

**Refugee Review Tribunal  
AUSTRALIA**

**RRT RESEARCH RESPONSE**

**Research Response Number:** PAK33343  
**Country:** Pakistan  
**Date:** 27 May 2008

Keywords: Pakistan – Ethnic Bengalis – Daily wage – Cost of living – Corruption

This response was prepared by the Research & Information Services Section of the Refugee Review Tribunal (RRT) after researching publicly accessible information currently available to the RRT within time constraints. This response is not, and does not purport to be, conclusive as to the merit of any particular claim to refugee status or asylum. This research response may not, under any circumstance, be cited in a decision or any other document. Anyone wishing to use this information may only cite the primary source material contained herein.

---

**Questions**

- 1. Please advise of the treatment of Bengalis generally, and in particular pre-1971 Bengalis by police, authorities and private individuals in the rest of Pakistan (outside Karachi) and in particular Lahore and Islamabad.**
- 2. Please advise of the daily wage as indicated by UNDP in Pakistan.**
- 3. Please provide information on the influence of connections and money in Pakistan.**

**RESPONSE**

- 1. Please advise of the treatment of Bengalis generally, and in particular pre-partition Bengalis by police, authorities and private individuals in the rest of Pakistan (outside Karachi) and in particular Lahore and Islamabad.**

A review of source information relevant to the question of the treatment of Bengalis in Pakistan in areas other than Karachi is presented below under the following sub-headings: [\*Current Treatment of Ethnic Bengalis in Pakistan\*](#), [\*Background on Treatment of Ethnic Bengalis in Pakistan\*](#), [\*Ethnic Bengali Population in Pakistan\*](#), and [\*Pre-1971 Bengali Communities in Pakistan\*](#).

**Current Treatment of Ethnic Bengalis in Pakistan**

Extensive searches were conducted for information on the treatment of ethnic Bengalis in areas of Pakistan other than Karachi, with specific focus given to Lahore and Islamabad. [A list of sources](#) consulted is provided at the end of this research response.

No comprehensive information was found which specifically addressed the current treatment of ethnic Bengalis in areas of Pakistan other than Karachi by police, government authorities or private individuals. Searches for information of this kind were conducted in recent US Department of State reports, UK Home Office reports, and material produced by IRB

Canada, Amnesty International, and Human Rights Watch; no such information could be found.

Information was located in other sources to suggest the possibility that the registration program for illegal immigrants conducted by Pakistan's National Aliens Registration Authority (NARA) may be applied to ethnic Bengalis living in areas of Pakistan other than Karachi. A 2004 article published on the OneWorld South Asia website made brief reference to comments on NARA's registration program by a man living in Lahore, with the context of the quotation implying the man was a Bengali resident of that city:

LAHORE, Feb 10 (OneWorld) – As Pakistani authorities stand accused of harassment and torture of illegal immigrants – who number more than 3.3 million – a decision by nodal body – the National Aliens Registration Authority (NARA) – to register all such persons and send their details to the police and home departments is being viewed with mistrust.

One third of so-called aliens in the country comprise Bengalis and most of them live in the southern port city of Karachi.

...the Bengalis are a frightened and traumatized lot. Says 35-year-old Shafiqur Rehman, a Bengali immigrant working in the fishing industry, "I have been in Karachi for several years. The police are a major problem as they extort money and those of us who can't pay are tortured and kept in illegal confinement."

Rehman has applied for the alien registration card as he believes it will give him legal status like other Pakistani citizens. "I don't know whether the police and other agencies will value this card but I see no harm in getting it made. I hope the card will save me from further harassment," he says.

Social activist Mehboob Ahmad echoes those fears. "Harassment is a tool used by law enforcement agencies to force illegal immigrants to get themselves registered with the authority. The aliens do not want to register themselves with NARA, as they believe it would increase their problems," he points out.

Ahmad believes launching a crackdown against the aliens isn't the real solution. "There is a need to get them to register and to inform them of its advantages. Otherwise the whole exercise would be a futile one," he argues.

**The main hitch is the immigrants' fear that after registration they will be deported to their country of origin. "I will never apply for the card. It is a conspiracy against us because once we get ourselves registered with NARA, Pakistan will deport us," says Saleemur Rehman, who runs a barber shop in the eastern city of Lahore.**

**Such fears are not unfounded as NARA sources say the Pakistani government is considering repatriation of those Bengali-speaking people who have acquired alien registration cards by admitting they are Bangladeshi nationals [my emphasis].**

Sources say the government has authorized a representative of the Interior Ministry and top ranking NARA officials to hold negotiations with Bangladesh diplomats in this connection (Khan, Ahmad Naeem 2004, 'Illegal Immigrants Fear Registration Means Exit in Pakistan', OneWorld South Asia website, 10 February

<http://southasia.oneworld.net/article/view/78856/1/> – Accessed 21 May 2008 – Attachment 1).

Previous *RRT Research Response PAK32916* referred to various sources regarding the activities of the National Aliens Registration Authority (NARA) in Pakistan, including reports which indicated that ethnic Bengalis in Karachi had been the focus of government initiatives to register illegal immigrants in Pakistan (RRT Research & Information 2008, *Research Response PAK32916*, 20 February – Attachment 3). No specific information was found regarding the practical implementation of NARA's program, or the actions of police or other authorities, with regard to Bengalis living in areas of Pakistan other than Karachi. Information was not located to exclude the possibility that this program, and its effects, could be extended to ethnic Bengalis living elsewhere in Pakistan

Sources indicated that while NARA had focused on Bengalis in Karachi, it had a nation-wide mandate to register illegal immigrants in Pakistan. A 2005 paper by Haris Gazdar on Karachi noted that "although NARA's mandate covers the whole country its operations are mostly limited to Karachi" (Gazdar, Haris 2005, 'Karachi, Pakistan: Between Regulation And Regularisation', in *International Migrants and the City* ed. M. Balbo, UN-Habitat, Venice, p. 166, *Miurbal* website [http://www.miurbal.net/documents/p001\\_International%20Migrants%20and%20the%20City.pdf](http://www.miurbal.net/documents/p001_International%20Migrants%20and%20the%20City.pdf) – Accessed 12 February 2008 – Attachment 2).

Writing with reference to the situation in Karachi, the same 2005 paper provided information to indicate that ethnic Bengalis may be negatively affected by NARA's activities, including those whose residence dates prior to 1971. According to this source "NARA officially declares all ethnic Bengalis as irregular migrants – regardless of their length of stay, or the fact that they might have arrived in West Pakistan as Pakistani citizens prior to the secession of East Pakistan". It concludes that "Bengalis as a group...have been disenfranchised, regardless of individual status, on the basis of race and ethnicity by official fiat". The same source also connected the activities of NARA, and the concomitant uncertain status of ethnic Bengalis in Karachi, to police harassment of the ethnic Bengali community:

NARA has had other consequences for ethnic Bengali and Burmese migrants in Karachi. Police squads specially created to enforce NARA regulations have gained powers of detention of suspected irregular migrants. Bengali and Burmese residents complain that these police units randomly arrest people and charge them with being irregular migrants. Such a course of action is of a racist nature, too, since it relies on identifying Bengali and Burmese individuals on the basis of appearance, language and accent...Many complain that police officers use their special powers of arrest not in the pursuit of national policy but in a bid to extract bribes from ethnic Bengali and Burmese people (Gazdar, Haris 2005, 'Karachi, Pakistan: Between Regulation And Regularisation', in *International Migrants and the City* ed. M. Balbo, UN-Habitat, Venice, pp. 169, 181, 170, *Miurbal* website [http://www.miurbal.net/documents/p001\\_International%20Migrants%20and%20the%20City.pdf](http://www.miurbal.net/documents/p001_International%20Migrants%20and%20the%20City.pdf) – Accessed 12 February 2008 – Attachment 2).

As noted in the background to this request, previous *RRT Research Response PAK32916* also referred to various local media reports of claims that the Bengali community had been subject to police harassment and violence in Karachi (RRT Research & Information 2008, *Research Response PAK32916*, 20 February – Attachment 3).

### **Background on Treatment of Ethnic Bengalis in Pakistan**

Previous *RRT Research Response PAK32916* referred to various sources on general attitudes to ethnic Bengalis in Pakistan (see pages 16-17 of RRT Research & Information 2008, *Research Response PAK32916*, 20 February – Attachment 3).

Specific information was located to indicate that in the wake of the creation of the state of Bangladesh in 1971 in the former territory of East Pakistan, ethnic Bengalis still residing in (West) Pakistan were subject to detention and restrictions on civil rights. An article published by *Time* in 1973 indicated that in 1971, ethnic Bengalis in Islamabad had been rounded up and detained in internment camps, and that many had lost their jobs ('The Forgotten Hostages of Peace' 1973, *Time* website, 21 May <http://www.time.com/time/printout/0,8816,907283,00.html> – Accessed 21 May 2008 – Attachment 4).

An undated article by Syed Sikander Mehdi provides a general summary of the marginal situation of the ethnic Bengali community in Pakistan after of the establishment of the state of Bangladesh in 1971 (Mehdi, Syed Sikander (Undated), 'Pakistan : Conflict, Migration and Peace', Irenees website <http://www.irenees.net/fr/fiches/analyse/fiche-analyse-648.html> – Accessed 19 May 2008 – Attachment 5).

### **Ethnic Bengali Population in Pakistan**

Extensive searches were conducted for information on the current existence of ethnic Bengali communities in areas of Pakistan other than Karachi, with specific attention given to Lahore and Islamabad. [A list of sources consulted](#) is provided at the end of this research response. No information was found which explicitly addressed the subject or question of whether ethnic Bengali communities currently living in areas of Pakistan other than Karachi.

A 2004 article published on the OneWorld South Asia website referred to the situation of a man who seemed to be referred to as an ethnic Bengali living and working in Lahore (Khan, Ahmad Naeem 2004, 'Illegal Immigrants Fear Registration Means Exit in Pakistan', OneWorld South Asia website, 10 February <http://southasia.oneworld.net/article/view/78856/1/> – Accessed 21 May 2008 – Attachment 1). Aside from this source, no definitive information was located either to establish that significant localized communities of ethnic Bengalis currently exist in areas of Pakistan other than Karachi, or to exclude this possibility.

Previous *RRT Research Response PAK32916* referred to various sources which indicated that there is a significant population of ethnic Bengalis living in Karachi, and that this population accounts for the majority of the current ethnic Bengali population of Pakistan (RRT Research & Information 2008, *Research Response PAK32916*, 20 February – Attachment 3; Mansoor, Hasan 2003, 'Illegal Lives' *Himal South Asian* website <http://www.himalmag.com/2003/july/report.htm> – Accessed 12 February 2008 – Attachment 6; 'Crackdown on aliens planned' 2003, *Dawn* website, 5 August <http://www.dawn.com/2003/08/05/local22.htm> – Accessed 15 February 2008 – Attachment 7).

### **Pre-1971 Bengali Communities in Pakistan**

Sources were located which indicated that prior to 1971, ethnic Bengali communities existed in Karachi, Lahore, Islamabad, and other areas of Pakistan, with the majority of the Bengali population centered in Karachi (Mehdi, Syed Sikander (Undated), 'Pakistan : Conflict, Migration and Peace', Irenees website <http://www.irenees.net/fr/fiches/analyse/fiche-analyse-648.html> – Accessed 19 May 2008 – Attachment 5; 'The Forgotten Hostages of Peace' 1973, *Time* website, 21 May <http://www.time.com/time/printout/0,8816,907283,00.html> – Accessed

21 May 2008 – Attachment 4; Schanberg, Sydney 1971, ‘Bengalis held in Pakistan long for home’ *New York Times*, 18 March – Attachment 10).

A UNHCR publication from 2000 indicated that UNHCR was instrumental in transporting at least 116,000 ethnic Bengalis from Pakistan to Bangladesh in 1973 and 1974, in the wake of the 1971 creation of the state of Bangladesh (‘Rupture in South Asia’ 2000, in *The State of the World’s Refugees 2000: Fifty Years of Humanitarian Action*, ed. Mark Cutts, UNHCR, Oxford University Press, pp. 71, UNHCR website <http://www.unhcr.org/publ/PUBL/3ebf9bab0.pdf> – Accessed 22 May 2008 – Attachment 11).

Various estimates were located regarding the number of ethnic Bengalis living in West Pakistan around the time of the creation of the state of Bangladesh in December 1971, ranging from 180,000 to 400,000 persons. No authoritative figure was located (for various estimates see Stateless People In Bangladesh Inc. 2006 ‘Stateless In Bangladesh & Pakistan: Generations Of Oppressed’, *The South Asian* website <http://www.thesouthasian.org/archives/archives/2006/StatelessinBangladesh-GenerationsofOppressedV1.1.pdf> – Accessed 22 May 2008 – Attachment 8; Trumbull, Robert 1972, ‘Dacca fears for Bengalis in Pakistan’, *New York Times*, 17 April – Attachment 9; ‘The Forgotten Hostages of Peace’ 1973, *Time* website, 21 May <http://www.time.com/time/printout/0,8816,907283,00.html> – Accessed 21 May 2008 – Attachment 4).

A definitive figure on the number of ethnic Bengalis remaining in Pakistan after the independence of Bangladesh in 1971 was not located. A 2003 article published by *Himal South Asian* quoted an estimate by a Pakistani official which indicated that less than 25,000 ethnic Bengalis chose to remain in Pakistan after Bangladesh’s independence:

After Bangladesh’s war of independence, fewer than 25,000 Bengalis opted to remain in Pakistan, according to NARA director general Shaikh, while most of the rest migrated to the former eastern wing (Mansoor, Hasan 2003, ‘Illegal Lives’ *Himal South Asian* website <http://www.himalmag.com/2003/july/report.htm> – Accessed 12 February 2008 – Attachment 6).

A 2003 article published on the *Asia Times Online* website estimated that “After Bangladesh became independent in 1971, the total Bengali-speaking population of Karachi came down to an estimated 10,000” (Raman, B. 2003, ‘The case for more fences’, *Asia Times Online* website, 6 February [http://www.atimes.com/atimes/South\\_Asia/EB06Df03.html](http://www.atimes.com/atimes/South_Asia/EB06Df03.html) – Accessed 14 February 2008 – Attachment 12).

## **2. Please advise of the daily wage as indicated by UNDP in Pakistan.**

A simple indicator of the current daily wage in Pakistan was not located on the United Nations Development Programme website. Information was located from various sources on average income in Pakistan, and on the cost of living in recent years. A review of source information is presented below under the following sub-headings: [Exchange Rate](#), [Average Income and Cost of Living](#), and [Information on Bengali Community](#).

### **Exchange Rate**

A currency exchange query performed on the XE.com website (<http://www.xe.com/>) on 20 May 2008 indicated that on that date, US\$1 bought 68.42 Pakistan Rupees (‘Exchange Rate:

U.S. Dollar to Pakistan Rupee' 2008, XE.com website, 20 May  
<http://www.xe.com/ucc/convert.cgi> – Accessed 20 May 2008 – Attachment 13).

With regard to the historical exchange rate for the Pakistan Rupee, the CIA World Factbook indicates that since 2003, the Pakistan Rupee has been losing value against the US Dollar:

Pakistani rupees per US dollar – 60.6295 (2007), 60.35 (2006), 59.515 (2005), 58.258 (2004), 57.752 (2003) ('CIA World Factbook: Pakistan' 2008, CIA website, <https://www.cia.gov/library/publications/the-world-factbook/print/pk.html> – Accessed 20 May 2008 – Attachment 14).

### **Average Income and Cost of Living**

A March 2007 article published by Pakistan news source the *Daily Times* estimated that “the average income of the common man in Pakistan...is around Rs 3,000-5,000 per month” (Farooqi, Bilal 2007, 'Property prices overvalued: survey', *Daily Times*, 24 March [http://www.dailytimes.com.pk/default.asp?page=2007%5C03%5C24%5Cstory\\_24-3-2007\\_pg5\\_13](http://www.dailytimes.com.pk/default.asp?page=2007%5C03%5C24%5Cstory_24-3-2007_pg5_13) – Accessed 19 May 2008 – Attachment 15).

Information regarding average incomes and cost of living in Pakistan was located on the website of the Government of Pakistan Bureau of Statistics. Information in the *Household Integrated Economic Survey (HIES) 2005-2006* places the average monthly household income in 2005-2006 in Pakistan at 12,326 Pakistan Rupees, and indicates that the average number of employed persons per household was 2.07. The same document reported an average per capita monthly consumption expenditure of 1,518 Pakistan Rupees (Pakistan Federal Bureau of Statistics 2007, *Household Integrated Economic Survey (HIES) 2005-2006*, Pakistan Federal Bureau of Statistics website, p.6,4, 5 [http://www.statpak.gov.pk/depts/fbs/statistics/hies05\\_06/complete.pdf](http://www.statpak.gov.pk/depts/fbs/statistics/hies05_06/complete.pdf) – Accessed 20 May 2008 – Attachment 16).

Information on wages earned by workers in a variety of different occupations in Pakistan from 1997 to 2006 was located on the International Labour Organisation website. Extensive information of wages for different occupations can be viewed in Attachment 17 ('Pakistan: Occupational wages and hours of work (1997 – 2006)' 2008, International Labour Organisation website, <http://laborsta.ilo.org/cgi-bin/brokerv8.exe> – Accessed 20 May 2008 – Attachment 17).

The *Pakistan Statistical Yearbook 2007*, published by the Pakistan Federal Bureau of Statistics, provides information on the cost of basic foodstuffs and other items to 2006; for details see Attachment 18 (Pakistan Federal Bureau of Statistics 2007, '17.6: Average Retail Prices of Basic Articles', in *Pakistan Statistical Yearbook 2007*, Pakistan Federal Bureau of Statistics website <http://www.statpak.gov.pk/depts/fbs/publications/yearbook2007/price/17.6.pdf> – Accessed 20 May 2008 – Attachment 18).

Information was located to suggest that since 2006, increases in food prices in Pakistan may have contributed to a rise in the cost of living. An article published on the IRIN website in January 2008 referred to an unreleased World Food Programme report which indicated that the per capita income was less than US\$100 per month in a majority of districts with urban populations:

Rising food prices and low purchasing power are leading to increased food insecurity in Pakistan's growing cities and towns, where some 35 percent of the country's over 160 million inhabitants now live.

According to a soon to be released report by the UN World Food Programme (WFP), of the 56 million people living in Pakistan's urban areas, about 21 million are now deemed food insecure

..."Purchasing power in many areas is low," WFP's Haq said. "Even if the food is there, if they don't have the purchasing power they can't afford to buy it."

In 78 percent of the country's districts with urban populations, per capita income was below US\$100 a month, the report noted ('Pakistan: Urban food security deteriorating – WFP study' 2008, *IRIN* website, 8 January <http://www.irinnews.org/report.aspx?ReportID=76138> – Accessed 20 May 2008 – Attachment 19).

An article published on the *Reuters* news website on 4 April 2008 indicated that there had been a significant recent increase in food prices in Pakistan which had affected the cost of living:

Nearly half of Pakistan's 160 million people are at risk of going short of food due to a surge in prices, the World Food Programme said on Friday.

...Sahib Haq, an official with the WFP's Vulnerability Analysis & Mapping Unit in Pakistan, said food prices rose at least 35 percent in the past year compared with an 18 percent rise in minimum wages.

"There is a very big gap between the increase in prices and increase in wages ... the purchasing power of the poor has gone down by almost 50 percent," Haq said.

...The consumer price index, a key indicator of inflation, rose 11.25 percent in February from a year ago, mainly due to food prices (Augustine, Anthony 2008, 'Nearly half of Pakistanis "food insecure" – WFP', *Reuters*, 4 April <http://www.reuters.com/article/latestCrisis/idUSISL192209> – Accessed 20 May 2008 – Attachment 20).

### **Information on Bengali Community**

A 2004 report published by the International Labour Organisation Information contains information regarding the economic situation and activities of the Bengali community in Karachi which may be of interest:

There is a vast migrant Bengali population in Karachi. Its communities can be found in Rehmanabad (near Aisha Manzil), Machhar Colony, Landhi area, Korangi area, Orangi Town and Moosa Colony. While men work in the garment and textile factories, hold jobs in construction and fishing, do daily-wage labour, some also work in domestic service. In particular, Bengali men who are in Pakistan with no families, often with wives and children at home in Bangladesh, find work as cooks. Women also work in the garment factories and as domestic servants.

...The Bengali community in Karachi is particularly vulnerable to harassment by the authorities because its members are predominantly illegal migrants from Bangladesh. According to key informants, men may earn Rs. 3,000-4,000 per week in garment factories but the police take most of the money and send them home with Rs. 500 or 1000 (Collective for Social Science Research, Karachi 2004, 'A rapid assessment of bonded labour in domestic

work and begging in Pakistan', International Labour Office, March, pp. 9, 20  
[http://www.ilo.org/dyn/declaris/DECLARATIONWEB.REPORT\\_BLOB?Var\\_DocumentID=2622](http://www.ilo.org/dyn/declaris/DECLARATIONWEB.REPORT_BLOB?Var_DocumentID=2622) – Accessed 19 May 2008 – Attachment 21).

### **3. Please provide information on the influence of connections and money in Pakistan.**

Pakistan recently received a relatively unfavourable assessment in the Transparency International 2007 Corruption Perceptions Index, being assigned a score of 2.4 (on a scale of 0 to 10, 0 being “highly corrupt” and 10 being “highly clean”). This score, based on a survey of opinions of businesspeople and country analysts, placed Pakistan 138<sup>th</sup> out of 179 ranked countries ('Corruption Perceptions Index 2007' 2007, Transparency International website [http://www.transparency.org/policy\\_research/surveys\\_indices/cpi/2007](http://www.transparency.org/policy_research/surveys_indices/cpi/2007) – Accessed 6 March 2008 – Attachment 22).

A 2006 Freedom House report on Pakistan provided information to indicate that bribery may be commonly required when dealing with government officials:

Corruption persists at almost all levels of government in Pakistan. Protections against conflict of interest are inadequate and even less adequately enforced. Separation of public office from the personal interests of public officeholders is not always maintained. Bribes are common in the higher education system, both for admission and for good grades.

...Although government regulation of the economy has progressively declined over the last several years, lack of transparency in government decision making still provides opportunities for corruption. Corruption is rampant at lower levels, where government officials demand bribes and gratuities for performing even routine functions. Low salaries and minimal compensation for government employees is often a major factor in perpetuating the graft (Freedom House 2006, *Countries at the Crossroads 2006: Country Report – Pakistan*, Freedom House website [http://www.freedomhouse.org/modules/publications/ccr/modPrintVersion.cfm?edition=7&ccr\\_page=31&ccrcountry=138](http://www.freedomhouse.org/modules/publications/ccr/modPrintVersion.cfm?edition=7&ccr_page=31&ccrcountry=138) – Accessed 21 May 2008 – Attachment 23).

A subsequent 2007 Freedom House report commented that initiatives to combat corruption in Pakistan have focused on civil servants and business people, but not on military and security personnel:

Corruption is pervasive at almost all levels of politics and government... Although Musharraf has publicly stated that eliminating official corruption is a priority, the National Anti-Corruption Strategy approved in 2002 focuses on politicians, civil servants, and businesspeople, while virtually ignoring military and security personnel (Freedom House 2007, 'Freedom in the World 2007 – Pakistan' Freedom House website, 17 April <http://www.freedomhouse.org/template.cfm?page=363&year=2007&country=7> – Accessed 12 December 7 – Attachment 24).

A US Department of State report on Pakistan published in 2008 indicated that corruption posed a “severe problem” in Pakistan:

Corruption within the police was rampant. Police charged fees to register genuine complaints and accepted money for registering false complaints. Bribes to avoid charges were commonplace. Individuals paid police to humiliate their opponents and avenge personal grievances. Corruption was most prominent among police SHOs, some of whom reportedly operated arrest-for-ransom operations and established unsanctioned stations to increase illicit revenue collection.



...The law provides criminal penalties for official corruption; however, the government did not implement the law effectively, and officials frequently engaged in corrupt practices with impunity. Public perception of corruption was widespread. The Worldwide Governance Indicators of the World Bank reflected that corruption was a severe problem (US Department of State 2008, *Country Reports on Human Rights Practices for 2007 – Pakistan*, 11 March, Sections 1.D, 3 – Attachment 25).

A 2006 survey published by Transparency International Pakistan reported that a majority of respondents rated the police as the most corrupt government department:

In the opinion of the 4000 respondents the three top most corrupt Government departments were Police, rated as number one by (64%) followed by Power (11%) third being Judiciary (9%) and fourth being Land ( 4.48%). The scenario appears to be changed from 2002 reports where Police was of course No.1, followed by Power and Taxation. The notable difference is the rating of the Police as the most corrupt sector this time a conspicuous majority 64% has rated Police as the most corrupt.

... Bribery or palm greasing has become so much part of the system that in all the ten sectors, the demand is directly made by the officer or person involved, without needing a negotiator or middle man (Transparency International Pakistan 2006, 'National Corruption Perception Survey 2006', Transparency International Pakistan website 11 August <http://www.transparency.org.pk/documents/National%20Corruption%20Perception%20Survey%202006.pdf> – Accessed 21 May 2008 – Attachment 26).

In a paper published in the *Asian Journal of Political Science* in August 2007, Faisal Khan argues that the Pakistan state has been weakened by corruption to the point that it is incapable of providing adequate basic services to citizens:

...Even a cursory analysis of the Pakistani state's governance capability shows that the state's ability to provide needed public goods and services, especially law and order, has been declining steadily for the last several decades. Frequent national power blackouts, the virtually complete lack of a municipal water supply to Karachi, Pakistan's largest city, the inability to adequately maintain major highways, rail lines or the all-important irrigation system are all symptomatic of declining state capabilities. However, what is most striking, and most symptomatic of state weakening, is the declining ability of the Pakistani government to maintain control over substantial portions of the country.

...In the case of Pakistan, extremely high levels of corruption at all levels of the administration account not only for the inability of its security forces to maintain law and order but also for its administration's inability to deliver development to its people. That is, corruption has weakened the state so much that it is incapable of providing for its people's needs.

...the average Pakistani encounters corruption every time they have any dealings with the bureaucracy: paying bills, registering births, reporting a crime, getting an electricity connection, trying to get their children admitted to a school, or recording the sale of a house. It does not matter how trivial the transaction might be, someone usually has their hand out (Khan, Feisal 2007, 'Corruption and the Decline of the State in Pakistan, *Asian Journal of Political Science*, Volume 15, Issue 2 August, pp. 220, 222 – Attachment 27).

## List of Sources Consulted

### Internet Sources:

#### **Search Engines**

Google search engine <http://www.google.com/>  
Google Scholar search Engine <http://scholar.google.com/schhp?hl=en&tab=ws>  
Google News <http://news.google.com/nwshp?hl=en&tab=wn>  
Microsoft Live Search Academic search engine <http://search.live.com/academic/>  
Microsoft Live Search search engine <http://www.live.com/>  
Alpha search engine <http://au.alpha.yahoo.com/>  
SearchMash search engine <http://www.searchmash.com/>  
Exalead search engine <http://www.exalead.com/search>  
Informaworld website <http://www.informaworld.com/smpp/home~db=all>  
Ingenta Connect website <http://www.ingentaconnect.com/>  
Infotrieve website <http://www4.infotrieve.com/search/databases/newsearch.asp>

#### **Pakistan News sites**

*Daily Times* website <http://www.dailytimes.com.pk/>  
*Dawn* website <http://www.dawn.com/>  
*The Nation* website <http://www.nation.com.pk/>  
*Jang* website <http://www.jang.com.pk/>  
*PakTribune* website <http://www.paktribune.com/index.shtml>  
*Pakistan Times* website <http://www.pakistantimes.net>  
*The News* website <http://www.thenews.com.pk/>

#### **Bangladesh News sites**

*The Daily Star* website <http://www.thedailystar.net/>  
*The Independent* website <http://www.theindependent-bd.com/>  
*The New Nation* website <http://nation.ittefaq.com/>  
*The News Today* website <http://www.newstoday-bd.com/>  
*Independent Bangladesh* website <http://www.independent-bangladesh.com/>  
*The Bangladesh Today* website <http://www.thebangladeshtoday.com/>

#### **International News and Politics**

*Frontline* website <http://www.frontlineonnet.com/>  
*Himal Magazine* website <http://www.himalmag.com/>  
Stratfor <http://www.stratfor.com/>  
*Jane's Intelligence Review* website <http://www.janes.com/>  
International Crisis Group website <http://www.crisisgroup.org/home/index.cfm>  
Reuters Alertnet website <http://www.alertnet.org/>  
IRINnews website <http://www.irinnews.org/>  
European Country of Origin Information Network website <http://www.ecoi.net/>  
*The Economist* website <http://www.economist.com/>  
*New York Times* website <http://www.nytimes.com/>  
BBC World News website <http://news.bbc.co.uk/>  
OneWorld South Asia website <http://southasia.oneworld.net/article/frontpage/158/1792>  
Time magazine website <http://www.time.com/time/>

#### **Government**

Government of Pakistan Bureau of Statistics website

<http://www.statpak.gov.pk/depts/index.html>

Pakistan Population Census organisation website

<http://www.statpak.gov.pk/depts/pco/index.html>

Immigration and Refugee Board of Canada website [http://www.cisr-irb.gc.ca/en/index\\_e.htm](http://www.cisr-irb.gc.ca/en/index_e.htm)

UK Home Office Country Reports website

[http://www.homeoffice.gov.uk/rds/country\\_reports.html](http://www.homeoffice.gov.uk/rds/country_reports.html)

### **United Nations sites**

United Nations Development Programme website <http://www.undp.org/>

United Nations Development Programme Human Development Report website

<http://hdr.undp.org/en/>

United Nations Economic and Social Development website <http://www.un.org/esa/>

UN Data website <http://data.un.org/>

United Nations Development Policy and Analysis Division website

<http://www.un.org/esa/policy/wess/>

International Labour Organisation website <http://www.ilo.org/global/lang--en/index.htm>

United Nations World Food Programme website <http://www.wfp.org/english/>

UNHCR website <http://www.unhcr.org/cgi-bin/texis/vtx/home>

UNHCR Refworld website <http://www.unhcr.org/cgi-bin/texis/vtx/refworld/rwmain>

### **Non-Government Organisations**

NationMaster website <http://www.nationmaster.com/index.php>

World Bank website <http://www.worldbank.org/>

Livelihoods website <http://www.livelihoods.org/>

Business Anti-Corruption Portal website <http://www.business-anti-corruption.com/Home.asp>

Transparency International Pakistan website <http://www.transparency.org.pk/index.htm>

Transparency International website <http://www.transparency.org/>

Global Integrity website <http://www.globalintegrity.org/>

Ethnologue website <http://www.ethnologue.com/>

Minorities at Risk website <http://www.cidcm.umd.edu/mar/>

Human Rights Commission of Pakistan website <http://www.hrcp-web.org/>

### **Databases:**

FACTIVA (news database)

BACIS (DIAC Country Information database)

REFINFO (IRBDC (Canada) Country Information database)

ISYS (RRT Research & Information database, including Amnesty International, Human Rights Watch, US Department of State Reports)

RRT Library Catalogue

### **List of Attachments**

1. Khan, Ahmad Naeem 2004, 'Illegal Immigrants Fear Registration Means Exit in Pakistan', OneWorld South Asia website, 10 February  
<http://southasia.oneworld.net/article/view/78856/1/> – Accessed 21 May 2008.
2. Gazdar, Haris 2005, 'Karachi, Pakistan: Between Regulation And Regularisation', in *International Migrants and the City* ed. M. Balbo, UN-Habitat, Venice, p. 166,

*Miurbal* website

[http://www.miurbal.net/documents/p001\\_International%20Migrants%20and%20the%20City.pdf](http://www.miurbal.net/documents/p001_International%20Migrants%20and%20the%20City.pdf) – Accessed 12 February 2008.

3. RRT Research & Information 2008, *Research Response PAK32916*, 20 February.
4. ‘The Forgotten Hostages of Peace’ 1973, *Time* website, 21 May  
<http://www.time.com/time/printout/0,8816,907283,00.html> – Accessed 21 May 2008.
5. Mehdi, Syed Sikander (Undated), ‘Pakistan: Conflict, Migration and Peace’, Irenees website <http://www.irenees.net/fr/fiches/analyse/fiche-analyse-648.html> – Accessed 19 May 2008.
6. Mansoor, Hasan 2003, ‘Illegal Lives’ *Himal South Asian* website  
<http://www.himalmag.com/2003/july/report.htm> – Accessed 12 February 2008.
7. Crackdown on aliens planned’ 2003, *Dawn* website, 5 August  
<http://www.dawn.com/2003/08/05/local22.htm> – Accessed 15 February 2008.
8. Stateless People In Bangladesh Inc. 2006 ‘Stateless In Bangladesh & Pakistan: Generations Of Oppressed’, *The South Asian* website  
<http://www.thesouthasian.org/archives/archives/2006/StatelessinBangladesh-GenerationsofOppressedV1.1.pdf> – Accessed 22 May 2008.
9. Trumbull, Robert 1972, ‘Dacca fears for Bengalis in Pakistan’, *New York Times*, 17 April.
10. Schanberg, Sydney 1971, ‘Bengalis held in Pakistan long for home’ *New York Times*, 18 March.
11. ‘Rupture in South Asia’ 2000, in *The State of the World’s Refugees 2000: Fifty Years of Humanitarian Action*, ed. Mark Cutts, UNHCR, Oxford University Press, pp. 59-79  
UNHCR website <http://www.unhcr.org/publ/PUBL/3ebf9bab0.pdf> – Accessed 22 May 2008.
12. Raman, B. 2003, ‘The case for more fences’, *Asia Times Online* website, 6 February  
[http://www.atimes.com/atimes/South\\_Asia/EB06Df03.html](http://www.atimes.com/atimes/South_Asia/EB06Df03.html) – Accessed 14 February 2008.
13. ‘Exchange Rate: U.S. Dollar to Pakistan Rupee’ 2008, XE.com website, 20 May  
<http://www.xe.com/ucc/convert.cgi> – Accessed 20 May 2008.
14. ‘CIA World Factbook: Pakistan’ 2008, CIA website,  
<https://www.cia.gov/library/publications/the-world-factbook/print/pk.html> Accessed 20 May 2008 – Accessed 20 May 2008.
15. Farooqi, Bilal 2007, ‘Property prices overvalued: survey’, *Daily Times*, 24 March  
[http://www.dailytimes.com.pk/default.asp?page=2007%5C03%5C24%5Cstory\\_24-3-2007\\_pg5\\_13](http://www.dailytimes.com.pk/default.asp?page=2007%5C03%5C24%5Cstory_24-3-2007_pg5_13) – Accessed 19 May 2008.
16. Pakistan Federal Bureau of Statistics 2007, *Household Integrated Economic Survey (HIES) 2005-2006*, Pakistan Federal Bureau of Statistics website

- [http://www.statpak.gov.pk/depts/fbs/statistics/hies05\\_06/complete.pdf](http://www.statpak.gov.pk/depts/fbs/statistics/hies05_06/complete.pdf) – Accessed 20 May 2008.
17. 'Pakistan: Occupational wages and hours of work (1997 – 2006)' 2008, International Labour Organisation website, <http://laborsta.ilo.org/cgi-bin/brokerv8.exe> – Accessed 20 May 2008.
  18. Pakistan Federal Bureau of Statistics 2007, '17.6: Average Retail Prices of Basic Articles', in *Pakistan Statistical Yearbook 2007*, Pakistan Federal Bureau of Statistics website <http://www.statpak.gov.pk/depts/fbs/publications/yearbook2007/price/17.6.pdf> – Accessed 20 May 2008.
  19. 'Pakistan: Urban food security deteriorating – WFP study' 2008, *IRIN* website, 8 January <http://www.irinnews.org/report.aspx?ReportID=76138> – Accessed 20 May 2008.
  20. Augustine, Anthony 2008, 'Nearly half of Pakistanis "food insecure" – WFP', *Reuters*, 4 April <http://www.reuters.com/article/latestCrisis/idUSISL192209> – Accessed 20 May 2008.
  21. Collective for Social Science Research, Karachi 2004, 'A rapid assessment of bonded labour in domestic work and begging in Pakistan', International Labour Office, March [http://www.ilo.org/dyn/declaris/DECLARATIONWEB.REPORT\\_BLOB?Var\\_DocumentID=2622](http://www.ilo.org/dyn/declaris/DECLARATIONWEB.REPORT_BLOB?Var_DocumentID=2622) – Accessed 19 May 2008.
  22. 'Corruption Perceptions Index 2007' 2007, Transparency International website [http://www.transparency.org/policy\\_research/surveys\\_indices/cpi/2007](http://www.transparency.org/policy_research/surveys_indices/cpi/2007) – Accessed 6 March 2008.
  23. Freedom House 2006, *Countries at the Crossroads 2006: Country Report – Pakistan*, Freedom House website <http://www.freedomhouse.org/modules/publications/ccr/modPrintVersion.cfm?edition=7&ccrpage=31&ccrcountry=138> – Accessed 21 May 2008.
  24. Freedom House 2007, 'Freedom in the World 2007 – Pakistan' Freedom House website, 17 April <http://www.freedomhouse.org/template.cfm?page=363&year=2007&country=7> – Accessed 12 December 7.
  25. US Department of State 2008, *Country Reports on Human Rights Practices for 2007 – Pakistan*, 11 March, Sections 1.D, 3.
  26. Transparency International Pakistan 2006, 'National Corruption Perception Survey 2006', Transparency International Pakistan website 11 August <http://www.transparency.org.pk/documents/National%20Corruption%20Perception%20Survey%202006.pdf> – Accessed 21 May 2008.
  27. Khan, Feisal 2007, 'Corruption and the Decline of the State in Pakistan', *Asian Journal of Political Science*, Volume 15, Issue 2, pp. 219-247, August.