mediation¹⁵.

3. Progress in the Member States – the Commission’s Assessment

Three years after the adoption of the EU Framework, progress, although still slow, is beginning to take shape in most Member States. This report looks in particular at what measures have been implemented, whether guidance provided in previous Commission progress reports has been followed, and whether there is a real impact on the ground. The accompanying Staff Working Document contains a detailed overview by Member State, and the first assessment of Croatia’s national Roma

integration strategy, submitted after its accession to the EU on 1 July 2013.

The assessment uses in particular information from the Member States through the National Roma Contact Points, from civil society and from the European Network of Independent Experts on Social Inclusion. The FRA survey of 2011 on the situation on the ground is the starting point from which progress is measured.

3.1. Education

In the EU Framework, the Commission calls on Member States to ensure, as a minimum, primary school completion, to widen access to quality early childhood education and care, ensure that Roma children are not subject to discrimination or segregation and to reduce the number of early school leavers. Member States were also called upon to encourage Roma youngsters to participate in secondary and tertiary education.

The Commission’s assessment reveals that Member States have taken a series of specific measures which delivered results on the ground. For instance, the reports reveal a clear positive general trend with regard to access to early childhood education and care.

However, much more needs to be done to bring about change on a larger scale. The most serious challenges previously identified by the EU Framework remain relevant and require further sustained efforts. In order to achieve significant progress, mainstream education systems should become more inclusive and more tailored to the needs of Roma pupils.

The persistence of segregation of Roma children in special schools or classes¹⁶ remains a key challenge, with no simple and clear-cut solutions. Desegregation requires political commitment, time, careful preparation and implementation plans, which take local circumstances into account. Measures that indirectly lead to segregation should be systematically eliminated. The Member States most concerned (e.g. Czech Republic, Slovakia, Hungary, Romania, Bulgaria and

Greece) will need to put in place stronger measures to end and reverse this situation through a quality, accessible and mainstream inclusive education system.

Importance of access to quality early childhood education and care (ECEC) is now broadly recognised. A series of legislative measures (e.g. compulsory pre-school years, in-cash incentives) have also been implemented in several Member States. Some Member States were able to report clear positive results. In Finland for example, within ten years, the participation of Roma children in pre-primary school increased from 2% to 60%. The same applies to Hungary, where the enrolment rate of Roma children in pre-school is high (79%) and is likely to further improve as the new law on public education lowers the starting age of compulsory kindergarten education to 3 years. On the other hand, in certain Member States, measures implemented are still insufficient (e.g. Slovakia) or even non-existent (e.g. Greece).

Reducing the number of Roma early school leavers also requires additional efforts, including extracurricular activities and close cooperation with families. The situation of children illegally staying on the territory may be even worse, when the lack of required official documents, such as a valid residence permit or medical records may prevent children’s enrolment in primary education. The French ombudsman’s report¹⁷ has indicated a number of cases where local authorities have hindered the access of Roma children

¹⁶ Segregation in mainstream schools attended by Roma: SK: 58%, HU: 45%, EL: 35%, CZ: 33%, BG: 29%, RO: 26%, FR: 24%, ES: 10%, IT: 8%, PT: 7%, PL:3%. - segregation in special schools: Roma children attending special schools mainly with Roma: CZ: 23%, SK: 20%, FR: 18%, BG: 18%, etc. Source: FRA, *Education: The situation of Roma in 11 EU Member States. Roma Survey - Data in Focus* (forthcoming in 2014).

¹⁷ Le Défenseur des Droits, *Bilan d’application de la circulaire interministérielle du 26 août 2012 relative à l’anticipation et à l’accompagnement des opérations d’évacuation des campements illicites août 2012 – mai 2013* (juin 2013).

¹⁸ The Council Recommendation of 20 December 2012 on the recognition of the value of non-formal and informal learning within the European youth field (O.J. C 398/1, 22.12.2012) encourages the use of instruments for recognition of skills and qualifications obtained through such learning experiences.

to primary education for such reasons. In addition, frequent moves of Roma and traveller families have led to interruptions in schooling, leading to learning gaps and high drop-out rates.

The Commission's assessment confirms that sustained efforts can bring about a significant impact on the situation of Roma in education. For example, in three years (2010-2013), a Bulgarian educational project has brought down the number of children who dropped out of school by almost 80%. There are further good practices, such as all day schooling in Bulgaria and Slovakia or after-school activities provided specifically for disadvantaged children in Hungary, the use of mediators in Finland, the inclusion of Roma culture in curricula in Slovakia and Hungary, providing language support in Bulgaria and France, providing bilingual education (Romani-Romanian), preparing Romani language teachers in Romania, and teacher training in Slovakia, Hungary and Bulgaria. In addition, the extension of education projects to children whose families move from one Member State to another is a positive development.

However, existing practices have a rather limited scope and the main challenge remains in up-scaling these initiatives and securing long-term financing. More efforts are needed with regard to teacher education and the introduction of inclusive teaching methodolo-

gies, which take into account individual learning needs. A more systematic use of Roma pedagogical assistants and mediators and greater involvement with local communities and parents would improve access of Roma children to mainstream quality education. Coherence of mainstream policies with the goals set in the national Roma integration strategies needs to be ensured (e.g. in Hungary).

Beyond compulsory schooling, enrolment differences between Roma and non-Roma become even larger. This is particularly detrimental to Roma integration and makes a difference in the labour market as the lack of professional skills and qualifications prevents Roma adults from accessing quality employment. There are few systemic measures encouraging the participation of Roma youngsters in further education, or helping Roma students to reintegrate into the education system after they have dropped out. Although in Poland, Finland and Sweden measures were put in place to increase the number of students who complete secondary and higher education and to enhance vocational education and training of adult Roma, in most Member States, similar measures are rather sporadic, mainly consisting of scholarships for talented students. In the field of youth, non-formal and informal learning are also important instruments to develop skills and increase employability among young people¹⁸.

Examples in the field of education

Bulgaria and Hungary - Two-year obligatory pre-school has been introduced in Bulgaria; obligatory pre-school from the age of three will be introduced in Hungary from the 2014-2015 school year. This mainstream measure is promising as regards education of Roma children for primary education, but sufficient capacities and quality staff are crucial for long-term results.

Denmark - The project 'Hold On Tight Caravan', administrated by the Ministry of Education, is focused on getting more youngsters from ethnic minorities to begin and complete a Vocational Education and Training programme. The initiative is managed in schools by coordinators who ensure an individual approach to each young person at risk of school failure or drop out. The project is implemented across Denmark. Since it started in 2009, overall school and training drop-out rates have fallen from 20% to fewer than 15%, while the gap with ethnic Danish students has narrowed. The ESF contribution for the 'Hold On Tight Caravan' has been €3,214,000 during 2009-2013.

Romania - The positive action programme for Roma in higher education continue. These mainstreamed programmes offer dedicated places for Roma for admission to public universities (in the academic year 2010/11, 555 places have been granted, and in 2012/13, 564 places).

Sweden - The Adult Education Association in Gothenburg (Studieförbundet Vuxenskolan i Göteborg) offers tuition for Roma who have not completed primary or secondary school education.

Although progress has been made, notably in access to early childhood education and care, much more needs to be done to reduce the educational disadvantage of Roma. For Member States with a significant Roma population priority should be given to combating segregation fighting early school leaving and making mainstream education systems more inclusive. Enabling Roma youngsters to

obtain marketable skills and qualifications, at least at secondary level and ensuring life-long learning for Roma adults should be a clear objective of both mainstream and targeted measures. Moreover, positive actions aimed at increasing the educational attainment of Roma should be sustained and scaled up to enable young Roma to get professional qualifications.

3.2. Employment

To close the employment gap between Roma and non-Roma, the EU Framework calls on Member States to ensure Roma non-discriminatory access to the open labour market, self-employment and micro-credit, and vocational training. Member States were encouraged to ensure effective equal access for Roma to mainstream public employment services, alongside targeted and personalised guidance and mediation for Roma jobseekers, and to support the employment of qualified Roma civil servants.

Although there are several promising initiatives across Member States, the expected impact has not yet been reached. Visible improvements in the educational participation and attainment have failed to translate into improving employment prospects among Roma¹⁹. In some cases, the employment situation of Roma has even further deteriorated, although this is partly due to the general increase of unemployment in several EU Member States over the past few years. Within this context, Roma, and to an even larger extent Roma women²⁰, have been particularly affected as they often lack marketable skills and qualifications. In addition, chances for the Roma on the labour market are limited by direct and indirect discrimination²¹. Advancing in this challenging situation requires determined action and investment in human capital by Member States, such as measures ensuring equal access to social services, and providing personalised guidance and

employment schemes. The potential for job creation for Roma through self-employment, (social) entrepreneurship, and by using innovative financial instruments have hardly been exploited. Social innovation should be reinforced by testing new policy approaches and scaling-up successful initiatives, via building cooperation between different actors at local and regional levels.

Lessons can be learnt from successful projects, for example the *Thara* information platform in Austria, a pilot project stimulating social and professional activation pathways in Belgium, Community Development Centres to eliminate barriers to the labour market in Bulgaria or the integrated action plans of Nordrhein-Westfalen and Berlin, to mention just a few. These projects however, are mostly initiated by local or regional authorities and are implemented by NGOs, so their result is bound to be limited to a given territory and their sustainability remains uncertain.

The assessment reveals that there are still too few systematic measures put in place at national level, although there are some good examples: the Roma job counsellors under the Ministry of Employment in Finland, the reallocation of resources for the Spanish *Acceder* program, or pilot projects in some municipalities in the Czech Republic introducing social considerations in public procurement.

¹⁹ FRA, *Poverty and Employment: The situation of Roma in 11 EU Member States, Roma Survey – Data in Focus* (forthcoming in 2014).

²⁰ Across the Member States surveyed, 21% of Roma women were in paid work compared to 35 % of Roma men. FRA, *Analysis of FRA Roma Survey by Gender* (September 2013).

²¹ Share of Roma experiencing discrimination in the past 5 years when looking for work: CZ 74%, EL 68%, IT 66%, FR 65%, PL 64%, PT 56%, HU 51%, SK 49%, BG 41%, RO 39%, ES 38%. FRA, *Poverty and Employment: The situation of Roma in 11 EU Member States. Roma Survey – Data in Focus* (forthcoming in 2014).

Examples in the field of employment

Bulgaria – Community Development Centres (CDC) aim to empower and promote the employment of young people and women in marginalised Roma communities. The initiative has been implemented by AMALIPE Centre for Interethnic Dialogue and Tolerance with the support of European Commission since 2011. Community Development Centres were established in 11 municipalities.

France (Lyon) – The multi-partner **Andatu** project has mobilised local, civil, national involvement as well as EU funding and combine training, access to employment and housing. As the program targets mobile EU citizens, French language courses are offered. The program also finances short professional trainings and provides individualised support. The European Social Fund supported the launch of the programme with €350,000. Currently reaching 73 beneficiaries, the intervention is planned to be extended to 400 participants requiring a total budget of €1.2 million.

Hungary – The mainstream programme of the Public Employment Service aimed at **improving the employability of the disadvantaged** targets various subgroups within the registered unemployed, with Roma prioritised as one target group. The programme provides a personalised combination of subsidies and services, such as labour market counselling, mentoring, vocational training and wage subsidies aiming at open labour market reintegration. According to external expert evaluation, the probability of employment increases by 40% after having followed this programme.

Despite the success of some measures, no tangible widespread impact has yet been achieved on the ground. To close the employment gap between Roma and non-Roma, Member States will need to target simultaneously the supply and demand sides of the labour market. On the supply side, the low skill levels of Roma job seekers must be addressed with vocational training and counselling, combining targeted measures and effective access to mainstream employment services. On the demand side, measures are needed

to give incentives to employers, such as recruitment subsidies, job trial and apprenticeship schemes. Other measures could include targeting Roma under the youth guarantee schemes, introducing social considerations into public procurement, fighting discrimination in the workplace and employing Roma in national and local civil service, in a manner that does not create a parallel labour system. Using the potential of social economy and social innovation could promote (re)entry to the labour market.

3.3. Health

To reduce the health gap between the Roma and the rest of the population, the EU Framework calls on Member States to provide access to quality healthcare especially for children and women, and to preventive care and social services at a similar level and under the same conditions as the rest of the population.

The poor health of Roma is very closely linked to social, economic and environmental factors. People in vulnerable situations often have trouble in navigating in the health system and in articulating their needs. Barriers include poor accessibility of health

services in terms of distance (e.g. Roma settlements in remote areas or Roma without settlement), lack of access due to financial difficulties (affordability of medicines), lack of registration with local authorities, lack of awareness especially about preventive services, cultural differences and discrimination. No health coverage often also means no vaccination for children, which in turn can prevent them from being accepted by schools and kindergartens.

Few Member States have provided information enabling comparison of the health of Roma with the general population. While there are a variety of

reasons for this, it is nevertheless essential that all relevant Member States can monitor the health of the Roma population. A good example is the health and welfare survey that Finland is about to develop.

The available information shows very significant differences among Member States both in terms of starting points²² and progress. Ensuring basic health coverage is still a challenge in some Member States, in particular in Bulgaria, Romania and also in Greece. With the rise of unemployment in these countries, the number of families lacking health coverage has increased. The impact of budgetary cuts, restructuring or cancellation of services in general health policies in some Member States had further consequences on vulnerable groups, including Roma. In France, the government has committed to reduce financial barriers to access to healthcare for the most vulnerable.

Reports from several Member States show significant

efforts in combatting infectious diseases among Roma. While progress in this area is very much welcome, more attention on prevention and treatment of non-communicable diseases and on general health campaigns with a focus on the promotion of healthy lifestyles is also required. Furthermore successful measures remain to be systematised.

Training health professionals (e.g. in Czech Republic) and involving Roma health mediators is one way to address access to healthcare services for the Roma population. Several Member States (e.g. Romania, Spain) have invested successfully in Roma mediators – however in most cases, there is a need to move from temporary to mainstream funding and ensuring adequate professional recognition. In 2013, the Commission launched an initiative to develop training packages for health professionals for migrants and ethnic minorities, including the Roma.

²² For example, 59 % of Roma women in Bulgaria, 47 % in Romania and 38 % in Greece said that they had no medical insurance compared with 22 % of non-Roma women in Bulgaria and in Romania, and 7 % of non-Roma women in Greece. FRA Analysis of FRA Roma Survey by Gender (September 2013).

Examples in the area of health

Czech Republic – Communication courses focusing on specific socio-cultural environment of a patient are compulsory in the medicine, dentistry and pharmacy curricula. Other medical staff is also trained through Interpersonal Skills of Professional (*Interpersonální dovednosti specialisty*) and Education (*Edukace*) programmes.

Hungary – Training for those working in basic healthcare services is being developed: in 2013, 250 health visitors took part in training courses, and some 4830 specialists are expected to be trained by them in the 1st half of 2014.

France – In January 2013, the government engaged to respond to growing health inequalities in the wake of the crisis and to reduce financial barriers to access healthcare.

Romania – Awareness raising and behaviour changing campaigns targeting the Roma people's health are operated through the healthcare mediation programme.

Spain – Health mediators have proven to contribute to the improvement of health among the Roma population in Spain. The example of Navarra that has been working for many years has been chosen as a good practice by the WHO²³

²³ In its publication on "Poverty and social exclusion in the WHO European Union: Health systems respond." http://www.navarra.es/NR/rdonlyres/D4DFA3BA-F54F-40DE-8C5F-9F24A003868E/233965/2_Spain_06Feb09casopublicado2010.pdf

Following the analysis of health measures, it can be concluded that healthcare and basic social security coverage is not yet extended to all. Investing in adequate healthcare and preventive measures for all Roma, in particular

children, is essential as it will prevent further health problems in the long-term. Promising initiatives should be extended and multiplied to make a real impact on the ground.

3.4. Housing

²⁴ 42 % of the Roma surveyed said that they have either no piped water or no sewage or no electricity in their home. FRA, *The situation of Roma in 15 Member States and Croatia* (2013).

²⁵ The European Court of Human Rights, *Yordanova and others v. Bulgaria* n°25446/06 judgment of 24 April 2012, concluded that although the concerned Roma lived in an illegal settlement, their eviction was a breach of article 8 of the European Convention of Human Rights (on private life and private property): their housing, although illegally built there, had to be considered as their property and it was disproportionate to evict them. "In the context of Article 8, in cases such as the present one, the applicants' specificity as a social group and their needs must be one of the relevant factors in the proportionality assessment that the national authorities are under a duty to undertake." This position taken by the Court in *Yordanova* was confirmed and further developed in a more recent judgment in case *Winterstein and others vs. France* (European Court of Human Rights, n° 27013/07 of 17 October 2013. Similar violation of the European Convention of Human Rights (article 8) was observed by the SK Public Defender of Rights (Ombudswoman) in her examination of the forced eviction and liquidation of a Roma settlement carried out in 2012 in Kosice, Slovakia (report of 23 July 2013).

²⁶ Guidance note on the implementation of integrated housing interventions in favour of marginalised communities under the ERDF, of 28 January 2011. http://ec.europa.eu/regional_policy/information/search/detail.cfm?LAN=EN&id=354&lang=en

To close the gap between Roma and non-Roma, the EU Framework calls on Member States to promote non-discriminatory access to housing, including social housing and public utilities (such as water, electricity and gas)²⁴. Furthermore, the EU Framework underlined the need to address housing as part of an integrated approach to social inclusion and desegregation.

Housing interventions have often been the weakest links in the national strategies. The absence of progress is mainly due to: grey zones concerning the legalisation of existing housing and halting sites, as illustrated by judgments of the European Court of Human Rights²⁵; failure to establish a real dialogue with both mainstream and Roma local communities (e.g. in Bulgaria); scarcity of national public funds and low uptake

of available EU funds despite the Commission's guidance²⁶; the need to further develop the social housing sector in several Member States. One of the main barriers encountered in the use of ERDF financing has been the design of integrated housing projects.

In spite of this challenging context, there are also promising practices. With the help of the European Regional Development Fund (ERDF) quality temporary lodgings have been built with the involvement of the Roma community in France. In Germany, housing projects also include measures that promote the integration of Roma families in neighbourhoods. In Belgium, mediators work to gain trust of both Roma and non-Roma for acceptable housing interventions. In Hungary, cities are required to prepare a desegregation plan as part of city development strategies.

Examples in the field of housing

Belgium – In January 2013, 38 mediators/bridge figures (i.e. intercultural mediators), neighbourhood stewards, project leaders, and consultants worked in the Region of Brussels Capital and the Flanders Region (employed by the Public Centres for Social Welfare, Department of Education, Employment Agency, Police, Integration Services or local NGOs) to gain the support of both Roma and non Roma for housing interventions.

Germany – In Kiel, the 'Maro Temm e.G.' housing project helps Sinti and Roma of all generations to live together and preserve their culture and language (Romani) without being segregated. Further activities such as homework support, leisure activities and small cultural celebrations are offered. In Berlin, the project 'Task Force Okerstraße' aims to ensure that Roma are accepted as neighbours and being integrated into the community. Roma families are given advice, helped in their dealings with the authorities and assisted in disputes with their landlords. Furthermore, care is offered to children, and young people are encouraged to take part in leisure activities.

Hungary – Cities are required to prepare a so-called *Local Equal Opportunity (Desegregation) Plan* as part of Integrated Urban Development Strategies. A Desegregation Plan identifies systemic interventions (relevant to the entire city) to stop or reduce segregation. Local Equal Opportunity Plans became a statutory requirement for local governments under the Equal Opportunity Act. ERDF funding supports integrated housing projects for Roma and other marginalised communities.

As in other areas, small-scale projects offer useful policy lessons but need to be extended to bring about the expected results. To achieve tangible and sustainable progress in the housing sector, Member States should address more efficiently the bottlenecks identified above. In some Member States, legislation is necessary to clarify the legal status of existing dwellings. Furthermore, regular urban planning interventions to eliminate and prevent ghet-

toisation in cities should be backed by national governments, while the disproportionate risk of social exclusion in rural areas demands stronger efforts. For the success of all projects, involvement of both Roma and non-Roma is essential. Given the scarcity of public resources, especially as housing belongs to the competence of municipalities in most Member States, better use should be made of funds available from the ERDF.

3.5. Fighting discrimination convincingly

The principle of non-discrimination is one of the core principles of our European Union. Thirteen years after the EU's landmark anti-discrimination directives were adopted in 2000, discrimination against Roma is still widespread²⁷. This has no place in the European Union. The situation of Roma women²⁸ is often worse than that of Roma men, as they tend to face multiple discrimination. The situation of Roma children often raises additional concerns²⁹.

Roma-specific problems are generally not due to gaps in legislation, but rather to its implementation. In order to strengthen the fight against discrimination legislation needs to be combined with policy and financial measures. The Council Recommendation (articles 2.1 to 2.5) proposes further specific measures to Member States, including positive action to fight discrimination. This Recommendation should mark the beginning of stronger political efforts from all Member States to end discrimination against Roma and ensure equality in practice. The Commission's upcoming progress reports on the implementation of the national Roma integration strategies will look carefully at the areas highlighted in the Recommendation.

The Commission's recent report on the application of the Equality directives confirms that Member States should make better use of the possibility to adopt measures to prevent or compensate for disadvantages (positive action). Such measures can usefully fight discrimination against Roma.

Addressing trafficking in human beings can also help to tackle discrimination and social exclusion of Roma. Women and children are at highest risk

of becoming victims. An equal focus is needed on preventing trafficking, protection, assistance and support to victims, and involving everyone who can help tackle the problem: health inspectors, police, education experts and legal professionals. The EU's Strategy towards the Eradication of Trafficking in Human Beings 2012-2016, has helped Member States live up to their obligations under the anti-trafficking Directive 2011/36/EU.

Most Member States have taken initiatives to raise awareness about Roma culture and history; in particular, in recent years, a growing number have organised activities to commemorate the Roma Holocaust. Finally, in all Member States, more effective measures should be taken to combat anti-Roma rhetoric and hate speech.

In some Member States, bodies for the promotion of equal treatment have played a particularly active role to raise awareness, report or put forward cases of Roma victims of discrimination (e.g. Bulgaria, Czech Republic, Finland, France, Greece, Ireland, Latvia, Lithuania, Romania, Spain and Sweden). As proposed in the Council Recommendation on effective Roma integration measures in the Member States, the work and institutional capacity of bodies for the promotion of equal treatment should be reinforced, and a regular dialogue between the National Roma Contact Points and these Bodies should be continued, as already initiated by the Commission.

Furthermore, in some Member States, effective tools still need to be developed to empower the Roma.

²⁷ Report from the Commission to the European Parliament and the Council Joint Report on the application of Council Directive 2000/43/EC of 29 June 2000 implementing the principle of equal treatment between persons irrespective of racial or ethnic origin ('Racial Equality Directive') and of Council Directive 2000/78/EC of 27 November 2000 establishing a general framework for equal treatment in employment and occupation ('Employment Equality Directive').

²⁸ The European Parliament also drew attention to the situation of Roma women in its *Resolution on the gender aspects of the European Framework of National Roma Inclusion Strategies* adopted on 10 December 2013.

²⁹ The Commission Recommendation *Investing in children: breaking the cycle of disadvantage. C(2013)778 of 20 February 2013 provides policy guidance to help the EU and Member States focus on successful social investment towards children.*

Example in the field of anti-discrimination

Slovakia – Amendment of the Antidiscrimination Act has introduced temporary equalising measures (positive action) that may be adopted on the grounds of ethnicity in all areas protected by the Act, i.e. employment, education, healthcare, social security and access to goods and services.

There are weaknesses in almost all Member States when it comes to fighting discrimination effectively. This should not be considered as a stand-alone policy, but should be mainstreamed into all policies. Additional attention should be paid to public commu-

nication that can promote the benefits of diversity and its acceptance in society. In addition, Member States will need to show clear political leadership and ensure that no racist manifestations are tolerated on their territories.

3.6. Securing financial support for sustainable policies

Roma integration is a long-term challenge. Policies and measures aiming at Roma integration need to be sustainable in the long term. The EU Framework invites Member States to allocate sufficient funding from national budgets, and to make the best use of EU and international funding.

In recent years, the volume of funds Member States target at Roma integration has increased significantly. While progress is evident in terms of commitment and planning, problems remain in implementation. Countries with large Roma populations still face major challenges in using EU funds. The gravity of the problems in the single policy areas and their interdependence requires an integrated approach, combining investments in employment, education, healthcare and housing, through various funds.

In the 2007-2013 period, the potential use of EU funds has not yet been fully exploited to support Roma integration. The reasons are various: difficulties in finding national co-financing and in combining funds, overly complex administrative structures, lack of administrative capacity and expertise, insufficient use of technical assistance for the use of EU funds, and poor cooperation between authorities and Roma. Although the adoption of National Roma Integration Strategies is a major step in providing a framework for Roma inclusion, experience shows that alignment between general and Roma-specific policies and funding should be further improved, building on better monitoring of the results and the impact of EU-funded interventions. Where relevant, such an integrated approach can be further enhanced by introducing a territorial approach, focusing on the most disadvantaged micro-regions.

For the 2014-2020 programming period, an effort has been made to address these deficiencies, by ensuring that an appropriate share of the cohesion policy budget is allocated to investment in human capital, employment and social inclusion. For the 2014-2020 period, €343 billion has been allocated to Member States from Structural and Cohesion Funds.

At least €80 billion of this will be allocated to investment in human capital, employment and social inclusion through the European Social Fund (ESF). It was decided that in each country, at least 20% (compared to the current share of around

17%) of the ESF must be earmarked to fight social exclusion and poverty i.e. about €16 billion. A specific investment priority for the integration of marginalised communities such as the Roma has also been established. Disadvantaged people, including Roma, will also benefit from measures funded under other ESF investment priorities aiming at good quality early-childhood education, reducing and preventing early school-leaving, promoting the access to employment or enhancing youth employment through youth guarantee. To ensure that the ESF will outreach the targeted beneficiaries, it is necessary that appropriate regulatory and institutional frameworks are already in place. Member States can improve the quality of how they use EU funds by exchanging best practices, through a permanent dialogue with stakeholders, evaluations and observations from academic studies.

Regarding the European Regional Development Fund (ERDF) the investment priority under the thematic objective of promoting social inclusion, combating poverty and any discrimination, allows support for physical, economic and social regeneration of deprived communities in urban and rural areas. This may be used to continue the type of integrated housing schemes for the benefit of marginalised communities, including Roma, which have been started with ERDF funding in the 2007-2013 period. Other investment priorities such as in the area of health, social and education infrastructure may support investments in hardware to implement the corresponding Roma integration goals, including for the involvement of Roma in mainstream actions. ERDF support to cities which address demographic and social challenges as part of integrated sustainable urban development strategies could also be relevant.

As part of the ex-ante conditionality mechanism for Cohesion Policy 2014-2020, a national Roma inclusion framework has to be in place where funds are programmed for Roma integration. This establishes a direct link between the EU policy framework and funding and aims to maximise the effectiveness of the funding.

In the negotiations with the Member States on the Partnership Agreements, the Commission makes sure that challenges for Roma inclusion identified within the European Semester are adequately reflected in the funding priorities of the future pro-

grammes. Furthermore, to improve administrative capacity and expertise, Member States may use global grants to entrust the management and implementation of some parts of their programmes to intermediary bodies with proven experience and knowledge on the ground³⁰.

In several Member States, a large part of the marginalised Roma communities live in rural areas. This is why the Commission has informed the Member States on the existing possibilities to support the integration of disadvantaged groups, including Roma, under the rural development policy by the European Agricultural Fund for Rural Devel-

opment (EAFRD). Within the framework of the informal dialogue on the Partnership Agreement and programmes for the 2014-2020 programming period, the Commission services have asked the most concerned Member States to bring their National Roma Contact Points into the discussions³¹.

Moreover, the funding possibilities of the Erasmus+ programme should also be fully exploited³².

The Seventh Framework Programme for Research and Development³³ provides also further opportunities to strengthen coherent and cost-effective policies in this field.

³⁰ Regulation (EU) no 1303/2013 of 17 December 2013 op. cit.

³¹ Member States were asked to invite the National Roma Contact Points to participate in the working bodies discussing the future Rural Development Programmes, as well as in the future Monitoring Committees of these programmes.

³² The Erasmus+ programme benefits from a 40% increase in its budget (i.e. €14.7 billion) in the 2014-2020 period. In particular, transnational cooperation projects in the framework of strategic partnerships (Key Action II) and prospective initiatives (Key Action III) can help develop new, innovative approaches to address the educational challenges faced by Roma communities.

³³ <http://romani.humanities.manchester.ac.uk/migrom/>

Bulgaria – The municipality of Kavarna is an example of investment in integration Local Development Strategies. The municipality of Kavarna has invested in infrastructure development, improved access for Roma children to quality early-childhood education and care, health education and cooperation with other cities and private employers to promote Roma employment. Diversification of resources, systematic measures and the strong political commitment of the municipal leadership has contributed to obtaining results in all policy fields (ranging from improved quality of public services, improved school attainment, decreased mortality rate and increased employment of Roma in both private and public sector). The European Structural and Investment Funds also helped ensure the sustainability of results by providing EUR 3.1 million for investments in physical infrastructure and human capital.

Spain – Within the ESF Operational Programme on Fight Against Discrimination, the non-profit organisation *Fundación Secretariado Gitano* has been playing a key role in the social and labour integration of Roma people as an intermediate body of the programme. Implementation through a non-governmental organisation as an intermediate body has proven to be crucial for the efficient and effective management of EU funding, the strong, operational and long-term partnerships established with private companies, the flexibility and adaptation of the programme to new social needs and the implementation of social innovation projects. As regards the whole OP, the number of agreements with entities and organisations has grown to 1400 active agreements, including businesses with a demand for employees (71%), the public administrations (20%) and entities of the Third Sector (9%).

Lasting success is only achieved when investments in education are accompanied by investments in employment and housing, targeting explicitly but not exclusively Roma communities. Embracing a multi-sector, multi-stakeholder and multi-fund approach (which is made easier by the new generation of EU Funds) is key to Roma inclusion. At the same time, to address local needs and build capacities of

small NGOs, non-competitive funding opportunities for small local projects should be ensured. Global grants should be promoted, especially in those Member States with more limited administrative capacities. In its contacts with the Member States, the Commission encourages local authorities and Roma representatives to work together from the outset on local inclusion strategies.

4. Enlargement countries

³⁴ As it has been recommended by the Commission in its Fourth Report on the Post-Visa Liberalisation Monitoring for the Western Balkan Countries (Albania, Bosnia-Herzegovina, The Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia, Montenegro and Serbia) COM(2013) 836 final, in accordance with the Commission Statement of 8 November 2010.

³⁵ In addition to seven EU Member States the following enlargement countries are members of the Decade for Roma Inclusion: Albania, Bosnia-Herzegovina, The Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia, Montenegro and Serbia.

There are about 10-12 million Roma in Europe, out of which some 4 million in Turkey and 1 million in the Western Balkans. Roma are very often the victims of racism, discrimination and social exclusion and live in deep poverty, lacking sufficient access to healthcare, education and training, housing and employment. Enlargement countries therefore need to step up their efforts to further integrate their Roma population, including refugees and internally displaced persons, many of whom are Roma. Roma exclusion continues to have consequences in terms of increased numbers of Roma temporarily migrating to EU Member States under visa-free regime and this can have a negative impact on visa liberalisation, which is a great achievement towards the integration of the Western Balkans³⁴ into the EU. The Commission works closely with each of the enlargement countries to review progress in implementing their commitments towards the inclusion of Roma.

In the period 2007-2013, over €100 million pre-accession assistance has been provided under the Instrument on Pre-Accession Assistance (IPA) to support social inclusion and integration of Roma in the enlargement countries, including housing. To improve coordination, efficiency and visibility of financial support to Roma inclusion under the new IPA II, tailor-made actions will continue to be financed under the relevant national programmes through a sectorial approach and as part of a global IPA envelope ("Roma inclusion facility"). This will be accompanied by rigorous monitoring involving governments and all stakeholders including civil society.

To support the enlargement countries in their efforts, the Commission will:

- Continue to support and co-organise with each country national follow up sessions to the 2011 "Roma inclusion seminars" with rigorous monitoring of implementation of the operational conclusions jointly reached;

- Increase and better target IPA II actions through a "Roma inclusion facility" to finance measures outlined in the Country Strategy Papers or agreed in the national seminars and to improve cooperation with external stakeholders; funding will shift from supporting policy development and institution building to actions directly making an impact on the lives of individual Roma persons, with a particular focus on education, housing and social inclusion;
- Award prizes to NGOs for innovative and successful projects for Roma inclusion.

The Commission will continue to closely follow developments in enlargement countries in its annual progress reports, and will support enlargement countries to translate their political commitments for Roma inclusion into concrete and enduring engagements on the ground.

The Council Recommendation on effective Roma integration measures in the Member States is relevant for enlargement countries, as it forms an integral part of the EU acquis. Enlargement countries also need to take targeted actions to bridge the gap between the Roma and the rest of the population in access to education, employment, healthcare and housing, accompanied by cross-cutting policies of particular relevance for these countries such as provision of personal documents and strengthening the involvement of local and regional authorities and dialogue with civil organisations.

The Decade for Roma Inclusion³⁵ has been a strong inspiration for the EU Framework. It has been playing a very positive role in mobilising civil society and ensuring the smooth transition of enlargement countries into the EU Framework. The work of civil coalitions coordinated and supported by the Decade of Roma Inclusion Secretariat has also showed a strong added value.

5. Conclusions - the way forward

The 2011 EU framework set up a long-term process. It calls for the sustained political commitment of all stakeholders to make a difference in the life of Roma people by 2020.

The first step on this long road was taken when each Member State developed its national Roma integration strategy. The implementation of these strategies has now started.

Following the Commission's guidance, Member States have started to put in place the structural pre-conditions that are indispensable to implement their strategies successfully³⁶. For the first time, all EU Member States have set their Roma inclusion strategies in motion and plenty of projects carried out in all EU Member States demonstrate that Roma inclusion is possible.

As a second step, tangible change in the situation of Roma will only be achieved if Member States:

- Demonstrate political will and determination to remain on the path leading to the expected results for Roma at the local level by 2020 and persistently honour the commitments they have undertaken at the highest political levels;
- Combine legislation with policy and financial measures; Improve and strengthen structures to ensure effective implementation of the national Roma integration strategies, in particular in terms of governance, cooperation with stakeholders and monitoring. These structures need to become firmly embedded in national administrations for the years to come;
- Together with the Commission, ensure monitoring and evaluation of the effective use of available European Structural and Investment Funds in line with the relevant shared management regulatory framework;
- Participate actively in the National Roma Contact Points' network and provide their National Roma Contact Points with an adequate mandate and

resources;

- Monitor progress and inform the Commission, including in view of the Commission's annual reports.

The EU Framework and the Council Recommendation on effective Roma integration measures in the Member States have opened up the path towards Roma inclusion. The EU will continue to provide political leadership and will give practical support to Member State efforts, including through EU funds. This is, however, just the beginning and the Commission will play its role in making sure that the path is consequently followed further. It will notably:

- Provide annual policy guidance in the Europe 2020 strategy, issuing Roma-specific country-specific recommendations where appropriate, and through progress reports in the areas highlighted in the Recommendation, which will be assessed concerning a necessity of revision or up-date by 1 January 2019;
- Provide methodological support and foster exchange of experience and best practice through the network of National Roma Contact Points;
- Continue a regular dialogue with civil society, support grassroots NGOs through the European Parliament's Pilot project, and involve civil society in the monitoring of progress;
- Promote the use of available EU funds³⁷ and strengthen the capacity of authorities at all levels to efficiently use EU funds;
- Provide specific support to the local level by: making easily accessible (online) information on available EU funds for social inclusion; undertaking an analysis of the needs of local authorities in 8 Member States in terms of awareness-raising and transnational cooperation; and strengthening their administrative capacity;
- In cooperation with Member States and, where appropriate, other organisations, including the

³⁶ Communication from the Commission to the European Parliament, the Council, the European Economic and Social Committee and the Committee of the Regions *Steps forward in implementing National Roma Integration Strategies* COM(2013)454 of 26 June 2013.

³⁷ Including through the EURoma network, made up of representatives of twelve Member States with the aim to promote the use of Structural Funds to enhance the effectiveness of policies targeting the Roma and to promote their social inclusion.

European Investment Bank and the European Bank for Reconstruction and Development, develop initiatives to better target funding for integrated and mainstream measures for Roma inclusion early during the 2014-2020 programming period.

On the basis of an assessment of the experience during this period, explore ways of further improving effectiveness and integration of EU financial support for Roma inclusion post 2020, including a specific facility.

Finally, Roma integration will also depend on sustained efforts from Roma civil society to engage with the mainstream population, as well as on joint actions from all stakeholders, including local and regional authorities, international organisations, academia, churches and the private sector.

The EU Framework's first years of implementation show that action in favour of Roma integration is in motion in all Member States. It should be the cornerstone for building further joint efforts and achieving significant progress by 2020.

Brussels 2.4.2014
SWD(2014) 121 final

Commission staff working document
accompanying the document

Communication from the Commission to the European Parliament,
the Council, the European Economic and Social Committee
and the Committee of the Regions

Report on the implementation of the EU Framework for National Roma Integration Strategies

{COM(2014) 209 final}

Table of contents

| | |
|--|----|
| Introduction..... | 3 |
| Austria | 6 |
| Belgium | 8 |
| Bulgaria | 10 |
| Cyprus | 12 |
| Croatia (Assessment of the National Roma Integration Strategy) | 14 |
| Czech Republic | 16 |
| Denmark | 18 |
| Estonia | 20 |
| Finland | 22 |
| France..... | 24 |
| Germany | 26 |
| Greece | 27 |
| Hungary | 29 |
| Ireland | 31 |
| Italy..... | 33 |
| Latvia | 35 |
| Lithuania | 37 |
| Luxembourg | 39 |
| Netherlands..... | 41 |
| Poland | 43 |
| Portugal | 44 |
| Romania..... | 45 |
| Slovak Republic..... | 47 |
| Slovenia | 49 |
| Spain..... | 50 |
| Sweden | 52 |
| United Kingdom | 54 |

Introduction

¹ The 10 Common Basic Principles on Roma Inclusion were presented at the first Platform meeting on 24 April 2009. They were annexed to the EPSCO Council Conclusions of 8 June 2009. http://www.consilium.europa.eu/uedocs/cms_data/docs/pressdata/en/lsa/108377.pdf

In response to the EU Framework for National Roma Integration Strategies adopted by the Commission on 5th April 2011, the Council Conclusions of 19th May 2011 and European Council Conclusions on 25th June 2011, all EU Member States have committed to implement national Roma integration strategies or sets of policy measures within their broader social inclusion policies. The objective is to improve the situation of the Roma, taking into account Member States' different starting points and the size of the Roma population living in their territories.

Since 2012, the Commission has been closely monitoring progress in each Member State. Despite the economic challenges, Member States' efforts for Roma inclusion in the past two years are starting to have an impact on the situation of the Roma on the ground.

Although positive steps have been taken in most Member States to address the situation of Roma in education, employment, health, housing as well as non-discrimination, further and more consolidated efforts are still needed to change the situation of Roma in Europe. The monitoring mechanism should have a stronger focus on assessing the impact and the conclusions of the monitoring should be channelled into policy development.

Regarding funding it should be underlined that data found in the country fiches hereafter are based on the financial allocation in the System for Fund management in the European Community 2007-2013. According to the EU financial regulations for 2007-2013 Member States are not obliged to report on EU funding for Roma or other ethnic minorities. Some even do not allow the collection of ethnic data for constitutional reasons.

In the 2007-2013 programming period, EU countries received almost €77 billion financial support from the European Social Fund (ESF). The ESF has not separately targeted Roma people. Marginalised Roma communities are expected to benefit from measures funded mainly under the objective of social inclusion, in particular from measures financed through the priority "integrating disadvantaged people" to which about €10 billion was allocated, i.e. 13% of the total ESF allocation. Moreover, disadvantaged Roma can also benefit from other priorities, such as the generic

education and employment ones. It should be emphasised however that in most cases non Roma disadvantaged people can benefit from the same measures, so the amount specifically benefitting Roma is unknown.

Roma may also benefit from the European Regional Development Fund (ERDF), for example, from projects co-financed from cost categories such as housing as well as education, health and social infrastructure. However, such investments are not target-group based, but, in line with the core mission of ERDF, are aimed at contributing to territorial development, increasing attractiveness and the quality of life. Furthermore, there is no requirement for Member States to report on investments in support of marginalised groups.

On the basis of data received from national authorities, Member States had allocated an aggregate amount of € 17,8 billion for the 2007-2013 period corresponding to the above-mentioned cost categories.

As far as targeted expenditures are concerned, following the 2010 modification of the ERDF regulation a total of € 80 million has been allocated to pilot housing schemes in favour of marginalised communities, including Roma in 8 MS (Bulgaria, Czech Republic, France, Greece, Hungary, Italy Romania and Slovakia). These have followed the Common Basic Principles on Roma Inclusion annexed to the Council Conclusions on Inclusion of the Roma¹ in June 2009. These principles do allow for explicit targeting, but this should not be exclusive in nature (i.e. targeting should cover other marginalised or poor groups). Additionally, two Member States with significant Roma populations have followed comprehensive approaches by territorial means. Hungary has brought together funding totalling € 360 millions from separate ESF and ERDF mono-fund programmes which target the most disadvantaged micro-regions, including localities with a high density of Roma. In the case of Slovakia, indicative funding from various ESF and ERDF programmes for a total of €200 millions was identified in the National Strategic Reference Framework.

The subsequent country-specific summaries reflect the Commission's assessment of steps taken in the

Member States. The Commission invites Member States to increase their efforts and convincingly address the remaining gaps.

For this report, Member States, civil society organisations and stakeholders had been invited to send information on steps taken since 2011. Those who have provided a contribution are listed below.

As Croatia joined the European Union only in July 2013, the Commission is assessing its national Roma integration strategy, using the same criteria as for the other Member States in 2012.

Finally, no assessment has been carried out for Malta as Roma presence in Malta is not relevant for the present report.

Progress report 2014 on Roma inclusion strategies - Contributions

| Organisation | Geographical scope |
|---|---|
| European Network Against Racism | Transversal contribution |
| European Roma Information Office | Transversal contribution and BG, CZ, IR, EL, FR, IT, HU, PL, PT |
| Fundamental Rights Agency | All EU Member States |
| EU network of independent experts on social inclusion | All EU Member States (except Malta) |
| Coalition of organisations, coordinated by the Decade of Roma Inclusion Foundation in cooperation with the Open Society Foundations, comprising the Open Society Institute – Sofia, Indi-Roma 97 Foundation, Health of the Roma People Foundation, Roma Academy for Culture and Education Association, Roma Solidarity Foundation, Integro Association, Nov Pat Association, Centre for Intercultural Dialogue and Tolerance “Amalipe”, World Without Borders Association | BG |
| Coalition of organisations, coordinated by the Decade of Roma Inclusion Foundation in cooperation with the Open Society Foundations, comprising SPOT – Centre for Social Issues; Czech Society for Inclusive Education (ČOSIV); Counselling Centre for Citizenship, Civic and Human Rights (Poradna); Mezanin Association; Open Society Foundation Prague (OSF Prague) and Multicultural Centre Prague (MKC Prague) | CZ |

| | |
|--|---|
| Coalition of organisations, coordinated by the Decade of Roma Inclusion Foundation in cooperation with the Open Society Foundations, comprising Fundación Secretariado Gitano (FSG), ALTER Research Group of the Public University of Navarra (UPNA) Asociación de Enseñantes con Gitanos (AecG) | ES |
| Coalition of organisations, coordinated by the Decade of Roma Inclusion Foundation in cooperation with the Open Society Foundations, comprising Partners Hungary Foundation, Autonomia Foundation, Chance for Children Foundation, Habitat for Humanity Hungary, Hungarian Women's Lobby, Hungarian Helsinki Committee, Romaversitas Foundation and the Metropolitan Research Institute. | HU |
| Coalition of organisations, coordinated by the Decade of Roma Inclusion Foundation in cooperation with the Open Society Foundations, comprising Resource Center for Roma Communities Foundation; Soros Foundation Romania; Civil Society Development Foundation; Roma Center for Health Policies – SASTIPEN | RO |
| Coalition of organisations, coordinated by the Decade of Roma Inclusion Foundation in cooperation with the Open Society Foundations, comprising Roma Institute, Milan Šimečka Foundation (NMS) and Quo Vadis | SK |
| Eurodiaconia | Transversal contribution and FI, HU, NL, RO |
| Amalipe | BG |
| Niedersächsischer Verband deutscher Sinti e.V. | DE |
| Romnokher Association of Sinti and Roma, BAG der RAA, Madhouse Freudenberg Stiftung | DE |
| Fundación Secretariado Gitano (FSG) | ES |
| Amnesty International | FR |
| Romeurope | FR |
| Médecins du Monde | FR |
| Irish Immigrant Support Centre (NASC) | IE |
| MOVISIE Netherlands centre for social development | NL |
| Renovabis | RO |
| UN Association of Sweden | SE |

2 Findings from the Commission's assessment of progress on the implementation of the National Roma Integration Strategies in the 28 Member States

Austria

| | KEY STEPS SINCE 2011 | IDENTIFIED GAPS |
|------------|--|---|
| Education | <p>Measures under the general education reform, which Roma children could benefit from (e.g. the final year of kindergarten is free; support is provided in overcoming the language barrier).</p> <p>Roma school assistants.</p> <p>Focus on vocational training and transition from school to employment.</p> | <p><i>Assessing the impact of measures undertaken on the enrolment, participation and educational achievement of Roma children is necessary.</i></p> |
| Employment | <p>Counselling and training provided to support Roma employability e.g. through Thara project.</p> <p>Support is provided under active labour market policies.</p> | <p><i>The successful, but rather small-scale initiatives targeting Roma (e.g. Thara project) should be scaled up. Active labour market policies should better reach out to the Roma community.</i></p> <p><i>Monitoring the impact of mainstream measures on Roma is necessary.</i></p> |
| Health | <p>Support is provided under mainstream health policy measures.</p> | <p><i>Monitoring the impact of mainstream measures on Roma is necessary.</i></p> |

| | KEY STEPS SINCE 2011 | ASSESSMENT |
|---------------------|---|--|
| Housing | Support is provided under mainstream policy measures. | <i>Fighting discriminatory practices in the property market needs to be addressed.</i> |
| Anti-discrimination | Awareness raising activities, promoting inter-culture dialogue between Roma and non-Roma. | <i>Roma empowerment in close cooperation with non-governmental organisations should be reinforced.</i> |

| | KEY STEPS SINCE 2011 | ASSESSMENT |
|---------|--|---|
| Funding | <p>Roma inclusion has been supported by national and EU funds under various mainstream policy measures, including social inclusion measures.</p> <p>In the 2007-2013 financial period, Austria has allocated 25,0 % (~€ 131 million) of its total ESF budget for integrating disadvantaged people.</p> | <i>Further use of existing possibilities under the EU funds to support Roma inclusion should be considered.</i> |

| | | |
|---|---|--|
| Structural priorities that should be considered | <i>Monitoring the impact of mainstream measures and activities undertaken on Roma should be considered.</i> | |
|---|---|--|

Belgium

| | KEY STEPS SINCE 2011 | ASSESSMENT |
|---------------------|--|--|
| Education | <p>A range of measures addressing the educational situation of Roma have been undertaken such as fighting early school leaving, encouraging Roma parental involvement, research on better understanding of the situation and needs of children from Eastern and Central Europe and addressing parents' illiteracy.</p> <p>Adoption of the National Child Poverty Reduction Plan (June 2013).</p> | <p><i>A series of good initiatives have been taken in the area of education, in particular in Brussels and Flanders.</i></p> <p><i>Special attention needs to be paid to increase school attendance and educational achievements of Roma children. Using Roma mediators could facilitate the process.</i></p> <p><i>More efforts are needed to put in place a comprehensive early school leaving strategy in the Walloon region (in cooperation with the French Community) and in the Brussels region (in cooperation with both the French and Flemish communities).</i></p> |
| Employment | <p>Amendment of the Law on work relations (strengthening the rules on self-employment).</p> <p>Action plan among the Public Employment Services to ensure registration and guidance of residents of Bulgarian and Romanian origin.</p> <p>Support to the Integration Centre "Le Foyer" for a project fostering entrepreneurship and skills of Romanian and Bulgarian newcomers.</p> | <p><i>More effective measures are necessary to ensure the integration of disadvantaged groups, including Roma, in the open labour market (e.g. personalised approach, job-search assistance, quality skills training in line with labour market needs).</i></p> <p><i>Measures to fight and monitor discrimination in the labour market should be considered, as well as policies for diversity in employment (including incentives for employers).</i></p> |
| Health | <p>Mobilisation of mediators in healthcare services (in over 50 Belgian hospitals).</p> <p>Specific action in the city of Sint-Niklaas, targeting Roma.</p> | <p><i>Additional attention should be paid to improve the access of Roma to preventive healthcare, such as vaccination. Furthermore, mediators should be used to overcome barriers and promote optimal use of healthcare services.</i></p> |
| Housing | <p>Priority given to access to housing in the federal poverty reduction plan and the Belgian National Roma integration Strategy.</p> <p>In July 2012, the Flemish government presented the strategic plan for caravan dwellers as part of the Flemish integration policy.</p> | <p><i>Supporting the access to social housing is a positive step. Attention needs to be paid to eliminating discriminatory practices in the property market.</i></p> |
| Anti-discrimination | <p>Guidelines drafted by a working group for the police and judiciary in order to deal with discrimination in a coherent way.</p> | <p><i>The legal protection mechanism should be reinforced.</i></p> <p><i>Awareness raising campaigns to promote intercultural dialogue and to enhance mutual trust should be carried out.</i></p> |

| | KEY STEPS SINCE 2011 | ASSESSMENT |
|---|--|--|
| Funding | <p>No specific amount has been allocated exclusively for Roma integration. However, Roma inclusion has been supported by national and EU funds under various mainstream policy measures, including social inclusion measures.</p> <p>In the 2007-2013 financial period, Belgium has allocated 22,7 % of its total ESF budget (~€ 243 million) for integrating disadvantaged people</p> | <p><i>Further use of existing possibilities under the EU funds to support Roma inclusion should be considered.</i></p> |
| Structural priorities that should be considered | <p><i>The promising initiatives in Flanders and Brussels should be scaled up and extended. Monitoring the impact of mainstreaming measures and activities for Roma should be considered, and the conclusions of monitoring should be channelled back to policy development.</i></p> | |

Bulgaria

| | KEY STEPS SINCE 2011 | ASSESSMENT |
|------------|--|--|
| Education | <p>Important measures in the mainstream education system: 2 year obligatory pre-school (with language training for children if needed), measures to reduce early school leaving, gradual introduction of all-day school.</p> <p>A wide number of small projects targeted at the most disadvantaged including the Roma (e.g. summer schools, school projects on tolerance, attention to disadvantaged families in kindergartens, work with parents and pupils to fight early school leaving, etc.).</p> | <p><i>Key mainstream measures in education have been adopted. However, stronger efforts and engagement at the local level are needed to promote inclusive education and ensure desegregation.</i></p> <p><i>More efforts are needed to effectively ensure access to good quality early childhood education and care to all Roma children, by creating the necessary capacities and ensuring qualified staff.</i></p> <p><i>Promising measures aimed at reducing early school leaving should be continued and scaled up, with a focus on second-chance education and teacher training.</i></p> <p><i>More targeted support schemes would be necessary in secondary vocational education and in higher education</i></p> |
| Employment | <p>80-95 Roma mediators appointed in local employment offices.</p> <p>Set up of several community development centres.</p> <p>Organisation of job fairs targeted at the most disadvantaged including the Roma.</p> <p>Meetings between labour offices and Roma NGOs in support of the participation of Roma in the labour market</p> | <p><i>Most measures planned in the strategy have been followed up. However, Roma employment in rural areas is still not convincingly addressed.</i></p> <p><i>Targeted active labour market policies for Roma should be planned in order to ensure effective integration in the open labour market.</i></p> <p><i>Using social considerations in public procurement, promoting social enterprises and Roma entrepreneurship, reaching out to private employers, targeting Roma under the Youth Guarantee, training and employing Roma civil servants should be considered. Fighting and monitoring discrimination in the labour market needs to be ensured.</i></p> |
| Health | <p>Various activities from mobile medical units and mediators in areas where a majority population lacks health insurance (e.g. X-ray, immunisation of children, medical and gynaecological exams, screenings and prevention of HIV, TB and malaria).</p> <p>Health education and awareness-raising actions (campaigns, trainings), increase in the number of Roma health mediators</p> <p>Availability of monitoring tools: quantified outcomes along with concrete indicators, detailed by region and programme/project.</p> | <p><i>The main challenge remains ensuring health insurance coverage for all.</i></p> |

| | KEY STEPS SINCE 2011 | ASSESSMENT |
|---------------------|--|---|
| Housing | <p>Launch of an important pilot EU co-financed housing initiative in 4 + 3 municipalities (Bourgas, Dupinitsa, Vidin, Devnya + Varna, Peshtera and Tundzha as reserves).</p> | <p><i>Housing interventions should be carried out within an integrated approach with participation in local Roma and non-Roma communities.</i></p> <p><i>Further efforts are needed to develop municipal action plans for improving housing conditions of Roma on a larger scale.</i></p> |
| Anti-discrimination | <p>Training police forces on human rights and minorities' issues.</p> <p>A wide number and variety of local actions (e.g. celebration of 8th April; project to prevent human trafficking; legal support and information on rights; work on the collaboration between public bodies and civil society; specific activities on Roma women and children; etc.).</p> | <p><i>A systemic approach is needed when addressing discrimination. Effective measures should also be taken to combat anti-Roma rhetoric and hate speech. The practical enforcement of the Act on the Protection Against Discrimination should be enforced.</i></p> |

| | KEY STEPS SINCE 2011 | ASSESSMENT |
|---------|--|---|
| Funding | <p>Roma inclusion has been supported by national and EU funds under various mainstream policy measures, including social inclusion measures.</p> <p>The European Regional Development Fund for the pilot initiative on housing originally foreseen for € 8 million (so far € 5.3 million awarded to 3 municipalities).</p> <p>In the 2007-2013 financial period, Bulgaria has allocated 3,2 % (~€ 37 million) of its total ESF budget for integrating disadvantaged people</p> | <p><i>Sufficient allocation of European Structural and Investment Funds, including in the specific investment priority for the integration of marginalised communities such as Roma, should be ensured in the 2014-2020 programming period. Furthermore, Roma inclusion should be mainstreamed into all relevant policy areas, including under the thematic objectives on social inclusion, education and employment.</i></p> <p><i>All existing possibilities to support Roma inclusion, including the European Agricultural Fund for Rural Development (EAFRD) should be considered</i></p> <p><i>Strong cooperation and coordination between the National Roma Contact Point and the authorities responsible for the management of European Structural and Investment Funds is necessary to ensure the successful mobilisation of EU funds for Roma integration, efficiency and sustainability of measures as well as proper monitoring of their impact.</i></p> |

| | |
|---|---|
| Structural priorities that should be considered | <p><i>Mainstream policy reforms particularly in the fields of education, employment, health and housing should contribute to support Roma inclusion. Political leadership of the inter-ministerial working group on the use of EU funds for Roma integration should be reinforced. The overall mandate and resources allocated to the national Roma contact point should be reinforced. Re-establishing a constructive dialogue with Roma civil society is a necessary success factor for the implementation of the strategy. Anti-discrimination campaigns and communication activities on Roma integration as a benefit for everyone should be developed, targeting all groups of the population.</i></p> |
|---|---|

Cyprus

| | KEY STEPS SINCE 2011 | ASSESSMENT |
|---------------------|---|---|
| Education | <p>Most measures targeting Roma pupils along with other potentially vulnerable groups are carried out under the Zones of Education priority (since most Roma are concentrated in these areas).</p> <p>Measures include multicultural education and overcoming linguistic barriers, teacher training, provision of bilingual teachers and provision of special support to Roma students.</p> | <p><i>Government involvement in Roma integration is most prominent in the field of education. Given the strong concentration of Roma in some geographic areas, Zones of Education Priority seem to be appropriate to foster the inclusion of Roma and other children.</i></p> <p><i>The main challenges include: safeguarding the right to education of Roma students, especially non-Greek speaking Roma; persuading Roma families to enrol their children in school, establishing intercultural dialogue and respect between persons of different ethnic origins.</i></p> |
| Employment | <p>Social inclusion of Roma is part of the Cypriot government's overall strategy for the effective social inclusion of all vulnerable groups.</p> <p>Assistance, including vocational guidance, counselling and training programmes, is provided through public employment services.</p> | <p><i>The impact of policies should be measured in order to ensure that the needs of the Roma are met.</i></p> |
| Health | <p>Healthcare is offered free of charge to all Turkish Cypriots, including Roma, regardless of whether they reside in the government-controlled part of the island or the part occupied by Turkey.</p> | <p><i>The impact of health policy measures should be measured in order to ensure that the needs of the Roma are met.</i></p> |
| Housing | <p>Two housing projects, one in Limassol and one in Paphos, have been launched.</p> | <p><i>The implementation of the housing projects should be closely monitored.</i></p> |
| Anti-discrimination | | <p><i>Awareness raising campaigns should be considered to promote Roma integration.</i></p> |

| | KEY STEPS SINCE 2011 | ASSESSMENT |
|---|---|--|
| Funding | <p>No specific amount has been allocated exclusively for Roma integration. However, Roma inclusion has been supported by national and EU funds under various mainstream policy measures, including social inclusion measures.</p> <p>In the 2007-2013 financial period, Cyprus has allocated 11,4 % (~€ 13 million) of its total ESF budget for integrating disadvantaged people.</p> | <p><i>Further use of existing possibilities under the EU funds to support Roma inclusion should be considered.</i></p> |
| Structural priorities that should be considered | <p><i>Monitoring the impact of mainstream measures and activities undertaken on Roma should be considered.</i></p> | |

Croatia (Assessment of the National Roma Integration Strategy)

| | | |
|-------------------------------------|------------------------------------|---|
| Document sent to the Commission on: | | 30. September 2013 |
| Roma population | Estimate in the document | 9463 |
| | <i>Council of Europe estimates</i> | <i>approximately 30–40 000 i.e. 0.1 % of the population</i> |
| Approach | | National strategy |

| | KEY ELEMENTS | IDENTIFIED GAPS |
|------------|--|---|
| Education | <p>The strategy includes, in particular, the following positive elements:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Focus on pre-school education; After-school programmes; Raising awareness among Roma parents and teachers; Roma assistants; Scholarships to support secondary education. | <p><i>A focus on desegregation measures towards inclusive education at all levels would be needed.</i></p> <p><i>Measures to reduce early school leaving, including promotion of vocational training and education should be considered.</i></p> <p><i>The implementation timeframe could have been more detailed.</i></p> |
| Employment | <p>A range of employment policy measures specifically targeted at Roma are defined, aiming to increase their employability with due consideration to young Roma, Roma women and Roma long-term unemployed</p> | <p><i>The proposed measures could be more precise and underpinned by clear budget allocations, a detailed timeframe and result indicators based on targets.</i></p> <p><i>Relevant labour market training to increase employability of Roma and reaching out to private employers would further improve the strategy.</i></p> <p><i>Attention needs to be paid to fighting discrimination in the labour market.</i></p> |
| Health | <p>Measures aiming to improve the health of the Roma, especially women and children.</p> <p>Roma health-care assistants.</p> | <p><i>More developed specific measures within an integrated approach are needed with expected outcomes and mechanisms to monitor progress.</i></p> |

| | KEY ELEMENTS | IDENTIFIED GAPS |
|---|---|--|
| Housing | <p>Legalisation of current Roma settlements as the legal condition for the construction of basic infrastructure.</p> <p>Renovation and construction of houses for Roma.</p> | <p><i>Housing interventions should be part of an integrated approach with the long-term objective of desegregation.</i></p> <p><i>Supporting Roma access to social housing would further improve the strategy.</i></p> |
| Structural priorities that should be considered | <p><i>Representatives of the Roma civil society participated in the preparation of the strategy. Their participation in the implementation of measures and monitoring is planned.</i></p> <p><i>The implementation of the strategy will be monitored by the members of a Monitoring Commission composed of all relevant stakeholders, including representatives of Roma communities, in addition to civil servants.</i></p> <p><i>Under the IPA IV various no specific amount has been allocated exclusively for Roma integration but has been supported by national and EU funds under various mainstream policy measures including social inclusion measures.</i></p> | <p><i>The strategy would benefit from a detailed description of clear targets, responsibilities, budget allocations as well as from a robust result-oriented monitoring and evaluation system.</i></p> <p><i>The cooperation with local and regional self-government should be reinforced.</i></p> <p><i>The synergy between actions supported by EU funds and national funds and mainstream policies should be ensured.</i></p> |

Czech Republic

| | KEY STEPS SINCE 2011 | ASSESSMENT |
|------------|---|---|
| Education | <p>Announced amendment of Decree on education forbidding education of socially disadvantaged children according to the educational programmes for pupils with disabilities.</p> <p>Amendment of Decree obliging the school counselling facilities to periodically review the special educational needs of pupils.</p> <p>Adoption of the Action plan of measures to execute the Judgment of the European Court of Human Rights in the case D.H and others vs. the Czech Republic, setting up the legal guarantees to ensure objective placement of children in education programmes for the mentally disadvantaged, without discrimination.</p> | <p><i>Further legislative efforts combined with effective implementation and proper monitoring are needed to eliminate enrolment of Roma children from socially disadvantaged environments into special-needs education.</i></p> <p><i>Ensuring access to, and promoting participation of, Roma children in quality inclusive pre-school education needs to be reinforced.</i></p> <p><i>Promotion of vocational education and training should also be prioritised.</i></p> |
| Employment | <p>Standard active employment policy tools are provided, increased attention from the labour offices' staff is paid to persons defined as needing special attention.</p> <p>The specific employment support programmes for Roma are provided by NGOs and financed mostly by the ESF or ERDF.</p> <p>Municipal initiatives on including social considerations into public procurement.</p> | <p><i>Extending social considerations in public procurement by municipalities to increase employability of Roma is a positive step which should be scaled up.</i></p> <p><i>The capacity of public employment services should be further developed to allow for individualised/targeted services for Roma job seekers. In this connection, the capacity of the Agency for Social Inclusion should be also reinforced.</i></p> <p><i>Support services for improving employability within temporary public work schemes should be ensured with a view to effective integration of Roma into the open labour market. In addition, promoting social enterprises and Roma entrepreneurship, reaching out to private employers, targeting Roma under the Youth Guarantee, training and employing Roma civil servants should be considered.</i></p> <p><i>Fighting and monitoring discrimination in the labour market needs to be ensured.</i></p> |
| Health | <p>Preventive outreach measures targeting Roma are solely implemented by the programme of health and social assistants in excluded localities. The implementation of the programme is provided by the NGO.</p> <p>Notification to health insurance companies about discriminatory practices of some healthcare professionals.</p> | <p><i>Further improving the access of Roma to healthcare should be addressed more systematically.</i></p> <p><i>Measures towards healthcare professionals to avoid discriminatory practices should also be reinforced.</i></p> |

| | KEY STEPS SINCE 2011 | ASSESSMENT |
|---------------------|---|---|
| Housing | <p>Approval of Concept of Homelessness until 2020.</p> <p>Use of European Regional Development Fund for housing interventions.</p> | <p><i>Improving access of Roma to quality social housing should be part of an integrated approach with a long-term objective of desegregation.</i></p> <p><i>EU structural funds should not be used for any kind of sub-standard housing, as is currently the case with social hostels (“ubytovny”).</i></p> <p><i>Attention needs to be paid to unlawful practices in the property market.</i></p> |
| Anti-discrimination | <p>Awareness raising activities.</p> <p>Support to victims of discrimination provided by the Ombudsman.</p> <p>Free legal assistance provided by the Czech Bar Association.</p> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>The effective practical enforcement of Antidiscrimination laws needs to be ensured.</i> • <i>Effective measures should also be taken to combat anti-Roma rhetoric and hate speech.</i> • <i>Desegregation measures need to be reinforced.</i> |

| | KEY STEPS SINCE 2011 | ASSESSMENT |
|---|--|--|
| Funding | <p>Roma inclusion has been supported by national and EU funds under various mainstream policy measures, including social inclusion measures. Main support has been provided via:</p> <p>ERDF: €14 million for housing interventions</p> <p>In the 2007-2013 financial period, Czech Republic has allocated 9,7 % (~€ 365 million) of its total ESF budget for integrating disadvantaged people.</p> | <p><i>Sufficient allocation of European Structural and Investment Funds including in the specific investment priority for the integration of marginalised communities such as Roma, should be ensured in the 2014-2020 programming period. Furthermore, Roma inclusion should be mainstreamed into all relevant policy areas, including under the thematic objectives on social inclusion, education and employment.</i></p> <p><i>All existing possibilities to support Roma inclusion, including under the European Agricultural Fund for Rural Development (EAFRD) should be considered.</i></p> <p><i>Strong cooperation and coordination between the National Roma Contact Point and the authorities responsible for the management of European Structural and Investment Funds is necessary to ensure the successful mobilisation of EU funds for Roma integration, efficiency and sustainability of measures as well as proper monitoring of their impact. Funding should be mobilised to support capacity building of Roma NGOs.</i></p> |
| Structural priorities that should be considered | <p><i>Mainstream policy reforms particularly in the fields of education, employment, health and housing should contribute to support Roma inclusion. Measures targeting Roma should be carried out within an integrated approach supported by adequate sustainable funding. The monitoring of the impact of these measures should be ensured. Mapping and strengthening the territorial aspects of policy making should focus on the most disadvantaged regions. A constructive dialogue with the civil society, as well as close cooperation with local and regional authorities should be ensured.</i></p> | |

Denmark

| | KEY STEPS SINCE 2011 | ASSESSMENT |
|---------------------|---|--|
| Education | Mainstream measures to fight early school leaving (e.g. campaign, creation of a task force) and to integrate all pupils (e.g. language screening and support; replacing segregation with individual support in mainstream education). | <i>The situation and the impact of mainstreaming measures on the Roma should be monitored systematically.</i> |
| Employment | Various initiatives aimed at supporting vulnerable groups' employment: DKK 45 million campaign to reach out to highly marginalised immigrants from which Roma can benefit; DKK 115 million campaign "We need everyone"; guidance provided to job centres on ethnic minorities. | <i>Monitoring the impact of active labour market policies on marginalised groups, including the Roma, is recommended.</i> |
| Health | Various measures have been taken to increase access to and use of healthcare among ethnic minorities, including the training of health professionals. | <i>Monitoring the impact of health policy measures on Roma is recommended.</i> |
| Housing | Initiatives (supported by an increase of the National Building Fund) to improve living conditions in deprived residential areas (DKK 220 million annually earmarked to disadvantaged housing areas in 2011-2014), to reduce the number of disadvantaged housing (between DKK 25-30 million annually, for the renovation of social housing, strengthened cooperation of stakeholders, etc.), to support the development of emergency shelters (DKK 7.5 million allocated in 2012 and 2013) and to prevent the formation of ghettos and of segregation between various communities. | <i>Monitoring the impact of housing policy measures on Roma is recommended.</i> |
| Anti-discrimination | Support provided to victims by the Danish Institute for Human Rights. | <p><i>Awareness raising campaigns to tackle prejudices and stereotypes on Roma should be carried out.</i></p> <p><i>Training activities focusing on administrative staff working closely with Roma communities should be reinforced.</i></p> |

| | KEY STEPS SINCE 2011 | ASSESSMENT |
|---|--|--|
| Funding | <p>No specific amount has been allocated exclusively for Roma integration. However, Roma inclusion has been supported by national funds under various mainstream policy measures, including social inclusion measures. Main support has been provided via the Social Reserve allocated to projects aiming at improving the situation of vulnerable groups.</p> <p>In the 2007–2013 financial period, Denmark has allocated no ESF budget for integrating disadvantaged people.</p> | <p><i>Further use of existing possibilities under the EU funds to support Roma inclusion should be considered.</i></p> |
| Structural priorities that should be considered | <p><i>Efforts have been undertaken in 2013 to facilitate the work of municipalities facing challenges in Roma integration, to stimulate dialogue among local authorities on this issue. However, the lack of more precise knowledge on the situation of Roma makes it difficult to evaluate the social and economic effects of the policy measures taken. Therefore evidence-gathering as a basis for systematic monitoring should be developed.</i></p> | |

Estonia

| | KEY STEPS SINCE 2011 | ASSESSMENT |
|------------|---|---|
| Education | <p>Mapping the situation on minorities in education.</p> <p>Exchange of best practices among schools and regional communities.</p> | <p><i>Equal access to inclusive education (starting with quality inclusive early childhood education and care as well as pre-school education) should be reinforced within a systematic approach.</i></p> <p><i>Roma children with learning difficulties should be offered pedagogical and linguistic support in order to avoid early school leaving as well as to improve their performance in basic skills.</i></p> <p><i>Teacher training and awareness-raising among parents and pupils should be reinforced.</i></p> |
| Employment | <p>Support based on an individual approach is provided within the mainstream active labour market policies.</p> <p>Study on the impact of equal treatment in the labour market.</p> | <p><i>The conclusions from the study on the equal treatment approach are expected to be followed up and translated into practice.</i></p> |
| Health | <p>Support provided under mainstream health policy measures.</p> | <p><i>Access to healthcare needs to be reinforced.</i></p> <p><i>Monitoring the impact of health policy measures on Roma is recommended</i></p> |
| Housing | <p>Support provided under mainstream housing policy measures.</p> | <p><i>Improving access of Roma to quality housing should be part of an integrated approach.</i></p> <p><i>Monitoring the impact of housing policy measures on Roma is recommended.</i></p> |

| | KEY STEPS SINCE 2011 | ASSESSMENT |
|---------------------|--|--|
| Anti-discrimination | <p>Recognition of Roma Holocaust.</p> <p>Promotion of inter-cultural dialogue between Roma and non-Roma,</p> | <i>The effective practical enforcement of Antidiscrimination laws needs to be ensured.</i> |

| | KEY STEPS SINCE 2011 | ASSESSMENT |
|---------|--|---|
| Funding | <p>No specific amount has been allocated exclusively for Roma integration. However, Roma inclusion has been supported by national and EU funds under various mainstream policy measures, including social inclusion measures.</p> <p>In the 2007-2013 financial period, Estonia has allocated 0,8 % (~€ 3 million) of its total ESF budget for integrating disadvantaged people.</p> | <i>Further use of existing possibilities under the EU funds to support Roma inclusion should be considered.</i> |

| | | |
|---|--|--|
| Structural priorities that should be considered | <i>Evidence-gathering as a basis for systematic monitoring should be developed to measure the impact of mainstream policy measures on Roma. A constructive dialogue with civil society and close cooperation with local and regional authorities need to be ensured.</i> | |
|---|--|--|

Finland

| | KEY STEPS SINCE 2011 | ASSESSMENT |
|------------|--|---|
| Education | <p>Compulsory pre-primary education for all children, not only Roma, is planned, starting from 2015.</p> <p>A number of local pilot projects (e.g. teacher training and involvement of Roma professionals).</p> <p>Support for transition between schools and labour market.</p> <p>Annual €75 000 funding for the “Romani language nest”.</p> <p>Teaching of Romani language and culture at Helsinki University and possible graduation as certified Romani language teachers.</p> | <p><i>The increased participation of Roma pupils in early childhood education and care as well as the new compulsory pre-school year are signs of progress. The employment of Roma school assistants and/or Romani language teachers should be considered.</i></p> <p><i>Assessing the impact of the pilot projects and of other measures is necessary.</i></p> |
| Employment | <p>Wide range of mainstream interventions aimed at increasing the employability of disadvantaged groups, including Roma.</p> <p>15 projects funded by the European Social Fund related to Roma integration: e.g. “<i>UusiTaito</i>” on training Roma employment mediators and <i>Kaleet kouluun!</i> for creating a model for employment and education of Roma.</p> <p>Various national funded projects promoting Roma employment (e.g. <i>Tempo</i>).</p> <p>Training and employment of Roma professionals in employment services targeting Roma.</p> | <p><i>Assessing the impact of mainstream and targeted measures is necessary.</i></p> <p><i>Attention needs to be paid to eliminating discriminatory practices in the public employment scheme.</i></p> |
| Health | <p>Research on the health situation of Roma, related in particular to preventive healthcare for children, youth and Roma women, conducted by the National Institute for Health and Welfare.</p> | <p><i>Drawing lessons from the research project and assessing the impact of mainstream measures is necessary</i></p> |
| Housing | <p>Research on the health situation of the Roma conducted by the National Institute for Health and Welfare with aspects related to the housing situation.</p> | <p><i>Drawing lessons from the research project and assessing the impact of mainstream measures is necessary.</i></p> <p><i>Discriminatory practices in the property market need to be addressed.</i></p> |

| | KEY STEPS SINCE 2011 | ASSESSMENT |
|---------------------|---|---|
| Anti-discrimination | <p>Study carried out in 2013 by the Ombudsman for Minorities on discrimination of the Roma in employment and housing.</p> <p>Official acknowledgement that the fight against discrimination is a precondition to improve Roma school attainment and effective equal access to the labour market.</p> <p>Website www.romanit.fi, offering information on Finnish Roma and Romani culture (including articles and teaching material).</p> | <p><i>The effective practical enforcement of Antidiscrimination laws needs to be ensured.</i></p> <p><i>Tools to enable Roma empowerment in close cooperation with non-governmental organisations should be developed</i></p> |

| | KEY STEPS SINCE 2011 | ASSESSMENT |
|---------|---|--|
| Funding | <p>Roma inclusion has been supported by national and EU funds under various mainstream policy measures, including social inclusion measures.</p> <p>In the 2007-2013 financial period, Finland has allocated 13,6 % (~€ 84.2 million) of its total ESF budget for integrating disadvantaged people.</p> | <p><i>Further use of existing possibilities under the EU funds to support Roma inclusion should be considered.</i></p> |

| | | |
|---|---|--|
| Structural priorities that should be considered | <i>Assessing the impact of mainstream and targeted measures is necessary.</i> | |
|---|---|--|

France

| | KEY STEPS SINCE 2011 | ASSESSMENT |
|------------|---|---|
| Education | <p>Restatement of the principle of compulsory education and measures foreseen in the <i>circulaire</i> of 26th August 2012 .</p> <p>Adoption of 3 major <i>circulaires</i> on education of Roma and Travellers .</p> <p>National working group on Roma and travellers' education and network of CASNAV⁴ .</p> <p>Adoption of <i>circulaire</i> of 26th August 2012 on anticipating and preparing evictions from illegal settlements.</p> | <p><i>Decisive steps forward have been taken, both in terms of policy and governance on Roma education.</i></p> <p><i>The circulaire of 26th August 2012 needs to be fully implemented at the local level. Evidence gathering should be further developed to measure the impact of activities undertaken on Roma and Travellers.</i></p> <p><i>An adequate strategy for Travellers, including measures to fight illiteracy and early school leaving should be developed. Measures promoting the access of Roma and Travellers to early childhood education and care need to be carried out.</i></p> |
| Employment | <p>Vocational training measures foreseen in the <i>circulaire</i> of 26th August 2012.</p> <p>Cancellation of the employers' tax to Office français de l'Immigration et de l'Intégration, from which Roma could have benefitted.</p> <p>Limited-scale projects to support travellers' employment (e.g. in agriculture).</p> | <p><i>The successful, but rather small-scale initiatives targeting Roma and Travellers should be scaled up and integrated into a more coherent approach.</i></p> <p><i>The circulaire needs to be fully implemented at local level. Evidence gathering should be further developed to support an adequate strategy for Travellers and to measure the impact of activities undertaken.</i></p> <p><i>Attention needs to be paid to monitoring and eliminating discriminatory practices at the workplace.</i></p> |
| Health | <p>Health measures foreseen in the <i>circulaire</i> of 26th August 2012.</p> <p>Cancellation of the registration tax for State Medical Aid (AME) and increase in the universal health coverage level (CMU).</p> | <p><i>Initiatives have been taken to step up the access for disadvantaged groups to healthcare and health insurance.</i></p> <p><i>The circulaire needs to be fully implemented at local level, in particular as conditions for Roma living in illegal settlements are of concern.</i></p> <p><i>Evidence gathering should be further developed to support an adequate strategy for Travellers and to measure the impact of activities undertaken on Roma and Travellers.</i></p> |

² NOR INTK1233053C

³ *Circulaires du 2 octobre 2012 sur: l'Organisation de la scolarité des élèves allophones nouvellement arrivés du 2 octobre 2012 (NOR REDE1236612C); l'organisation des Casnav (NOR REDE1236614C) ; la scolarisation et scolarité des enfants issus de familles itinérantes et de voyageurs (NOR REDE1236611C).*

⁴ Centre académique pour la scolarisation des enfants allophones nouvellement arrivés et des enfants issues des familles itinérantes et de voyageurs.

| | KEY STEPS SINCE 2011 | ASSESSMENT |
|---------------------|--|---|
| Housing | <p>Adoption of <i>circulaire</i> of 26th August 2012 on anticipating and preparing evictions from illegal settlements.</p> <p>Dialogue and support (including financial - € 4 million annually) provided to all local authorities in charge of implementing the <i>circulaire</i>.</p> <p>Proactive data collection and regular monitoring of all illegal settlements.</p> <p>Effective use of the ERDF by regions to build housing solutions for Roma.</p> <p>Allocation of € 5 million in the national budget for halting sites.</p> | <p><i>The circulaire of 26th August 2012, welcomed by all stakeholders, fills a gap regarding the conditions under which evictions from illegal settlements used to take place. However, implementation is a challenge. Further efforts in terms of governance are needed to monitor the follow-up of the circulaire as well as population fluxes.</i></p> <p><i>The development of an adequate strategy for Travellers is necessary, so as to develop quality halting sites and to meet the challenges raised by important gatherings (grands passages).</i></p> |
| Anti-discrimination | <p>Amendment of the 1969 law.</p> <p>2012-2014 Action Plan against Racism.</p> <p>National working group on discrimination and effective dialogue between the national Roma contact point and civil society / local actors.</p> | <p><i>Proactive steps are being taken to tackle misconceptions and would need to be consolidated. Recommendations from the Défenseur des droits and from the Commission Nationale Consultative aux Droits de l'Homme are expected to be followed up, so as to ensure access and continuity of rights to education, healthcare and services essential to people's dignity.</i></p> |

| | KEY STEPS SINCE 2011 | ASSESSMENT |
|---------|--|--|
| Funding | <p>Roma inclusion has been supported by national and EU funds under various mainstream policy measures, including social inclusion measures.</p> <p>Effective use in 2007-2013 of the European Regional Development Fund (€ 7 million programmed focusing on housing for disadvantaged groups).</p> <p>In the 2007-2013 financial period, France has allocated 34,6 % (~€ 1 861 million) of its total ESF budget for integrating disadvantaged people.</p> | <p><i>Further use of existing possibilities under the EU funds to support Roma inclusion should be considered.</i></p> <p>.</p> <p>.</p> |

| | | |
|---|---|--|
| Structural priorities that should be considered | <p><i>The policy framework is in place for Roma integration but is not fully implemented in practice. Implementation could be more effective through a stronger coordination between territories and the central level. A strategy for Travellers' integration still has to be developed. The capacities and mandate of the National Roma Contact Point should be further reinforced. Full implementation of the strategy at local level should be ensured via more systematic efforts in order to build a culture of social inclusion with awareness raising activities and mediation.</i></p> | |
|---|---|--|

Germany

| | KEY STEPS SINCE 2011 | ASSESSMENT |
|---------------------|--|---|
| Education | <p>Federal Working Group on Roma education, involving Ministries, Roma NGOs, foundations, researchers and activists set up.</p> <p>A series of state and municipal level projects supporting German Sinti and Roma, and Roma from other EU Member States (e.g. in learning German language, after-school activities, supporting transition between school and the labour market etc.).</p> | <p><i>Several positive steps have been taken, in particular at local level (e.g. Berlin Action Plan).</i></p> <p><i>Evidence gathering should be developed to assess the situation and the impact of measures on the Roma.</i></p> <p><i>Early school leaving should be carefully tackled, particularly in Vocational Education and Training.</i></p> |
| Employment | <p>Support based on an individual approach provided within the mainstream active labour market policies.</p> | <p><i>Using the individual approach bringing Roma to the open labour market is positive.</i></p> <p><i>Evidence gathering should be developed to assess the situation and the impact of measures on the Roma.</i></p> |
| Health | <p>Roma can benefit from mainstream policy measures.</p> | <p><i>Evidence gathering should be developed to assess the situation and the impact of measures on the Roma.</i></p> |
| Housing | <p>Social housing provided at state and municipal level.</p> | <p><i>Attention needs to be paid to eliminating discriminatory practices in the property market.</i></p> |
| Anti-discrimination | <p>Awareness-raising activities against racism and all kinds of discrimination, promoting inter-cultural dialogue, in particular in schools.</p> | <p><i>Developing tools to enable Roma empowerment in close cooperation with non-governmental organisations is necessary.</i></p> |

| | KEY STEPS SINCE 2011 | ASSESSMENT |
|---------|---|--|
| Funding | <p>In many cases no specific amount has been allocated exclusively for Roma integration. However, Roma inclusion has been supported by national and EU funds under various types of mainstream measures, including social inclusion measures. In the 2007-2013 financial period, Germany has allocated 20% (~€ 1 878 million) of its total ESF budget for integrating disadvantaged people.</p> | <p><i>Further use of existing possibilities under the EU funds to support Roma inclusion should be considered.</i></p> |

| | | |
|---|--|--|
| Structural priorities that should be considered | <p><i>The coordination role of the National Roma Contact Point should be reinforced. The development of local action plans should be supported. Evidence gathering should be developed to enable assessment of the situation and the impact of mainstream measures and targeted activities undertaken on the Roma. The involvement of civil society in Roma-related activities should be reinforced.</i></p> | |
|---|--|--|

Greece

| | KEY STEPS SINCE 2011 | ASSESSMENT |
|------------|--|---|
| Education | <p>Implementation of policy incentives to increase school attendance via two programmes – “Education of Roma Children” and “Roma Children in Macedonia and Thrace”.</p> | <p><i>Systematic measures are needed to reinforce inclusion in compulsory education, starting with ensuring access to quality-inclusive early childhood education and care, as well as pre-school education.</i></p> <p><i>Proper monitoring of enrolment and attendance is necessary.</i></p> <p><i>Desegregation measures need to be reinforced.</i></p> |
| Employment | <p>Implementation of Local Integrated Programmes for Vulnerable Social Groups (TOPEKO).</p> <p>Continuation of 29 Support Centres for vulnerable groups, including Roma.</p> | <p><i>Targeted measures within the active inclusion policies with increased focus on the effective integration into the open labour market are needed. Promoting Roma entrepreneurship under the Youth Guarantee should be considered.</i></p> <p><i>Proper operation of 29 Support Centres for vulnerable groups, including Roma, should be secured by adequate and sustainable funding.</i></p> |
| Health | <p>Focus on preventive healthcare, mainly on vaccination.</p> | <p><i>Improving access of Roma to healthcare should be addressed by more systematic measures.</i></p> <p><i>Training of healthcare professionals should be reinforced.</i></p> |
| Housing | <p>Three regional integrated pilot programmes with infrastructure component.</p> | <p><i>The implementation of well-designed regional programmes needs to be supported by adequate and sustainable funding.</i></p> <p><i>Mapping of socio-economic and living conditions in Roma settlements should be considered.</i></p> |

| | KEY STEPS SINCE 2011 | ASSESSMENT |
|---------------------|--|---|
| Anti-discrimination | The Greek Ombudsman has created a separate office for Roma issues. | <p><i>The effective practical enforcement of anti-discrimination law needs to be ensured.</i></p> <p><i>Effective measures should be taken to combat anti-Roma rhetoric and hate speech.</i></p> <p><i>Desegregation measures should be accompanied by awareness-raising activities among both Roma and non-Roma.</i></p> |

| | KEY STEPS SINCE 2011 | ASSESSMENT |
|---------|---|--|
| Funding | <p>Roma inclusion has been supported by national and EU funds under various types of mainstream measures, including social inclusion measures. Main support has been provided via:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - European Regional Development Fund: € 18.9 Million in Thrace (Operational Programmes “Central Macedonia, Western Macedonia and Eastern Macedonia - Thrace”) and Thessaly € 3.7 Million in Thessaly (Operational Programme “Thessalia - Sterea Ellada – Ipiros”). <p>In the 2007-2013 financial period, Greece has allocated 9,2 % (~€ 397 million) of its total ESF budget for integrating disadvantaged people.</p> | <p><i>Strong cooperation and coordination between the NaS-trong cooperation and coordination between the National Roma Contact Point and the authorities responsible for the management of European Structural and Investment Funds is necessary to ensure the successful mobilisation of EU funds for Roma integration, efficiency and sustainability of measures as well as proper monitoring of their impact.</i></p> |

| | | |
|---|--|--|
| Structural priorities that should be considered | <p><i>Mainstream policy reforms particularly in the fields of education, employment, health and housing should contribute to support Roma inclusion. Measures targeting Roma should be carried out within an integrated approach supported by adequate sustainable funding. The monitoring of the impact of these measures should be ensured. Mapping and strengthening the territorial aspects of policy making should focus on the most disadvantaged regions. A constructive dialogue with the civil society, as well as close cooperation with local and regional authorities should be ensured.</i></p> | |
|---|--|--|

Hungary

| | KEY STEPS SINCE 2011 | ASSESSMENT |
|------------|--|--|
| Education | <p>Broad range of measures to ensure equal access to quality education for the disadvantaged (integrated pedagogical system, Sure Start houses, scholarship programmes, etc.).</p> <p>School centralisation including harmonisation of curriculum, centralised textbook publishing, professional services, financing and aspects of human resource management</p> <p>Reduction of mandatory age limit in compulsory education (to the age of 16) accompanied with shortening of vocational cycle and the introduction of a dual system.</p> <p>Planned introduction of compulsory pre-school attendance from age three with measures to encourage participation in including cash incentives and the extension of Sure Start Children Centres.</p> | <p><i>The integrated Pedagogical System contributes positively to Roma pupils' education, nevertheless, more efforts are needed to promote their access to the mainstream education system.. The impact of recent reforms needs to be closely monitored in this regard.</i></p> <p><i>A systematic approach to desegregation needs to be put in place, building on the opportunities presented by the school centralisation.</i></p> <p><i>Early school leaving should be carefully tackled, particularly in Vocational Education and Training.</i></p> <p><i>Focus on basic skills and key competences should be reinforced in general and vocational schools. Increased participation of Roma pupils in pre-school should be accompanied by qualified staff, necessary infrastructure and sustainable funding.</i></p> |
| Employment | <p>Wide range of mainstream actions aimed at increasing the employability of disadvantaged groups with due consideration to gender aspects.</p> <p>Roma mentors in Public Employment Services.</p> | <p><i>Continuous and individualised supporting services of temporary public work schemes should be reinforced with a view to effective integration in the open labour market.</i></p> <p><i>A comprehensive package of measures targeting private employers including extending social considerations in public procurement, promoting diversity in the workplace, coupled by job trials, recruitment subsidies, targeting Roma under the Youth Guarantee should be considered.</i></p> <p><i>Fighting and monitoring discrimination in the labour market needs to be ensured.</i></p> |
| Health | <p>Healthcare measures aimed at reducing inequalities, including preventive health care.</p> <p>Special focus on early childhood development (screening tests), youth and Roma women.</p> <p>Incentives for paediatricians, general practitioners to fill empty practices in most disadvantaged regions.</p> <p>Training of healthcare professionals.</p> <p>Awareness-rising campaigns among Roma.</p> | <p><i>Evidence gathering should be developed to measure the situation and the impact of measures on the Roma.</i></p> |

| | KEY STEPS SINCE 2011 | ASSESSMENT |
|---------------------|--|--|
| Housing | <p>Systematic and integrated approach with the long-term objective of desegregation.</p> <p>In the Programme <i>Trust and Work</i> as well as in <i>the Complex estate programme</i> housing interventions complementary to employment, training, health care and social work activities. Additional pilot housing measures launched.</p> | <p><i>Evidence gathering should be developed to enable measuring the situation and the impact of mainstream measures and activities undertaken on the Roma.</i></p> <p><i>Spatial desegregation should be strengthened</i></p> |
| Anti-discrimination | <p>Financial support to municipalities provided under the condition that they observe the principles of equal treatment and long term desegregation.</p> <p>Amendment of the penal law related to violence against the members of ethnic communities.</p> <p>A range of measures have been launched to contribute to the empowerment of Roma (such as the establishment of the <i>Roma Public Life Academy of Politics</i>, promoting Roma journalists).</p> | <p><i>The effective practical enforcement of anti-discrimination legislation needs to be ensured.</i></p> <p><i>Effective measures should also be taken to combat anti-Roma rhetoric and hate speech.</i></p> <p><i>Desegregation measures should be accompanied by awareness-raising activities for both Roma and non-Roma.</i></p> <p><i>Attention need to be paid to eliminating discriminatory practices in the public work scheme. Close cooperation with the media is recommended.</i></p> |

| | KEY STEPS SINCE 2011 | ASSESSMENT |
|---------|---|--|
| Funding | <p>Roma inclusion has been supported by national and EU funds under various types of mainstream measures, including social inclusion measures. Main support has been provided via:</p> <p>- European Regional Development Fund: Housing supported by € 8.6 million + €3.46 Million (Operation Programme housing projects) = € 12.06 million EUR.</p> <p>In the 2007-2013 financial period, Hungary has allocated 8,8 % (~€ 319 million) of its total ESF budget for integrating disadvantaged people.</p> | <p><i>Sufficient allocation of European Structural and Investment Funds, including in the specific investment priority for integration of marginalised communities such as Roma should be ensured in the 2014-2020 programming period. Roma inclusion should be mainstreamed into all relevant policy areas including under the thematic objectives on social inclusion, education and employment.</i></p> <p><i>All existing possibilities to support Roma inclusion, including under the European Agricultural Fund for Rural Development (EAFRD), should be considered.</i></p> <p><i>The synergy between actions supported by EU funds and national funds and mainstream policies should be ensured. Strong cooperation and coordination between the National Roma Contact Point and the authorities responsible for the management of European Structural and Investment Funds is necessary to ensure the successful mobilisation of EU funds for Roma integration, efficiency and sustainability of measures as well as proper monitoring of their impact.</i></p> |

| | | |
|---|--|--|
| Structural priorities that should be considered | <p><i>The monitoring mechanism should have a stronger focus on assessing the impact. The conclusions of the monitoring should be channelled into policy developments. Cooperation with all segments of Roma civil society and local and regional authorities should be reinforced. Mainstream policy reforms should be more coordinated to support Roma inclusion. Anti-discrimination campaigns and targeted actions should be developed.</i></p> | |
|---|--|--|

Ireland

| | KEY STEPS SINCE 2011 | ASSESSMENT |
|------------|---|--|
| Education | <p>Mainstream measures, e.g. to fight early school leaving (School Completion Programme), support at-risk pupils (Home School Community Liaison), support the transition from primary to post-primary education (education passport) and provide English language support.</p> <p>Closing of all segregated schools/ pre-schools for Travellers.</p> | <p><i>A number of mainstream measures have been taken to support disadvantaged pupils.</i></p> <p><i>The impact of mainstream policies and measures on Travellers and Roma should be monitored.</i></p> <p><i>Measures addressing education should be better coordinated with other policies, in particular employment and housing.</i></p> |
| Employment | <p>National Action Plan for Social Inclusion 2007-2016. Review of the Special Initiative for Travellers to improve its effectiveness.</p> <p>A number of local projects (e.g. Community development projects; support to Travellers' entrepreneurship in Galway).</p> | <p><i>Local initiatives promoting Roma employability should be scaled up.</i></p> <p><i>Providing relevant labour market training and assistance for entrepreneurship among Travellers and Roma should be considered.</i></p> |
| Health | <p>Mainstream measures have been accompanied by a number of local initiatives aimed at supporting access of Travellers and Roma to healthcare.</p> <p>Mainstream measures (Future Health 2012-2015; Healthy Ireland 2013-2025).</p> <p>A wide range of specific health services and initiatives (e.g. GP Roma Mobile Clinic, vaccination campaigns, development of training on healthcare and Travellers, various initiatives from the Health Service Executive).</p> | <p><i>Local initiatives have been taken to specifically support the access of Roma and Travellers to healthcare.</i></p> <p><i>The impact of mainstream measures and local initiatives aimed at improving access of Travellers and Roma to healthcare should be monitored.</i></p> <p><i>The health policy measures should be better coordinated with other policies, in particular housing.</i></p> <p><i>Awareness-raising on health issues among Travellers and Roma should be carried out in close cooperation with civil society organisations.</i></p> |

| | KEY STEPS SINCE 2011 | ASSESSMENT |
|---------------------|---|---|
| Housing | Implementation of the 2009-2013 Traveller Accommodation Programmes by local authorities and development of new 2014-2018 Traveller Accommodation Programmes. | <p><i>The housing actions should be carried out as part of an integrated approach, paying attention to education, employment and health challenges.</i></p> <p><i>Adequate funding needs to be secured for local authorities to deal with higher risk of homelessness among Travellers and Roma</i></p> |
| Anti-discrimination | <p>Various local initiatives (e.g. factsheet on travellers for enterprises in Galway) and activities from the Equality Authority (e.g. workshop promoting Traveller Employment in the Private sector).</p> <p>Work on building positive relations between the police and the Travellers / Roma.</p> <p>Publication of anti-bullying procedures to be adopted and implemented by all primary and post-primary schools.</p> | <p><i>A systematic approach to tackle prejudices against the Traveller and Roma communities, including working with the media should be developed.</i></p> |

| | KEY STEPS SINCE 2011 | ASSESSMENT |
|---------|--|--|
| Funding | <p>Roma and Travellers' inclusion has been supported by national and EU funds under various types of mainstream measures, including social inclusion measures.</p> <p>In the 2007-2013 financial period, Ireland has allocated 28,6 % (~€ 107,5 million) of its total ESF budget for integrating disadvantaged people.</p> | <p><i>Further use of existing possibilities under the EU funds to support Roma inclusion should be considered.</i></p> |

| | | |
|---|---|--|
| Structural priorities that should be considered | <p><i>Mechanisms to ensure a constructive dialogue, better communication and coordination between public authorities, Travellers and Roma communities and local and regional authorities should be reinforced. The role of the National Roma Contact Point needs to be reinforced. Travellers' and Roma integration should be addressed across all relevant policy areas. Measuring the impact of mainstream measures on Travellers and Roma remains necessary.</i></p> | |
|---|---|--|

Italy

| | KEY STEPS SINCE 2011 | ASSESSMENT |
|---------------------|--|--|
| Education | <p>Measures planned to decrease the early school leaving rate in four regions.</p> <p>National project launched in 2013 with the aim to increase participation of Roma children in primary and secondary schools involving 13 large municipalities.</p> | <p><i>Adequate funding to secure effective and sustainable implementation of the planned measures is necessary.</i></p> |
| Employment | <p>Promoting vocational training, job orientation to support inclusion of Roma and other vulnerable groups in the labour market.</p> <p>The national working group on labour has been developing projects which include Roma people as targets on such issues as; prevention of early school leaving; integration of migrants; fight against undeclared work; access to services; self-employment; creation of a national Integration Website focusing on migrants' needs.</p> | <p><i>Positive steps have been taken in designing and implementing policies and actions for the Roma by local authorities. Promising initiatives need to be scaled up.</i></p> <p><i>Further attention is needed to fight discriminatory practices in the labour market.</i></p> |
| Health | <p>Additional financial allocations in 2012 and 2013 to a national institute created to promote health among migrant population and to fight diseases due to poverty, Roma persons included.</p> <p>A project "TroVARSI" (Vaccinations Roma and Sinti) which began in 2013, aims at increasing the level of protection of Roma children from diseases that can be prevented by ordinary vaccination.</p> | <p><i>The national health system provides universal access to healthcare (including Roma people), prevention and uniform criteria for quality services throughout the country. However, measuring the impact of mainstream health policies on Roma and the possibility of further targeted measures should be considered.</i></p> |
| Housing | <p>Efforts to overcome the "camps-system" were made in various areas of the country.</p> | <p><i>Overcoming the camps-system should be carried out within an integrated approach addressing simultaneously challenges in the areas of education, employment and health.</i></p> |
| Anti-discrimination | <p>The "Campaign Dosta! 2012-2013" is aimed at raising awareness and combating anti-Roma prejudice.</p> | <p><i>The effective practical enforcement of anti-discrimination legislation needs to be ensured.</i></p> <p><i>A systematic approach to tackle prejudices against the Roma, including working with the media should be developed.</i></p> <p><i>Effective measures should also be taken to combat anti-Roma rhetoric and hate speech.</i></p> |

| | KEY STEPS SINCE 2011 | ASSESSMENT |
|---|---|--|
| Funding | <p>Roma inclusion has been supported by national and EU funds under various types of mainstream measures, including social inclusion measures.</p> <p>In the 2007-2013 financial period, Italy has allocated 8,7 % (~€ 602 million) of its total ESF budget for integrating disadvantaged people.</p> | <p><i>Sustainable financing including from national funds should be secured for the implementation of the strategy.</i></p> <p><i>Further use of existing possibilities to support Roma inclusion under the EU funds should be considered.</i></p> |
| Structural priorities that should be considered | <p><i>The effective implementation of measures to step up Roma integration should be ensured by securing adequate and sustainable funding, efficient coordination between the national and local level and a constructive dialogue with civil society.</i></p> | |

Latvia

| | KEY STEPS SINCE 2011 | ASSESSMENT |
|------------|---|--|
| Education | <p>Mapping the situation and participation of Roma in education.</p> <p>Measures focusing on early-childhood education, primary and secondary education.</p> <p>Roma teachers' assistants.</p> <p>Support centres for Roma parents.</p> <p>Training of professionals.</p> | <p><i>Systematic measures to reinforce desegregation and inclusion into mainstream education are needed, starting with ensuring access to quality-inclusive early childhood education and care as well as pre-school education.</i></p> <p><i>Evidence gathering should be developed to assess the situation and the impact of measures on the Roma. Training and employment of Roma teachers' assistants should be continued.</i></p> <p><i>Proper monitoring of enrolment and attendance is necessary in order to effectively fight early school leaving.</i></p> <p><i>Further attention should be paid to tackling illiteracy.</i></p> |
| Employment | <p>Active labour market policy measures envisaging support for Roma as a vulnerable group among other unemployed, socially inactive or ethnic minorities.</p> | <p><i>More efforts should be placed in active inclusion labour market policies providing individualised support to Roma. The promotion of employment through training and reskilling relevant to labour market should be addressed.</i></p> |
| Health | <p>Support provided within the mainstream health policy measures.</p> | <p><i>A more systematic and integrated approach is necessary to improve access of Roma to healthcare, including health insurance coverage. Training of healthcare professionals should also be promoted.</i></p> |
| Housing | <p>Support provided within the mainstream housing policy measures.</p> | <p><i>A more systematic and integrated approach is necessary to improve access of Roma to quality housing.</i></p> |

| | KEY STEPS SINCE 2011 | ASSESSMENT |
|---------------------|--|--|
| Anti-discrimination | Awareness-raising activities (including from the Ombudsman) promoting inter-cultural dialogue. | <i>The effective practical enforcement of anti-discrimination law needs to be ensured.</i> |

| | KEY STEPS SINCE 2011 | ASSESSMENT |
|---------|---|---|
| Funding | No specific amount has been allocated exclusively for Roma integration. However, Roma inclusion has been supported by national and EU funds under various types of mainstream measures, including social inclusion measures. In the 2007-2013 financial period, Latvia has allocated 7,3 % (~€ 42 million) of its total ESF budget for integrating disadvantaged people. | <i>Further use of existing possibilities under the EU funds to support Roma inclusion should be considered.</i> |

| | | |
|---|---|--|
| Structural priorities that should be considered | <i>The implementation of effective Roma inclusion measures in education, housing, healthcare and employment should be secured, together with the allocation of adequate funding. Evidence gathering should be developed to measure the situation and the impact of activities on the Roma. A constructive dialogue with civil society and close cooperation with local and regional authorities need to be ensured. This is necessary for the successful implementation of mainstream social inclusion measures for all disadvantaged groups.</i> | |
|---|---|--|

Lithuania

| | KEY STEPS SINCE 2011 | ASSESSMENT |
|------------|---|--|
| Education | <p>Amendments to the 2012 Law on Education; provision of assistants where needed.</p> <p>Review of Roma children integration into educational system.</p> <p>Education for Roma children (pre-school age group) and adults provided in the Roma Community Centre.</p> <p>Teaching material prepared on Roma history and culture.</p> | <p><i>The outcome of the education review on Roma children needs to be taken into consideration in the implementation of the policies.</i></p> <p><i>Measures towards inclusive education and desegregation need to be reinforced.</i></p> <p><i>Awareness-raising measures among Roma parents and youth on the benefits of education are necessary. Attention should be paid to tackling illiteracy and offering second chance education to adult Roma.</i></p> |
| Employment | <p>Support provided within the mainstream employment policy measures.</p> <p>Continuation of the project 'European Roma culture and business park Bahtalo Drom', funded by EU structural funds in the Vilnius region.</p> | <p><i>Measuring the impact of mainstream measures and activities undertaken on employment of Roma is necessary.</i></p> <p><i>Labour market relevant training to increase employability of Roma should be considered.</i></p> |
| Health | <p>Support provided within the mainstream health policy measures.</p> <p>Actions such as combatting HIV and other illnesses among Roma have been taken and awareness raising lectures have been given.</p> <p>The Roma Action Plan for 2012 -2014 has estimated the healthcare and awareness raising financing needs for one local Roma settlement.</p> | <p><i>Measuring the impact of mainstream health policies on Roma is necessary.</i></p> <p><i>Awareness-raising activities on preventive healthcare should be developed. Training of healthcare professionals on the health needs of vulnerable groups, such as Roma, could be considered.</i></p> |
| Housing | <p>Support provided within the mainstream housing policy measures.</p> | <p><i>Housing policies to improve access of Roma to quality housing should be part of a systematic and integrated approach.</i></p> |

| | KEY STEPS SINCE 2011 | ASSESSMENT |
|---------------------|--|--|
| Anti-discrimination | <p>Adoption of inter-institutional Action Plan to Promote Non-discrimination for 2012–2014.</p> <p>Activities of Equal Opportunities Ombudsman on complaints lodged by Roma.</p> <p>Launch of the Dosta! Campaign.</p> <p>Concert and exhibition of Roma artworks, organised for the celebration of International Roma Day on 8 April 2013.</p> <p>Brochure about Roma victims of the Holocaust (printed, it will be distributed to history teachers).</p> | <i>The effective practical enforcement of anti-discrimination law needs to be ensured.</i> |

| | KEY STEPS SINCE 2011 | ASSESSMENT |
|---------|--|---|
| Funding | <p>Roma inclusion has been supported by national and EU funds under various types of mainstream measures, including social inclusion measures.</p> <p>In the 2007-2013 financial period, Lithuania has allocated 5,8 % (~€ 59 million) of its total ESF budget for integrating disadvantaged people.</p> | <i>Further use of existing possibilities under the EU funds to support Roma inclusion should be considered.</i> |

| | | |
|---|---|--|
| Structural priorities that should be considered | <i>Measuring the impact of mainstream policies on Roma is necessary. A constructive dialogue with civil society and close cooperation with local and regional authorities need to be ensured.</i> | |
|---|---|--|

Luxembourg

| | KEY STEPS SINCE 2011 | ASSESSMENT |
|---------------------|--|---|
| Education | <p>Roma can benefit from mainstream educational policies. Reforms to improve educational quality and performance, including the participation of (migrant) youth, are on the policy agenda.</p> <p>Training on the reception and integration of Roma children at school was organised for teachers during the school year 2011-2012 and welcoming classes (separated: "classes étatiques" or integrated: "cours d'accueil") exist for newcomers.</p> <p>Intercultural mediation is offered in several languages.</p> | <p><i>Measuring the impact of mainstream educational policies on Roma should be considered.</i></p> |
| Employment | <p>Roma can benefit from mainstream employment measures. Many initiatives have been taken to increase the employability of jobless people, including through job integration programmes and subsidised employment.</p> | <p><i>Measuring the impact of mainstream employment policies on Roma should be considered.</i></p> |
| Health | <p>Roma can benefit from mainstream health policy measures. Two measures could be of specific importance for Roma youth – preventing early pregnancy and promoting sexual health, facilitating access to dental services.</p> | <p><i>Measuring the impact of mainstream health policy measures on Roma should be considered.</i></p> <p><i>Awareness-raising measures aimed both at Roma and health professionals could be considered.</i></p> |
| Housing | <p>Early 2013 Luxembourg government adopted a national strategy against homelessness and housing exclusion.</p> | <p><i>Measuring the impact of planned mainstream housing measures on Roma should be considered.</i></p> |
| Anti-discrimination | <p>Newly established Welcome and Integration Contract (Contrat d'Accueil et d'Intégration – CAI).</p> | <p><i>A systematic approach to tackle prejudices against the Roma, including working with the media should be developed.</i></p> |

| | KEY STEPS SINCE 2011 | ASSESSMENT |
|---|---|--|
| Funding | <p>No specific amount has been allocated exclusively for Roma integration. However, Roma inclusion has been supported by national and EU funds under various types of mainstream measures, including social inclusion measures.</p> <p>In the 2007-2013 financial period, Luxembourg has allocated 9,6 % (~€ 2 million) of its total ESF budget for integrating disadvantaged people.</p> | <p><i>Further use of existing possibilities under the EU funds to support Roma inclusion should be considered.</i></p> |
| Structural priorities that should be considered | <p><i>Measuring the impact of mainstream measures on Roma should be considered.</i></p> | |

Netherlands

| | KEY STEPS SINCE 2011 | ASSESSMENT |
|---------------------|--|--|
| Education | <p>A series of local level projects organised by local municipalities to fight school absenteeism and reducing school drop-out rates.</p> <p>The individual approach used in improving the school attendance of Roma children (one family-one plan-one case manager).</p> <p>Employing school attendance officers and Roma school assistants at primary schools.</p> | <p><i>Using the individual approach in improving the school attendance of Roma children and close cooperation with Roma families are steps in the right direction.</i></p> <p><i>The awareness-raising activities to enhance mutual trust between Roma parents, Roma pupils, in particular Roma girls and schools should be considered.</i></p> <p><i>A stronger attention should be paid to the fight against adult illiteracy.</i></p> |
| Employment | <p>Support provided within the mainstream active labour market policies</p> | <p><i>Measuring the impact of mainstream measures and activities undertaken on employment of Roma is necessary.</i></p> <p><i>Vocational training among young Roma could be considered.</i></p> <p><i>Fighting discriminatory practices in the labour market needs to be addressed.</i></p> |
| Health | <p>Support provided within the mainstream health policy measures.</p> | <p><i>Awareness-raising campaigns on preventive health-care targeting Roma families should be considered.</i></p> |
| Housing | <p>Access to social housing and subsidised rented houses provided within the mainstream housing policy measures.</p> <p>Municipalities provide for halting sites.</p> | <p><i>Fighting discriminatory practices in the property market needs to be addressed.</i></p> |
| Anti-discrimination | <p>No specific step to support anti-discrimination regarding the Roma, beyond mainstream policy measures.</p> | <p><i>Awareness-raising campaigns to tackle prejudices and stereotyping against Roma and Sinti, to enhance mutual trust between both Roma and non-Roma should be carried out.</i></p> <p><i>The training activities focusing on administrative staff working closely with Roma communities should be reinforced.</i></p> |

| | KEY STEPS SINCE 2011 | ASSESSMENT |
|---|---|--|
| Funding | <p>No specific amount has been allocated exclusively for Roma integration. However, Roma inclusion has been supported by national and EU funds under various types of mainstream measures, including social inclusion measures. Main support has been provided via:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> , - national and municipal budgets. - EU Labour Plus project running in nine countries and funded by INTERREG IVC in cooperation with the European Towns and Pilot cities Platform. <p>In the 2007-2013 financial period, Netherlands has allocated 8% (~€ 66 million) of its total ESF budget for integrating disadvantaged people.</p> | <p><i>Further use of existing possibilities under the EU funds to support Roma inclusion should be considered.</i></p> |
| Structural priorities that should be considered | <p><i>An interconnected activity between municipalities facilitated by the creation of the Platform of Roma municipalities is an important step to support Roma integration at the local level. Representation and active participation of Roma into the planning, implementation and evaluation of measures/ activities related to them should be encouraged. Evidence from the "Roma monitor" survey could inspire measures reflecting the complexity of the situation of Roma. Measuring the situation and the impact of mainstream measures and activities undertaken on the Roma should be reinforced.</i></p> | |

Poland

| | KEY STEPS SINCE 2011 | ASSESSMENT |
|---|--|---|
| Education | Implementation of the Programme for the Roma community including a number of incentives to enforce pre-school and compulsory education. | <p><i>In spite of positive incentives, a more systematic approach towards inclusive education and effective implementation of desegregation measures need to be ensured.</i></p> <p><i>Reducing secondary school dropout rates, promoting vocational training and increasing participation in tertiary education should be prioritised.</i></p> |
| Employment | Implementation of the Programme for the Roma community supporting subsidised jobs, trainings and internships. | <p><i>Targeted measures within the active labour market policies with increased focus on effective integration to open labour market need to be taken.</i></p> <p><i>Promoting social enterprises and Roma entrepreneurship, targeting Roma under the Youth Guarantee should be considered.</i></p> |
| Health | Preventive health measures focusing on Roma women and children, vaccination, co-financing medicines, supporting community nurses. | <i>A more systematic and integrated approach is necessary so as to improve access of Roma to healthcare.</i> |
| Housing | Implementation of the Programme for the Roma community supporting the improvement of Roma housing conditions. | <i>Housing interventions to improve access of Roma to social housing should be part of a systematic and integrated approach underpinned by sustainable and adequate funding.</i> |
| Anti-discrimination | Awareness raising activities promoting cultural dialogue among Roma and non-Roma. | <i>The effective practical enforcement of anti-discrimination law needs to be ensured.</i> |
| | KEY STEPS SINCE 2011 | ASSESSMENT |
| Funding | Roma inclusion has been supported by national and EU funds under various types of mainstream measures, including social inclusion measures In the 2007-2013 financial period, Poland has allocated 11,2 % (~€ 1 089 million) of its total ESF budget for integrating disadvantaged people. | <p><i>Efficiency and sustainability of measures as well as proper monitoring of their impact should be ensured.</i></p> <p><i>Further use of existing possibilities under the EU funds to support Roma inclusion should be considered.</i></p> |
| Structural priorities that should be considered | <i>Better-targeted, result-oriented interventions across all relevant policy areas supported by adequate and sustainable funding, efficient monitoring, and constructive dialogue with the civil society and close cooperation with local and regional authorities need to be ensured.</i> | |

Portugal

| | KEY STEPS SINCE 2011 | ASSESSMENT |
|---|---|--|
| Education | <p>Improving access to early childhood education and care through awareness-raising activities targeting Roma mothers and by using the mediators.</p> <p>Vocational training courses.</p> <p>Implementation of programme (Choices) aiming at promotion of social inclusion among children and young people from disadvantaged backgrounds.</p> | <p><i>Measuring the impact of mainstream activities on the situation of Roma children is necessary.</i></p> <p><i>Further attention should be paid to the situation of Roma girls.</i></p> <p><i>Desegregation measures need to be reinforced.</i></p> |
| Employment | <p>Measures focusing mainly on tailored training to facilitate access to employment and to enhance self-employment.</p> | <p><i>The focus needs to be put on an integrated approach and active labour market policies with tailor-made interventions for the Roma. Targeting Roma under the Youth Guarantee should be considered.</i></p> |
| Health | <p>Mobile units of the National Health Service.</p> | <p><i>Further work on monitoring the health outcomes should be considered.</i></p> |
| Housing | <p>Mapping the housing situation of Roma communities in 308 municipalities through a survey.</p> | <p><i>Housing interventions to provide non-discriminatory access of Roma to quality housing should be part of systematic and integrated approach with long-term objective of desegregation.</i></p> |
| Anti-discrimination | <p>Creation of a Consultative Group for Roma communities' integration.</p> <p>Launching of National Study on Roma communities.</p> <p>Programme for Municipal Roma mediators.</p> <p>Awareness raising campaigns.</p> <p>Organisation of first Roma Women seminar.</p> | <p><i>The effective practical enforcement of anti-discrimination law needs to be ensured.</i></p> |
| | KEY STEPS SINCE 2011 | ASSESSMENT |
| Funding | <p>No specific amount has been allocated exclusively for Roma integration. However, Roma inclusion has been supported by national and EU funds under various types of mainstream measures, including social inclusion measures.</p> <p>In the 2007-2013 financial period, Portugal has allocated 6 % (~€ 381 million) of its total ESF budget for integrating disadvantaged people.</p> | <p><i>Further use of existing possibilities under the EU funds to support Roma inclusion should be considered.</i></p> |
| Structural priorities that should be considered | <p><i>Measuring the impact of mainstream policies on Roma people is necessary. An integrated approach, supported by adequate sustainable funding is needed. A constructive dialogue with Roma NGOs and local and regional municipalities as necessary needs to be reinforced.</i></p> | |

Romania

| | KEY STEPS SINCE 2011 | ASSESSMENT |
|------------|--|---|
| Education | <p>Continuation of on-going programmes (second chance education and early childhood education).</p> <p>Increasing use of Romani language in education at all levels (Romani being taught in over 300 schools).</p> <p>Extensive training of Roma mediators (a total of 1,010 school mediators have received training, from which every year 420-460 work in the education system).</p> <p>In higher education, places for young Roma secured in all public universities (564 in 2012-13).</p> <p>Summer kindergartens to prepare Roma children for a successful start in primary school.</p> | <p><i>Initiatives undertaken should be scaled up and secured by adequate and sustainable funding. In particular, programmes aimed at providing access to good quality early childhood education and care and second chance education should be expanded.</i></p> <p><i>Further efforts are needed towards inclusive education and desegregation, including through the enforcement of legislation in place and active desegregation measures. All new measures in education should be carefully assessed and monitored for their potential impact on sustaining segregation.</i></p> <p><i>A comprehensive strategy for early school leaving needs to be put in place, focusing on better access of Roma to quality early childhood education and supporting Roma children to complete primary and secondary education.</i></p> <p><i>Measures need to be taken to ensure paid employment of trained mediators.</i></p> |
| Employment | <p>Mainstream employment policies.</p> <p>Project Romano-Cher ("The House of Roma") attempting to create small cooperative /associative structures.</p> <p>Projects mostly implemented by NGOs providing tailored job search assistance combined with training courses and support for the social economy (several targeted Roma communities).</p> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>While measuring the impact of mainstream policies on Roma remains necessary, more targeted active labour market policies for Roma are needed.</i> • <i>Relevant labour market training to increase employability of Roma should be reinforced.</i> • <i>Using social considerations in public procurement, promoting social enterprises and Roma entrepreneurship, reaching out to private employers, targeting Roma under the Youth Guarantee, training and employing Roma civil servants should be considered.</i> • <i>Fighting and monitoring discrimination in the labour market needs to be ensured.</i> |
| Health | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Health mediators (HM) program. • Implementation of 35 projects funded from the state budget (following an initiative taken by the National Agency for Roma). | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Improving the access of Roma to health insurance coverage should be reinforced.</i> • <i>Measures improving the effective access of Roma to medical services should be taken.</i> • <i>Awareness-raising campaigns about preventive health targeting the Roma should be carried out. Employing Roma mediators could help to facilitate the process.</i> • <i>Training of health professionals should be also considered. Measures to employ trained health professionals should be taken</i> |

| | KEY STEPS SINCE 2011 | ASSESSMENT |
|---|--|--|
| Housing | Mainstream housing policies. | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Housing interventions should be part of the integrated approach with the long-term objective of desegregation, secured by adequate and sustainable funding. Regularisation of Roma settlements as the legal precondition for the construction of basic infrastructure should be prioritised.</i> • <i>Housing conditions and access of Roma to social housing should be reinforced.</i> |
| Anti-discrimination | Awareness raising activities (e.g. project “See me as I am!”), with due consideration to gender aspects. | <p><i>The effective practical enforcement of antidiscrimination law needs to be ensured.</i></p> <p><i>Effective measures should be taken to combat anti-Roma rhetoric and hate speech.</i></p> <p><i>Desegregation measures should be reinforced.</i></p> <p><i>Strong attention needs to be paid to eliminating discriminatory practices in the employment and housing areas.</i></p> |
| | KEY STEPS SINCE 2011 | ASSESSMENT |
| Funding | <p>Roma inclusion has been supported by national and EU funds under various types of mainstream measures, including social inclusion measures as well as under education and employment Priority Axes.</p> <p>In the 2007-2013 financial period, Romania has allocated 11,8% (~€ 433 million) of its total ESF budget for integrating disadvantaged people.</p> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Efficiency and sustainability of measures as well as proper monitoring of their impact should be ensured. Sufficient allocation of European Structural and Investment Funds, including in the specific investment priority for the integration of marginalised communities such as Roma, should be ensured in the 2014-2020 programming period. Furthermore, Roma inclusion should be mainstreamed into all relevant policy areas, including under the thematic objectives on social inclusion, education and employment. In addition, measures to support Roma inclusion should also increasingly rely on national funds. All existing possibilities to support Roma inclusion, including under the European Agricultural Fund for Rural Development (EAFRD) should be considered. Strong cooperation and coordination between the National Roma Contact Point and the authorities responsible for the management of European Structural and Investment Funds is necessary to ensure the successful mobilisation of EU funds for Roma integration, efficiency and sustainability of measures as well as proper monitoring of their impact.</i> |
| Structural priorities that should be considered | <p><i>Implementation and mainstreaming of many legally adopted policies and programs in the field of social inclusion have been delayed, due to a lack of implementation capacity and funding and the absence of strong commitment by public authorities. Mainstream policy reforms particularly in the fields of education, employment, health and housing should contribute to support Roma inclusion. Measures targeting Roma should be carried out within an integrated approach supported by adequate sustainable funding. The monitoring of the impact of these measures should be ensured. Mapping and strengthening the territorial aspects of policy making should focus on the most disadvantaged regions. A constructive dialogue with civil society, as well as close cooperation with local and regional authorities should be ensured.</i></p> | |

Slovak Republic

| | KEY STEPS SINCE 2011 | ASSESSMENT |
|------------|---|--|
| Education | <p>Introduction of premium for teachers teaching in normal classes at primary schools with “individually incorporated disadvantaged pupils”.</p> <p>Pedagogical Guidelines for 2013/2014 explicitly called for the prohibition of all forms of discrimination and segregation.</p> <p>New Recommendations to the Centres of Pedagogical and Psychological Counselling and Prevention to improve diagnosis of school abilities of children from socially disadvantaged environment.</p> <p>All day programmes tested in 200 elementary schools. Building of prefabricated, modular elementary schools where needed.</p> <p>Implementation of programmes towards inclusive education “Investment into Early Childhood – Support of Social Innovations and Integration of the Roma”.</p> <p>Adding of Culture and Roma language and Literature to subjects of the school-leaving exam.</p> | <p><i>In spite of positive incentives a systematic approach combined with effective implementation and proper monitoring are needed to eliminate the enrolment of Roma children from socially disadvantaged environments into special-needs education for mentally impaired pupils.</i></p> <p><i>Ensuring access and promoting participation of Roma children to quality inclusive pre-school education needs to be reinforced.</i></p> <p><i>Alternative options to building new school facilities in predominantly Roma-populated areas (such as providing school bus for children above a certain age) should be considered to avoid segregation.</i></p> <p><i>Reducing secondary school dropout rates, promoting vocational training should be prioritised.</i></p> |
| Employment | <p>Amendment of the Act on Employment Services reforming the active labour market policies.</p> <p>Amendment of the Act on Social insurance facilitating the employment of long-term unemployed by exempting the employers and employees from paying social security and health insurance contributions for 12 months.</p> <p>Amendment of the Act on Assistance in Material Need.</p> <p>Implementation of the social field work projects.</p> | <p><i>Measuring the impact of the amendments of existing law on the situation of marginalised Roma is necessary.</i></p> <p><i>Targeted active labour market policies for Roma focusing on personalised services, and quality training in line with labour market demand should be planned in order to ensure effective integration in the open labour market.</i></p> <p><i>Using social considerations in public procurement, promoting social enterprises and Roma entrepreneurship, reaching out to private employers, targeting Roma under the Youth Guarantee, training and employing Roma civil servants as more efficient alternatives to public work schemes should be considered. Fighting and monitoring discrimination in the labour market needs to be ensured.</i></p> |
| Health | <p>Preventive outreach measures targeting marginalised Roma are solely implemented by the program of health mediators.</p> | <p><i>A more systematic integrated approach with clear measurable targets, a timeframe for implementation, appropriate financial allocation and effective monitoring should be taken. Measures towards healthcare professionals could also be considered.</i></p> |

| | KEY STEPS SINCE 2011 | ASSESSMENT |
|---------------------|---|---|
| Housing | <p>The Housing Development Programme provides grants to villages and towns for the construction of rental flats of normal and lower standard. Within the programme a grant for technical equipment to enhance the socio-cultural level of Roma settlements is provided up to 80% of the acquisition cost.</p> <p>The new Construction Act is being prepared.</p> <p>In order to increase affordability of housing the state offers a housing allowance for those in material need amounting to €55.80 a month for an individual and €89.20 for a household with more than one member.</p> | <p><i>Housing interventions should be part of an integrated approach with the long-term objective of desegregation. An adequate system of supervising and monitoring the construction, maintenance and upgrading of existing low-standard flats should be put in place. Abolishment of informal dwellings in the Roma settlements should be accompanied by adequate accompanying measures</i></p> <p><i>Legalisation of the land as the legal precondition for the construction of basic infrastructure is necessary.</i></p> |
| Anti-discrimination | <p>Amendment of the Antidiscrimination Act which introduces temporary equalising measures (positive action) which can be adopted on the grounds of ethnicity in all areas protected by the Act, i.e. employment, education, healthcare, social security and access to goods and services.</p> <p>Efforts to mainstream antidiscrimination in gender equality policies.</p> <p>Promoting cultural activities.</p> | <p><i>Temporary equalising measures are welcome. However, in order to be effective, they need to be well promoted. The effective practical enforcement of anti-discrimination law needs to be ensured.</i></p> <p><i>Effective measures should also be taken to combat anti-Roma rhetoric and hate speech.</i></p> <p><i>Desegregation measures should be accompanied by awareness-raising activities and appropriate training.</i></p> |

| | KEY STEPS SINCE 2011 | ASSESSMENT |
|---------|--|--|
| Funding | <p>Roma inclusion has been supported by national and EU funds under various types of mainstream measures, including social inclusion measures.</p> <p>In the 2007-2013 financial period, Slovakia has allocated 10,9% (~€ 162 million) of its total ESF budget for integrating disadvantaged people.</p> | <p><i>Sufficient allocation of European Structural and Investment Funds, including in the specific investment priority for the integration of marginalised communities such as should be ensured in the 2014-2020 programming period. Furthermore, Roma inclusion should be mainstreamed into all relevant policy areas, including under the thematic objectives on social inclusion, education and employment.</i></p> <p><i>All existing possibilities to support Roma inclusion, including under the European Agricultural Fund for Rural Development (EAFRD) should be considered.</i></p> <p><i>Strong cooperation and coordination between the National Roma Contact Point and the authorities responsible for the management of European Structural and Investment Funds is necessary to ensure the successful mobilisation of EU funds for Roma inclusion, efficiency and sustainability of measures as well as proper monitoring of their impact.</i></p> |

| | | |
|---|---|--|
| Structural priorities that should be considered | <p><i>Mainstream policy reforms, particularly in the fields of education, employment, health and housing should contribute to support Roma inclusion. Measures targeting Roma should be carried out within an integrated approach supported by adequate sustainable funding. The monitoring of the impact of these measures should be ensured. Mapping and strengthening the territorial aspects of policy making should focus on the most disadvantaged regions. A constructive dialogue with the civil society, as well as close cooperation with local and regional authorities should be ensured. Anti-discrimination campaigns and actions presenting Roma integration as a benefit for everyone should be developed</i></p> | |
|---|---|--|

Slovenia

| | KEY STEPS SINCE 2011 | ASSESSMENT |
|---|--|---|
| Education | Implementation of the programme “Raising social and cultural capital”. | <i>Implementation of the programme has resulted in an increased participation of Roma in early childhood education. Access to high quality inclusive pre-school education could still be further reinforced. Existing efforts to help children overcome language barriers should be maintained and reinforced.</i> |
| Employment | Mainstream measures under active labour market policies. Workshops for life-long career guidance and counselling. | <i>Measuring the impact of mainstream measures and activities undertaken on employment of Roma is necessary. Targeted measures to improve the employability of Roma should be considered. Vocational training among Roma youth could be considered.</i> |
| Health | A series of workshops and projects to promote preventive healthcare with special attention to women and children. | <i>Further attention needs to be paid to ensure the vaccination of all Roma children.</i> |
| Housing | Legalisation of current Roma settlements as the legal precondition for the construction of basic infrastructure. | <i>The on-going process of legalisation of the land is a positive step forward. Housing interventions should be part of an integrated approach with the long-term objective of desegregation.</i> |
| Anti-discrimination | Awareness-raising activities. Training of Roma on their rights. Training of public servants and judiciary. | <i>The effective practical enforcement of anti-discrimination legislation needs to be ensured. A systematic approach to tackle prejudices against the Roma, including working with the media should be developed.</i> |
| | KEY STEPS SINCE 2011 | ASSESSMENT |
| Funding | Roma inclusion has been supported by national and EU funds under various types of mainstream measures, including social inclusion measures. In the 2007–2013 financial period, Slovenia has allocated 5,9 % (~€ 41 million) of its total ESF budget for integrating disadvantaged people. | <i>Further use of existing possibilities under the EU funds to support Roma inclusion should be considered. Strong cooperation and coordination between the National Roma Contact Point and the authorities responsible for the management of EU funds is necessary to ensure efficiency and sustainability of measures as well as proper monitoring of their impact.</i> |
| Structural priorities that should be considered | <i>Mainstream policy reforms particularly in the fields of education, employment, health and housing should contribute to support Roma inclusion. Measures targeting Roma should be carried out within an integrated approach supported by adequate sustainable funding. The monitoring of the impact of these measures should be ensured. A constructive dialogue with the civil society, as well as close cooperation with local and regional authorities should be ensured.</i> | |

Spain

| | KEY STEPS SINCE 2011 | ASSESSMENT |
|------------|---|---|
| Education | <p>A series of specific measures (e.g. granting subsidies to Roma associations or organisations that assist Roma students and activities to develop intercultural education and compilation of school material).</p> <p>Measures addressing vulnerable groups including the Roma, in particular to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - increase their educational opportunities in the first 3 years of primary education (Educa3 Plan) - develop support plans (Programme of Educational Support and Guidance PROA) - reduce early school leaving. <p>Adult schools.</p> | <p><i>Significant progress regarding Roma education has been made.</i></p> <p><i>Further attention needs to be paid to high rates of early school leaving, absenteeism and the lack of continuity in formal education and training. Second chance education could be further encouraged.</i></p> <p><i>The impact of mainstream policies on Roma should be monitored.</i></p> |
| Employment | <p>Reinforcement of Roma targeted programmes (e.g. Acceder) through the reallocation of additional ESF funds.</p> <p>Targeted and mainstream measures included in the National Action Plan for Social Inclusion 2013-2016.</p> <p>Mainstream measures to step up employment of disadvantaged groups, such as the Strategy for Entrepreneurship and Youth Employment 2013-2016.</p> | <p><i>Further attention needs to be paid to ensure access for Roma to mainstream employment programmes.</i></p> <p><i>Effective implementation of the strategy at local level needs to be secured.</i></p> <p><i>Evidence gathering should be more consistently developed to enable measuring progress.</i></p> |
| Health | <p>Development and implementation of mainstream measures with a possible impact on the Roma such as the National Strategy for Health Equality and health measures in the strategic plan on children and young people 2013-2016.</p> <p>Creation of the inter-university Institute supporting the capacity of the national authorities regarding health equality among the Roma.</p> <p>Monitoring and support of the Roma health network gathering 16 NGOs on Roma health (Equi sastipen Network).</p> <p>Preparation for the next national health survey on the Roma.</p> <p>Continued activities from the Spanish Network of Healthy Cities (RECS) targeting disadvantaged groups.</p> <p>Roma targeted measures included in the National Action Plan for Social Inclusion 2013-2016 aimed at facilitating the access to health services for vulnerable groups.</p> | <p><i>Positive steps forward have been made, both via mainstream measures and targeted activities to improve the Roma health situation.</i></p> <p><i>More targeted programmes, including preventive healthcare, could be developed.</i></p> |

| | KEY STEPS SINCE 2011 | ASSESSMENT |
|---------------------|--|---|
| Housing | <p>Adoption of a number of mainstream measures expected to have an impact on the Roma, in particular the State Plan for the Promotion of Rental, Rehabilitation, Urban Regeneration and Renovation 2013-1016 and the related Law of June 2013.</p> <p>Various housing initiatives taken at the regional and municipal levels (e.g. Andalusia, Catalonia).</p> | <p><i>Mainstream measures have been adopted with a possible impact on the Roma. Further attention needs to be paid to the situation of Roma in illegal settlements.</i></p> <p><i>The impact of measures and progress should be monitored.</i></p> |
| Anti-discrimination | <p>Comprehensive Strategy against Racism, Racial Discrimination, Xenophobia and other related forms of Intolerance.</p> <p>Training among security forces and creation of the Platform for the Police and management of diversity.</p> <p>Re-launch of the centres assisting victims of discrimination. Annual report on discrimination and the Roma population.</p> <p>Awareness-raising activities (funded by the government and carried out by NGOs; Dosta! Campaign; etc.).</p> <p>Hate attorneys in 50 Provinces.</p> | <p><i>The effective practical enforcement of anti-discrimination legislation needs to be ensured.</i></p> <p><i>Additional activities aimed at fighting prejudices in the media and addressing multiple discriminations should be undertaken.</i></p> |

| | KEY STEPS SINCE 2011 | ASSESSMENT |
|---------|---|--|
| Funding | <p>Roma inclusion has been supported by national and EU funds under various types of mainstream measures, including social inclusion measures.</p> <p>In the 2007-2013 financial period, Spain has allocated 6,7 % (~€ 536 million) of its total ESF budget for integrating disadvantaged people.</p> | <p><i>Further use of existing possibilities under the EU funds to support Roma inclusion, should be considered. The European Regional Development Fund could be further mobilised to develop housing solutions for Roma.</i></p> |

| | | |
|---|---|--|
| Structural priorities that should be considered | <p><i>Efforts need to be maintained to ensure the effective implementation of the National Roma Integration Strategy. The conclusions from the 2013 internal evaluation of the Action Plan (including strengthening data collection and improving coordination and governance) should be followed-up.</i></p> | |
|---|---|--|

Sweden

| | KEY STEPS SINCE 2011 | ASSESSMENT |
|------------|---|--|
| Education | <p>Government program initiated to allow all Roma children to receive education in Romani language; development of teaching materials in Romani language.</p> <p>Mapping the situation of Roma children in school and pre-school and training mediators in five pilot municipalities ("bridge-builders" programme).</p> <p>Production of teaching supplement about national minorities with special focus on Roma distributed in schools.</p> | <p><i>Steps have been taken in order to assess the situation of Roma children in school and to provide teaching on the Romani language. The provision of teaching on the Romani language should be accompanied by the allocation of appropriate funding and administrative capacity. Evidence gathering should be further developed to enable measuring the impact of mainstream measures and activities undertaken on the Roma.</i></p> <p><i>Prioritising further efforts on promoting vocational training and increasing participation in secondary and tertiary education would be relevant. Awareness raising campaigns among Roma (in particular focusing on parents) are also needed.</i></p> |
| Employment | <p>Mapping the situation of Roma employment in five pilot municipalities ("bridge-builders" programme)</p> <p>Focus on training Roma women so as to step up their employability.</p> | <p><i>Steps have been taken in order to assess the situation of Roma employment; adult vocational training possibilities have also been provided. However, evidence gathering should be further developed to enable measuring the impact of mainstream measures and activities undertaken on the Roma.</i></p> <p><i>Reaching out to private employers (via antidiscrimination campaign, or fiscal incentives) to support employment of Roma could be considered.</i></p> |
| Health | <p>Roma mediators within healthcare services (with special focus on Roma women and girls).</p> <p>Various programs: to assess the situation of Roma women, dedicated to reproductive health with particular attention on Roma girls or on health communicators.</p> | <p><i>Important progress in the attention paid to Roma health and to women's rights.</i></p> <p><i>More awareness-raising campaigns on healthcare issues targeting Roma mothers, girls and youth would be necessary.</i></p> |
| Housing | <p>Mapping the situation of Roma housing in five pilot municipalities ("bridge-builders" programme).</p> | <p><i>Access of Roma to social housing could be supported by EU funds in a more extensive manner.</i></p> <p><i>Attention needs to be paid to eliminating discriminatory practices in the property market.</i></p> |

| | KEY STEPS SINCE 2011 | ASSESSMENT |
|---------------------|--|--|
| Anti-discrimination | <p>Report from the Equality Ombudsman on discrimination of Roma.</p> <p>Awareness-raising activities (including for Roma victims on their rights and possibilities of seeking redress) and promotion of inter-cultural dialogue between Roma and non-Roma.</p> | <p><i>As highlighted in the Swedish Ombudsman's report, ensuring equality and non-discriminatory practices, in particular on the property market, is still a challenge. The effective practical enforcement of discrimination legislation needs to be effectively ensured.</i></p> |

| | KEY STEPS SINCE 2011 | ASSESSMENT |
|---------|---|--|
| Funding | <p>Roma inclusion has been supported by national and EU funds under various types of mainstream measures, including social inclusion measures.</p> <p>In the 2007-2013 financial period, Sweden has allocated 3,4 % (~€ 23 million) of its total ESF budget for integrating disadvantaged people.</p> | <p><i>Further use of existing possibilities under the EU funds to support Roma inclusion should be considered.</i></p> |

| | | |
|---|--|--|
| Structural priorities that should be considered | <p><i>A constructive dialogue with civil society and close cooperation with local and regional authorities need to be reinforced. Measuring the impact of mainstreaming measures and activities for Roma should be considered.</i></p> | |
|---|--|--|

United Kingdom

| | KEY STEPS SINCE 2011 | ASSESSMENT |
|------------|--|---|
| Education | <p>A number of provisions for Roma: Roma educational support programme, Roma education welfare officer, support for the purchase of the school uniform, inclusion and diversity service and newcomer scheme- and Travellers (Northern Ireland).</p> <p>Annual Welsh specific Grant for the Education of gypsy and Traveller children (Wales).</p> <p>Foreseen seminar and online curriculum on Roma culture (Wales).</p> | <p><i>Various mainstream and targeted measures have been taken. Monitoring their impact should be ensured.</i></p> |
| Employment | <p>A Government strategy for increasing ethnic minority employment and participation in the labour market based on mainstream measures through locally delivered flexible provisions.</p> | <p><i>Monitoring the impact of mainstream measures and activities undertaken on Roma should be considered.</i></p> |
| Health | <p>Roma health project and health mediators, and regional minority ethnic health and social wellbeing steering group;</p> <p>a number of measures for Travellers: a strategy for improving Traveller health and wellbeing, dedicated health support staff and many projects (Traveller health improvement programme, Traveller health DVD, etc.) (Northern Ireland).</p> <p>Revision of health and homelessness standards; plans to publish guidance for healthcare providers (Wales).</p> <p>Access for newly arrived Roma communities to the national health services, including with the help of Roma women health mediators (Yorkshire).</p> | <p><i>Initiatives targeting the needs of newly arrived Roma communities should be continued.</i></p> <p><i>Monitoring the impact of mainstream measures and activities undertaken on Roma should be considered.</i></p> |
| Housing | <p>Mediation on housing issues from Roma advocates (Northern Ireland).</p> <p>Traveller Accommodation Programme (revised annually) (Northern Ireland).</p> <p>Implementation of the Mobile Homes Act on travellers' sites (Wales).</p> <p>Proposal for a statutory duty upon local authorities to provide Traveller sites where there is a need and support for the development of new sites (Wales).</p> <p>Housing strategy with the help of EU funds (Scotland).</p> | <p><i>Halting sites for Gypsies and Travellers and housing for Roma remain a challenge all over the UK. Housing initiatives should be scaled up and implemented as part of an integrated approach.</i></p> |

| | KEY STEPS SINCE 2011 | ASSESSMENT |
|---------------------|---|--|
| Anti-discrimination | <p>Comprehensive study on hate crime (launched by the University of Leicester, it will include attention to potential and actual victims of hate crime, community groups, including Roma, police, local authorities, non-governmental organisations).</p> <p>Awareness raising activities and promotion of inter-cultural dialogue.</p> | <p><i>Hostile attitudes and negative stereotyping of Gypsies and Travellers and newly arrived Roma should be carefully addressed.</i></p> <p><i>Effective measures should be taken to combat anti-Roma rhetoric and hate speech.</i></p> |

| | KEY STEPS SINCE 2011 | ASSESSMENT |
|---------|--|--|
| Funding | <p>No specific amount has been allocated exclusively for Roma integration. However, Roma inclusion has been supported by national and EU funds under various types of mainstream measures, including social inclusion measures.</p> <p>In the 2007-2013 financial period, the United Kingdom has allocated 24,2 % (~€ 1 082 million) of its total ESF budget for integrating disadvantaged people.</p> | <p><i>Further use of existing possibilities under the EU funds to support Roma inclusion should be considered.</i></p> |

| | | |
|---|---|--|
| Structural priorities that should be considered | <p><i>Monitoring the impact of mainstream measures and activities undertaken on Roma should be considered. Dialogue between Travellers and Gypsies and local and regional authorities should be reinforced.</i></p> | |
|---|---|--|

