

SET ESSN Task Force Meeting minutes

AGENDA	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Welcome and review of action points from the previous meeting 2. Updates on ESSN implementation nationwide and in SET 3. Presentation of findings of the ESSN PDM and the ESSN Q1-2018 Monitoring Reports 4. AOB
Time & Date	10 May 2018, 9.30-11.00am
Location	UNHCR, Gaziantep
Chairs	Hanifi Kinaci (TRC), Bahodur Umarov (WFP)
Participants	Bulent Ozturk (TRC), Bekir Halhalli (Concern), Chris Bender (UNHCR), Defne Murt (DRC), Gunes Alpan (Care), Hilary Bowman (UNHCR), Mohammad Bakkar (Watan), Melisa Gunduz (AAR Japan), Mohammad Khalil Haji Yousef (WHH), Obada Kahil (WHH), Yakup Kose (TRC), Zeynel Dogan (TRC)

1. Welcome and review of action points from the previous meeting

- Chairs welcomed participants and after a quick tour de table the action points from the previous meeting were reviewed as per below:

Action point	Status
WFP/TRC to follow-up regarding the 100 days of continuation of the SGK record after completion of the short-term work permit and its influence to ESSN entitlement.	Pending response from the Ministry
WFP/TRC to check the possibility of obtaining the total number of Syrians who are cut from SASF support at district/provincial levels.	Pending response from the Ministry
WFP to present the findings from the most recent PDMs at the next TF meeting.	On Agenda
TRC to share the risk assessment form used during the screening visits.	Pending feedback from CCTE team
To check on the possibility to include the total number of applications and ineligibility rates among other nationalities to TF presentations	Pending

2. General update on the ESSN and update on ESSN implementation in SET

- TRC and WFP provided the following update on ESSN implementation:
 - According to the data received from the MoFSP as of 07 May 2018, **1,362,578 individuals** countrywide have been deemed eligible to benefit from the ESSN. The inclusion rate remains at the range of 53%.
 - The number of cards uploaded for April payment reached 223,408, with 9028 new cards distributed nationwide.

10 May 2018, 9:30-11.00am, UNHCR, Gaziantep

- ESSN applications in SET (as of 7 May): Gaziantep is hosting the highest number of eligible beneficiaries in SET (159,795 individuals), followed by Sanliurfa, Hatay, Adana, and Mersin. At the district level Sahinbey received 26,411 applications in total, which is the highest number in SET.
- For more information on implementation of ESSN both nation-wide and in SET in April, please refer to attached presentation.
- Chairs announced that effective from April Ziraatbank and Vakifbank do not apply commission fees for TRC cards when withdrawing cash from their ATMs.

3. Presentation of findings of the ESSN PDM and the ESSN Q1-2018 Monitoring Reports

- WFP M&E unit presented findings of the recent ESSN PDM/CVME exercise. Both the CVME (Comprehensive Vulnerability Mapping Exercise) and PDM (Post-Distribution Monitoring) are run in parallel to collect necessary information on impacts of the programme, being the first a tool to collect data remotely (i.e. via call center), and the latter as complementary exercise to collect additional/supplementary data.
- The current presentation is a snapshot of the findings. The World Bank is conducting **Propensity Score Matching** (PSM), which will illustrate the real measure of impact. Results will be updated once PSM is complete. The baseline (PAB) data was collected on February/March, 2017; and the presentation provides findings of two rounds of both CVME and PDMs.
- Findings show that the percentage of refugees living under extreme poverty (with the income less than 165TL/person/month), who deemed as ineligible decreased from 7% to 4% since the PAB. The same figure for refugees living under poverty line (284 TL/person/month) decreased from 23% to 15%. Results also indicate that after the transfers the poverty rate of eligible respondents has fallen more than ineligibles (from 20.76% to 11.71% under extreme poverty). Analyses of the arrival profiles shows that the rate of non-applicant among new arrivals (within the last 6 months) is higher in CVME second round (27%).
- The lack of DGMM registration remains the main reason of not applying for the ESSN, though it reduced to 13% compared to CVME 1 data. In contrast, the lack of address registration (Nufus) as a reason for non-applicant increased from 13 to 16%. Finding support a positive school attendance trend of ESSN beneficiaries' children, though the absence from school of boys in female headed households remains significantly high.
- Comparison of food consumption shows that beneficiaries have increased consumption of all food groups from PAB to PDM, demonstrating highest increases in vegetables and egg, meat and fish. Although both eligible and ineligible respondents have increased acceptable food consumption, beneficiaries have larger increase (12% in total in contrast to 6% of non-beneficiaries). The same trend is observed for consumption and livelihoods coping strategy indexes (namely rCSI, LCSi) and application of stress, crisis and emergency strategies.
- According to findings, both beneficiaries and non-beneficiaries have decreased debt in the last three months, however the decrease for beneficiaries is significantly high (6%). The total household debt has decreased for beneficiaries from average of 750 TL (PAB) to 350 TL (PDM2), while remained almost the same for non-beneficiaries (around 700 TL).
- The satisfaction rate with the quantity of the amount of assistance remains at 70% range, however almost half of respondents declare that it is not sufficient to meet HHs basic needs.
- TRC presented the findings of the Q1/2018 monitoring activities. WFP and TRC completed 61 Focus Group Discussions (FGD) across 20 provinces, with participation of over 600 eligible and ineligible refugees. In Q1 2018, WFP/TRC field teams conducted a total of 1,290 visits to 331 SASF offices, 116 Halkbank branches and 11 TRC Service Centers in 63 provinces of Turkey.

- By the end of March 2018, **9,374 cases** had been referred to TRC's newly formed ESSN Outreach teams from multiple sources including TRC Service Centres, TRC Call Centre, WFP/TRC field teams, TRC branches, and NGOs. For further details please refer to presentation of findings of the ESSN PDM and the ESSN Q1-2018 Monitoring Reports.
- Partners asked whether the results will propose to change quarterly top-ups based on geographical regions. WFP/TRC explained that it will be difficult to practically apply such an approach considering frequent changes of residence locations by beneficiaries. At the same time the third round of both CVME and PDM will have an additional focus on respondents living in rural areas. The CVME results also informed setting the vulnerability criteria for SASF allowances, which is currently being piloted in some provinces.
- TRC informed partners that based on agreement with Facebook office in Turkey, the ESSN programme is granted free of charge Facebook Ads (advertisement), which will allow wider outreach via the social media channel.
- Partners were interested about the current stage regarding payments of disability allowances and the duration of the funding. WFP/TRC pointed out that necessary arrangements are still being implemented to start both disability and SASF allowances and the first payments are expected to be released within upcoming months. It was also mentioned that the current funding agreement was signed for a period of one year.

ACTION POINTS:

- Chairs to share the PDM/CVME presentation with members. **Deadline: 18 May.**

4. AOB

- Chairs announced that a Focus Group Discussion with FSA WG, BN WG and ESSN TF members will be held on Thursday, 17 May between 9:30-11:00 within the frames of Lessons Learned Exercise (LLE) of the ESSN Task Force, which will be conducted by external evaluators to assess the role of the ESSN Task Force in how it has coordinated the ESSN programme in Turkey.
- **Next Meeting: 11 June 2018**